

BOOK REVIEWS

Anthropology & aesthetics

FORTY, ADRIAN & SUSANNE KÜCHLER (eds). *The art of forgetting*. xiv, 216 pp., illus., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berg Publishers, 1999. £42.00 (cloth)

In Western societies, so the editors of this volume argue, material objects are generally assumed to play a positive role in the process of remembering. To protect memories against loss, we feel we must externalize them in some physical medium – deposit them in archives, erect monuments to commemorate them, and give them other sorts of enduring forms. A particular, culturally specific conception of the process of forgetting seems to lie behind practices of these kinds: namely, an assumption that forgetting is a passive process, in which memories inexorably fade over time and must perish unless measures are taken to conserve them. From this perspective, the central problem memory appears to pose is how to preserve or prolong it. Here, material culture seems to play a vital role.

But the contributors to this volume have in common a quite different starting-point. They suppose, like Freud, that forgetting is an active process, a struggle to banish memories often stubbornly reluctant to leave us. From this perspective, the key problem posed by memory is how to exorcise it. Forgetting, then, is a purposeful activity. Indeed, as every study in this volume convincingly shows, it is a socially organized activity directed at what people as members of collectivities do not want to recall. The intriguing question this raises for the contributors is the role played by material objects and artefacts in these processes of social forgetting. Are monuments, for example, ways not just of preserving the past but also of erasing unwanted aspects of it?

In some non-Western societies, the necessary role of material artefacts in enabling people to forget does seem to be recognized much more openly than in the West. Nicholas Argenti and Susanne Küchler examine the role of artefacts in funerary ritual in an African and in a Melanesian society respectively. Neither society seems to have an interest in durable memorials, but commemorate the dead with what Argenti and Küchler call ‘ephemeral monuments’ – objects made in the course of rituals, and destroyed or abandoned afterwards.

Extending these insights to the Western art world, the second section of the volume examines the role of memory and forgetting in the art of eighteenth-century Europe: in portraiture (Helen Weston), funerary sculpture (David Bindman), and Piranesi’s prints of Rome (Tanya Cooper). The third and final section focuses on war memorials, seeking to uncover what these monuments suppress as well as what they commemorate about past conflicts. Michael Rowlands discusses the Vietnam Veterans Memorial in Washington, arguing that the sacrificial imagery of this and other war memorials works by enabling the living to forget many inconvenient ‘actualities’, such as inequalities of social class among those who died. Alex King shows similarly how the public debates surrounding the building of First World War memorials in Britain, concerning how to remember the war appropriately, were also implicit controversies about what ought to be forgotten. Finally, Neil Jarman examines the role of two important annual commemorations in Northern Ireland, both concerning events of 1916: nationalists commemorate the Easter Rising, and unionists remember the battle of the Somme. Jarman shows that the two commemorations involve not just the remembering of the past, but a principled and complicit forgetting by both communities of much of their historical common ground.

In short, this volume explores a variety of different cultural and historical settings in which people have constructed material artefacts to preserve memories and also to erase them. Perhaps understandably, such practices seem especially pronounced in the specific context on which most of the contributors have chosen to focus: namely, the art and ritual concerned with death. This volume presents a new and intriguing perspective on the relationship between the material and immaterial dimensions of culture, suggesting that people’s material technologies of memory are always – though much more openly in some cultures than in others – also their technologies of forgetting.

SIMON HARRISON

University of Ulster, Coleraine

PINNEY, CHRISTOPHER & NICHOLAS THOMAS (eds). *Beyond aesthetics: art and the technologies of enchantment*. vii, 288 pp., illus., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berg Publishers, 2001. £42.99 (cloth), £14.99 (paper)

At the time of Alfred Gell's untimely death in 1997, the anthropology of art, once a fertile field of enquiry, was suffering a kind of atrophy. This was due mostly to the deconstruction of 'art' as an ethnocentric, elitist concept, and a more popular interest in the global exchange networks of 'material culture'. But Gell, in a posthumously published monograph entitled *Art and agency*, revitalized anthropological interest in art, his ground-breaking book ensuring the longevity of 'art' as a concept of central importance to anthropological enquiry, not to mention his own legacy as an accomplished theoretician.

In *Beyond aesthetics: art and the technologies of enchantment*, Nicholas Thomas, who wrote the foreword to *Art and agency*, and Christopher Pinney, who along with Thomas is credited with facilitating its publication, bring together a dozen essays that reflect on the theoretical advances made in Gell's final work. Each serves as a kind of test case for Gell's ideas.

The title, *Beyond aesthetics*, alludes to Gell's disdain for the typical ethnographer's preoccupation with aesthetic judgements in lieu of more appropriately anthropological attention to social analysis. This inspired his call for a 'methodological philistinism' in the study of art, as well as his emphasis on non-Western 'technology' as a linguistic substitute for the more problematically aesthetical concept of 'art', as well as motivating his refreshingly radical idea that art objects are extensions of human agency. Fortunately, the contributors to *Beyond aesthetics* have done a far better job of communicating Gell's ideas than I can do here. It is to their credit, and somewhat regrettable, that one need not actually read all of Gell's work in order to understand each essay.

Most of the essays make use of some piece of ethnographic detail to test the limits of Gell's ideas. Ian Keen and Francesca Merlan use radically different examples, classical music and aboriginal painting respectively, to explore the issue of authenticity in relation to Gell's nexus of artist, index, and audience. Clare Harris's essay on icons of the Dalai Lama in Tibet and Dharamsala and Charlotte Townsend-Gault's essay on the 'Queen's baton' from the Commonwealth Games in British Columbia both offer insightful examples of art as an index of agency in an overtly political, nationalist context. Other authors seem taken by Gell's concept of captivation and the virtuosity of the artist. Lissant Bolton's analysis of Vanuatu textiles, Susanne Küchler's ruminations on knots, Shirley Campbell's essay on the famous prow-boards, Daniel Miller's exploration of Trinidadian web sites, and Christopher Pinney's description of religious chromolithographs all offer various perspectives on the captivating agency of art objects.

James Weiner and Anne D'Alleva represent the strongest challenges to Gell's ideas, though both critiques seek to expand rather than dismantle his position. Finally, Marilyn Strathern provides the reader with a surprising return to one of Gell's earlier interests in technology, turning his idea on its head to great effect.

Beyond the specific contributions of any particular essay, however, what most interests me is the volume's role in crafting Gell's legacy. Though many of the essays reserve sharp criticism for certain aspects of Gell's varied and often controversial positions, taken as a whole *Beyond aesthetics* affirms his place in the bibliographical review of any anthropologist concerned with art or material culture. From the seed of his ideas in shorter articles, from which the subtitle 'technologies of enchantment' is taken, to his longer monographs on tattooing, time, and agency, *Beyond aesthetics* synthesizes Gell's ideas, allowing us to believe they were fully formed from the beginning. Taking into consideration their involvement in *Art and agency*, it would seem the editors are engaged in some intradisciplinary myth-making, attempting to captivate us all in the 'spectacle of unimaginable virtuosity' that constitutes Gell's life's work. The myth, however, is not undeserved, and *Beyond aesthetics* provides us with another index of Alfred Gell's considerable agency within anthropology.

RUSSELL LEIGH SHARMAN
Brooklyn College, CUNY

MOERAN, BRIAN. *Folk art potters of Japan: beyond an anthropology of aesthetics*. xiv, 272 pp., tables, illus., bibliogr. Richmond, Sy.: Curzon, 1997. £40.00 (cloth), £14.99 (paper)

There has been a great need in the anthropology of art and aesthetics for concise and thorough ethnographies of the complex art traditions of East Asian cultures. The strengths of this study of the Japanese folk art tradition of *Mingei* lie in the synthesis of detailed social analysis of its production in a local community with critiques of both Western and Japanese aesthetic theory. Moeran's ethnography highlights the important relationship between theory and practice as manifested in the community of Sarayama where Onta pottery (*Ontayaki*) is produced. At the centre of the *Mingei* movement are the theories of Yanagi Sōetsu (1889–1961) involving the idealized relationships between community, nature, and the importance of direct perception of the art object. Anthropologists interested in the cross-cultural study of art will find, as Moeran points out, that this 'romantic idealism towards folk arts and artists is not unlike that of European and American anthropologists towards "primitive" people during the course of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries' (p. 44).

Strong ethnographic chapters deal with social organization, labour co-operation, and ecology, as well as changes in those structures over time and in relation to market and aesthetic expectations. The maintenance of a traditional way of life, co-operation between community members, and a close relationship with nature is what makes the Sarayama potters such an ideal example of *Mingei*, yet the very success of this community has led to complex changes that may be interpreted in different ways. The adoption and eventual rejection of a mechanical water-wheel that was hailed by the connoisseurs as evidence of the potters' concern for the *Mingei* ideals of tradition and closeness to nature was due in reality to its technical inefficiency (p. 137).

The active engagement of the Onta potters with *Mingei* aesthetic theory is particularly enlightening in illustrating how the often detached theories of critics filter down to, and are in turn influenced by, the producers of the works themselves (pp. 181–206). Moeran proposes a useful analytical framework revolving around the different values associated with the works, their production, and their circulation. These are outlined as 'use', 'appreciation', 'commodity exchange', 'symbolic exchange', 'technical' and 'social values' (pp. 154–5, 200–1). Connoisseurs' focus upon appreciation, as opposed to the tendency of potters to highlight technical concerns to explain the form of a pot, is just one example of how 'potters disagree with critics about the relationship between form and function because of their own experience in making pots' (p. 201). The potters are very well aware of their status within the *Mingei* movement – though that status has often fluctuated as the practices of the potters and the form of their wares have appeared to divert from the ideals set by connoisseurs. 'The way in which potters *ought* to make their wares may not be the same as they actually do make them; how they *ought* to participate in community life may well differ from how they actually do make them' (p. 62).

I question, however, the proposal for the anthropology of values to replace the anthropology of art (pp. 215–17). This thought is not due to the conception of the anthropology of values itself – this is as valid as any anthropological framework – but to the vast range of alternative ways to formulate global studies of expressive culture. Despite many problems, the term 'art' has lasted, due in part to the dominant Western conception but, more importantly, also because producers of expressive cultural forms throughout the world are aware of, and now engage with, the term on an increasingly critical level. I see the theory of value taking its place next to, rather than in place of, the anthropology of art with which it overlaps in the growing web of the discipline.

This book represents an important expansion beyond the dominant anthropological concern with 'tribal' art and aesthetics. The use of com-

parative examples from other cultural traditions and new interpretations of orientalism is particularly effective. Concerns over the primitivist strain in modern Western art have been a common concern in anthropology, yet, as Moeran quite rightly points out, it has been a strain 'which, in anthropology, has been seen as related somehow to virtually every "non-western" art form *except* Japanese art' (p. 224). In opposition to definitions of a global art world based upon a strong Western system of art, Japan and other East Asian cultures present a fundamental challenge – equally complex, yet differently aestheticized systems of beliefs about art from those in the West.

MORGAN PERKINS

SUNY, Potsdam

Anthropology & history

CHILVER, E.M. & UTE RÖSCHENTHALER.
Cameroon's tycoon: Max Esser's expedition and its consequences. xx, 204 pp., maps, illus., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berghahn Books, 2001. £17.00 (paper)

Colonial history, biography, social geography, travel writing, historical ethnography, family album, anthropology of cross-cultural encounters: this book leaves no genre unexplored in its drive to reassess the nature of the relationship that bound one man – and through him a hesitant empire – to the Cameroon Grassfields. While anthropological orthodoxies have tended to cast colonial administrations in the same hackneyed role over recent decades, Chilver and Röschenthaler's inspired examination of the personal, economic, and cultural factors that led a well-to-do German Jewish cavalry officer and entrepreneur on an exploratory mission to investigate the potential of setting up plantations on Cameroon's coast offers us a multifaceted and nuanced insight into the early years of African agronomy.

By means of painstaking research in colonial archives in Cameroon and Germany, the editors reveal that Max Esser's view that the continent's natural resources were limited, that the goodwill of the suppliers that Western dealers depended upon was not to be taken for granted, and that the introduction of intensive methods of cultivation would in the long term repay the heavy initial investment required – both to European investors and local workers alike – stands out as a bold and prescient position in the context of prevailing nineteenth-century Western opinion. According to this view, Africa was nothing more than a superabundant wilderness, the inexhaustible fruits of which were to be effortlessly harvested without second thoughts.

But this book is no simplistic eulogy of Second Reich exploration, and still less can it be dismissed as a revisionist apology for the nefarious consequences of German imperialism. As the book's subtitle implies, it is not only Esser's background and his intentions that are examined, but also the manner in which his single-minded determination to see large-scale plantations set up on the coast of Germany's new Cameroonian territory necessitated a steady and dependable supply of labour.

The ten chapters of the book's second part are devoted to an edited translation of the book that Esser himself published in 1898 from the diaries that he kept while on his journey into the ' hinterland' of Cameroon to try to secure such a labour supply. The very helpfully annotated translation of *An der Westküste Afrikas* details the expedition Esser undertook in 1896, retracing the steps of Dr Eugene Zintgraff (with Zintgraff again joining the expedition) to the Grassfields kingdom of Bali Nyonga. Part merchant banker on a hunting foray, part ethnographer, Esser records his first impressions of the peoples he comes across with humanity, humour, and lucidity, culminating in a lively account of his stay in Bali Nyonga and his negotiations with its Fon, or king, for the supply of men to work in the coastal plantations.

Unbeknown to them, the agreement that Esser and Fon Galega reached would outlive both parties to the pact and have far-reaching consequences for the political history of the Grassfields and the German colonial enterprise alike. As the migrant workers of the highland Grassfields began to fall by the dozen once they reached the malarial coast, and as unscrupulous colonial officers took to meting out rough justice and illegitimately recruiting forced labour in the colony, dissenting voices rapidly emerged from other factions in the empire: amongst others, from the Basel missionaries who recorded the atrocities and from representatives of the Left in the German Parliament, who remonstrated on behalf of the Bali workers.

The third part of the book adds to Esser's diary translations of contemporaneous primary sources and provides information on developments in German Cameroon that further complement the picture: *inter alia*, the advent of a competing trade company – the Gesellschaft Nordwest Kamerun – a parliamentary enquiry into the well-being of plantation workers on the coast, and a report from the German lieutenant running the Bamenda station to the Imperial Government in Buea on the measures taken following the killing of his predecessor in an uprising. And here we come to the ultimate consequences of Esser's foray: the destabilization of the balance of power in the Grassfields, the arming of the uniformed 'Bali Truppe' or *basoge* irregulars, and their deployment in 'punitive expeditions' intended to suppress uprisings against German incursions and labour recruitment drives.

While this compendium is not an apology, then, it does not offer the reader a ready brush with which to tar all its protagonists: the cumulative effect of the primary sources gathered, translated, and annotated here is to complexify our understanding of the early Cameroonian colonial encounter and of the disparate motivations of its participants, and to reveal the ways in which the pull of new political forces in this emerging territory had unintended consequences for local and German actors alike, thus continuing to inform the political dynamics of Cameroon to this day.

NICOLAS ARGENTI

Brunel University

FAUBION, JAMES D. *The shadows and lights of Waco: millennialism today*. xvii, 242 pp., illus., bibliogr. Oxford, New Jersey: Princeton Univ. Press, 2001. £37.95 (cloth), £15.95 (paper)

Paranoid, gun-toting, drug-using, fornicating, often-divorced, child-abusing, born-again Americans who, talking to God, receive blessed assurance that they are among the divinely chosen: Faubion writes about some of my neighbours. Prophets regularly rise up in the uplands of Arkansas and on the bucolic Oklahoma and Texas plains. They sweep into town preaching doom and destruction. One of my favourites foresaw the obliteration of my town Tulsa – that Great Whore of Babylon – on 9 June 1989. (The city spelled backwards is, of course, 'a slut'.) We call these people 'Trailer Trash'. But Faubion, good anthropologist that he is, demands that we take seriously this cheaper cut of American culture.

On 19 April 1993, the United States government attacked Mount Carmel in Waco, Texas, the compound of David Koresh (a.k.a. Vernon Howell) and his Branch Davidians. Fifty-one days earlier, in an exchange of gunfire, the Davidians had killed four Federal agents who were hunting for illegal weaponry. Weary of besieging, official forces at last broke into the compound and eighty Branch Davidians – including Koresh – died among the gunfire, fire, and smoke.

A year later, James Faubion came up from Houston to visit the site of the tragedy and consider, ethnographically, the lay of the land. At its barrier fence, he met Amo Paul Bishop Roden (to whom he dedicates his book). Ms Roden, camped outside the gates with photocopied exegeses, tracts, and other writings on offer, seemed a likely informant. She was the one-time partner and mother of the daughter of George Roden, a son of Branch Davidian prophet Ben Roden, whose aged if powerful widow Lois may or may not have enjoyed intimate relations with the twenty-something, ambitious, and upcoming Koresh.

Surviving descendants of the various lineages of this Branch Davidian family tree were then

fighting bitterly over the organization's charred bones. Because Faubion fell in with Roden, her religious rivals essentially refused to deal with him and he learned what he could 'of Branch Davidian lives other than Ms. Roden's own largely from indirect and secondary sources' (p. 84). Faubion, however, manages to spin straw into gold, or at least to translate dubious ethnographic nuggets into higher theory. He frames his book upon Ms Roden herself: her initial conversion (Part 1), her truths (Part 2, 'Gnosis'), morals (Part 3, 'Ethics'), and her identity as obstinate prophet in the deadened wilderness of American society (Part 4, 'Colonization'). Faubion tacks back and forth between the appalling, nutty, and sometimes passionate details of Roden's life and letters and a superior sort of social theory: a little Foucault, St Augustine, Bataille, Pierce, Kant, Burke, among a library of others.

These swoops between highbrow and low are sometimes vertiginous, but often revealing. I was at first perplexed by Faubion's seeming detours, such as one into Thucydides' account of the mutilation of the herms in 415 BCE, until he found along the way a useful perspective on Waco, and anthropological, mentality. Likewise, Faubion's account of a seventeenth-century messianic movement centred on Sabbatai Zevi seemed remote from the Texas plains until he placed Koresh also in the tradition of 'sinful messiah'.

Faubion squeezes suggestive generalizations from Ms Roden's Texas particulars. He suggests a pedagogical theory of conversion in which belief follows practice; he speculates on a meta-sociology of millenarianism (where and why this occurs) and on the parallels between millenarian schemes and the structure of rites of passage; he wonders about an anthropology of ethics; and he questions why we insist that millenarian belief, nowadays, be appreciated as irrational and cultic. We do so, of course, because we are 'colonized' by ruling ideas that cage the dangers of religious enthusiasm. A few in Waco, however, have escaped. Faubion hopes that he has 'succeeded in giving pause to those who would rather pathologize David Koresh or Ms. Roden than recognize them as the subversives they actually are' (p. 188). A short pause, maybe, but, given the tenor of everyday life in the Mount Carmel compound, one can understand why folks called Koresh crazy. Are there any healthier, subversive millenarians out there? Some of the Greens come to mind, although Faubion is unable yet to 'pick them out of the crowd' (p. 183).

Faubion supposed that Ms Roden offered herself up as anthropological informant partly to spread her message and partly because 'she thinks herself deserving of a scholar's attention' (p. 158). One also recalls competitive Melanesian prophets who fill the ears of passing anthropologists lest their cult rivals get there first. Ms Roden may similarly have had her enemies in mind. Still, anthropological fieldwork succeeds best, as in this

case, when researcher and informant use one another for the good of us all.

LAMONT LINDSTROM

University of Tulsa

HOSTETLER, LAURA. *Qing colonial enterprise: ethnography and cartography in early modern China*. xx, 257 pp., maps, figs., tables, plates, bibliogr. London, Chicago: Univ. Chicago Press, 2001. £22.50 (cloth)

Historians of China have tended to shy away from attempts to place China's development during the early modern period in the context of global developments. But as Hostetler seeks to show in this book, eighteenth-century China did not function in glorious isolation, and her thesis, at its most basic level, may be regarded as an attack on the theory of China's exclusivity. By tracing 'simultaneous developments in cartographic and ethnographic modes of representation' (p. 1) based on empirical knowledge, Hostetler argues that during the early modern period China was not a passive recipient, but an active participant in global changes. Her central theme is an exploration of the Qing use of cartographical and ethnographical representation in empire-building, from which she concludes that the processes underpinning the expansion of the Qing empire were similar to those that shaped early modern Europe.

Like Joseph Needham and Cordell Yee before her, Hostetler argues that Chinese cartography was in no way inferior to that of the West, and calls for a broader conception of mapping that embraces different kinds of maps. Taking this argument one step further, she suggests that in the early modern period there was no sharp dichotomy between Western and Chinese cartography; just as China had no monopoly on traditional maps, so scientific cartography was not uniquely Western. There is no doubt that the expansion in cartography at this time was born of an exchange of knowledge, and may thus be viewed as part of an international enterprise. However, while acknowledging that China valued Western scientific methods despite the stigma of foreignness, in her attempt to downplay the importance of Western cartographic techniques, Hostetler risks overstating her case. She may be correct to suggest that the use of a standard scale in the Kangxi Jesuit atlas marked a departure from the pre-modern to modern mode, but it was also an extremely significant departure from Chinese tradition.

The driving force behind this global cartographic enterprise was, according to Hostetler, a common advent – the development of early modern empires. In mapping the territory of its expanding empire, she argues that 'the Qing court purposely chose to use the same idiom or map language as its competitors' (p. 23), thus suggesting that China was a player in global

trends of the early modern period, and employed the same methods, technologies, and ideologies as its European counterparts. Just as the acquisition of greater knowledge about distant places had promoted developments in cartography, so the increasing volume of information about distant peoples prompted the development of ethnographical works. Here, Hostetler continues the comparative approach by looking at the development of Western and Chinese ethnographic writings and argues that not only were they a response to similar political and colonial designs, but both were characterized by an emphasis on observation and empirical knowledge.

The latter half of the book is devoted to a case-study of Guizhou province and the genre of works known as the Miao albums. Following a detailed discussion of the geography, peoples, and political background to the incorporation of Guizhou into the empire, Hostetler examines the development of gazetteers and histories about the region from 1560 to 1834. The remaining chapters focus on the Miao albums. Initially, in the mid-eighteenth century, these works with their striking illustrations and accompanying text were concerned solely with recording the customs and habits of the Miao peoples in order to educate Chinese officialdom. By the nineteenth century, the texts had come to reflect a greater concern with control and suppression, and the peoples depicted were now objects of fear. By this time, however, the albums were valued as works of art. Hostetler's highly detailed examination and comparison of the albums traces the shifts in the development of the genre, and also shows how the cataloguing of differences among some eighty-two non-Han groups was part of the imperial ordering of knowledge which would lay the groundwork for the ideological inclusion of different peoples into the empire. Yet, if these visual representations (as opposed to ethnographical writings) were a significant feature of the imperial project, it is puzzling that the genre was not widely replicated in other parts of the expanding empire. Moreover, if this was part of a global phenomenon, then perhaps more could have been gained from further exploration of comparable works produced in the West.

Whether or not one is convinced by Hostetler's central argument that China was an interactive partner with the West in terms of the 'technologies of representation', this book makes a significant contribution to existing scholarship by drawing attention to the importance of visual representation in relation to the process of empire-building. This is a carefully researched, highly readable, and visually appealing work, which should be of interest to all historians of the early modern period, as well as to China specialists.

L.J. NEWBY

University of Oxford

LIENHARDT, PETER; AHMED AL-SHAHI (ed.).
Shaikhdoms of Eastern Arabia. xx, 257 pp., map, figs., illus., bibliogr. Basingstoke, New York: Palgrave, with St Antony's College, Oxford, 2001. £45.00 (cloth)

This is an anthropological gem. It is a work whose subject matter is no longer recognizable in the realities of the twenty-first century, but whose descriptions and analysis make more transparent and comprehensible the current political and economic driving forces of the region roughly covering the United Arab Emirates. It is a mere two hundred or so pages sandwiched in by an editor's preface and epilogue; a dense body of anthropological analysis, written over two, possibly three decades, depicting an 'ethnographic present' long passed. Peter Lienhardt first went out to the Shaikhdoms of the Trucial Coast in 1954 and over the next twenty years conducted anthropological field-work which he slowly wrote up and rarely published. From the bibliography consulted for this collection there are only a few references to his earlier publications, beginning in 1957 in the journal *Man* and ending in 1975 with an essay in *Arabian Studies*. As Al-Shahi explains in his preface, *Shaikhdoms of Eastern Arabia* was successfully submitted as a D.Phil. thesis at the University of Oxford in 1957. For nearly the next thirty years, until his death in 1986, he reworked the manuscript, but never got around to publishing it. That it has seen the light of day is due to Al-Shahi's diligence and hard work.

The book is fundamentally concerned with the political aspects of life in the 'traditional' society of the Trucial Coast. It is particularly interested in the governments of the rulers and the associated structures supporting such rule. The first of six chapters examines the political complexity of the shaikhdoms. It sets out the historical context of the Trucial Coast, its links with the British Empire, and its ecological relationship with the desert and the sea, and with the incipient oil industry. The next chapter, surprisingly, is about relationships between men and women. Had it been written a few decades later, it would have been simply entitled 'Gender relations'. It is a refreshing read, carrying with it a sense of lost opportunity, in that it comes too late to contribute to the debates of the 1980s and early 1990s concerning Arab women's role in society. But it does lay the groundwork for the later chapters which examine the political uses of the marriage tie and the importance of maternal kin as well as agnates in understanding the political structure of the society. The next chapter concerns itself with the Bedouin and with the segmentary lineage system which characterizes their economic and political organization and which also marks town structures. Lienhardt maintains that

these are desert states, and there has been a constant coming and going between the

desert and the town. The Trucial Coast has no large population of peasants to maraud, and the settled places have had no system of government essentially different from that which is applied in the desert (p. 81).

His next chapter examines the historical past of town structures and organizations, as well as the maritime activities of the Trucial Coast, including fishing, merchant seafaring, and pearl fishing. This is followed by a penultimate chapter on the history and political struggles of the shaikhly families he knew so well. The concluding chapter draws all the previous threads together: political tribal structures of segmentation and what he calls 'impartial transcendence'; the role of women in society and the importance of marriage contracts and maternal kin in maintaining political structures; the impact of the desert and the sea in creating the shaikhdoms of the mid-twentieth century; the way in which tribalism is slowly being reduced in importance and, instead, a two-tier class system is emerging – one wealthy and one poor; and, finally, the way in which systems of patronage and clientage cut vertically through the classes where locality, on the one hand, and family, on the other, are of extreme importance.

This is a book which will interest anyone concerned with Middle Eastern society in general and the Persian or Arabian Gulf in particular. Although some of the material is dated, it is historically relevant and throws fresh insight onto the processes of transformation which affected the Trucial Coast. It also contributes to the discourses on women and men's roles in Arab society, and to the debate concerning the transformation of leadership systems derived from segmentary lineage structures.

DAWN CHATTY

University of Oxford

MENCHACA, MARTHA. *Recovering history, constructing race: the Indian, Black and White roots of Mexican Americans*. xi, 375 pp., maps, illus., bibliogr. Austin: Univ. Texas Press, 2001

Unravelling the long and complex developments of the racial make-up of the Mexican American people and then analysing how race and racism affected their historical and cultural experiences is a tall order. University of Texas professor Martha Menchaca has written a book, *Recovering history, constructing race*, that has made a great contribution to this effort and personalized it with insights gained from her own bio-ethnographic background on the subject. In fact, the book starts off with her enquiries about her father's African racial background and additionally integrates the California Indian genealogy of her husband, a Chumash. This book is the first serious undertaking to come to grips with the notion of *mestizaje* (miscegenation, usually racial

but also often cultural). It carefully examines the Indian, Spanish, and African interactions and admixtures over time that characterize the Mexican American experience. The author documents how a series of contacts and conquests led to legal codes and restrictions to advance the racist ideology of the dominant class (a process that she calls 'racialization'), and weaves into this scholarly analysis more contemporary events (for example, the Chicano Movement). As I have noted, especially helpful in charting these transformations are the bio-ethnographic observations of race and history, a deft progression from macro- to micro-levels of analysis that makes for engaging and easy reading.

Menchaca begins her account by underscoring how the 1960s Chicano Movement made the indigenous heritage of Mexican Americans a central issue. It was during this time that writers and activists, such as the poet laureate, Alurista, staked out new terrain for the indigenous identity of the Mexican American people. From this juncture, Menchaca gives a basic outline of the Indian peoples prior to and at the time of the conquest, explores the diversity among them, the mixed heritage of Spain, and an interesting section on the slave trade in Mexico and the roots of the slaves. Accordingly, Spain established a racial order, thus leaving an institutionalized legacy of racism in Mexico. Subsequent chapters provide specific historical examples of developments in the southwest United States, beginning with settlement in the area, the encroachments of Anglo-Americans and the Mexican American War of 1846–8, the treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo ending that war, and modern transformations depicting the forging of a Mexican American subordinate population in the United States. It is in the Anglo-American period that Menchaca makes her most original and important contributions, where she carefully dissects racialization legislation affecting people of colour.

Although she revisits many well-documented events, Menchaca's work differs from other histories of Mexican Americans in several important ways. For one, she focuses on racial conflict rather than the national development of Spain, Mexico, or the United States. As she underscores, her work examines how 'Spain and the United States used their legal systems to confer social and economic privileges upon Whites and to discriminate against people of color' (p. 3). She utilizes the term and process of racialization to discuss racial categorization and shows how power and wealth were denied to non-Whites. Indeed, one of the strongest points of Menchaca's text is the way in which she elaborates on the concept of racialization. Colour and class are important aspects in understanding the Mexican American, but very little has been written about Mexican Americans and the legal system. She digs deep into a large expanse of ethnohistory and covers legal issues and developments from the conquest to the anti-affirmative action cases

of today, showing how White privileges were secured and assured.

One of the best aspects of the book is the way in which Menchaca utilizes her bio-ethnographic perspective to provide concrete observations on how racial legislation and racism have affected contemporary populations, providing the reader with first-hand sources of a kind often neglected by conventional anthropologists.

In conclusion, this is a solid piece of scholarship, and will fill a major void in a much-neglected area. Not only is it a fast and enjoyable read for undergraduates and academics, but it provides insightful analyses on several points seldom explored in Chicano/a studies, such as racialization over time, the Afro-mestizo roots of Mexican Americans, and the bio-ethnographic perspective. This pioneering book will enrich the fields of anthropology and Chicano studies.

JAMES DIEGO VIGIL

University of California, Irvine

Anthropology & psychology

BARRETT, LOUISE, ROBIN DUNBAR & JOHN LYCETT. *Human evolutionary psychology*. xiv, 434 pp., figs., tables, bibliogr. London, New York: Palgrave, 2002. £17.99 (paper)

This is an enormously rich book, summarizing and explaining just about every recent controversy in this burgeoning field. As if anticipating anthropologists' misgivings about the whole enterprise, the authors begin by attacking the 'over-enthusiastic application of evolutionary theory to humans in a way that seems to leave no room for cultural influences'. Thanks to language, they stress, humans have been able 'to create and live in "virtual worlds" – worlds where intangible ideas and imaginary flights of fancy are as important and as meaningful as solid objects' (p. 2). Culture – as Kenan Malik observes – is not a mere encrustation upon human nature, like dirt on a soiled shirt. Without culturally transmitted patterns of behaviour and belief, human nature would lack any vehicle of expression.

The authors' stated aim is to bridge the gap between 'evolutionary psychology' (EP) and 'human behavioural ecology' (HBE). EP focuses on putatively innate cognitive mechanisms; HBE is much closer to anthropology, examining social and other behavioural strategies. While ostensibly even-handed, in practice the strongly HBE authors mount an effective demolition job on EP as promulgated in the United States. In the well-publicized metaphor of John Tooby and Leda Cosmides, the human mind is a 'Swiss army knife'. More specifically, it is 'a confederation of hundreds of thousands of functionally dedicated

computers' designed by natural selection during the remote Plio-Pleistocene. The linguist and philosopher Jerry Fodor – who first coined the term 'modular mind' – dismisses this whole idea as 'modularity gone mad'. Barrett and colleagues support Fodor in tearing it to shreds. If there is a dedicated, informationally encapsulated, hard-wired module for each aspect of human behaviour, how can any of us possibly decide between alternative courses of action? Which specialized module could conceivably do the deciding? Are the cues to trigger this or that 'module' weighted in some way? How do the postulated modules interact with one another and engage with the real world? 'So far', note the authors, 'Tooby and Cosmides have not provided the answers to these questions' (p. 273).

In a short review, it is impossible to do justice to the richness and thoroughness with which this and other debates have been covered. Human origins, hunter-gatherer food-sharing, genomic imprinting, problems of cheat-detection, parent-offspring conflict, child abuse, mate choice strategies, the demographic transition, evolution of the menopause, inheritance, warfare, mind-reading, language, laughter – these and other fascinating topics are discussed with transparent authority and abundant, up-to-date referencing throughout. I know of no volume remotely comparable in scope. As a textbook for undergraduate courses in evolutionary anthropology and psychology, it stands in a class of its own.

Academics are much like other people. We need our tribal loyalties, cementing these by starkly polarizing debate in terms of bloody combat between 'us' and 'them'. Barrett, Dunbar, and Lybett decline this temptation. Partisans of science – and in particular, of formal mathematical modelling so as to generate testable predictions – they also acknowledge companion methods and seek to give each camp its due, quoting accurately and seeking a synthesis wherever possible. With respect to the 'modularity' debate, for example, they conclude that 'mind' surely is 'modular' in some sense – but that human mental architecture was not fixed for all time among our prehistoric ancestors. Yes, within about nine minutes of birth, human infants respond positively to face-like stimuli. But no, this is not evidence for a fixed or permanent 'face-processing module'. Instead, stimulated by subsequent experience, a population of cells in each child will become progressively modularized for faces – or alternatively for bird-watching or spotting motor cars, as the case may be (pp. 279–80). In short, each of us acquires our uniquely modularized mind as a result of developmental processes, the outcome being intimately bound up with cultural transmission and learning (pp. 279–81).

The cover photograph of this excellent volume is captioned 'Pilgrims praying at the base of the 18-ft statue of Lord Bahubali'. This brings me to my only criticism. The relevance of the illustration escapes me. Prayer to supernatural

beings is the one topic surely *not* suitable for a cover illustration in this case. Religion is mentioned nowhere in the volume, not featuring even in the index. Pascal Boyer's psychological efforts in this area – such as his *Religion explained* (2001) – are completely overlooked, as are my own and all other evolutionary contributions to this field. Consistently with this extraordinary omission, the authors fail to discriminate between 'culture' (possessed by humans along with other species) and 'symbolic culture' (unique to humans). Over the years, I have become resigned to this apparent blind spot in the work of Dunbar and his colleagues, but it never ceases to amaze.

CHRIS KNIGHT

University of East London

MAGEO, JEANNETTE (ed.). *Power and the self*. xi, 221 pp., bibliogr. Cambridge: Univ. Press, 2002. £45.00 (cloth), £15.95 (paper)

Almost a decade ago I briefly reviewed an excellent book entitled *New directions in psychological anthropology* by Schwartz et al. (1992). The book suggested that the new approach would entail putting 'people in biology' and reaffirming the 'mindful body' (not that ordinary people outside academia had ever conceived of the person as a disembodied ego or the emotions as purely a social construct!), as well as making links with psychoanalysis and critiquing psychiatry – none of which were particularly new or original. I joked that the likes of Laing, Goffman, and Foucault had critiqued the 'medical model' of psychiatry some thirty years before and suggested that, rather than instituting a remarriage with psychoanalysis, psychological anthropology might be better served by building bridges with history and the social sciences generally. Interestingly, although Foucault was then all the rage in sociology and cultural studies, he was hardly mentioned in the whole book.

Engaging in what Roy D'Andrade has aptly described as 'agenda hopping', some members of the clan have now turned their attention to 'the neglected topic of power' – the ways in which power is experienced by individual people. The outcome is another interesting collection of essays from the psychological anthropology clan, edited by Jeannette Mageo. Like the earlier collection, the essays are lucid and engaging, theoretically informed, and grounded in either ethnographic research or personal experiences. In a highly laudatory preface, Gananath Obeyesekere describes the collection of papers as powerful, original, and inspiring. Phew!

In a useful introduction, Mageo and Knauth outline their project, the bringing-together of two 'rich traditions' – critical theory (Marxism) and psychological anthropology – to 'map' initially the 'space' between the intellectual hori-

zons of 'power' and the 'self'. Key figures who have allegedly attempted to bring the issues of power and the self together are briefly discussed: Gramsci, Marcuse, Foucault, Bakhtin, Bourdieu. But, of course, over the past fifty years or so many scholars have explored the relationship between power and the psychology of individuals, even though they may not have focused specifically on unique persons (self), and the following come to mind – Fromm, Reich (both of whom attempted to mediate the intellectual divide between Marxism and psychoanalysis long before Marcuse became interested in Freud), Laing, Wright Mills, Goffman, Bettelheim, Elias, Giddens, Taylor, and the Comaroffs. As one ought to make a clear distinction between cultural conceptions of the person (ideological, religious, legal, moral) – which my own book was all about – and the personhood and subjectivity of unique individual humans (self), studies of the relationship between 'power' and the 'self' (so understood) can only be biographical (or autobiographical), as indeed are many of the essays in this collection.

Foucault famously declared that 'the individual is the product of power'. According to his friend Deleuze, this was a profound insight. By the 'individual' Foucault meant either the ideological conception of the individual articulated in Cartesian metaphysics and early bourgeois political theory – the 'abstract' individual or epistemological 'subject' (individuated, monadic, asocial, detached), in which case Foucault was not saying anything new or original. (Indeed, bourgeois individualism had been lampooned by Marx and Bakunin in the middle of the nineteenth century and critiqued by social scientists for more than a century.) Or he (Foucault) meant the unique individual (self), in which case he seems to deny human agency. (As Strauss and Quinn have suggested, if you substitute 'culture' for 'power' in Foucault's writings, his statements sound very much like Benedict's classic culture-and-personality theory!) Mageo and Knauth in fact suggest that not only are Foucault's concepts of 'episteme' and 'resistance' rather ghostly entities, but that the subject rarely appears as an agent in his work. Marxists and sociologists have been critiquing Foucault on this issue for over a decade. It is, however, difficult to conceive how you could have resistance without agency. The trouble with Foucault, as with many of the contributors to the present collection (who tend to follow his path in their emphasis on 'epistemic power' to the neglect of economic and political structures), is that resistance and agency are never theorized adequately, and both are seen in a very individualistic fashion, even though, like power itself, they are intrinsically social. Thus there appears to be no mention in the essays of 'counter-hegemonic discourses' (noted in the introduction) or any sense that people resist power not only as the 'lone ranger', or the 'body', or through 'psychic power', or pathologically (by

becoming mad, hysterical, or destructive), but through social organizations and social movements. The body, even conceived as a social being, may be the likely 'nexus' of personal resistance and agency (so we are told), but in real life resistance and agency are expressed in social contexts, involving diverse groups and associations. Given their biographical emphasis, such forms of social resistance are hardly explored in the present book. Indeed, most of the essays, though interesting in themselves, never engage with the critical Marxists who are heralded in the introduction.

The collection of papers themselves – eight in all – is very diverse and I can merely outline their content briefly and schematically here: a theoretical reflection on genocide and everyday violence and her mother's predicament in a state nursing-home (Schepers-Hughes); an account of interviews with a man who suffered from 'neurotic depression' and who had no stable sense of self (Lachicotte); a Lacanian analysis of 'action man' toys and heroes which engage the fantasy of a young boy (the author's son), in which I learned that the phallus is a symbolic representation of power and not an actual penis (!) (Allison); a sensitive account of the experiences of a Turkish woman in Holland (Ewing); an analysis of conceptions of the 'self' among the Rawa of Papua New Guinea, focusing specifically on two men who exhibit 'normative schizophrenia' (Dalton); a detailed historical account of changing conceptions of gender/self in Samoa (Mageo); the problems encountered by a ritual elder among the Mountain Ok culture, also of Papua New Guinea, and which affirmed that ritual power is ambiguous (hardly news to Ioan Lewis!) (Whitehead); and, finally, an interesting survey of the varied feminist writings on emotions (Lutz).

Although 'power' for Foucault has a rather totalizing quality, it is quite evident from his writings that power for this anarchist scholar meant not only epistemic power, but capitalism and the power of the modern state – power that was not only concentrated and coercive but percolated into the very fabric of social life. It is worth noting that both these latter forms of power are beyond the purview of most of the essays noted above. I also find it interesting that, in attempting to reorientate psychological anthropology towards issues of power (which is commendable), Mageo and Knauf pay tribute to such fashionable academic icons as Bakhtin, Foucault, and Gramsci (also commendable), yet, surprisingly, hardly bother to engage with home-grown theorists of power like Wolf, Chomsky, and Gutman – but then they belong to a different clan! Had they done so, they would never have theorized the notion that the individual 'self' is the 'site' where resistance takes place – a position similar to that which Bettelheim suggested long ago. Critical theorists and socialists have a very different conception of power and resistance – both are fundamentally

social, which is not to deny human agency and the self.

One final point. I found it interesting that we are again informed that the Melanesian (or Rawa) conception of the self (as a human agent) is fluid and flexible, embodied, contextually and historically engaged, and 'dividual' (that is, people have multiple or relational identities). I had the distinct impression that this describes the self-conceptions of people everywhere, Europeans included. The conflation of the Cartesian subject – monadic, fixed, bounded, detached, asocial (which is an ideological category) with the self-conceptions of ordinary living Europeans seems to me to be completely obfuscating. Even Deleuze recognized that the nomadic 'schizoid' personality that he celebrated – as if anyone has a fixed identity! – was not schizophrenic or completely 'fragmented', for the self has to have a certain coherence in order to function as a social being.

It would require a review article to deal adequately with the many issues and important insights that emerge from this interesting collection of essays, which constitutes yet another useful contribution to anthropological understanding from members of the psychological anthropology clan.

BRIAN MORRIS

Goldsmiths College

SHERIFF, ROBIN E. *Dreaming equality: color, race, and racism in urban Brazil*. x, 264 pp., bibliogr. London, New Jersey: Rutgers Univ. Press, 2001. \$60.00 (cloth), \$22.00 (paper)

In *Dreaming equality*, Robin E. Sheriff advances a compassionate and detailed ethnographic account of racism in Brazil. Focusing on Morro do Sangue Bom, one of the poorest Afro-Brazilian communities of Rio de Janeiro, Sheriff examines how a history of racial prejudice and discrimination has perpetuated the residents' poverty and political marginalization. In unravelling this community ethnography, Sheriff contextualizes their narratives by juxtaposing them against their White middle-class neighbours, as well as by foregrounding their voices with the multivocal political discourses of Rio de Janeiro Black Movement activists.

Sheriff's main ethnographic focus and method is employing 'discourse analysis on race' to understand her informants' bipolar discursive construction of race relations in Brazil. The strength of *Dreaming equality* lies behind the vivid accounts of everyday racist practices experienced by Blacks. Her account deconstructs the myth of racial democracy and delineates that it is an ideal and a dream, rather than a practice. Although most people in Brazil support the ideal of racial equality, in practice prejudice and discrimination against Blacks have become the norm and the government does little to change that situation.

Blacks are treated as a class of people who are only deemed worthy of service occupations, and when they are employed in blue- and white-collar jobs they are seldom promoted. *De facto* social segregation is also common, as Whites seldom socialize with Blacks, and for Whites interracial dating is a taboo. Whites rationalize the boundaries they construct by employing strategies ranging from racist discourses that naturalize White superiority to discourses that camouflage segregation by claiming slavery produced a social class structure that maintains the separation of the races.

Sheriff's book also offers a critical, yet sensitive psychological analysis of how racism impacts upon the self-perceptions of Black people. Blacks in Morro do Sangue Bom overwhelmingly concur that Blacks in Brazil associate beauty with Whiteness and a person is assigned higher social prestige the lighter they are. Many families discourage their mulatto and *moreno* children from marrying *negros* in an attempt to whiten the next generation. This practice is not based on self-hatred, but rather on pragmatic family politics that will ensure the next generation will be Whiter, and thus have a better chance of economic mobility.

An additional strength in Sheriff's book is her provocative analysis that 'silence' is a significant discursive sign. Sheriff found that Blacks in Morro do Sangue Bom seldom discuss within their families the history and causes of their racial oppression. She regards this silence as being a conscious strategy to contain their anger, and a way of protecting themselves from psychological pain. Likewise, she found that Whites do not talk about slavery in Brazil in order to erase any personal family connection with the past. In this way, because Whites believe they are blameless, they can ignore the suffering of Black people. Although Sheriff's conclusion is full of cultural meanings, her psychological analysis borders on reproducing a revised culture of poverty thesis that suggests because Blacks do not talk about racism they cannot fight it. Therefore, they are also to blame for their own problems.

Overall, Sheriff presents a well-scripted ethnography. At times, however, there are abrupt theoretical discontinuities. Critical statements or concepts are introduced and are left vague or not developed. In the introduction of the book and in chapters 1 and 2, Sheriff carefully details her methods, defines discourse terms, and explains that race is a social and not a biological concept. However, although throughout the text the term 'racialized' is also central, she does not define it, and she often changes its meaning. For example, the term 'racialized' is used as a vague bipolar Black-White reference (pp. 36, 217); at other times it is used in relation to White oppression (pp. 157, 202), yet it is also used in a contradictory manner to mark how Blackness is a rallying-point of peoplehood (p. 214). It is also difficult to discern how the term is used in the comments on global politics (p. 157). Given that

'racialized' is a central concept in the scholarship of 'critical race theory' and has a non-bipolar Black-White application, a definition would clarify Sheriff's theoretical position (see R. Delgado, *The Latino/a conditions: a critical reader*, 1997).

Another distraction in Sheriff's theoretical discussion deals with Whiteness. In chapter 6, Sheriff proposes that we need to decentre the study of racialized oppression by focusing on Whiteness. Without a doubt we need to 'study up', as she proposes. However, it is unclear why the focus on race relations should be Whiteness.

Overall, Sheriff's analysis offers an insightful critique of racism in Brazil and is a useful teaching resource on discursive ethnographic methods.

MARTHA MENCHACA

University of Texas, Austin

SKULTANS, VIEDA & JOHN COX (eds). *Anthropological approaches to psychological medicine: crossing bridges*. 303 pp., bibliogr. London, Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley Publishers, 2000. £14.95 (paper)

This set of essays explores different sorts of relationships between anthropology and psychiatry. One of its goals is to argue for a more culturally sensitive sort of psychiatry. The editors note that psychiatry has been drawn to anthropology because both disciplines involve personal encounters between scientific professionals and people whose perceived reality is strikingly different. Both fields are rooted in Enlightenment conceptions of science, although anthropology has begun to view human experience from a more postmodern, social construction of reality point of view. The introductory article by Sushrut Jadhav sets the stage by showing that 'depression' is a relatively new disease in Western culture, derived from the older diseases of guilt and melancholy. Guilt, which originally meant paying for an offence, merged with the Christian concept of sin to produce melancholy, characterized by black bile. In the nineteenth century, these earlier concepts were modified by scientific ideas about pressure, force, and energy, eventually to produce 'depression'. An even more recent disease, post traumatic stress syndrome (PTSD), is described by Vieda Skultans (p. 99). PTSD became widely recognized in the United States of America following the Vietnam War. It seemed to alleviate collective guilt about violence by making it an individual medical problem. Depression and PTSD are thus new diseases in Western culture, perhaps as dramatic as the well-known culture-bound syndromes discussed by Roland Littlewood (pp. 85-6). From the current point of view, disease categories in different cultures, although rooted in human biology, are always culturally defined and understood.

Skultans's essay on remembering and forgetting demonstrates the social construction of reality from another angle. She points out that it is difficult to hear what others are saying if we do not share a common social context. Victims of torture and sexually abused children may have been speaking for years, but only recently have we begun to listen carefully to them (p. 102). While psychiatry still assumes, Enlightenment fashion, that there are a set of facts out there to be discovered, anthropology has begun to explore the complex worlds of meaning which surround us, and which demand acute active listening skills to perceive.

Some of the volume's contributors have long clinical experience. Jane Jackson relates concepts from anthropology to her own work in England as a public health physician. She notes, for example, that in nursing-homes for the disabled or chronically ill, 'social death' often comes before physical death, reversing the procedure in traditional societies, in which physical death comes first, followed by rituals to comfort those left behind and draw the community together (p. 160). Her portrait of elderly people living alone in Britain is very moving. She notes that the poor, isolated widows she came to know were precisely the sort of people accused of witchcraft in earlier centuries (p. 167). Her insightful article underlines the similarities in human terms of fieldwork in anthropology and working in the field as a public health physician.

Ethnographically, the richest article is Maurice Eisenbruch's description of postnatal disorders in Cambodia, where he did fieldwork for ten years. He describes traditional healers' concepts of anatomy. The uterus, for example, is suspended by 'tubules' which are weak after childbirth, and must be given time to toughen up (p. 207). Some of the healers drew their anatomical concepts onto body outlines which Eisenbruch provided for them. After childbirth, women must rest on a bed suspended over a fire for several days. When they leave the 'bed of fire', they are at risk of fever and a kind of puerperal psychosis in which they cry out and talk deliriously. Traditional healers cure this condition in various ways, by using traditional medicines containing repellent substances, by reciting magical *pali* stanzas, and by drawing *yantra* or magical designs, of which Eisenbruch provides an example (p. 224). Eisenbruch's material, so rich in detail, cries out to be put into a more general explanatory framework.

Returning to Western biomedicine, Simon Sinclair uses Bourdieu's concept of 'dispositions' to describe how medical students learn their profession. The disposition of Status is emphasized early in their training, to mark themselves off as special individuals. Knowledge, acquired by intense study, and Experience with patients in the hospital are the dispositions which create Status. Status in turn is tempered by Responsibility for patients' welfare, and by Idealism. Openly expressed Co-operation co-exists with

an underlying Competition for grades and Status. In fact, Sinclair notes that, when the point of choosing medical specialties arrives, psychiatry is always recognized as having very low Status. This is because it is short of proper Knowledge, and because there can be only limited Responsibility for these sorts of patients (pp. 264-5). Sinclair's paper, developed out of Howard Becker's classic study of medical training, seems to me acute and perceptive.

In a collection from so many authors, and covering many diverse topics, quality and readability inevitably vary. Occasional lapses into jargon make it heavy going. For example, 'the ascription of difference to devalued status is based on a scale of evaluation that is itself a product of group identity, but therefore susceptible to change and adaptation' (p. 249). This seems to translate as: 'the role of being mentally ill is a social construct susceptible to change'. Nevertheless, there are many insights and nuggets of value in this collection. Maurice Lipsedge reminds us how badly psychiatry needs anthropology's insights, noting that 'race' is still being listed as an important factor influencing behaviour in an authoritative psychiatry textbook from the 1990s (p. 286). This book should contribute to the ongoing dialogue between the two fields.

PHILIP A. DENNIS

Texas Tech University

Archaeology

PILLSBURY, JOANNE (ed.), *Moche art and archaeology in ancient Peru*. 343 pp., maps, tables, plates, illus., bibliogr. London, New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 2002. £40.00 (cloth)

This handsome volume contains fifteen papers given by leading Peruvian and North American Moche scholars at the two-day symposium, 'Moche: art and political representation in Ancient Peru', held at the Center for Advanced Study in the Visual Arts, National Gallery of Art, Washington DC in 1999. To have published such a well-edited and illustrated volume of papers two years after the symposium is no mean achievement, and the papers by the Peruvian contributors are particularly welcome. The quality of the printing of the text, illustrations, and colour plates is excellent. Pillsbury's introduction outlines very well the current state of Moche studies, emphasizing how recent archaeological excavations and iconographic studies have refuted earlier unitary models of the Moche.

Quilter's paper, which follows Pillsbury's introduction, considers the nature of Moche architectural art and contrasts it with that of Chavin. He concludes that while Moche artists were influenced by Chavin's artistic conventions

they added a human dimension to their art. Uceda's piece on investigations at the Huaca de La Luna is a clear, well-illustrated description of important fieldwork carried out by Peruvian archaeologists at this major Moche structure, demonstrating how the Huaca de Luna was built sequentially. Chapdelaine's paper on the urban Moche class draws on evidence from his recent excavations in the urban zone of Moche between the Huacas Sol and Luna. Among his conclusions is that the Moche urban population was heterogeneous, based on burial evidence. Bourget's paper about the rituals of sacrifice is based on his excavations at the Huaca de Luna and presents a thought-provoking analysis of Moche human sacrifice using osteological, iconographic, and documentary evidence. Verano's, on Moche warfare and death, uses evidence from both osteology and iconography. He urges caution in interpreting scenes of Moche combat, citing examples from Maya and Aztec iconography which refer to specific events. Donnan's succinct paper on Moche ceramic portraits is generously illustrated with photos from his extensive Moche archive, and the author convincingly argues that the Moche portrayed individuals at different stages in their lives, some of whom may have been captured and sacrificed. Galvez and Briceño's contribution about the Moche in the Chicama Valley concentrates mainly on describing recent excavations at the Huaca Cao Viejo, the authors showing that the Moche abandoned the Chicama Valley after Phase IV, while Russell and Jackson's piece about political economy and patronage at Cerro Mayal in the Chicama Valley uses ceramics made at Cerro Mayal to suggest that the distribution of ceramics was embedded in the local Moche hierarchy.

Shimada's paper on late Moche urban craft production draws on his work at Pampa Grande. After a very comprehensive and detailed paper, his nine conclusions include the proposition that at least some workshops were engaged in multiple crafts. Jones provides a useful survey of Moche metalwork, but all but one of her relatively few illustrations are from collections in the northeastern United States. Alva's contribution on the very important Moche Sipán tombs explores the relationship between the costumes and the grave goods found there and the exercise of power by the 'lords' of Sipán, showing how the emphasis on dominance on Sipán imagery was crucial to the maintenance of political authority, while Cordy-Collins's straightforward and well-illustrated paper on labretted ladies uses evidence from figurines and ceramics to suggest that a group of foreign women may have come into the Moche area from the Piura-Chira area in the eighth century AD. The contribution by Dillchay on late Moche 'Town and country' in the Jequetepeque and Zaña valleys suggests that Moche society was more complex than the 'elite' models, the author postulating that the late Moche people moved around, aban-

doning settlements for reasons that are not yet known. Bawden's paper on the symbols of late Moche social transformation draws extensively on his work at the late Moche site of Galindo and argues for a 'new and dominant alien ideology' (p. 303), but this is mainly defined on the evidence of new ceramic forms. Castillo concludes the volume with a study of the Moche occupation of Lambayeque, centred round his excavations at San José de Moro in which he shows that the five-phase Moche sequence developed further south does not apply in Lambayeque where the late Moche peoples interacted with Wari influence.

In her introduction, Pillsbury claims that 'the papers in this volume represent an admirable step forward in Moche studies' (p. 16). Certainly, this book bears out that claim and while, as she freely admits, there is still not 'a consensus on the nature of the Moche' (p. 16), this volume represents a landmark in Moche studies.

GEORGE BANKES

University of Manchester

ROTHMAN, MITCHELL S. (ed.). *Uruk Mesopotamia and its neighbours: cross-cultural interactions in the era of state formation*. xxi, 556 pp., maps, figs., tables, diagrs., illus., bibliogr. Oxford: James Currey/Santa Fe: School of American Research Press, 2002. £45.00 (cloth), £16.95 (paper)

In many ways the closure of Iraq to Western archaeologists has been unfortunate. And yet this interruption in fieldwork has given archaeologists time to examine data from this region more closely than would normally be possible. Another benefit has been the tendency for those who originally worked in southern Mesopotamia to shift the focus of fieldwork into southeastern Turkey and Syria, thereby shedding light on the roles these regions played in the evolution of Mesopotamian society. This is clearly seen in this volume, which was a result of a conference organized by Mitchell Rothman as part of the School of American Research Advanced Seminar Series.

This volume seeks to understand the nature of the expansion and eventual collapse of Uruk influence out of the alluvial plains of southern Mesopotamia into the peripheral regions of Greater Mesopotamia (Syria, western Iran, southeastern Anatolia, and northern Iraq) during the late Chalcolithic period (c.3700–3100) and attempts to understand how it impacted on complex societies in these regions. To a large extent, this volume represents a response to Guillermo Algaze's (*The Uruk world system*, 1993) modified use of Wallerstein's (*The modern world system*, 1974) world-system model. He argues that state societies which emerged in southern Mesopotamia early in the fourth millennium BC needed materials such as wood, stone, and metals

that were scarce on the alluvium but available in the surrounding highlands. This led to the development of colonies and trade outposts in the peripheries, thereby drawing them into exchange relations with southern Mesopotamia and resulting in increased prosperity and social complexity among the peripheral groups. During the late fourth millennium BC, southern Uruk states experienced a period of decline and a collapse of exchange networks. Because of their dependence on trade relations with the south, this brought a decline in prosperity and complexity throughout the peripheral regions as well. Alagaze's model has been influential because it recognizes that connections among the different sub-regions of Greater Mesopotamia were potential catalysts for development and change. Thus his model goes far in providing a plausible explanation for the Uruk expansion and its collapse. However, his model is not without its problems. It is now clear that many peripheral societies had already achieved a great deal of complexity on their own prior to the Uruk expansion. Furthermore, evidence suggests that Uruk society in the south was not a homogeneous or united entity and probably did not have the ability to control regions very far from the southern core area.

Whether or not one agrees with Alagaze, one cannot deny the influence his model has had on understanding the Uruk expansion. Most of the papers in this volume engage Alagaze's ideas in one way or another. A reformulation of Alagaze's model sets the pace for most of the other papers. Chapters by Henry Wright, Hans Nissen, and Susan Pollock address the nature of the data available from southern Mesopotamia, Khuzistan, and the Susiana plain and provide a detailed picture of southern Uruk society. Nissen's chapter also gives a good historical overview of political, economic, and social interactions throughout Greater Mesopotamia prior to and after the Uruk expansion. Chapters by Glenn Schwartz, Gil Stein, Marcella Frangipane, and Mitchell Rothman discuss the nature of society in the peripheral regions of northeastern Syria, southeastern Anatolia, northern Iraq. These chapters also provide an excellent discussion of the evidence for pre-Uruk complexity in these northern regions. Holly Pitman addresses the late Chalcolithic glyptic evidence (seals and sealings used for administrative purposes) found throughout Greater Mesopotamia. Henry Wright and E. Rupley discuss the radiocarbon data concerning the timing of the expansion and its collapse. Terence D'Altroy, an Andeanist, concludes the volume by comparing the Uruk data with data on Inka state-formation in the Andes of South America. He also raises a number of provocative issues and questions based on his work that could help guide future research on the Uruk.

The various papers in this volume do not present a unified explanation for the Uruk

expansion and its collapse. Rather, they provide a well-thought-out range of possible explanations and give a solid framework for further study once the core region of southern Mesopotamian is once again open for archaeological work. Although this volume is anthropological in its approach, with anthropologists as its primary audience, it is highly recommended to anyone with a general interest in social evolution, interactions at cultural boundaries, and the nature of colonial systems.

BRIAN L. PEASNALL

University of Pennsylvania

SILVERMAN, HELAINE & DONALD A. PROULX.

The Nasca. xix, 339 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. Oxford, Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishing, 2002. £55.00 (cloth), £19.99 (paper)

Andeanists should welcome this addition to the series devoted to single prehistoric societies. The volume covers an aesthetically spectacular art style from the near southern Peruvian coast, dated to AD 100–700. The writing is smooth and readable, despite widely recurrent themes; the mild jargon is in postmodernist 'landscapes', and the coverage is very extensive in cultural aspects, and intensive in including both history and content of the archaeological treatment. Much will be of considerable interest to both specialists and students, as well as the general public.

Alfred Kroeber and his student Anna Gayton established an initial ceramic chronology using a simple but robust quantitative trait correlation matrix, highly unique and inventive for its 1927 date, but subsequently studiously ignored. Convergently, Lawrence Dawson used the same basic relationships in a non-quantitative manner to derive the detailed eight-phase 'Berkeley' stylistic seriation about 1956, later elaborated by various others, including Proulx; many will especially appreciate this first inclusive presentation. Although the lack of colour photos is unfortunate, it is not critical to the seriation.

'Life in the desert' highlights adaptations in a rainless climate, with year-round agriculture based on the irrigation of valley flood plains plus the unusual tunnelling for sub-surface water. Subsistence and technological practices and resources are well covered, as are environmental threats from ENSO, hydrological and tectonic disruptions.

'We, the Nasca' is an interesting catch-all inclusion of physical type, language (and cognition?), dress, gender differences, textile and pottery production, musical instruments, and head-hunting, ending with discussion of Nasca-style influences in neighbouring valleys to the north, these not reaching upper Ica until Phases 3–4.

'The inhabited landscape' considers building and site types in the eight distinct Nasca drainages. Ordered by phase, recent work by Browne and Reindel and Isla in the northern branches is noted, as is the continuing work of Schreiber and Orifici. Cahuachi, a line of pyramid-like terraced constructions along the river-bordering hills, is introduced strictly as a pilgrimage ritual centre. Obvious monumental/ritual/elite architecture is rare elsewhere, but large agglutinated occupational sites, often on terraced slopes, are common, some with low platforms of potential special function; the authors apparently prefer the term 'village' for these.

'Symbolic expressions of the natural and supernatural world' gives an unusual coverage of studies of ideological interpretations, from Joyce, Putnam, Seler to Schleiser. Identification of supernaturals, a specialty of Proulx, follows; then the famous 'Nasca lines' or geoglyphs. Ritual practices and paraphernalia are considered first in terms of archaeological materials and depictions, then through a lengthy discussion of attempts at reconstructing ideological content, including those (often divergent) of the co-authors themselves. Following this coverage of head-hunting and warfare extends this emphasis on ideology.

The important chapter on socio-political organization considers all types of ethnohistorical Andean organizational principles, and Silverman, as previously, skirts the chiefdom/state village/city dichotomies cautiously: Cahuachi as a non-urban, ritual pilgrimage centre follows a long-held interpretation, while Silverman thinks her Ventilla site might be a paired, moiatal 'urban' political centre. A confederation of chiefdoms is Silverman's interpretation, though surprisingly she dismisses Reindel and Isla's Palpa site as a regional political centre. Socio-economic class-level differentiation is not clear, there being too many potential elites, oddly enough. A societal break is noted after the Phase 3-4 apogee of Cahuachi, with a non-centralized reorganization leading to Phase 7, while the final chapter traces the last of the Nasca-style tradition in Phases 8 and 9, under strong stylistic and physical intrusions of Wari-related highlanders.

A (dis)advantage of reviewing familiar subjects is having preformed criticisms. Mine are that (1) proving the negative – Cahuachi being a low-population ritual site – has inherent problems (think Moche); (2) both the chiefdom/state and urban/non-urban models are abstractly understandable but problematic in borderline cases, as here, especially with confederacies, whose levels of expectable accomplishments are undetermined and, to me, underrated; (3) while agreeing to little Nasca presence north of Ica, Silverman still claims Nasca 1-2 in upper Ica, overlooking the fact that the north-south valley extremes are further apart than each, respectively, is from central Pisco and northern

Nasca; and (4) Carmen (which I defined in 1959 from Cañete to Pisco) was never presented as being Nasca-derived, although the urban Dos Palmas assemblage showed more Nasca influence – hardly surprising, given its location at the head of the road to Ica. Despite this, the book is a feast for all.

DWIGHT T. WALLACE

California Institute for Peruvian Studies

Biological anthropology

ECKHARDT, ROBERT B. *Human paleobiology*. xiii, 350 pp., tables, diagrs., bibliogr. Cambridge: Univ. Press, 2000. £52.50 (cloth)

Robert B. Eckhardt wastes no time in setting a daunting challenge for himself in *Human paleobiology*: the 'reconstruction of earlier humans as living members of populations, adapted to particular ecological niches, as real in every respect as the various animal species that are our contemporaries, or as real as ourselves'. Whereas he does not quite achieve that lofty goal in this seminal text, he certainly succeeds in establishing the framework by which biological anthropologists, and particularly palaeoanthropologists, can gain more useful insights from our fossilized past. Thus Eckhardt's true challenge is set for his peers to synthesize the 'palaeo' with more from what we know of contemporary biology.

A science of palaeobiology is the perfect antidote to palaeoanthropology's inordinate focus on naming taxa and building phylogenies. Eckhardt carefully builds his case with historical insights, noting that the naming of most major categories of fossil hominids was done in a theoretical vacuum, that is, before the evolutionary synthesis of the 1920s. To some extent palaeoanthropology has persisted with the antiquated taxonomic focus – one that would clearly change with a palaeobiological focus. For example, by decoupling molecular and morphological rates of evolution and looking at our evolutionary lineage devoid of fossils, it becomes clear that recently proposed 'bushy' phylogenies probably need to be pruned considerably.

Eckhardt takes a population biology approach to breathe life into the fossils. Variability among people, papionines, and *Pan* are used to assess how variable early hominid populations may have been. Contemporary behavioural, physiological, and developmental adaptations among those groups set the bounds for analysing phenotypic plasticity for the hominid populations, again throwing the multiplicity of named taxa into question. Genetic distance data are used to delve into hominid diversity issues further.

Exemplary scholarship is exhibited throughout *Human paleobiology*, with citations ranging from morphological analyses by Thomas Huxley to the genetics of J.B.S. Haldane, through to a pivotal assessment of Clifford Jolly's baboon research and Phillip Tobias's palaeoanthropology. That is not so remarkable in and of itself; how seamlessly Eckhardt accomplishes the task is.

This book should be read by every graduate student studying biological anthropology, as well as by their professors. Eckhardt's insights are occasionally astonishing, sometimes well established in the literature, and always on the mark. Whereas the book could benefit from a glossary for the students who will repeatedly return to this text, the lucid and almost poetic writing style will carry them along. Eckhardt is highly skilled in interweaving science history with contemporary theory. It is not always clear from the outset where his historical peregrinations are headed, but once he gets to his point you understand the route.

The only ones who will have difficulty reading, or accepting, what Eckhardt has to say are those with a penchant for distinguishing evolutionary species by anatomical minutia – their approach gets pilloried with primate populations every few pages. But this recurrent theme is only part of the treasure Eckhardt lays before us. He also seems to have a deeper understanding of evolutionary dynamics than the average palaeoanthropologist, and effectively offers the 'big picture' of human palaeobiology. But, as he acknowledges in his preface: 'Much more remains to be done.'

Has Eckhardt reset the palaeoanthropologist's agenda? Only time will tell. Meanwhile, read the book carefully, and refer back to it often.

JEFFREY K. MCKEE

Ohio State University

SALZANO, FRANCISCO M. & MARIA CÁTIRA BORTOLINI. *The evolution and genetics of Latin American populations*. xvi, 512 pp., tables, bibliogr. Cambridge: Univ. Press, 2001. £60.00 (cloth)

This is a useful volume that provides a wealth of data on the history, historical demography, and genetics of Latin American populations, particularly Brazil. The close to 2,500 references are in themselves an important source of information. The extensive tables are also a useful summary format for providing information on different countries and topics. The data in this ambitious volume are based on over forty years of work by Francisco Salzano in the field of population genetics in Latin America, while Maria Cátila Bortolini contributed to the analyses of these data in more recent times.

The first chapter deals with 'Origins'. The brief discussion of the source of New World populations is relevant but could have been

expanded considerably, while the review of European and African prehistory seems less pertinent to the major focus of the volume. Chapter 2, on 'Environment and history', provides an overview of events in the history of Latin America and socio-demographic data on various Latin American countries in tabular form. Such data would have been more useful to the central task of the chapter if it had focused more on population history rather than historical events.

Chapter 3, on 'Socioeconomic indices, demography and population structure', is much more biological and substantive in its focus on historical demography. Much of the data pertains to Brazil, but there is a good review of data on inbreeding and isonymy for the region. The tables summarizing sources of information on migration in Latin America and in Brazil and studies of isonymy in Latin America are particularly useful. The text portion of chapter 4 ('Ecology, nutrition and physiologic adaptation', is somewhat cursory, but the tables at the end of the chapter summarizing growth studies in Latin America are quite informative, and the strength of chapter 5 ('Morphology') is also mainly in the tables at the end. Chapter 6, on 'Health and disease', provides a brief overview of a broad field with excellent tables which contain considerable genetic data summarizing studies on a number of topics.

Chapter 7, on 'Hemoglobin types and hemoglobinopathies', contains information on genetic distances among Latin American populations, in a world-wide population context, based on beta S-globin and beta A-globin haplotype diversity. The tables are also a rich source of information on population genetics in Latin America based on hemoglobin data. Chapter 8, on 'Normal genetic variation at the protein, glycoconjugate and DNA levels', also provides information on a variety of topics – including the D1S80 nuclear DNA polymorphism, mitochondrial DNA variability, and Y chromosome variability – mostly in Brazil, and has particularly extensive and useful tables at the end. The text of Chapter 9, on 'Gene dynamics', is quite general, but, again, the tables at the end of the chapter are extensive and informative.

In summary, this is a useful volume that presents a considerable amount of information on health-related studies and on the genetics of Latin American populations, particularly Brazil. Although the authors cover a wide variety of topics, there is not much overall synthesis and there is little or no discussion of major theoretical issues in population genetics. Overall, the volume presents an overview of genetic studies of Latin American populations and is a good reference for primary sources on this topic.

LAWRENCE S. GREENE

University of Massachusetts, Boston

General

BELLÉR-HANN, ILDIKÓ & CHRIS HANN. *Turkish region: state, market and social identities on the East Black Sea coast*. xii, 244 pp., maps, illus., bibliogr. Oxford: James Currey; Santa Fe: School of American Research Press, 2001. £40.00 (cloth), £16.95 (paper)

Turkish region, co-authored by Beller-Hann and Hann, is an anthropological study of a region on the Black Sea coast of Turkey. Coming at a time when anthropology is becoming increasingly theoretical and integrated into the wider field of cultural studies, it is something of a surprise. At first glance, it seems a throwback to traditional ethnography. Unfortunately, this is not the case, since the authors provide only the most general information about the region, and the reader acquires hardly any feel for the place or for the people who live there. *Turkish region* is also weak in its attempts to tie the different chapters together and to place the description of the region within the context of wider theoretical debates on nationalism, civil society, religion, and ethnicity. This weakness stems largely from the limitations of the book's Gellnerian perspective.

In defining the region of study, the authors use the term 'Lazistan', which derives from the name of an Ottoman sub-province (*sancak*). However, as the authors themselves point out, this term is not used in contemporary Turkey, nor do the inhabitants of the region view themselves as a cohesive unit. This makes the use of this historical term problematic, and underlines the arbitrary way in which the authors have defined the region of study. The authors' way of coming to terms with this dilemma is to problematize the culture concept in anthropology on the one hand, and to subscribe to a Gellnerian modernization perspective on the other. While the authors are correct in problematizing the culture concept in anthropology, they seem to have found little with which to replace traditional ethnography. They claim that the aim of the book is 'to illuminate the complexities of the Kemalist society by describing how the modernity it has brought has been experienced by "ordinary people"' (p. 20). While this is certainly a laudable goal, the book falls short of fulfilling it. The authors merely conclude that the Kemalist modernization project has largely succeeded, since the inhabitants of the region identify with a national culture in Gellnerian terms. However, by avoiding a discussion of politically volatile issues and side-stepping the highly conflictual debate on national and local identities in contemporary Turkey, the authors reduce a highly complex and dynamic situation to one seemingly characterized by harmony and consensus. The reader is left wondering the degree to which these 'foreign' researchers made

close contact with the 'natives', given the wide debate in Turkish society today on national identity and its relationship to local and historical identities.

Given the dearth of ethnographic research in contemporary Turkey, and the cultural diversity of the Eastern Black Sea region, *Turkish region* is a study that raises high expectations which it unfortunately fails to fulfil.

LEYLA NEYZI

Sabanci University

CONNOR, LINDA H. & GEOFFREY SAMUEL (eds).

Healing powers and modernity: traditional medicine, shamanism, and science in Asian societies. x, 283 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. London, Westport: Bergin & Garvey, 2001. £58.95 (cloth)

This intriguing and eclectic book covers diverse Asian societies without trying to be fully representative. The range includes majority and minority groups, beginning with healing 'in the modern state' in Korea, Malaysia, and India. Part 2 covers healing 'on the margins', featuring the Temiar of the Malaysian rainforest, Iban of Sarawak, Sasak of Indonesia, and Naxi of China's southwest. The volume concludes with three varied contexts for the practice of Tibetan medicine, in Tibet and North India. Each case raises questions concerning the interrelation of politics, power, modernity, and healing. While the authors privilege traditional medicine, most also deal deftly with the ways modernity, in the form of cosmopolitan or biomedicine, has impinged on or influenced traditional practices and concepts. A major message, as Linda Connor explains in her introduction, is that issues of illness and healing are embedded in politics in diverse ways. This begs a larger question, however, of whether the mega-category 'Asia' is a useful construct, and why.

Laurel Kendall's perceptive essay shows how personal stories of Korean patients, shamans, and apprentices are 'swallowed up in a larger national story' when healing becomes public performance, complete with microphones. The shifting fate of shamanic reputation has revealing implications for Korean definitions of modernity and superstition. Carol Lademan brings readers deeply into a Malay community where competing definitions of shamanic authenticity create discord. She suggests Malaysians are not alone in their anguished explorations of 'alternative medicine'. Kalpana Ram discusses Indian midwives as 'culture brokers', and effectively critiques 'colonial medicine'. She suggests that 'finely graded distinctions' should be made to transcend the old-fashioned dichotomy of science versus religion. Mark Nichter cleverly turns Indian preoccupation with digestion into an elegant metaphor concerning the politics of health and ecology.

Ethnomusicologist Marina Roseman leads the second section with her poetic and poignant description of the Temiar, whose forest once provided refuge but is now violated by 'land-grabs' and lumbering. Asking 'Can songs suture the wounds?', she argues that 'spirit practices – these imaginative realms of dream and song – are critical sites for the engagement of local peoples with global practices'. Amanda Harris analyses spirit healing in Iban longhouses by moving from focus on the ritual specialist to the healing context. Both authors offer insights into processes of resistance, co-option, appropriation, and partial Islamization. Cynthia Hunter suggests fundamentalist Islam has superseded syncretic Islam for many Sasak of East Lombok island. Yet she concludes that sorcery provides 'continuity of meaning from pre-Islamic times to the present'.

Sydney White discusses how Naxi (a Tibetan-Burmese group) negotiate Chinese narratives of modernity and a Chinese nationalism that compartmentalizes them as a backward 'minority nationality'. 'Civilizing' is a delicate matter of multifaceted perceptions, as Craig Janes indicates as well. Janes explains 'at no time did Tibetan medicine lose its state legitimacy', but he leaves open the question of whether Chinese take their medical complaints to Tibetan doctors. Significantly, he argues that Tibetan medicine has become a 'safe' setting for expressions of Tibetan identity. (Art Kleinman's medical anthropology of China provides further perspective for these chapters.)

The final chapters shift focus from Tibetan identity to medical practice. Vincanne Adams adds gender sensitivity to our understanding of (and respect for) Tibetan medicine. Geoffrey Samuels, based on work with Linda Connor, concludes that Tibetan medicine is relatively more 'pragmatic' than 'spiritual' in the exile community of North India. While this requires further documentation, his essay reinforces Adam's conclusion that 'religion and science are taking on new meanings'.

In sum, a synthetic conclusion could have drawn larger lessons from these chapters. But each (re)affirms separately, as Sydney White phrases it, that 'medical pluralism ... is the politics of therapeutic practice'.

MARJORIE MANDELSTAM BALZER

Georgetown University

DANET, BRENDA. *Cyberpl@y: communicating online*. xviii, 418 pp., tables, illus., bibliogr. Oxford, New York: Berg Publishers, 2001. £42.99 (cloth), £15.99 (paper)

This book is an attempt at presenting an ethnography of playful communication on the internet. Arguing that electronic communication is a medium that lies between speaking and writing, Danet addresses the question of what happens to patterns of inscribed communication when they

lose their 'artefactual' nature and become digital and multimedia. Evidence as to why communication on-line is playful is presented through analysis of e-mail style, virtual theatrical performances, 'cyber-greetings', various forms of computerized art, Internet Relay Chat (IRC), and font design and collation. Perhaps anticipating the criticism that most of the forms of electronic communication discussed in this book have changed radically since the research material was collated, the descriptions of such communication are also intended as an historical record of the transition from text-only to multimedia communication. In this sense, this book is written with an eye on the future in order to provide later generations of researchers with an understanding of changes in communication patterns during the 1990s.

The central question raised by the book is an interesting one: why is it that communication on-line is so often light-hearted, jovial, and playful? The research material presented ranges from the banal to the enchanting. At the former end of the spectrum is a laborious analysis of e-mail correspondence (chap. 2); while at the other are accounts of the typed simulation of smoking marijuana and real time performances of Shakespeare's *Hamlet* ('Hamnet') on-line (chap. 3). The following, from *Hamlet*, 3. 1, is an example of what Danet means by 'playful':

To be, or not to be: that is the question:
Whether 'tis nobler in the mind to suffer
The slings and arrows of outrageous
fortune,

...
The heart-ache and the thousand natural
shocks
That flesh is heir to, 'tis a consummation
Devoutly to be wish'd. To die, to sleep

In the on-line 'Hamnet' production this becomes:

2B | !2B ... the question.
Whether tis nobler in the mind
To suffer the splits and lags
That net is hair to
Tis a logoffing to be devoutly wished
To lag, to split no more

This is undoubtedly 'playful' à la Huizinga's *Homo ludens*, but what explanations does Danet give for this phenomenon? The primary reason presented is that electronic communication is 'interactive' and therefore is also totally absorbing, and is experienced as an extension of the self. Furthermore, the magical 'quality of instant efficaciousness' allows communicators to lose track of time and get instant feed-back from choices. In this sense, the atmosphere is at once theatrical and carnivalesque, having roots in the subversive, ironic, and dry nature of hacker culture, as personal details are masked and the absence of non-verbal and other social and ma-

terial evidence leads to the suggestion of other selves and identities.

While all this is in part true, there is a sense with this book that playful elements of internet communication have been taken to show that the internet is playful. There is no discussion of the internet as a medium of delivering voyeuristic pornography – playful or otherwise; neither is there any discussion of the ways in which the internet has profoundly expanded the capacity of bureaucracy to perpetuate itself. There is an increasing amount of evidence, most obviously from the private sector, that, for those who use information technology in the workplace, electronic communication is becoming oppressive, burdensome, and unproductive (as a medium). Could it be that since the mid-nineties, when the bulk of the research in this book was conducted, the use of communication technology has taken on an entirely less playful gait as it has been incorporated into public and private working culture? If so, the next question should then be: how did the internet's carnivalesque grin turn into a snarl?

While this book purports to be an ethnography, it suffers from the same problems as many other books about the internet, namely that the good ethnography of graphic artefacts and so on is hindered by a lack of good ethnography of users of such communication technologies. Generally, however, this book raises some thought-provoking questions about the ways in which communication communications are changing the ways we think and the ways in which we can theoretically understand the relationships between talking and typing and between lexicon and meaning.

EDWARD SIMPSON

London School of Economics & Political Science

HAGBERG, STEN. *Poverty in Burkina Faso: representations and realities*. ix, 116 pp., maps, plates, bibliogr. Uppsala: ULRicA, 2001. SEK85, \$7.99, €8.75 (paper)

Hagberg's book is a concise study of representations and realities of poverty in Burkina Faso. This includes an analysis of local, national, and international perspectives and practices related to poverty. The study on which the book is based was conducted as a consultancy assignment for the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (p. vii). Hence, *Poverty in Burkina Faso* can be seen as an example of anthropology's potential contribution to development knowledge and policy. Hagberg characterizes this contribution as one aimed 'to a large extent, to provide context' (p. 7), and criticizes the lack of context of most (official) poverty assessments, including so-called Participatory Poverty Assessments (PPA). The book's basic assumption is that any attempt to understand the notion of poverty must consider it as 'contextual,

situational and relational' (p. 2), and Hagberg claims to have attempted to 'go beyond simply representing "voices of the poor" by also analysing the context in which various idioms of poverty are expressed' (p. 9).

Poverty in Burkina Faso contains seven chapters. In the introduction the author situates his work *vis à vis* the field of the anthropology of development, and outlines his research methods. Chapter 2 provides a review of Burkina's economic, historical, and political context, while chapter 3 reviews the main poverty assessments carried out in Burkina Faso, discussing different definitions of poverty and highlighting several shortcomings of 'official' representations of poverty. Chapter 4 unravels poor people's perceptions of poverty in the four regions on which the study is focused, emphasizing, for each region, specific topics of regional relevance. Various 'sectors of poverty' as defined by national and international organizations (for example, education and training, health and social services, and so on) are considered in chapter 5, while chapter 6 looks at local, national, and international initiatives to combat poverty. The last chapter highlights the drawbacks of the concept of 'poverty' and contrasts official representations to contextual realities of poverty.

Methodologically, the study has relied on three sources of data: anthropological fieldwork; studies on issues of poverty mostly carried out by the national government and international development organizations; and policy and project documents and interviews with the staff of development projects and NGOs. While policy documents and official studies are assessed in a critical way, they are not treated as 'cultural texts' to be 'deciphered', reflecting the interests and values of the institutions with produced them. It is problematic, from the perspective of an anthropology of development, that the book perceives 'local voices' to require 'context', while what might be called 'official voices' are not contextualized as part of wider discourses of development originating from historically rooted configurations of power.

Fieldwork has been carried out in four different regions, thus covering different facets of Burkina's geographic, economic, and social reality. However, fieldwork duration varies substantially across regions. In the western region (Comoé Province), the author's findings are based on more than four years of fieldwork. In the central western region (Sanguié Province) the author has conducted fieldwork one month every year from 1995; in the northern region and in the Ouagadougou region, specific fieldwork and focused surveys have been carried out for one week in each of the two regions. From an anthropologist's point of view, one week of research can hardly count as fieldwork, and the research base underlying Hagberg's comparative analysis is clearly uneven across the four sites.

This work has pros and cons. Anthropology has been criticized for lacking a policy of public

representation and for having no practical relevance for the people of the countries where fieldwork is done. It has been argued that the discipline should strive to make its findings accessible and relevant to a wider public, including the subjects of its enquiries. *Poverty in Burkina Faso* is a clear analysis of the phenomenon of poverty, to a large extent free from anthropological jargon. While it uses statistics, survey data, and various poverty measurements profusely, it is well aware of the limits of these tools: integrated in a wider interpretative framework, statistical data add to, rather than detract from, the clarity of Hagberg's analysis. It outlines concisely the contextual, situational, and relational dimensions of poverty, reaching valuable findings which can be operationalized into more effective poverty alleviation policies, and hence relevant not only to decision-makers, but to poor people themselves.

On the other hand, even in the more genuinely 'anthropological' chapters, anthropologists will find the 'context' provided rather 'thin': chapter 4, which presents local perceptions of poverty in the four regions studied, dedicates between five and eight pages to each region. The book quotes Fulbē, Mossi, Lyela, Karaboro, and Bella informants without situating their perspectives within a thorough ethnographic analysis. To some extent, these problems highlight the trade-offs that anthropology faces when it tries to make its findings available to a wider, interdisciplinary audience. In only 107 pages, *Poverty in Burkina Faso* provides perhaps the maximum amount of 'context' that an economist at the World Bank would be willing to read, with the minimum ethnographic analysis that an anthropologist may wish to consider.

BENEDETTA ROSSI

London School of Economics & Political Science

HARROD, HOWARD L. *The animals came dancing: native American sacred ecology and animal kinship*. xxv, 171 pp., map, bibliogr. Tucson: Univ. of Arizona Press, 2000. \$17.95 (paper), \$35.00 (cloth)

Concerned that wild animals will not survive the twenty-first century, professor of religion Howard Harrod's book is a reflective conservationist moral appeal to consider how animals were thought about and lived with by peoples on the Northern Plains in the development of public policy for the North American developed world. This invitation to have us reconsider how we relate to the non-human realm is laudable and important, but there are weaknesses in this engagement with Plains Indian mythology and practice, in this reviewer's estimation.

Harrod focuses on Plains Indian cultures in the century between 1750 and 1850, a time easily mistaken for cultural stability and con-

structed from the highly problematic, idealized, and essentialized memory ethnographies generated in the collaboration between Indian survivors of the Euro-American onslaught and salvage anthropologists in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, when both believed a whole way of life was coming to a definitive end. Harrod is aware of this historical context and its implications for the status of the texts but proceeds none the less, even as he recognizes that 'Indian people have not assimilated but rather are still deeply embedded in cultural patterns, values and religious practices' (p. 147). As a result, much of this book summarizes already published material only lightly interpreted to make a few points in the service of the much more ambitious undertaking.

Part of the way through Harrod's typology of animals gift narratives, this reader was struck by the realization that these stories are not really about the knowledge people had about animals at all, nor about the reciprocal relationship between humans and non-humans, but about the way in which an array of animals is used in stories about relations between humans in the construction of the architecture of human thought and practice.

These stories are about directionality, the visible and the invisible, earth and water, consumption and distribution, sacrifice and abundance, agriculture and hunting, good and bad fortune, cleverness and deception, betrayal and trust, sex and marriage, violence and authority. These stories are not ethno-ecological but ethno-sociology in an animal semiotic idiom. If there is a metapostulate that underlies them all, it is that moral relationships between human beings make for abundance, as symbolized by the apparent willingness of animals to die so that humans may live. Harrod implies this in his consideration of Fiernrup-Riordan's and Adrian Tanner's works, both of which deal with the reciprocal relationships between human and non-human realms, but their insights are not developed. Importantly, it is clear that proper relations between human beings are the necessary condition for exchange between animals and humans.

In chapters 4, 5, and 6, we get a deeper understanding of how the religious dimensions of these cultures constituted the way people related to the animals that were hunted and killed for food. However, the reader does wonder whether Harrod underplays the social significance of rituals in favour of arguing for a particular and complex relationship between the realm of humans and the realm of animals. He describes the Mandan Snow Owl and Red Stick rituals, for example. These include sexual intercourse between the young wives of 'clan brothers' and older men chosen by their husbands. Is this best thought of as primarily hunting magic following Malinowski, as the author indicates, or a means of constituting hegemonic age-grade and gender relations?

In the last chapter, the author returns to the question that motivated the book and advocates consideration of Northern Plains orientation towards the natural world as 'subversive counter-imaging'. By virtue of their transcendent spirits, animals had moral standing for Northern Plains peoples, thus requiring full engagement on the part of humans. He rehearses a critique of Euro-American animal categories, and of the alienated food culture of Euro-America, arguing for an understanding that animals and plants are the source of our lives. The analysis is a wide-ranging and hopeful attempt to explore the moral implications of our intellectual interest in the Northern Plains worldview by using it as the basis of a critique of our depersonalized, disenchanted, utilitarian relationships of 'dominance, manipulation and control' of the non-human living world. Animal rights advocates will find the book nourishing, but readers who are interested in the complexity, subtlety, dynamism, and history of the still culturally and politically viable life of the indigenous peoples of the Northern Plains are encouraged to look elsewhere.

LARRY NESPER

University of Wisconsin-Madison

HASTRUP, KIRSTEN. *A place apart: an anthropological study of the Icelandic world*. xii, 227 pp., map, illus., bibliogr. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998

This book opens with a story of Hastrup's problems with collecting cows for the evening milking at a farm in the south of Iceland. To cut a long story short, she loses control of the cows when, as she puts it, they 'seem to sense her panic' (p. 5). In the end she has to seek help from the men at the farm to bring the cows under control. I suspect that this initial story is Hastrup's way of letting the reader know that she also had certain problems in her fieldwork interactions with Icelanders.

Such problems seem to have been most prominent in the fishing village, where Hastrup stayed in a house in which migrant fishermen also lodged. The reader learns that whilst staying there she learned to lock her door to avoid the 'anti-social behaviour' of the young fishermen (p. 59). As an historical anthropologist she has explanations for such behaviour. The socio-structural position of the migrant fishermen, she argues, is the modern equivalent of that of the unsettled vagrant people of earlier centuries who had 'no sense of value beyond the immediate satisfaction of their basic needs' (p. 163). Vagrants were thought to threaten 'the self-definition of the farming population, being in structural dominance since the age of the settlements and until this century' (*id.*). The migrating fishermen's non-social being is based on such unsettledness and also on residence in dwellings which are considered to be 'counter to the idea of the

social, as centred around the idea of the [farm]' (p. 164). Here, of course, one must ask by whom are they thus considered? Do the fishermen think of themselves as 'anti-social'?

In Iceland as elsewhere, history is contested. This was particularly clear in the spring of 1993 when Icelandic National Television showed documentaries that attacked the dominant farmer-centred view of history. The films excited great concern among the farming community, but also among other people who felt that this was an attack on Icelandic-ness as such. Hastrup's presentation of Icelandic history is very much in tune with this conventional (and official) farmer-centred version of Icelandic history. In speaking of a site with an abundance of historical remains that she finds fascinating, Hastrup observes that it was only 'ten minutes' drive away and marvels that her subjects had no interest in it. I am surprised at her lack of speculation as to the possible reasons people may have for such a lack of interest. Could it be that the site is not particularly 'historical' for them?

In a volume edited by Borofsky (2000), *Remembrance of Pacific pasts*, the remaking of the Pacific Islands peoples' histories is considered by a number of authors. A central theme is the emergence of many histories instead of the conventional monolithic and eurocentric history. The problem, as Borofsky points out, is identifying and understanding the biases, interpretations, and silences in the historical documentation produced in bygone times by those in a position to do so. Another related concern is that of reconstructing peoples' histories from non-textual sources. That conventional Icelandic history is at times highly contested should make anthropologists working in this field aware of the possibilities of multiple Icelandic histories, and that such a multivocal notion of the past might deepen our understanding of it. We should therefore attempt to reconstruct these where we find evidence of them. Ethnographically this means that the fieldworker should listen to 'deviant' voices and find the reasons for some peoples' apparent lack of interest in official historical sites. Hastrup claims (p. 198) that the main characters of her book are real people whose voices we often hear on the pages. I beg to differ. I do not think Hastrup has much concern for the 'real peoples' voices, except in a very general sense as confirmation of a particular historico-cultural model of Iceland.

SVEINN EGERTSSON

University of Iceland

HOPE III, ANDREW & THOMAS F. THORNTON (eds). *Will the time ever come? A Tlingit source book*. 159 pp., illus. Fairbanks: Univ. Alaska, 2001. £10.95 (paper)

This book grew out of the first Conference of Tlingit Tribes and Clans in 1993 in southeast

Alaska. As Tlingit co-editor Hope notes, '[s]uch a gathering never occurred, so far as we know, in pre-contact times. Though there have been many, many large intertribal gatherings over the years, such as memorials, pole raisings, ANB [Alaska Native Brotherhood] conventions, and house dedications, these were never inclusive of all tribes and clans' (pp. 9–10). The book's title, '*Will the time ever come?*' is a question Tlingit elder and scholar Matthew Fred asked in response to plans to incorporate Tlingit knowledge – as conceived by Tlingit people – into school curricula. The time has come, and ideas contained here provide resources to facilitate the larger projects of cultural transmission and sustained revitalization.

The book includes conference and other papers, a list of Tlingit tribes, clans, and houses, and excerpts from a previously unpublished 1916 manuscript by George Emmons held in the American Museum of Natural History. The book's authors represent a mix of Tlingit and non-Tlingit researchers, and some papers read as spoken texts, little modified beyond their original presentation. The intended audience certainly includes the Tlingit themselves, Tlingit specialists, and students. Other readers of this journal may be interested, as this work exemplifies an emerging genre in Native North American studies, publications that represent co-operative efforts between anthropologists and tribal members.

Part 1, 'Tlingit history and traditions', begins with Sergei Kan's initial instalment of an annotated bibliography of anthropological works on the Tlingit. There may be no one better qualified for this than Kan; I hope that future versions of the bibliography include the many Ph.D. dissertations and government reports that treat Tlingit topics. The results, interpretations, and representations in these works require evaluation by the Tlingit themselves, and, by making these works more accessible, Kan's annotated bibliography could catalyse such re-evaluation.

Papers by Andrew Hope, Harold Jacobs, and Herb Hope each represent unique perspectives on Tlingit history. Local knowledge is required to appreciate these contributions, and in some cases they contradict previously published material (for example, the English translations of place names, house names, and so on). Jacobs details clanhouse affiliations and care-takers in Angoon, Alaska, and while presented as 'fact' some of this might be legitimately contested by other Tlingit. Telling clan history is always a simultaneous claim to authority. H. Hope's story of the 1804 Tlingit survival march from Sitka is a fascinating reconstruction based on oral history and incomplete written records. His attempts to 'ground-truth' the actual route taken by his ancestors reveals both the challenges and rewards of this type of research.

Part 2, 'Contemporary issues and projects', starts with Richard Dauenhauer's all-too-brief introduction to sounds in the Tlingit language that commonly frustrate English speakers. Co-

editor Thornton advocates building a comprehensive resource atlas mapping Tlingit territory. Such maps are themselves non-Tlingit cultural constructions, but the hope is that Tlingit categories of 'resources' will have significant value for land-use planning and education. H. Hope's attempt to retrace the survival march (mentioned above) hints that contemporary conceptions of landscapes may differ substantially from those held by elders who have died over the last twenty or more years. Steve Langdon describes the value of contemporary subsistence practices against the background of the Tlingit's long heritage of ingenious salmon fishing methods. Ellen Hope Hays calls for a revitalization of Tlingit traditions of naming to mark historic events and milestones.

The Emmons's excerpts in the appendix cry out for explanatory annotations to provide context and explain value judgements. Unfortunately, we do not learn why the editors selected the two *kuváans* (tribal divisions) and three clans presented here. Based on my work with the manuscript itself, the published selection on *kuváans* represents perhaps 10 per cent of the total. None the less, I am happy to see a portion of this valuable source in print, and I hope the full manuscript will be published eventually. The other part of the appendix is a list of Tlingit *kuváans*, clans, and houses, perhaps the most complete such list ever published. I only wish the editors had followed Leer's format (in his 1985 list) with a name index to enhance use of their list as a research tool.

This book is not easily accessible to 'outsiders', and requires specialized knowledge to appreciate. Some chapters lack references, and an index would have enhanced the usability of the text. While not the source book on the Tlingit, this is a worthy source book, and I hope just the first of an ongoing series.

MADONNA L. MOSS

University of Oregon

LAWRENCE, HELEN REEVES & DON NILES (eds). *Traditionalism and modernity in the music and dance of Oceania: essays in honour of Barbara B. Smith*. xviii, 267 pp., maps, illus., musical notation, bibliogr. Sydney: Univ. Sydney, 2001. \$40.00 (paper)

The pioneering ethnomusicologist Barbara Smith, founder of the Study Group on the Musics of Oceania (part of UNESCO's International Council for Traditional Music), is honoured in this collection of essays on the ethnomusicology and ethnochoreology of Oceania. The contributors are members of the SGMO from Australia, Canada, Denmark, Guam, Japan, New Zealand, Papua New Guinea, the United States, and Vanuatu. Several are former students and colleagues of Smith at the University of Hawaii, where she has spent most of her

professional life. An appendix outlines Smith's career in teaching and research.

The seventeen essays are grouped in three sections. The first, 'Changing directions, maintaining values', examines historical continuities and transformations in the dance and music cultures of a number of Oceanic communities. They discuss the transformation of pre-colonial agonistic dance contests in Kiribati (Mary E. Lawson Burke), the evolution of the Kantan Chamorrita song form in Guam (Judy Flores), the distinctive dance 'signatures' that characterize different Fijian dance traditions (Joann W. Keali'ino-homoku), the chequered history of the accordion in the music of the Tahiti region (Adrienne L. Kaeppler), and changes in song poetry in Mungiki, Solomon Islands (Jane Mink Rossen). Three case-studies from Papua New Guinea concern the reception of songs from the dead in Takû (Richard M. Moyle), contemporary conceptions of song and music ownership in Madang (Jun'ichiro Suwa), and the changing acoustic environment of the Waxei people of the Sepik region (Yoichi Yamada).

The second section is entitled 'On the outside looking in/on the inside looking out'. These essays concern the explication of a Maori song text in the fraught context of differences between insiders and outsiders in their notions of ownership (Mervyn McLean and Margaret Orbell); the difficulties of an outsider in studying music of the Iatmul (Gordon D. Spearritt); and the relationships between foreign and local ethnomusicological research in Papua New Guinea (Don Niles). Two final essays in this section concern the role of public research bodies and collecting organizations in Vanuatu and New Caledonia (Raymond Ammann) and Australia (Stephen A. Wild).

Part 3, 'Moving to the "classroom"', deals with aspects of dance and music education in Oceania: with the role of indigenous dancers and musicians in the university teaching of ethnomusicology in Australia (Elizabeth Mackinlay), the effects of the colonial education systems on music in Yap (Junko Konishi), the history of music and dance in Hawaiian mission schools (C.K. Szego), and the emergence of formal dance teaching in Tahiti (Jane Freeman Moulin).

The essays in this volume all attest to the continuing creativity and diversity of Oceanic dance traditions, and to the diversity of perspectives within contemporary ethnomusicology itself. A common concern with the relationship of the traditional and the modern unifies the essays, the authors all viewing tradition and modernity as aspects of a continuum rather than as an absolute dichotomy. Hence the recurring themes that many of the essays explore: the ways in which people work to preserve or revitalize their dance and music traditions, or give them new meaning, in contemporary contexts; their decisions to appropriate, modify, and sometimes reject, foreign music and technology in pursuing these aims; and their creation of dance and music prac-

tices that exemplify the reciprocal, mutually constitutive influences of the indigenous and the foreign.

SIMON HARRISON

University of Ulster, Coleraine

MARKOWITZ, FRAN & MICHAEL ASHKENAZI (eds).

Sex, sexuality and the anthropologist. viii, 230 pp., bibliogr. Urbana: Univ. Illinois Press, 1999. \$34.95 (cloth), \$18.95 (paper)

Sex, sexuality and the anthropologist is the latest book to look at the role of sexual experience during fieldwork, particularly the effects that an anthropologist's sexual behaviour can have on informants. Taking a broad geographical span, the contributors discuss frankly their theoretical and practical difficulties with the ideal of the asexual anthropologist in the field. This ideal, they feel, involves denying an aspect of themselves which they believe to be important. Several contributors note that fieldwork is 'living a life' and that as sex is part of life, so it is inevitably part of fieldwork. Pointing to the discrepancies between Malinowski's diaries and his published ethnography, many authors feel that such a split is now untenable and argue that the current practice of situating oneself within one's ethnographic text, means honesty about all aspects of fieldwork, including sexual experiences. Feminist anthropologists have long discussed the issue of gender and the way that it has informed their fieldwork experiences, and discussions of sexuality inevitably cover some of the same ground. It is interesting therefore to have such strong male perspectives in this volume, analysing not just sexuality but men's awareness of their gender role.

Such a project is, of course, risky. There is a reluctance, and sometimes a distaste, among many anthropologists to see their own sexual behaviour (or to read about that of others) as a legitimate area for enquiry. The editors of this volume are aware of this risk and in their introduction argue that they are interested in the 'intersections where sexuality and anthropology meet' (p. 5), because this sheds further light on relationships in the field and the complexities of fieldwork. They are interested not so much in sex itself as the effects that an anthropologist's sexuality can have on personal relationships in the field and subsequently on how data is both collected and analysed.

Several chapters stand out as being successful in looking at this intersection. Rose Jones's chapter on fieldwork in St Lucia where, despite a husband back in North America, she was constantly encouraged to find a St Lucian husband to give her a baby or, failing that, to take a *zameze*, 'a woman who loves other women'. Her chapter expresses eloquently how her relationships with the men and women with whom she worked were shaped and changed by a frank

acknowledgement of her sexuality and how this then affected her work. Similarly, Frank Salamone's chapter looks at the ways that his relationships with women have affected his field-work over the long term, discussing how relationships with wives and lovers have had an impact on how he conducted his research and how he was perceived by his informants in the field. Both chapters are less about sexual experience in the field than they are about social relationships, building trust, and self-presentation. Other chapters in the book examine being a lesbian in Taiwan, pubic nudity in Vienna and Japan, and gender relationships in Mexico, Hungary, and Israel.

One problem about being so frank and placing oneself and one's own experiences at the centre of an account, however, is that if readers do not find that person sympathetic, it is difficult to read a chapter with anything but irritation. I found Lunsing's chapter on being a gay man in Japan problematic because of the self-congratulatory tone of the chapter and his refusal to change any aspect of his lifestyle or behaviour. As he puts it, 'I usually engage in sex and love relationships wherever I am ... and I saw no reason to abandon my usual behaviour' (p. 180). Yet, whatever else fieldwork teaches us, it is that during fieldwork we do need to abandon some aspects of our usual behaviour, and we may well have to act differently in the sexual, as well as the social, sphere. Other contributors discuss this point and comment honestly on the difficulties of negotiating sexual relationships. In the context of this book, this seems a more appropriate response than a blanket refusal to compromise.

Some people will find this book prurient and unnecessary and may feel squeamish about its subject matter, an issue that all the contributors acknowledge and attempt to deal with. Others will feel that openness about ethnographic methods must include openness about issues of sex, sexuality, and desire, and for them this will be a welcome addition to books about the realities of fieldwork.

HEATHER MONTGOMERY

The Open University

MUNASINGHE, VIRANJINI. *Callaloo or tossed salad? East Indians and the cultural politics of identity in Trinidad*. xv, 315 pp., maps, bibliogr. New York: Cornell Univ. Press, 2001. £30.50 (cloth), £13.50 (paper)

Callaloo is a vegetable stew common throughout the Caribbean. In it, the ingredients blend and merge into a green and tasty mass. Tossed salad is, well, tossed salad, in which the ingredients are together but maintain their distinct characteristics. Much of the Caribbean presents itself as a racial and ethnic callaloo, a claim that echoes the older self-ascription of the United

States as a melting-pot. However, and like those in the melting-pot, the callaloo's ingredients may not be as thoroughly blended as they are claimed to be.

Munasinghe's book describes the state of the cooking in Trinidad, which is fairly distinctive in the anglophone Caribbean because of the presence of a high proportion of people of South Asian (overwhelmingly Indian) descent – about 40 per cent of the population. The work is a detailed description of racial-ethnic relations over the past two centuries, complemented by the results of her own fieldwork. The result is intriguing and persuasive.

Although this book is about Trinidad, Munasinghe's argument bears, at least in principle, on all countries that see themselves as being made up of a variety of immigrant groups of distinct cultural identity. Her work suggests that where such countries espouse an ideal of inclusiveness, they are prone to have two national self-conceptions, one resembling callaloo and one resembling tossed salad. These are not mutually exclusive, for a country can invoke each of them in different circumstances during the same period in its history.

The problem that she points to, however, is that the callaloo or melting-pot model, though espousing a kind of diversity, in fact tends to grant higher status to some expressions of diversity than others. In the case of Trinidad, the diversity that was privileged in most of the second half of the twentieth century was that expressed in the concept of Creole. Although this refers to and values mixture, the mixture identified is that of white European and black African, a mixture of what are seen locally as pure racial stocks that results in a distinctively Trinidadian person, the type of person with a legitimate claim to be the 'real Trini'. The difficulty is that those who do not fit on the dimension defined by these two poles find themselves marginalized.

In Trinidad, a number of groups do not fit on this dimension, but the most numerous, the one that concerns Munasinghe, is Indo-Caribbeans, the descendants of Indians who went to Trinidad as indentured plantation workers between the end of slavery and around 1920, when indenture ended. In Trinidad but only ambiguously of it, Indian-orientated political strategy over the course of the twentieth century can be seen as an extended effort to negotiate a place for Indians in this system and, since independence, in the operation of the Trinidadian state.

The strength of this work is the careful description and analysis of the position of different racial-ethnic groups over the course of time in Trinidad, and the dominant understandings of those groups and their relationships to each other. Thus, while this book is concerned with understandings, Munasinghe is careful to locate them in the context of the political and economic position of Trinidad, as colony and as country, and in the context of the position of

different groups within it, especially as those have been affected by the changing nature of the country's sugar production, in which Indo-Caribbeans dominate, and the changing state of the country's economy more generally.

Overall, the book is slightly unbalanced. The introduction lays out Munasinghe's analytical model, drawing on work on identity in Trinidad and elsewhere, and implies that what is to follow will be as much an analytical as a descriptive work. However, the body of the work is predominately descriptive, although she does invoke her analytical apparatus where it is appropriate. It remains the case, though, that Munasinghe does not seek to develop her analytical model, and the work contains no concluding chapter to draw together the theoretical points she has made. Also, even though there are parallels between what Munasinghe describes for Trinidad and the situation in other countries in the region, she makes little sustained effort to make those parallels explicit.

Even so, *Callaloo or tossed salad* is sure to attract anthropologists interested in the Caribbean, both because of the importance of Trinidad within the region and because of the region-wide issues that it raises. It should attract anthropologists interested in identity and national politics more generally, for the descriptive material is complemented by a useful and interesting analytical framework of broader applicability. It is nice to see a tale this interesting told this well.

JAMES G. CARRIER

PRIESTLEY, MARK (ed.). *Disability and the life course: global perspectives*. xix, 252 pp., figs., tables, bibliogr. Cambridge: Univ. Press, 2001. £40.00 (cloth), £14.95 (paper)

This is a welcome and timely publication. There has been for some time a burgeoning worldwide interest – in both developed and developing social and educational systems – as to how best to support and deploy resources for individuals experiencing a range of disabling circumstances. This book is commendable for four reasons. First, Priestley has brought together an impressive team of contributors from across the world and from different personal, professional, and theoretical perspectives. Secondly, the cross-cultural aspect of the text gives an added authenticity to the global movement to ensure that societies may be judged by the extent to which they develop truly inclusive policies. Thirdly, the emphasis on life-span perspectives will ensure that the text has a universal appeal to all who are engaged in working with and for those individuals marginalized by virtue of disabling conditions. Lastly, the mixture of theoretical, empirical, and autobiographical accounts gives the text a vibrancy.

It is hardly surprising that in a text with over twenty contributors, there is a certain vari-

ability in the quality of the papers, in part determined by cultural contexts from which individual contributors come. In a very real sense, however, it is this very variability which gives the text an added and welcome relevance. For example, South Africa and the former Soviet republics represent two important transitional democracies, the one emerging from decades of a political regime founded on the principle of (racial) exclusion, the other effecting that painful transition from a centralist political regime to one where Western ideas of 'democracy' and 'market-driven' economics are beginning to take hold. The chapters by Morgan (South Africa), Iraskia-Smirnova (Russia), and Kikkas (Estonia) give the reader insights into the extent to which systems, rather than individual handicapping conditions, can be disabling. Of added interest is the piquancy of the individual autobiographies provided. This use of 'story' is a commendable feature of the text as a whole, with a number of chapters making effective use of the technique.

Ghai provides the reader with an optimistic but not uncritical view of what disability means in the disabling 'chaos' of the urban slums of Delhi. McNeil's account of growing up visually impaired in post-Partition India and of her eventual life in the United Kingdom provides the reader with graphic insights into the experiences of being 'different' in differing cultural contexts. It is this focus on the impact of context as a marginalizing or disabling force which gives the volume its overall appeal. In addition, the organization of the text leads the reader from a critical overview of conceptual issues, through illustrative accounts of life-span experiences to the final section which offers a multi-dimensional critique of the politics of disability. Those readers schooled in a more deterministic tradition – one which stresses the role of within-individual pathologies – will find the paradigm shift towards the more systems-oriented perspectives of this book challenging and disturbing. Those readers familiar with the rhetoric of the social construction of disability will find in the text commendable attempts to underpin that rhetoric with theoretical perspectives. For example, Rowlands's account of the impact on a young man of traumatic brain injury in early adulthood is made the more interesting by her attempt to set that individual experience within a wider theoretical context in which she stresses the importance of community discourse.

Overall, this is valuable addition to the literature on disability. It draws together differing perspectives and sets these within both global and life-span perspectives. The text is likely to have an appeal to all who are concerned and work with individuals disabled by virtue of handicapping conditions but whose disabilities are exacerbated by contextual determinants such as societal attitudes, social policies which of themselves are disabling, the impact of globalization; poverty, and so on. The text will be of value to

students of social policy as well as those engaged in applied professional training towards social work or educational and clinical psychology. It will have further appeal to policy-makers at local and national levels. In bringing this compilation together, Priestley is to be congratulated, not least for bringing to the wider debate on provision and support for individuals with disabilities that attention to the global dimension of the debate as expressed by one contributor:

‘so big deal if I cannot walk. If there is a will, there is a way. I will definitely prove to the world that I am much more than my disability.’ I am sure this commitment will be familiar to disability activists all over the world. It is in this sense that disability truly becomes a global issue.

(Ghai, p. 36)

GEORGE O.B. THOMSON

University of Edinburgh

RUBINSTEIN, RAECHELLE & LINDA H. CONNOR (eds). *Staying local in the global village: Bali in the twentieth century*. xiv, 352 pp., illus., tables, bibliogr. Honolulu: Univ. of Hawaii Press, 1999. \$47.00 (cloth)

This interesting collection of papers by experts on Bali from different disciplines comes out of a conference held at Sydney in 1995. It is difficult for publications about Indonesia to keep up with events. Putu Suasta and Connor's chapter updates the political and economic events which have shaken Indonesia since 1997 and their implications for Bali, but even since the book's publication in 1999 one president has already been and gone, and both events of 11 September and ‘the nightclub bombing’ have happened. None the less, there are many useful contributions to this volume which will appeal to experts and students of the region.

A number of names will be familiar to regional specialists. Michel Picard's work on tourism and performance is well known; here, he presents the start of a new project on transcultural identity construction. Brett Hough has published in Australia on cultural politics of performance and here replays his arguments for a wider readership. Margaret Weiner's historical anthropology has been widely praised, and here we have a taster of her Benjamin-inspired analysis of the kingdom of Klungkung. Mark Hobart's chapter on television viewing practices also provides a taster from a wider project.

Reading the contributions at the beginning and end of the book, I wondered why so many edited volumes are produced about Bali but not Java. The obvious reason is the scale and diversity of Javanese cultures, which are resistant to the homogenization of Bali – but Bali is not homogeneous either. The book seemed at risk of

generalizing Balinese identity as something to be transacted in the wider spheres of state and international tourism, running the risk of reifying what Balinese people themselves attempt to resist by emphasizing local specificity within the different regions of Bali, but four chapters by a new generation of scholars that are close-grained micro-studies in an ethnographic vein balance lurking assumptions elsewhere about the homogeneous production of Balinese identity. Thomas Reuter analyses the traditional ‘Bali Aga’ villages, the best-known site of ‘otherness’ in Bali. His discussion of their cosmological and historical orientation to ‘the rest’ of the island and his critiques of spatial metaphors and ensuing constructions of marginality in Western research will be of great use in teaching and rethinking the relationship of local to analytical categories – though Reuter might be challenged for presenting here a tentative personal definition of Bali Aga, rather than indigenous discourses. Graeme MacRae focuses on Ubud, the centre of cultural tourism in Bali. His spatial and historical analysis explains how Ubud came to be the place it is; the detail of its ritual resources emphasizes variation within the Balinese cultural landscape, and also deals a blow to Geertz's controversial *Negara*. I Gede Pitana's ethnography of the division of labour between twice-born and commoner caste priests is particularly useful when read in conjunction with MacRae's chapter, and again contributes to our understanding of the complexity of social dynamics within Bali, and of how the resources outside the island are mustered to support and oppose claims to monopolistic legitimacy. Ayami Nakatani's useful account of transformation in weaving, traditionally women's work, and its changing markets and pressures is a salutary reminder that, questions about the reification of gender difference apart, the Balinese include both men and women.

This book stimulates useful reflections on the vexed notion of globalization, but it remains for academic practices to find a way not to collude with Western dominance. While the presence of Balinese contributors is to be applauded, there is a predominance of ‘overseas’ scholarship, with only 1.5 local scholars and 8.5 from ‘Western’ universities; its equally useful predecessor, *Being modern in Bali: image and change* (edited by Adrian Vickers, 1996), included two out of eight chapters by Balinese scholars. As far as academic participation in the global-local dynamic, Balinese academics do tend to stay local in the global village, partly due to limited opportunities to study overseas or attend conferences outside Indonesia; an Indonesian translation of this book would be an invaluable resource to which Balinese and other Indonesian scholars could respond. Another local view is provided by Surya Dharma's well-known cartoons, including ‘Shadow puppet play with overhead projector’ (p. 252), a masterly metaphor for the processes described in the book, and the ‘mega project’

carrying off Bali on a bulldozer (p. 105), echoed in Jango Pramartha's more specific critique with a bulldozer labelled 'BNR' ('*Botak Nipu Rakyat*' – the bald one deceives the people – a reference to the then-governor of Bali, Ida Bagus Oka) (p. 103). These trenchant visual commentaries provide a refreshing satirical dimension and a reminder that globalization is always selective. Despite claims that political 'openness' has improved, humour and images are still the only safe way for Indonesians to express public truths about social realities.

FELICIA HUGHES-FREELAND

University of Wales, Swansea

Language & linguistics

AIKHENVALD, ALEXANDRA Y. & R.M.W. DIXON (eds). *Areal diffusion and genetic inheritance: problems in comparative linguistics*. xvi, 453 pp., maps, figs., tables, bibliogr. Oxford: Univ. Press, 2001. £60.00 (cloth)

This invaluable volume contains revisions of fourteen of the sixteen papers presented at the International Workshop, 'The Connection between Areal Diffusion and the Genetic Model of Language Relationship', held in August 1998 at the Research Centre for Linguistic Typology (RCLT), which was then based at the Australian National University. The point of departure of the discussions was Dixon's essay, *The rise and fall of languages* (Cambridge, 1997), with its use of biologist Stephen Jay Gould's 1970s concept of 'punctuated equilibrium' being reapplied to certain issues in historical linguistics. Not all the papers make much use of punctuated equilibrium as an informing ideology, however, and the general tenor of the contributions, though clear in its recognition of the essential importance of examining areally diffused features in the historical changes which languages have undergone, does not derive from unswerving obedience to an externally imposed theoretical doctrine of language change. The contributors to the volume range from emerging young scholars to renowned experts in their field, such as Calvert Watkins the Indo-Europeanist; the uniformly high quality of the contributions demonstrates that all contributors know whereof they speak.

The papers included (actually there are fifteen chapters, since the editors have presented a general introduction to the contributions on pages 1–26) are rich in maps, diagrams, and data, and the pages are closely printed. Four of the fifteen contributors are based at the RCLT and two more, including the archaeologist Peter Bellwood whose skilful contribution is the only non-linguistic paper in the collection, are at the

ANU. The geographical range of the contributions (and most of them are firmly rooted in the areal linguistic phenomena of particular geographical regions) is impressive, including Anatolia (with separate papers on the western part of Anatolia in pre-Christian times and modern-day East Anatolia), Amazonia, Oceania, Australia itself, and sub-Saharan Africa, while there are no fewer than four papers, comprising 132 pages, which deal with areal aspects of Sinitic and other languages of East and South East Asia. Of these, Nicholas J. Enfield's typological study of the various paths towards grammaticalization of a morpheme with the primary meaning 'acquire' in various languages of South East Asia is the most narrowly focused paper in the book. In contrast, the final paper, by RCLT member Timothy Jowan Curnow, is one of the most general, as it surveys the findings of the other contributions in the book as a means to examining whether there are any limits to borrowing between languages.

Some of the material in this book is extremely new in print, whereas a few articles (those by Aikhenvald on Arawak languages in Amazonia and Malcolm Ross on contact-induced language change in northwestern Melanesia, for example) appear to incorporate many of the previously published findings of their authors. Nevertheless, such inclusions are both welcome, as the originals are not always easy to find. Of the newer papers, one of the most controversial will be Dixon's on Australia as a linguistic area, as Dixon debunks the long-held idea that there is such a genetic grouping as 'Pama-Nyungan' (while also pointing out that Mabuiag or Kala Lagaw Ya, of Torres Strait, a language often used as an example in general linguistics books of what Australian languages are like, is not actually an Australian language after all, but a Papuan one with an Australian substratum). What Dixon's paper cannot explain is how, if Pama-Nyungan as a genetic linkage be chimerical, there are none the less so many provable pre-European language families and isolates in Australia (the same question may be asked of North America). Quite simply, we do not know, and the heuristic powers of the Comparative Method will not let us go far enough back to see what language families there were in Australia, say ten thousand years ago.

The quality of the production is high, though I have noticed a few errors; for example, 'Huikui' on page 319 should be *Huihui*. This book's contents make it clear to more traditionally minded diachronists that the impact of unrelated or less closely related languages and their speakers upon the history, fabric, and patterns of many languages has often left more numerous and permanent traces than those remaining from the proto-language from which the particular language is derived. Let us hope that these contents will soon be available in paperback to students.

ANTHONY P. GRANT

NETTLE, DANIEL. *Linguistic diversity*. xii, 168 pp., map, tables, illus., bibliogr. Oxford: Univ. Press, 1999. £35.00 (cloth), £12.99 (paper)

Daniel Nettle is a linguist (with field experience in collecting the first appreciable body of data on the Nigerian Chadic language, Fyem) who is also interested in the modes and causes of diversity among the languages spoken in a given area. In this book, which is well provided with illustrative tables and charts, he attempts to explain why certain regions of the world are characterized by a greater degree of variety among the languages spoken there than other regions of comparable size or population, and in doing so he applies and integrates recent and relevant findings from several scientific disciplines, including genetic and typological linguistics, population genetics, social anthropology, and agricultural science. This integrative approach, sometimes known as the 'New Synthesis', has been impinging upon writings in historical linguistics for over a decade, and Nettle's work contemporaneous with and subsequent to this book places him in the forefront of those 'New Syntheses' whose point of departure is linguistics. Some of Nettle's later work makes use of Social Impact Theory, a model which certainly informs his discussions here, although the theory is never referred to by name. This volume represents the synthesis of a bewildering amount of information and theory in numerous disciplines.

Especially in the later chapters, the examination of the defining factors is played out against the backdrop of an important aspect of the current linguistic *Zeitgeist*, namely an increase in interest in, and concern for, the increasingly rapid depletion of natural language variety and diversity in many parts of the world as a result of linguistic obsolescence – another issue upon which Nettle has written extensively. 'New' speech communities, using languages which were previously unknown (and which may as yet have no clearly identified genetic relatives) are still occasionally discovered, for instance, in parts of Amazonia or Irian Jaya. But this is an infrequent occurrence nowadays, and the number of new languages discovered each decade is a tiny fraction of those previously documented which go out of use during the same period.

The customary front-matter aside, the book is divided into an introduction, six themed chapters, and a four-page epilogue, followed by a table of global diversity data for several dozen countries (mostly those in the Third World or in the South), a list of references, and an index with, it has to be said, numerous omissions and no clear policy for the inclusion of subjects. A glossary for some of the neologisms which Nettle uses would have helped, too.

The two early chapters discuss the way in which new languages evolve from older languages, through the cumulation of the effects of imperfect learning, the presence of different kinds of variation, and the various kinds of selec-

tion (social, functional, and geographical) which serve to ensure that the effects of variation are not smoothed out or cancelled out. The isolation of some speech communities from other bodies of speakers of the same language is especially relevant here. Nettle employs models of computer simulation to portray the effects of these forces, which he depicts using a variety of graphic modes. The two chapters which follow examine language diversity, the first dealing with aspects of linguistic diversity in space and the situation of diversity in hunter-gatherer societies, and the second with changes in diversity which have been brought about by the palaeolithic, neolithic, and industrial technological revolutions. It is in the first of these chapters that Nettle proposes the idea that the number of languages in a particular country and its population is governed by the degree of ecological risk (for instance, the possibility of frequent bouts of famine): the greater the ecological risk, the fewer the number of languages. This is a hypothesis which still needs to be proved beyond doubt (the northern regions of the former Soviet Union would be a plausible counterexample). Many 'risky' areas have never been thickly populated in the first place.

Chapter 6 discusses phylogenetic diversity (the number of separate linguistic stocks, and the unequal distribution of these in various continents when land and population size are taken into account), while the following chapter discusses the degree of attested structural diversity in the world's languages. These are controversial matters; some of the material in both these chapters is open to debate (the number of stocks spoken in Eurasia at any time is higher than one would expect), and some assertions are simply wrong. For example, Hawaiian has at most eighteen (non-loaned) phonemes, not thirty-six as stated on page 145, and this affects the argument.

Nettle has made an interesting synthesis from several fields, but it will need to be re-examined in the light of more finely detailed investigations.

ANTHONY P. GRANT

SMITH, GEOFF P. *Growing up with Tok Pisin: contact, creolization, and change in Papua New Guinea's national language*. xi, 244 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. London: Battlebridge Publications, 2002. £18.00 (paper)

Melanesia is an area which reportedly has 0.1 per cent of the world's population, but approximately 20 per cent of the world's languages. The majority of these are in Papua New Guinea (PNG), where 862 are spoken, according to a recent count (p. 8). Tok Pisin (also known as New Guinea Pidgin, Neo-Melanesian) is the major lingua franca. It has now become the first language of a generation of new speakers, and has

been adopted as one of Papua New Guinea's national languages.

Tok Pisin has been written about by a number of linguists, but most have documented its use as a pidgin (a subsidiary language system), rather than as a creole (a first language). The author of this study lived and worked in PNG for twenty-two years, and his book, based on his Ph.D. dissertation, is possibly the first to focus on those who have grown up with Tok Pisin as their native language. As he notes: 'This study aims to contribute ... to the filling in of some ... gaps by investigating the linguistic characteristics of the spoken Tok Pisin of first language speakers in a variety of geographical locations' (p. 22). The data consist of samples of recorded speech from young, mainly adolescent, first language speakers, with particular attention to regional variation.

The book contains eight chapters. Chapter 1 provides a general background to pidgins and creoles, and Tok Pisin in particular; chapter 2 summarizes the research design and procedure, and gives information on the location and selection of informants; chapters 3 to 7 outline the data, moving from phonology to morphology to the lexicon to syntax to discourse processes; finally, chapter 8 is a brief discussion of the findings, and includes comments on the relationship between Tok Pisin and English. A small appendix contains samples of speech from several areas, and a number of photographs scattered throughout the book provide an enjoyable guide to the general appearance of the landscape and the informants.

The strength of this book is that it covers a wide area within PNG, with 536 informants coming from twenty-one different places, so including all the main locations in which Tok Pisin is spoken. The initial recordings made by Smith stretched across almost 3,000 hours, of which 50 hours' worth have been analysed in depth. The examples provided are numerous, relevant, and well translated.

The main interest of the book is that it gives detailed, clear information about current developments in Tok Pisin: it is impossible to do justice to its richness in a brief review. For example, the phonological inventory of Tok Pisin was once small, containing no affricates, few fricatives, and only occasional consonant clusters or diphthongs. Smith's recordings show how this is changing under English influence, with words such as *fish*, *lif*, *tichim*, *gold* intermittently replacing older *pis* ('fish'), *lip* ('leaf'), *tisim* ('teach'), *gol* ('gold'). This allows words which were once homophones to be distinguished, as with *gol*, once both 'goal' and 'gold'. Speed of delivery has led to phonological reductions, some of which can now be regarded as the norm, as *mipla* ('we'), once *mipela*, *lo* ('in, at'), once *long*. A strong point in Smith's presentation is that he gives the number of occurrences of the older 'standard' form, as well as that of the newer, reduced form, as with 'standard' *bilong* ('of')

which occurs 206 times, alongside the reduced forms *blong* (1,587), *blo* (6,862), and *bl* (2,673). Over morphology, he points to an increasing trend towards more redundancy and obligatory marking, as with plural marking.

In the section on the lexicon, he shows how, for example, a borrowed connector such as *bikos* (157 examples) is taking over from traditional *long wanem* (28). The chapter on syntax contains a wealth of statistics on changing constructions, such as the decline of the preverbal particle *i*, whose function is disputed. More than half of all the ten thousand plus occurrences are followed by only four words, *go*, *kam*, *stap*, *bin*, he points out. TMA (tense mood aspect) particles and their combination are considered, as well as information on verb serialization, relative clauses, and complementizers. The chapter on discourse looks at a variety of discourse conventions found in speech, letters, and traditional narratives. The final chapter concludes that a lot more remains to be done, and gives some interesting examples of code switching between English and Tok Pisin.

This is not a beginners' textbook: those starting out would be advised to consult a learner's manual, such as Dutton and Thomas's *A new course in Tok Pisin* (1985). But for those who want seriously to know about Tok Pisin, and where it is going, Smith's book is a treasure trove of clear, well-documented information.

JEAN AITCHISON

University of Oxford

Social anthropology

BENJAMIN, ALAN F. *Jews of the Dutch Caribbean: exploring ethnic identity on Curaçao*. xii, 200 pp., maps, tables, illus., bibliogr. London, New York: Routledge, 2002 £50.00 (cloth)

Ethnic identity is an important concern in anthropology and the Caribbean is a region where anthropologists consider identity to be especially significant and problematic. Benjamin's *Jews of the Dutch Caribbean* thus fits nicely within disciplinary interests. The work operates on three different levels: as a consideration of the issue of ethnic identity, as a consideration of ethnic identity in the Caribbean, and as a description of a particular set of people within the region.

The particular people the work describes is a set of Sephardi Jews from Portugal, via Holland, whose ancestors first settled in Curaçao in the middle of the seventeenth century, with a subsidiary focus on a set of Ashkenazi Jews from south central Europe whose ancestors first settled in the nineteenth century. In these descriptions, this book increases work published in English on Curaçao, relatively neglected in the literature, and

it offers a description of an ethnic group in the region that has received little anthropological attention.

This is not, however, a conventional ethnography, and in fact it includes relatively little ethnographic description, perhaps because of the author's peculiar relationship with the set of people he studied (described in the second chapter). Rather, the book is easiest to approach as containing three distinct themes.

The first of these is a particular model of ethnic identity. The core of this model can be stated simply. It is that people have cognitive maps of the social landscape that identify sets of people, that indicate a cluster of attributes associated with these people, and that relate those sets to each other. Although this approach is cognitive, Benjamin is careful to point out that placing people in terms of these maps is complex, as people can have multiple identities, can possess some pertinent attributes but not others and can possess the 'wrong' attributes, and that in any event ethnic identity is as much a matter of performance and embodiment as it is a matter of cognitive placement in this conceptual space.

The second theme of the book is the history of the Jews of Curaçao, especially the Sephardi Jews who are his main concern. Benjamin presents this history as the background in which Curaçao Sephardi identity emerged and that has inflected current practices and beliefs. Benjamin tends to take that relationship between history and the current state of affairs for granted, rather than as something to be demonstrated. Even so, that history is long and interesting, and raises intriguing questions about who on Curaçao is entitled to claim to be truly local.

The third theme is the way that ethnic identity is construed and played out in modern Curaçao. Here, Benjamin's peculiar field situation has unfortunate consequences. Although he describes some interesting instances of peculiar or anomalous identity claims and ascriptions, empirically there is little more here than very brief and fairly bland vignettes, brief statements by individuals, and the like. That is, the work lacks the sort of detailed and sustained ethnographic description and analysis that would give texture to his points and make them compelling. It is worth noting, though, that there are a few interesting descriptions of public Curaçao scenes, such as a New Year's parade, that give a sense of public life and performance.

This work is distinctive in another way, as well. At times, reading it I thought that I was not confronting a work of anthropology but instead a work in, perhaps, Jewish studies. This was especially the case in the long historical descriptions, particularly those that covered the prehistory of Sephardi Jews before they left Europe for Curaçao. The looking inwards and backwards that produces this sense of the work has a benefit, for the historical material is,

as I said, interesting. However, it also has a disadvantage. Curaçao may be part of a poorly studied area in the Caribbean, the Dutch-speaking part; there may be little material on areas that are directly comparable. However, Benjamin has missed the opportunity to place the island in its broader regional context, and so inform the reader about what was and was not distinctive in Curaçao life. Similarly, although there is substantial work on ethnic identity in the region, Benjamin treats the situation he studies in isolation.

In sum, this needs to be treated as a highly specialized work, which adds to the published material on social groups in the Caribbean, but does not take the opportunity to relate these Curaçao Jews to other groups in the region.

JAMES G. CARRIER

COWAN, JANE K., MARIE-BÉNÉDICTE DEMBOUR & RICHARD A. WILSON (eds). *Culture and rights: anthropological perspectives*. xiv, 258 pp., tables, bibliogr. Cambridge: Univ. Press, 2001. £45.00 (cloth), £15.95 (paper)

This is a serious book that addresses important political issues and challenges the adequacy of the anthropological and legal concepts that impinge on them. What is culture? What are rights? How are they joined? Are these concepts of the same order? We are all familiar with the existence of claims of entitlement founded on assertions of long-standing cultural practice or on the identity associated with group membership. These are phenomena now found around the world. And the fact-by-fact account of imposed mores and alien orthodoxies, of forced appropriations of property, of losses of autonomy are familiar enough. But this book does not simply play the righteousness card, and assert that there are many places where dominant groups are behaving badly, and where the pathetic fate of the downtrodden has become known to the sympathetic anthropologist, a stance which would easily have won it many readers and much approval. Instead, the essays contained in this volume take the trouble to reflect on the contradictory and complex moral and practical aspects of what is going on, and the inadequacy of the conceptual tools with which such problems have been addressed.

This collection addresses the 'global spread of rights-based political values' that has reached local communities (p. 1). It seeks to explore 'the tensions between local and global formulations of rights' and 'the interplay between the languages and institutions at multiple levels, from the local to the transnational' (p. 2). In short, this is a most ambitious agenda, stretched from analysing the discourse of rights, the law at many levels, and the particularities

of specific rights struggles in specified cultural contexts.

What the editors contend, and the ethnographic articles demonstrate, is that the debates about universalism versus cultural relativism, group rights versus individual rights, should not be used to force us to choose between them. Treating these dichotomies as absolute alternatives has been a distraction from developing an adequate processual and transformational approach both to culture and to law. The editors speak of the way Western positive law and Islamic law essentialize social categories and identities when they give universal status to legal rules. But they point out that, in fact, in practice, this essentialization 'never completely eradicates the complexity of social facts, which present themselves in the courtroom, in the legislative arena and in political struggles. Legal principles are constantly being readjusted to the demands of the present, the unpredictable and the local' (p. 6). They insist, most persuasively, that anything one may have to say about culture and rights is itself part of culture, part of history, constantly changing, but unevenly so, locally variable, and always being revised and reconceived in multiple, but specific, changing contexts. It is that processual and contextual approach that the chapters of the book illustrate.

The papers range over wide areas of the world, and many topics. They show that the benefits to be had from the international standardization of rights in a Western model, generally emanating from the United Nations, often miss their emancipatory goal. The examples are interesting. In the first part of the book the contributors address the issues surrounding violence against women in Hawaii, the criminalization of excision operations performed by African migrants on their daughters in France, child prostitution in Thailand, and the great variety of situations of women in Botswana. The section ends with a penetrating critique of the UNESCO concept of culture by Thomas Hylland Eriksen. The second part of the book explores 'how activists involved in grassroots cultural or ethnonationalist movements have been claiming rights based on what they perceive as "their culture"' (p. 49). Here, the examples range from the predicament of the Macedonian minority in Greece, and the history of Nepalese national categorizations of its peoples in law, to the way 'indigenous culture' has been imagined in Guatemala. It ends with the sad case of the Innu of Canada towards whom a grand simulation of cultural respect and consultation was proffered by the authorities while they proceeded ineluctably with the development of mining projects.

What this excellent book shows is that the standardized legal form that the international definition of rights has taken cannot easily accommodate the complex realities of the world as it is. Could this overarching inadequacy be

remedied? Or is the paradoxical tension between the rigidities of general rules and the multiform nature of particular circumstances inevitable and ongoing?

SALLY FALK MOORE

Harvard University

DESJARLAIS, ROBERT. *Shelter blues: sanity and self-hood among the homeless*. x, 307 pp., illus., bibliogr. Philadelphia: Univ. Pennsylvania Press, 1997. £40.00 (cloth), £18.95 (paper)

There are really two books twined together in this one volume. The first is an interesting ethnographic study of homeless people classified as having mental disabilities, living in Boston's Station Street Shelter during a sixteen-month period from 1991 to 1992. The second is an extended philosophical essay on the nature of human experience that does not really work for me.

The ethnography is set in the Massachusetts State Service Center, a massive ferro-concrete monstrosity designed in the 1960s by a Brutalist architect called Paul Rudolph (p. 47), whose features include corrugated concrete walls liable to draw blood if you lean on them. It says much for the fortitude of Desjarlais's subjects that they manage to survive quite well in this 'citadel of despair' (p. 50), and some even come to feel at home in it – a classic case of appropriation.

The building serves as an apt metaphor for the modern capitalist state's attitude to the mentally ill: Bentham's Panopticon, the perfect site of observation and control, is there in the conception, but very muted in the execution (pp. 98–104). The waste of money on the architecture and subsequent rounds of spending cuts left the building incomplete: its central controlling feature, an intimidating tower, was never built. Instead, there is a 'gaping wound', a construction site frozen in time, at the heart of it. Within the ruin of Rudolph's plans, the residents find various nooks and crannies in which they can enjoy a degree of freedom. They sleep communally in a basketball court. They are medicated, counselled, and thrown out between 9 a.m. and 3 p.m. to fend for themselves, so this is no total institution. As Desjarlais aptly puts it, the culture of therapy is offset by the culture of capitalism (p. 177).

The accounts of life in the shelter are written in a self-consciously literary style, in a long series of short themed chapters. Individual residents of the shelter rarely appear for more than a page or two. Little clusters of their actions and statements are briefly introduced and used to trigger intellectualizing riffs. As a literary device this interestingly mirrors the fleeting encounters within the shelter, but allows only frustratingly incomplete glimpses of some intriguing individ-

uals. There is very little discussion of their past history, and Desjarlais admits (p. 243) that he knows little of their lives outside the shelter. Nor does he bother to discuss the demographics of the shelter's population: for instance, the fact that non-whites account for six out of eighteen female residents but only three out of twenty-eight male residents goes undiscussed in a book that largely neglects race and gender in its narrow focus on the institution of the shelter.

On the positive side, this narrow focus succeeds in showing in vivid detail how individuals manage their existence within this bureaucratic environment. Behaviour conforming to the management's notions of 'improvement' will be rewarded with praise, privileges, and tokens (a closed currency exchangeable for goods at the shelter shop). Excessively crazy demeanour ('decompensation') will result in being transferred to the much harsher regime of the closed psychiatric ward on the fourth floor. On the other hand, residents are aware that if they show too much improvement, they may cease to be regarded as mentally ill and be forced to leave the shelter. Hence the regime encourages a display of modest psychological improvement punctuated by occasional reminders of mental illness, such as repetitive pacing with head held low. The net result: thirty-three of forty-six subjects had been living in the shelter for a year or more, and fifteen had been there for over two years. In showing at the level of individual responses how the institution perpetuates itself, Desjarlais makes a valuable contribution to the literature of institutionalization.

Unfortunately, this useful work is framed by some highly questionable theorizing about the meaning of experience. In a pair of early chapters (pp. 10–24), Desjarlais draws a distinction between 'experience' and 'struggling along' and argues that, to a large extent, the shelter residents are merely doing the latter and are not capable of the former. 'Day in, day out,' he says of them, 'things happened much more on the retina, the eardrums and the fingertips than in any detached haven of mind or body' (p. 24). One wonders how he knows. This theme of lives devoid of experience fades away thereafter, before reappearing *fortissimo* in the final chapter, which concludes: 'the poverty and transience that are increasingly coming to characterize life on the fringes of many societies today suggest that experience might become, at least in some circles, a relic of the past' (p. 249). Leaving aside whether Desjarlais could prove that poverty and transience are becoming more prevalent on the kind of global scale implied, and why he focuses on those two phenomena rather than mental health, his ominous notion that poverty and transience somehow preclude experience sets a whole class of people into a fundamentally separate category from the rest of humanity. In fact, give or take some interestingly eccentric narrative styles, most of the behaviour he observes in

the Center differs only in degree from that of 'normal' folk.

THOMAS GILL

University of Tokyo

HELMREICH, STEFAN. *Silicon second nature: culturing artificial life in a digital world*. xii, 314 pp., illus., bibliogr. London, Berkeley: Univ. California Press, 1998. \$29.95 (cloth)

Silicon second nature is a critical ethnography of the ways and beliefs of a group of 'artificial life' researchers affiliated to New Mexico's Santa Fe Institute for the Sciences of Complexity. Artificial Life (known by adherents as Alife or simply AL) first emerged as a research field in the United States in the late 1980s in the wake of attempts by Artificial Intelligence (AI) scientists and cognitive theorists to build synthetic (self-organizing) models of the human mind. What Helmreich's anthropological exploration sets out to show is how the entire ethos of Artificial Life works – especially the economic, social, and intellectual contexts that source the field's primary institutional nexus and growing research empire of transitional collaborations – to take arguably the vision of synthesized life a few steps further than the preceding rationales of AI. It happens to be part of the daily work routine of computer programmers and researchers shut up at the Institute to ask how computers themselves might be used to remodel biological systems as new forms of life, or, as this protagonist describes, as 'silicon second nature'.

Successfully installing himself as a resident scholar amongst this AL community (many participants are ex-hippies so it helps to grow long locks), denim-clad Helmreich proceeds to detail the local knowledges and artefacts that are produced amongst this 'new elite' of science ambassadors (p. 201). By dint of his own attendance at research conferences, general networking, and extensive participation in virtual web-based discussion forums, Helmreich skilfully pieces together the way in which scientists' computational models of 'possible biologies' are powerfully inflected by their cultural conceptions and lived understandings of gender, kinship, sexuality, and race. Additionally, much of the text is devoted to how such understandings are believed to inform theories about 'reproduction', 'sex', 'relatedness', and 'sexual selection' in such 'artificial worlds' (with Helmreich making quite a point of the heterosexual culture in which most such researchers work). How notions of competition derived from the market economies of the capitalist West also shape scientists' beliefs in 'artificial ecologies' wherein populations of computer programmes vie to 'survive' and 'reproduce' will no doubt interest biologists and non-biologists alike.

Some of the best discussion is a close study of the imagery encoded by scientists as they

talk about computer simulations. When computers may be imagined as self-contained worlds comprised of programmes that are potentially or actually alive, the cosmology of Artificial Life also devolves into other virtual and alternative sites for evolution. Many of the male scientists interviewed by Helmreich report a strong sense of communion with their computers, believing that their own bodies and the insides of the terminals they work with are cut of the same fabric, that each are basic fragments of the same fundamental reality. And perhaps it is not so surprising that such 'complex' kinds of simulated persons – persons whose bodies comprise what one AL informant describes as 'teeming with unimaginable intricacy' (p. 196) – are able to make themselves known to others by way of their hubristic visions of immortalized self-transcendence. Cultivating institutional debates on the future of 'artilects' (artificial intellects), questioning who or what should become the next dominant species: such discussions are framed within AL culture not only as important political issues of the twenty-first century, but as developments for which these scientists imagine themselves to be uniquely responsible.

Though the Santa Fe Institute is only one of several sites around the world where work on Artificial Life is currently conducted, this ethnography helps chart the wider picture. In its retelling of a story about changing definitions of life as simulation, one starts to appreciate how computer scientists, biologists, physicists, and philosophers have all been busy heralding new conceptions and configurations of the natural, the artificial, and the organic in late twentieth-century United States and European culture. (Later discussions in the book helpfully draw out some of the distinctions between North American computational approaches and the more philosophical inclinations of European AL approaches based on *autopoiesis* [a processual view of 'self-producing' living systems first promoted by Francisco Varela, the Latin American biologist].) The interest here for cultural anthropologists should be obvious. What is less obvious is the fact that such exploratory work is not exactly easy ethnography to do, as certain of Helmreich's rather more reproachful and threatened informants make quite clear. I only wish Helmreich had dared to include more of the undermining e-mail texts and conversations that sceptical scientists, as the author himself notes, from time to time directed his way. That would have made the text even more compelling to read, though probably somewhat harder to write. But this is a minor grumble. *Silicon second nature* is a fine example of what the best cross-disciplinary synthesis work that is contemporary science ethnography can hope to achieve as social critique of Western technoscience.

MONICA KONRAD

School of Advanced Study, University of London

KNIGHT, JOHN (ed.). *Natural enemies: people-wildlife conflicts in anthropological perspective*. ix, 254 pp., bibliogr. London, New York: Routledge, 2000. £15.99 (paper)

The sub-field of environmental anthropology – as this has been developing within European social anthropology in the 1990s – has emerged as a thriving area for research and an indispensable part of the teaching curriculum in several anthropology departments. John Knight's edited collection, *Natural enemies*, is a valuable new addition to this new anthropological literature on the environment, addressing, from a thoroughly comparative perspective, conflicts between human communities and animal species.

The editor's introduction to this volume is a scholarly essay that attempts to demarcate the topic of human-animal confrontation as an anthropological object of study in its own right. The expression 'people-wildlife conflicts' – which also appears in the book's title – is used here to refer to a wide range of phenomena that involve antagonism between human society and non-human living beings. The origins of this antagonism often lie in real or imagined threats posed by wildlife to human populations, livestock, agricultural production, human safety, and well-being. John Knight focuses on the discourses employed to describe these threats and the cultural variation that accounts for them. Divergent perceptions of wildlife pestilence give rise to different standards of pest control and conflicting expectations about wildlife management. Some cultural worldviews prioritize human needs over species protection, while others, such as those of some Western conservationists, might or might not exclude humans from the animal realm. Knight deals systematically with these varied perceptions of wildlife, drawing examples from within and beyond the anthropological record. His account adds to the greater anthropological project of denaturalizing the human-environmental relationship and sets the foundation for further study in the field.

The chapters by the contributors examine the opposition between human society and the representatives of the wild as manifested in particular cultural contexts. Some chapters focus on animals that have been overtly stigmatized by human society. Chimpanzees in Sierra Leone, Paul Richards explains, are associated with negative memories of violence and abduction that stretch back in local history. Not surprisingly, chimpanzee behaviour serves as a model for pursuing political claims and arguments. Conservationists would certainly benefit from understanding the history of the particular species in local culture, before they proceed with the implementation of environmental policies. Another stigmatized animal, the fox, has been treated in rural Britain as such vermin, justifications being employed to legitimize fox-hunting by the elite – particularly in response to accusa-

tions and protest by animal rights groups. But fox-hunting, Garry Marvin reminds us, is a complex drama, supported by a rich set of performative aspects of culture and involving complex relationships that include additional species, such as horses and hounds.

Other contributions to the volume emphasize the effect of wildlife pestilence on not particularly affluent indigenous populations. Subsistence cultivators, such as the Malawians and Nepalese villagers, studied by Brian Morris and Ben Campbell respectively, are particularly vulnerable to the depredations of wild animals. The latter also have to confront the alliance of international environmentalists with national park authorities. Similarly, crop-raiding pigs, Simon Rye describes, add to the farming toil of Javanese transmigrants in Sumatra. Belief in pig-shapeshifting – an ability attributed to forest-dwelling Sumatrans – is founded upon the migrants' hostility towards the pigs and the wild. Likewise, cultural notions of sharing within human society or between humans and wildlife find an expression in human-elephant antagonism, as Axel Kohler's account of elephant-shapeshifting among the Baka of Congo documents.

Other chapters focus on species that trigger contradictory symbolic and social associations. The Saami reindeer-herders in Sweden feel hostility towards the wolf, a sentiment not shared by the Swedish urban dwellers and neo-shamans studied by Galina Lindquist. The urbanites treat the wolf as a natural spiritual symbol and advocate wolf conservation at the expense of the indigenous Saami whose livestock is affected by wolf predation. In a similar way, bears in upland Japan have been traditionally treated as an enemy of the human society, but nowadays, as Knight points out, urban images of the animal focus on its cute, vulnerable profile as a displaced creature threatened by the presence of humans. Pigeon-shooting in Pennsylvania is justified in terms of a pestilence discourse, but Hoon Song, in another chapter, explains that additional pigeons are imported in the particular region to become targets. Finally, Kay Milton, in a particularly stimulating chapter, discusses a case of 'reverse' conservation. This time it is the conservationists themselves who favour the shooting of the American ruddy duck as it threatens to replace the European white-headed subspecies. Kay Milton takes the opportunity to reflect upon ideas that relate the constitution of environmentalism, foregrounding the fact that conservationist attempts to restore nature indirectly relate to a conceptual attempt to exclude humans and the products of their activity from nature.

Unlike previous anthropological accounts of cultural perceptions of animals – most of which had been primarily concerned with either animal symbolism or technical aspects of pastoralism – this volume makes a significant contribution to the study of human-animal

relationships *per se*, putting the subject of 'people-wildlife' conflicts on the anthropological agenda. It is also a book which will supplement courses in environmental anthropology and provide inspiration to enlightened specialists in wildlife management and conservation. But above all, *Natural enemies* constitutes valuable empirical testimony to the complexity of the human-environmental relation, thereby adding to our understanding of nature as primarily social and negotiable.

DIMITRIS THEODOSSOPOULOS

University of Wales, Lampeter

MAKRIS, G.P. *Changing masters: spirit possession and identity construction among slave descendants and other subordinates in the Sudan*. xiii, 432 pp., bibliogr. Evanston: Northwestern Univ. Press, 2000. \$75.00 (cloth)

Changing masters represents an important contribution to the study of spirit possession cults, focusing as it does on the little-known *tumbura* cult in northern Sudan. The author locates *tumbura* as part of what he calls the *zar* spirit complex of Islamic Africa, seemingly close to the much-better-known *zar bore* cult practised by northern Sudanese women of Arab descent. *Tumbura*, however, is practised by freed slaves and their descendants, and includes men among its devotees. Historically, slaves were drawn from the darker coloured, non-Islamic peoples of southern and western Sudan. These slaves were seen as commodities without religion, descent, or history, and slave ancestry continues to carry a stigma into the present period.

A discussion of this historical context reveals the ways that Islamized slaves and their descendants developed a counter-hegemonic discourse expressed in alternative Islamic practices like *tumbura* that sought to assert their humanity. The main thesis of the book is that the healing of the possession victims that culminates in their initiation into the cult rests on the articulation of an alternative positive self-identity that negates the sub-humanity attributed to them by dominant others. Makris argues that this is done through the manipulation of three bundles of meaning: religious belief, descent, and historical consciousness. The self-identified 'Sudani' who make up the cult's following are from diverse backgrounds, united by their subordination and by Islam, but through the cult's narratives they construct themselves as a supra-tribal community of 'original people' and owners of the land.

What is interesting about Makris's account is that his description of the cult's adaptation to changing circumstances reminds us to see culture in processual terms as a flow of meaning. His data suggest that the distinct practices of *tumbura* and *zar bore* interact with each other and, thanks to the creative capabilities of contemporary offi-

cients, cross traditional demarcation lines. Thus Makris concludes that *tumbura* is approaching ever closer to *zar bore*. He documents the decline of the cult so that only two groups remain in the greater Khartoum area. This is the greatest limitation of the study, for the data are by necessity derived from the observation of these two remaining groups, although the author has made attempts to generalize by including information about the cult as it is practised in other areas and, most importantly, by concerning himself with the historical perspective.

Makris is at pains to point out that, although the majority of the devotees in the two groups he observed were women, *tumbura* is not essentially a female cult as appears to be the case for *zar bore*, but is a cult of non-Arab, Muslim subalterns that has recently come to be practised mainly by women. The cult's organization into male and female hierarchical lines articulates a vision of ritual descent that presents the devotees as human beings and good Muslims rather than sub-human slaves. In doing so, it projects into the past a collective identity, which, though created through subordination, is stripped of its negative connotations. The devotees are transformed into true human beings and owners of the land. Thus, in the author's understanding, *tumbura* possession offers the patient an historically informed framework within which his or her ailment acquires meaning. Through the *tumbura* songs, the devotees represent themselves and their lives as members of a distinct community acting in historical time. This allows them to present their history as being of the same order as its Arab counterpart. The songs give them a voice to talk about and thus realize their imagined community.

Finally, Makris describes the '*tumbura* process' consisting of four stages, divination, therapy, thanksgiving, and initiation into the cult, by which the patient's shattered, subordinate self is reconstituted into the cult's framework of meaning. He argues that the key to this process lies in the transformation of individual cases into members of a collectivity. The patient is given a position in a ritual descent system that goes back to prophet Muhammad through the manipulation of those bundles of meaning that Makris calls descent and religion. In the process, the novice changes masters: no longer a sub-human slave, she becomes a human being under the authority of the Sufi *Shaykh Abd al-Qadir al-Jilani*.

In all, *Changing masters* provides us with a novel understanding of a possession cult; familiar in its similarities to *zar bore*, but nevertheless significant because of its differences. The work therefore adds considerably to our understanding of the complex class of phenomena commonly glossed as *zar* spirit possession.

IAN S. FAIRWEATHER

University of Manchester

MATSUOKA, ATSUKO & JOHN SORENSEN. *Ghosts and shadows: construction of identity and community in an African diaspora*. xiv, 261 pp., map, bibliogr. London, Toronto: Univ. Toronto Press, 2001. £35.00 (cloth), £14.00 (paper)

In *Ghosts and shadows*, Atsuko Matsuoka and John Sorenson explore experiences of the Canadian diaspora for exiles from the Horn of Africa. Focusing on the power of memory and the ways in which movement across international boundaries affects myths of homeland and return, the authors set out to 'consider how ethnic and national forms of affiliation are constructed, transmitted, and transformed' (p. 6). Challenging the classic image of the powerless exile 'stripped of the specificity of culture, place and history' (p. 3), they suggest that, while the process of displacement may appear to constitute a complete break with the past, '[t]hose who undergo this experience are not simply passive inhabitants of a dead zone of loss and estrangement' (p. 4). Instead, exile is 'a fecund space for new ways of organizing experience – for creating new affiliations, associations and communities and developing new identities' (p. 4).

Drawing on Avery Gordon, Matsuoka and Sorenson argue that the 'deterritorialized space of exile is a *haunted* one' (p. 5). Like Gordon, they suggest that the past, rendered invisible by the experience of exile, produces material effects which ultimately inform and influence present circumstances. As such, 'haunted spaces have their own structures of feeling, their own moral economies' (p. 5), which form the basis for group identity in the diaspora and facilitate the ordering and reordering of social and political categories that ultimately 'remake' the exiles' world 'in the context of a charged strangeness' (p. 5). Exilic identities, consequently, are structured by a myth of return while simultaneously being influenced by experiences in the country of resettlement.

Treating the approximately ten thousand refugees and immigrants who fled Ethiopia during the 1980s, Matsuoka and Sorenson focus on three self-defined groups – Eritreans, Ethiopians, and Oromos – asking how each have developed different styles of adaptation in their community organizations and politics, and how these differences have been shaped by the remembrance of an imagined homeland. Following on this, their primary argument is that the cohesive, homogeneous exile community – as viewed by Canadian government authorities – is, in fact, complexly diverse. Their field data, based primarily on interviews, points instead to 'struggles "inside" this supposedly homogenous community – struggles to define and represent various identities' (p. 14), counterdiscourses that fragment any sense of internal cohesion. It is this clash of different understandings of cultural identity in ethnic and national discourses among exiles from the Horn of Africa that points to

ways in which history is interpreted and utilized to construct an imagined diasporic identity.

Matsuoka and Sorenson challenge us to refocus our discussion of the diaspora experience, to view exile communities as existing simultaneously in multiple spaces, constructed and maintained through the affective power of memory and longing. Clearly for the Eritreans, Ethiopians, and Oromos living in the diaspora, an imagined community is intimately linked to the powerful and unifying symbol of homeland. And it is precisely because communal identity is envisioned in relationship to nostalgic memories of homeland that community should be understood to be moving and moveable, defined by discursive practices rather than by pre-established social structures or the fixed co-ordinates of a geographic space. This is where the authors ultimately fail to live up to their own challenge; it is precisely at this juncture between homeland and exile home that *Ghosts and shadows* falls short. While the experiences of these communities clearly indicate a challenge to classical notions in early immigration studies of core and periphery, the authors tend to fall back on the idea that homeland, as defined by geo-political, rather than nostalgic diasporic imagined realities, is the presumed dominant core of cultural discourse and activity shaping the ways in which the diaspora, still in their eyes the presumed periphery, is constructed. For the authors, it seems, exilic identity is informed solely by the socio-political realities of back home. Their ethnography, which thickly describes the history and politics of Ethiopia, all but ignores the actual lived experience of everyday life in Canada. The complex juxtapositions that inform everyday lives in the diaspora are left unexplored, providing little insight into how these refugees organize meaning and action in displacement, or how the complex juxtaposition of cultural forms that are shaped by the continuous and comprehensive interplay between here, there, and everywhere play themselves out in the daily lives of the authors' informants. *Ghosts and shadows* leaves us haunted by the past, but still wondering about the present.

JOANN D'ALISERA

University of Arkansas

MOORE, HENRIETTA L. & TODD SANDERS (eds).

Magical interpretations, material realities: modernity, witchcraft and the occult in postcolonial Africa. xiii, 253 pp., illus., bibliogr. London, New York: Routledge, 2001. £16.99 (paper)

Magical interpretations helpfully consolidates the emergent analytic within anthropology of examining African witchcraft through the context of modernity. With ten solid ethnographic chapters and an engaging introduction, the book provides the reader with many insights into the varied ways through which 'the occult' is an historically

and morally significant domain of thought and practice for many Africans to interpret, resist, exploit, fear, ridicule, and manage processes engendered by particular configurations of modernity.

Moore and Sanders locate this analytic within the anthropological tradition of trying to 'make sense' of African witchcraft. Although noting new theoretical, methodological, and topical approaches to the resurgence in the anthropology of African witchcraft since the late 1980s, the newer writers share an analytic with structural-functionalists of the 1950s and 1960s that explains 'both the nature and the prevalence of witchcraft on changed relations of power, production and consumption' (p. 9). The significant difference of the newer analytic is that witchcraft is viewed as not only shaped by but also constitutive of modernity in particular locales. This assumption highlights the varied cultural inflections of modernity, contributing to the term's pluralization ('multiple modernities') and thereby signalling the dominant anthropological project of destabilizing Western teleologies such as modernization or development through examining the lives of Others. Moore and Saunders note the danger of reinscribing the us/them dichotomy of such a project, but not every contributor is able to avoid it.

Many chapters explore the theme of local responses to changes arising from modernity. Francis Nyamnjoh details key categories of personhood in the Bamenda Grassfields of Cameroon affecting development initiatives; categories which he characterizes as the populist epistemological order that assumes the visible realm is shaped, in part, by actions in an invisible realm. Susan Rasmussen also provides an analysis of indigenous terms of ritual power, in her case of the Tuareg of Niger. She insightfully examines changes in the content and uses of these terms, suggestively showing how they mutually inform alterations in social relationships and status within Tuareg communities due to economic and political changes arising from the state and global processes. Situating his discussion amongst the Ihanzu, Todd Sanders suggests the murkiness of the invisible realm provides sufficient ambiguity for these Africans to debate and discuss the morality of the market, increasingly important given the exacerbation of inequalities under structural adjustment in Tanzania. Jane Parish uses contrasting attitudes towards shrines and their talismans amongst Akan youth to look at some of the local debates over modernity and witchcraft. Richly documenting the multiple sources of material insecurity facing Sowetans, Adam Ashforth argues that the personal anxieties arising from witchcraft beliefs will constantly be fed by and feed the great economic and personal uncertainties of these South Africans. Misty Bastian's detailed analysis of three sub-genres of the Nigerian popular press about magical modernity, situated in the changing political economy of urban areas and the nation, offers an

examination of how global modernity is refashioned for local people's own situations. Rosalind Shaw gives an excellent study of how witchcraft practices in colonial and post-colonial Sierra Leone have been shaped by memories of the earlier transregional process of the slave trade.

Other chapters explore the complex skein of relations between state practices and witchcraft township, the use of youths to instil fear under the Banda state in Malawi, and shifting generational politics. Rijk van Dijk suggests how laughter at confessions of occult practices acted as a form of conviviality with and against political authority. Isak Niehaus explicitly engages in the politics of witchcraft by examining a 1996 commission of inquiry into witchcraft in South Africa and what it means in terms of governance towards the violence connected with witchcraft. Cyprian Fisiy and Peter Geschiere plumb their deep research experiences to link the uses and type of witchcraft in Cameroon to state development and political projects, particularly the linkage between the dissolution of state-led economic change and the rise of accumulative forms of witchcraft in the 1990s.

Magical interpretations shows how witchcraft is an unyielding, if not growing, concern and presence in much of Africa and how it can be a diagnostic and vehicle of varied social, economic, and political processes. Although it is sometimes unclear whether the various authors treat discourse as separate from (as suggested in the book's title) or also constitutive of material reality – itself a defining debate in the study of witchcraft – and although some chapters are unable to shake the us/them (as in 'modern/local') dichotomy, this collection demonstrates how the new analytic is productive of important anthropological insights about African witchcraft.

BLAIR RUTHERFORD

Carleton University

NAZPARY, JOMA. *Post-Soviet chaos: violence and dispossession in Kazakhstan*. ix, 217 pp., tables, bibliogr. London: Pluto Press, 2001. £45.00 (cloth), £18.99 (paper)

This is a welcome addition to the sparse anthropological literature on Central Asia, specifically urban Central Asia. It sets out to describe responses of those people in Almaty, the former capital of Kazakhstan, who have suffered most from the collapse of the Soviet Union and Kazakhstan's emergence as an independent republic in 1991. It is worth noting in passing that Nazpary's fieldwork was undertaken in 1995–6, the period when Kazakhstan's economic depression was at its worst.

The commonest description of the situation is *bardak*, or 'chaos', which, as Nazpary explores, indicates a loss of social and moral order. Following Humphrey (1996), Nazpary focuses on

the double loss in the notion of the 'dispossessed', at once uncoupled from a paternalistic state and, simultaneously, deprived of rights to work and domestic stability. For those who have suddenly found themselves thus marginalized and unemployed, the culprits of this predicament are quite clear: first, local elites who have used their previous *nomenklatura* connections to become the new rich; secondly, capitalist rationality spearheaded by United States intervention. There is a necessary picking-apart of such conspiracy theories in the opening and closing chapters. Acknowledging that there is in fact evidence of order (orders?) in exchange networks or even highly organized racketeering gangs, a 'chaotic mode of domination' is proposed as a means of analysing the chaos that seems to frame accounts of daily life. Essentially, this term refers to the dissolution of an overarching common understanding of the Soviet social and moral order. From 1987, the influence of the centre over the periphery had already begun to wane, resulting in the emergence of local, often criminal networks. Independence exacerbated this situation with new governmental institutions often becoming closely intertwined with such networks.

Nazpary is clear that his aim is to present a picture of contemporary Almaty from the point of view of the people who have suffered most from the recent massive, social and economic upheavals. This he does admirably. The reader is left with a numbing sense of a cul-de-sac, that all sense of security has been lost, that value systems have been completely overturned. However, it sometimes seems as if the author has taken at face value informants' statements that disorder has replaced order, and has sought to theorize chaos as a new and current condition, reifying local understandings. Yet the theme of current disorder set against previous orders has long been a motif of informal Soviet discourse. Similarly, inequality and differential access to good jobs, apartments, polyclinics, and so on has a venerable history in the Soviet Union, particularly so in Almaty, where elite networks were famously even more tightly closed than in Moscow. Nazpary's agenda is pretty clear from the acknowledgements that encourage the reader to 'take part in the struggle against global capitalism, which is the prime cause of [the plight of many in Almaty]'. That at least is an honest declaration of faith, but sits oddly with the perhaps slightly disingenuous presentation of the naive fieldworker.

Those are my quibbles. Authorial position aside, the great strength of Nazpary's book is in the precise minutiae of how ethnic, gender, and generational tensions are manifested in the everyday micro-strategies to make ends meet, and the narratives that try to account for what has happened, try to make sense of this sudden abandonment. In particular, the carefully detailed chronicling of the sexual strategies of survival, the sudden escalation of an ethnic street brawl,

the economic inability of a young man to compete for sexual favours – these vivid pictures powerfully show, rather than tell, the immediate, devastating consequences for people of the collapse of empires, sweeping changes in political ideologies and economic systems. Nazparay has provided a necessary counterpoint to the public success stories of the resource-rich Kazakhstan, convincingly demonstrating the gulf that divides rich and poor, and precisely how people struggle to remake their lives. *Post-Soviet chaos* certainly has a relevance well beyond Kazakhstan and the former Soviet Union in counting the human cost of global politics.

CATHERINE ALEXANDER

University of Cambridge

SAVISHINSKY, JOEL S. *Breaking the watch: the meanings of retirement in America*. 281 pp., bibliogr. London, Ithaca: Cornell Univ. Press, 2000. £16.95 (cloth)

This superb book will be of great interest to those who study ageing, the life course, and the post-modern self. It is one of the very few works to tackle the new reality of American retirement from an ethnographic and qualitative perspective. It contributes in important ways to our understanding of adulthood and old age in recent times, as these have changed to include increased longevity and improved health and the bringing to bear of greater executive consciousness on this period of life. It is therefore a major work.

In a series of long interviews, interactions, and conversations over coffee, Savishinsky interviews twenty-six elders from the town of 'Shelby', New York, as they face retirement and through the following several years. The twenty-six were not chosen to represent some larger reality, but were accessible and willing. One of the most interesting things about this group is that, while they inhabit the same area, unevenly connected to a college town that is both rural and with small businesses and light industry, they are never described as making up a community as it is traditionally construed. However, the lives here overlap variously; some might work at the same place, or use the same accountant, or take breakfast at the same shop. The author describes this as a 'community biography' (p. 243), told 'through the biographies of its people' (p. 243).

Retirement is presented in several linked ways, as unfolding over time, as unmoored from meaningful ritual transition, as related to the prior life course, and as issue focused, most significantly around health, gender, and finances. 'Talk' between Savishinsky and his informants touches on dozens of additional critical issues concerning retirement. These are highlighted and summarized in detail in each chapter.

The core of this book is found both in the author's decision to let people speak largely for themselves and in his skill as a writer. This is

wonderfully written, skilful in its presentation, and subtle as it moves around different points of view. Savishinsky permits the reader to meet individuals and their families through conversation that draws the reader in and through lengthy, highly readable narratives by the twenty-six informants about how they have faced, adapted to, and got through retirement.

Most of the twenty-six informants are young by recent standards, in their 50s and early 60s; only two are in their 70s. The past cultural conflation of 'retirement' with 'old age' is not necessarily in operation any more. In a new segment of life, under an individualism of self-construction and also subject to procedures of 'self-management', these retirees face issues centred in the construction of personal meaning from multiple sources: latent interests, family, activities, community, place, routines, new work, relationships, detachment, responsibility, and freedom. How these informants face these and other issues is fascinating.

There are several issues that remain unattended to in this book. This is not an ethnically diverse sample (informants appear to be white); and most informants appear to be middle income and above, ranging from a postman to the physician couple from well-to-do families. Most appear to be well educated and to own their own homes. More fundamentally, issues of income and assets, while important as areas of contrast in the book, receive little in the way of detailed discussion. It is very rare that dollar amounts for anything are given. Some informants refer to having stock portfolios. In certain ways this is an elite sample. While the insights into retirement provided by this sample are significant, research similar in form with recent working-class retirees would help us better understand both issues and the meaning of 'self-hood' to those with far fewer resources. Similar work with ethnic minorities is also critical.

Of course, no book can do everything. What we have here is a compelling study of the self in transition, from the central portion of life into its last chapters. The burden for developing and carrying out this transition is placed on individuals, with very little social guidance or recognition. 'Self-management' becomes a full-time job of sorts. Savishinsky shows how people shine some light in the tunnel, which for them may have darkness at its end.

ROBERT L. RUBINSTEIN

University of Maryland Baltimore County

SCHOFFELEERS, MATTHEW. *Religion and the dramatisation of life: spirit beliefs and rituals in southern and central Malawi*. 166 pp., map, illus., bibliogr. Blantyre, Malawi: CLAIM, 2000. £7.95 (paper)

This is a timely collection of six important and representative ethnographic papers on the reli-

gion and rituals of the Maravi-speaking peoples of central and southern Malawi. Their author, Matthew Schoffeleers, worked in this area for sixteen years as a Roman Catholic missionary priest and has published two major studies of the oral traditions and religious history of the Mang'anja people of the region, a sub-group of the Chewa.

The topics covered in the six papers are equally divided between rain cults, territorial spirit mediumship, and cults of affliction. Their content is a mix of 'raw' ethnography and theoretical argument, the latter most evident in the fifth chapter, where Schoffeleers measures his detailed study of spirit possession in the Lower Shire Valley against the generalizing propositions of I.M. Lewis and Lewis's critic Peter J. Wilson. He concludes that neither Lewis's account of possession as a female response to perceived male domination nor Wilson's intra-gender status rivalry adequately account for the facts, and that consequently 'spirit possession cannot be regarded as a uniform phenomenon in its relationship to the social system' (p. 113). This conclusion emerges from a systematic analysis of historical evidence pointing to fundamental social-structural changes from the middle of the nineteenth century, changes that affected the nature and functions of mediumship. One of these changes was the appearance from 1850 onwards of male mediums in what had earlier been an all-female profession. Schoffeleers's materials are sufficiently ample to allow the construction of an elaborate typology and the formulation of testable hypotheses – a notable advance in anthropological sophistication in this area.

In a brief introductory chapter penned in 1997, Schoffeleers restates his seemingly plausible view, since contested by Boucher, Van Breugel, and Morris, that the famous *nyau* ritual of the Chewa-speaking peoples is a symbolic re-enactment of the Chewa creation myth. According to this myth, Chiuta ('God') originally lived in the sky above a waterless and lifeless earth. Then Chiuta descended to earth, bringing with him the life-giving rain, together with the first man and woman and all the animals. God, humans, and animals lived happily and peacefully together until man accidentally discovered fire, causing all the animals except dog and goat to become his enemies. God returned to the sky and humans became subject to death. Schoffeleers argues that the *nyau* ritual, when men wearing animal masks move from the forest into the village and socialize over beer with the inhabitants, represents the original state of paradisical harmony, and the ritual's concluding episode, when the theoriomorphic masks are burned, re-enacts the primal folly when fire brought conflict and death on human society.

Schoffeleers touches on a further controversial issue relating to this origin myth in his discussion of indigenous concepts of what he calls a

'Supreme Being'. His Mang'anja ethnography does, indeed, reveal a symbolic identity between the paramount chief and Chiuta as sky-god who acts as husband to the female earth. The chief's ritual congress with his wife evokes Chiuta's fertilization of the earth with his rain-semen. Schoffeleers's analysis appears ethnographically well founded and convincing, yet the term 'Supreme Being' applied without qualification to the entity known, among several other names, as Chiuta ('Big Bow') would seem to convey the implication that this masculine component of a dualistic scheme of cosmic complementarity is in some fundamental way analogous to the all-dominating male deity of the three Semitic world religions. That such an implication is untenable seems apparent from evidence, obliquely mentioned by Schoffeleers (p. 59), that the 'male' Chiuta (or Chauta) can in certain contexts be female and, as Brian Morris has put it in *Animals and ancestors* (2002), a mothering presence, immanent in the material world. Chewa concepts of divinity may well be more sophisticated than their many ethnographers have yet been able to come to terms with.

Finally, one would like to see this author's exceptionally rich data placed in a larger ethnographic and theoretical context. The 'dramatisation of life' referred to in the title invites comparison with the works of Michel Leiris and Victor Turner, while the cosmic oppositions of rain and fire so vividly evoked in the Chewa origin myth resonate with a mythic theme common to the Luba cosmos as described in Luc de Heusch's *Le roi ivre*. The Frazerian motif of divine kingship is plainly relevant to the symbolic role of Mang'anja chiefship, while the chief's ritual congress with his earth-mother wife similarly evokes the classical *hieros gamos*.

ROY WILLIS

University of Edinburgh

WEISMANTEL, MARY. *Cholas and pishtacos: stories of race and sex in the Andes*. xlvi, 326 pp., maps, plates, bibliogr. London, Chicago: Univ. Chicago Press, 2001. £38.00 (cloth), £14.50 (paper)

This book explores how race and sex interact in Andean social life through two figures: *cholas* (bi-racial market women) and *pishtacos* (imaginary White slaughterers of Indians). Following Butler, Weismantel approaches race and sex performatively, deriving them from penetrative and accumulative interactions with two coded positions, one White and male, the other Indian and female. Individuals may occupy different positions in different interactions, which they successively embody to form a more stable identity (pp. 174–5). The argument requires that sexual-racial positions be binary (p. xxxii), so Weismantel merges Indians and Blacks as non-Whites (chap. 6), ignoring how each has been

racialized differently. It also requires that all parties understand penetration and accumulation sexually and racially. Weismantel claims that they do (p. 192) and produces unequivocal evidence for White Andean elites, but not for those she calls 'Indians' and '*cholas*', most of whom reject those labels as insults. Do these people respond to racist treatment by adopting or developing their own racial ideologies? Weismantel begs this question and simply assumes a social consensus that 'race matters' in the Andes. As used here, the concept of performativity suppresses ethnographic investigation of such issues and becomes a vehicle for imputing strategic essentialist notions of race and sex as the hidden truth of Andean social life.

The sustained analysis of how *chola* market women work, consume, and dress (chaps. 2-3) may be the book's best moment. Weismantel argues that they break White codes that confine women, food preparation, and consumption to the home and separate them from monetized transactions in public space. Whites view them as licentious Indian whores for working, eating, and selling in public, but these same activities give them a degree of masculine Whiteness that condenses around their concealed purses, which Weismantel views as phallic (p. 248). These discussions are often more nuanced than Weismantel's analytical assertions of race, but do not escape them entirely. By confining her discussion of racial relativity to *cholas*, she often implies (perhaps inadvertently) that everyone else is unproblematically White or Indian, which is hardly so. This selective emphasis queerly reproduces the White male obsession with these women that Weismantel documents so well. Systematic research into the broader spectrum of Andean racial ambiguity would have better explained and partially diminished the *chola* as fetish, but that was not the goal.

Weismantel introduces *pishtacos* as White exploiters and commodifiers of Indian lives by placing them in the grand analytical contrast of market exchange versus reciprocity (pp. 139-45). This dated approach still raises the question of why the worry is about fat and slaughter, not money and labour (see Gose in this journal, 1986). Weismantel's answer is that Indians see fat as the embodiment of their productive and reproductive capacity, which *pishtacos* violently extract and sell to Whites, who consume it in their distinctive medicine and technology (pp. 199-213). By seeing *pishtaco* beliefs only as a commentary on exploitation, and ignoring their emphasis on sacrificial assimilation, Weismantel overlooks how they assert consubstantiality and depict White claims to be racially separate from Indians as a massive fraud. Her most original claim, that *pishtacos* are also rapists, lacks ethnographic foundation. She produces no evidence of her own, only two short unpublished field notes from the Vicos project in the 1950s. In one, an informant explicitly denies that *pishtacos* are rapists (p. 153) but Weismantel insists that they

are, presumably to further her basic contention that violent penetration constitutes Whiteness. Psychoanalysis definitively supplants ethnography when she invokes an equivalence of eyeballs and testicles to extend the *pishtaco*'s reach into Lima (p. 255), now as the *sacaos* or 'eye-snatcher' (for a critique, see Canessa in this journal, 2000). These interpretative liberties, along with deliberate misreadings of other scholars' work, errors of fact and bibliography, repeatedly compromise even the book's more credible arguments.

The author's sensationalist treatment of *cholas* and *pishtacos* serves her primary goal of making race 'visible' (p. xxxii). Her caricatured and reductionist rendering of these figures accentuates the racism in Andean social life, and presents it as absolute and unqualified. By so doing, Weismantel unreflexively constitutes her own credentials as anti-racist external observer. Those who enact the script of Andean White male are racists and rapists whereas Weismantel, by virtue of speaker's privilege, is not. This presumed moral authority is as questionable as the analysis from which it emerges, and could itself be construed as racist for the distancing superiority it implicitly claims from its omnipotent American standpoint. In short, this book exploits the racist pain it purports to describe, and performatively increases it with every self-serving exaggeration.

PETER GOSE

University of Regina

WHITEHOUSE, HARVEY. *Arguments and icons: divergent modes of religiosity*. x, 204 pp., maps, diagr., bibliogr. Oxford: Univ. Press, 2000. £40.00 (cloth), £17.99 (paper)

This is a clearly written text with a seemingly convincing argument. However, by page 102 I felt that I was being submitted to one of its main ideas: 'th[e] emphasis on the rote-learning of doctrine through continual repetition'. This is what Whitehouse refers to as 'doctrinal religiosity'; it differs, we are told, fundamentally from 'imagistic religiosity'. This challenging book has a central thesis which is reiterated in various forms throughout the book's nine chapters.

The thesis runs something like this. There is an analytical category called 'religiosity', which exists in the two modes already mentioned. These modes 'constitute tendencies towards particular patterns of codification, transmission, cognitive processing and political association' (p. 1, emphasis removed). The mechanism which constitutes the tendencies in these patterns is memory. Not any memory but very specific types: episodic and semantic. The first is memory of personal experiences, unique events of a person's life; semantic memory is memory of a more general and propositional kind. According to recent theory in cognitive psychology, the semantic ultimately derives from the episodic, in what is called a 'cognitive processing loop'.

Memory is, so to speak, driving the show here. In the 'imagistic mode', episodic memory rules the day and as a result one is limited to small-scale, regionally 'fragmented' social and ritual organization. Given the nature of memory operative here, the social ties between people are 'highly cohesive'. Melanesia is Whitehouse's exemplar of this 'tendency'. Where semantic memory rules the day, large anonymous communities are possible – such as world religions – a consequence of the way doctrine is transmitted through routine patterns. Exemplars of this 'tendency' are Christianity, mission Christianity, and the hybrid forms that emerge in places like Melanesia.

This is all very neat. The evidence for what cognitive psychologists refer to as episodic and semantic memory is interesting. But their research applies to individual minds. Can their findings be generalized (in good semantic memory fashion) not only to collectives as diverse as Melanesia and Western Christianity, but to the complexities of ethnography and history documented for these collectives? This is the theoretical challenge the book seeks to demonstrate through ethnographic and historical illustration.

Consider the following. This is part of the discussion in chapter 2 (p. 35), where the different 'modalities of codification' are highlighted between 'doctrinal' and 'imagistic religiosity':

No Christian ritual, no painting, no hymn, no statue, no altar, no posture in church – in fact, no aspect of Christian culture in general – can be adequately understood without reference to a body of ideas codified in language. This is by no means true of all religions, including many of those in pre-contact Papua New Guinea.

Even if we assume with the author that pre-contact Papua New Guineans had 'religions', it is not clear to me how his final sentence can possibly be correct. How can one have an idea, even in a 'mode of religiosity', which does not also exist – is codified to some degree – in language? The images revealed in ritual, in contrast to talk about them, might be what is specifically valued, as Roy Wagner and others have argued for various Melanesian cases. But the ideas must exist under some form of description (language, myth), otherwise they could not be performed in the first place.

In fact, the split between 'imagistic' and 'doctrinal' modes is very difficult to sustain in actual ethnographic instances. If I refer to my own material from among the Fuyuge of highland Papua, and in particular the performance of their *gab* ritual, it is apparent that the ritual can be described as much in 'doctrinal' form – as a set of procedures to be followed one after the other – as in 'imagistic' form, as the revelation of a distinct performance that must be witnessed in order to have an effect.

The problem with this radical split is further exemplified around Whitehouse's discussion of 'cargo cults'. He notes: 'It has often been argued that "cargo cults" constitute a passing phase in the emergence of Melanesian nationalist and other pragmatic protest against colonial states' (p. 47). According to his model, they are exemplars of the 'doctrinal mode of religiosity': semantic as opposed to episodic memory. Unfortunately, though, none of the references he cites in this context were published after 1974. Is this because anthropologists are not making these arguments anymore and the debate has moved on? And yet Lindstrom (1993), Lattas (1998), and even Burridge's classic *Mambu* (1960) – which is absent from the bibliography – present detailed and compelling arguments which complicate the portrayal of cargo cults. The arguments of the pre-1974 literature can possibly be disposed of, but what about the more recent scholarship?

Burridge's text, *Mambu*, is a case in point. Burridge carefully delineates the complex set of relations between missionaries, colonial administrative agents, and the local Melanesian people. This he calls 'the triangle'. It was in this triangle of relations that what came to be referred to as 'cargo cults' emerged. (A post-1945 linguistic creation, as Lindstrom [1993] carefully documents. In fact, to refer to the Orokaiva 'Taro cult' documented by F.E. Williams during the 1920s as a 'cargo cult' [e.g. p. 188] is historically incorrect.) Again, unfortunately, to ignore the colonial administrative side of this 'triangle' – by only focusing on mission Christianity – is to capture only part of the processes informing 'religious' change.

None of this would really matter if the thesis of *Arguments and icons* was restricted to 'modes of religiosity'. However, in the final chapter Whitehouse seeks to advance an argument about the broad sweep of history and political evolution. In the course of twenty-eight pages we move from the 'imagistic mode' in the Upper Palaeolithic to the 'doctrinal mode' and the 'Great Transformation'. On the basis of his cognitive theory and the evidence he has marshalled, the author seeks to show how the two 'modes of religiosity' can account for the broad unfolding of human development.

There is a confidence about the thesis because of the certainty that it rests on the solid foundations of two forms of cognitively demonstrated memory. The problem, though, is the radical division between 'modes of religiosity' as much as it is the connections between 'individual' minds and 'collective' forms. Is it correct to assume that collective forms can simply be reduced to the physical and formal requirements of memory? The real challenge and ultimate problem with this analysis is the distinction between 'imagistic' and 'doctrinal'. Analytically, this appears direct and powerful. Empirically, though, the separation is virtually impossible to sustain in any particular case. The analytical distinction, it seems, obscures more than it reveals.

Pre-colonial Melanesia might have lacked Christianity but it did not lack features which one might label 'doctrinal'.

ERIC HIRSCH

Brunel University

WU, DAVID Y.H. & TAN CHEE-BENG (eds). *Changing Chinese foodways in Asia*. xiii, 286 pp., tables, bibliogr. Hong Kong: The Chinese Univ. Press, 2001. HK\$250.00 (cloth)

This is the latest addition to the growing number of anthropological publications on food consumption in Asia, which include *Golden arches east: McDonald's in East Asia* (ed.) James L. Watson (1997) and *Feeding China's little emperors* (ed.) Jun Jing (2000). Overall, the present volume does not match up to these previous works.

The twelve substantive chapters span rural South China, Hong Kong, Taiwan, Southeast Asia, Korea, and Japan. According to the introduction, the authors set out not only to describe recent changes in the consumption and preparation of Chinese food in this vast area, but also to engage in an 'anthropological attempt to understand the meanings of changing foodways' (p. 2). None the less, many of the essays emphasize description over interpretation. They range from Zhou Dasheng's broad survey of pork-eating practices among different ethnic groups in East Asia to Su Jianling's conscientious documentation of the ongoing changes in food production and consumption in a single village in the Pearl River Delta in Guangdong Province. Other primarily descriptive chapters include Elaine Yi-lan Tsui's study of breakfasting in Taipei, Chen Yunpiao's outline of food habits in the Chaoshan region in northeastern Guangdong, and Diana Martin's meticulously researched chapter on the food restrictions observed by pregnant women in Hong Kong.

Siumi Maria Tam, David Y.H. Wu, and Sidney Cheung all discuss the meanings associated with different catering establishments and with ways of eating out in Hong Kong. Cheung relates the history of Hakka-style restaurants in post-War Hong Kong. The restaurants, popular in the 1950s, 60s, and 70s, failed to establish themselves as 'high cuisine' in the growing cosmopolitanism of the 1980s and 90s. Wu, by contrast, finds that the city's 'tea cafés' remained popular precisely because they signified the opposite of refinement. Being both Chinese and Western, egalitarian, versatile, and practical, the tea café 'represents the essence of a Hong Kong way of life' (p. 79). Similarly, Tam contends that the practice of *yumcha*, or going out to a tea-house or restaurant to drink tea and eat dim sum, has become

'Hong Kong's own identity marker' (p. 58). Tam argues that Hong Kong-style *yumcha*, which she describes as an informal, efficient, and globalized style of consumption, stands for a new, cosmopolitan Hong Kong identity.

A number of essays highlight the interaction between Chinese and other Asian foodways. Tan Chee-beng combines a tour of Malaysia's culinary diversity with a discussion of the uses of food and eating as ethnic markers between different Chinese groups in the country and between Chinese and other Malaysians. Writing on Singapore, Chuah Beng Huat and Ananda Rajah maintain that, despite the constant mixing of food habits, the boundaries between cuisines are carefully policed in the city-state's popular culture in order to fit the official model of the Singaporean nation as a combination of strictly defined ethnic categories.

The interest in national identity is shared by the scholars writing on the ethnically more homogeneous states of North East Asia. Tamotsu Aoki traces the history of *ramen* noodles in Japan from their introduction by Chinese traders in the nineteenth century to their current status as a 'national dish'. Kim Kwang-ok discusses the ongoing redefinitions of Chinese food in South Korea, situating these within the country's political and social transformation in the post-war period.

The authors often claim to draw on recent discussions concerning the links between globalization, modernity, consumption, and identity, but none actively engage with these debates. Moreover, several contributors (e.g. Tam, Wu, Huat, and Rajah) assume that social meanings are simply immanent in the foods and sites of consumption themselves. With the notable exception of Martin's chapter, the reader is told very little about what specific informants actually did or said. I looked in vain to the editors' introduction for a more sustained discussion to compensate for the general lack of analytical rigour and for the heavy emphasis on description. Neither Li Yih-yuan's preface nor Sidney Mintz's concluding commentary sufficiently compensate for these shortcomings.

Finally, the proof-reading is grossly inadequate. Many of the chapters are poorly written or badly translated. Although the book is virtually jargon-free, many passages are incomprehensible because of grammatical mistakes and idiosyncratic choice of words. Anthropologists working specifically on food and eating in East and South East Asia will none the less find much useful material in this volume, but it will be of limited interest to other scholars.

JAKOB KLEIN

School of Oriental & African Studies