

**FROM EMPIRE TO REPUBLIC:
A STUDY OF CHANGES IN ADVERTORIAL PROSE, 1876-1928**

by
Aslı Menevşe

Submitted to the Graduate School of Arts Social Sciences
in partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts in History

Sabancı University
September 2010

**FROM EMPIRE TO REPUBLIC:
A STUDY OF CHANGES IN ADVERTORIAL PROSE, 1876-1928**

APPROVED BY:

Asst. Dr. Yusuf Hakan Erdem
(Dissertation Supervisor)

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Halil Berktaş

Asst. Prof. Dr. Ayhan Akman

DATE OF APPROVAL: 07.09.2010

© Aslı Menevşe 2010

All Rights Reserved

To My Grandfather,
Mehmet Zeki Menevşe

ABSTRACT

**FROM EMPIRE TO REPUBLIC:
A STUDY OF CHANGES IN ADVERTORIAL PROSE, 1876-1928**

Menevşe, Aslı
MA., History
Advisor: Yusuf Hakan Erdem
September 2010, 161 + ix pages

This study examines the texts of Late Ottoman and Early Republican advertisements to understand how these texts, as forms of social discourse, reflect the mainstream ideologies. This study exploits this opportunity to closely examine Turkish society through the lens of a particular time frame: starting with the first appearance of local advertisements in Ottoman lands by the end of the 19th century until the reform of conversion to Latin script in Turkish Republic in 1928. Therefore it only deals with the texts in old script. The advertisements published in the late Ottoman and early Republican periodicals provide the primary material for this research. The nature of language employed in the advertisements is of significant emphasis in this study. Advertisements are analyzed in order to reveal the common themes in their prose with respect to patriotism, nationalism, Islamism, technology and modernity, and Westernism. These themes and the prose change in the advertisements parallel to the discourse of available political authority and the events that society experiences during this time period. The rationale of such a focus is to have a better understanding of the transition of Ottoman subjects into Turkish citizens since advertisements provide a mirror to the transformations in society as well as continuities.

Keywords: Advertisements, Ottoman History, Turkish Republican History, 19th Century, 20th Century, Authority, Identity

ÖZET

İMPARATORLUK'TAN CUMHURİYET' E: REKLAM DİLİNİN DEĞİŞİMİ ÜZERİNE BİR ÇALIŞMA, 1876-1928

Menevşe, Aslı
Yüksek Lisans, Tarih
Danışman: Yusuf Hakan Erdem
Eylül 2010, 161 + ix sayfa

Bu yüksek lisans tezi, geç Osmanlı ve erken Cumhuriyet dönemlerinde toplumsal söylemin ürünleri olarak reklamların ne şekilde başat ideolojileri yansıttığını incelemektedir. Bu amaç doğrultusunda çalışma, Türk toplumunu belirli bir zaman dilimi içerisinde ele almaktadır. Bu zaman dilimi Osmanlı topraklarında ilk yerel reklamın ortaya çıktığı 19. yüzyıl sonlarından, Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nde 1928 yılı harf devrimine kadar geçen süreyi ele almaktadır; bu nedenle sadece eski harf metinleri kullanılmaktadır. Geç dönem Osmanlı ve erken dönem Cumhuriyet dergileri bu çalışmanın başlıca birincil kaynaklarını oluşturmaktadır. Bu kaynaklarda yer alan reklamlar ve kullanılan dil bu tezin başlıca konusudur. Reklamlar kullandıkları dilde vatanseverlik, milliyetçilik, İslamcılık, teknoloji ve modernite, ve Batıcılık benzeri ortak temaların incelenmesi şeklinde ele alınmaktadır. Bu temalar ve reklamın dili, siyasi otoritenin değişimi ve bu doğrultuda siyasi söylemin de geçirdiği dönüşüm ile paralellikler sergilemektedir. Bu nedenle tez, reklamın dili ve temalarında var olan değişikliklerin izini sürüp, siyasi otoritenin söylemlerini, sosyal dönüşümleri, savaşların ve göçlerin etkilerini göz önüne sermeyi amaçlamaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Reklamlar, Osmanlı Tarihi, Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Tarihi, 19. Yüzyıl, 20. Yüzyıl, Otorite, Kimlik.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am grateful to many people who helped me through this process. Their assistance, guidance and support made this thesis possible. First, I am deeply thankful to Yusuf Hakan Erdem, my thesis advisor, who did not spare his precious comments and suggestions during this study. I also want to thank my thesis committee, Halil Berktaş, for his comments, which made me see the bigger picture; and also for his courses which provided me with the critical point of view that I needed for my thesis. I thank Ayhan Akman, my committee member for his criticisms and suggestions. I am grateful to Bratislav Pantelic, for supporting me all these years, and giving me the chance for the best experience as a teaching assistant. I thank Ertuğrul Ökten, who made me love learning and reading Ottoman Turkish. I thank all my professors, Cemil Koçak, Fikret Adanır, Metin Kunt, Akşin Somel, Ayşe Kadioğlu and Hülya Canbakal, for teaching me and letting me know that I could knock their doors anytime I have a question. I would be forever grateful for Zeynep Nevin Yelçe, who was there for me all these times, inspired me to love what I do. I would also like to thank Engin Kılıç, for showing there was an alternative way, and supporting me since my first years in Sabancı University. I owe to Benneth Young for his careful eyes and genuine work, and time and effort he put to my thesis. I would also like to thank Sabancı University staff, especially Sumru Şatır and Viket Galimidi, for helping through all big and small problems.

I thank the administrators and staff of Sabancı University Information Center, who helped me and provided me with the sources I needed for the thesis. I am thankful to staff members in ISAM, [İslam Araştırmaları Merkezi] who introduced me to my very first material, and provided a friendly service.

Finally, I want to thank to my dear father and mother, for their encouragement and support.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 1 THE REIGN OF ABDULHAMID II AND THE CRISIS OF IDENTITY 9	
1.1 Reconciliation of Different Identities	9
1.2 The Shadow of the God, or an Enlightened Monarch?.....	11
1.2.1 The Champion of Muslims	12
1.2.2. The Autocrat.....	13
1.3. The Empire's Place in the Age of New Imperialism	14
1.4. Advertisements in the Hamidian Era	16
1.4.1. Censorship and Reading Habits	17
1.4.1.1. The Variety of Books	21
1.4.2. For Islam, Buy Muslim.....	24
1.4.2.1 The Muslim Woman as Consumer.....	25
1.4.3. Amazing Marvels, Amazed Customers.....	27
1.4.4. Style and Fashion in Advertisements.....	29
1.4.5. Another Dimension of Westernization.....	31
CHAPTER 2 TRANSFORMATION OF A STATE, TRANSFORMATION OF A SOCIETY: THE YOUNG TURK REVOLUTION OF 1908	35
2.1. Progress and Unity: The Young Turk Movement	35
2.1.1. The Foundation, Motives and Triumph of the Young Turk Movement.....	36
2.1.2 Science, Reason and Progress.....	38
2.1.3. A Revolution or an Occupation of Power?	40
2.2. Advertising: The Birth of a Profession	41
2.3. The Changing of the Reading Habits.....	44
2.4. The Boycott of Austro-Hungarian Goods and First Steps into the National Economy	47
2.5. Long Live the Constitution!.....	50
2.6. The Books and Schools for Learning Foreign Languages.....	53
CHAPTER 3	
WARS AND THE NATIONAL AWAKENING	56
3.1. The History of the Problem.....	56
3.2. Echoes of the Balkan Wars and the Decision to Enter WWI.....	59
3.2.1. The Turkish Nationalism: From Idea to Reality	62
3.2.2. The Increased Visibility of Turkish Identity	64
3.2.2.1. 'Türk Yurdu'	66
3.3. Fertile Lands, National Banks	68
3.3.1. Agriculture and the National Economy	70
3.3.2. The Ottoman Bank and The National Bank.....	71
3.3.3 'The Fez Wars'	72
3.4. How Does a State Ask to Borrow Money?	74
3.5. Ladies to Women	76
3.5.1 Smooth Skins, Wasp Waists.....	79
CHAPTER 4	
THE YEARS OF NATIONAL STRUGGLE AND THE ROLE OF THE OFFICERS..	82
4.1. The Armistice.....	83
4.2. The National Resistance	85
4.3. The Nationalists and the National Congresses.....	89

4.4. Discontinuities and Continuities through the Advertisements.....	91
4.4.1. Discontinuities	91
4.4.2. Continuities.....	93
4.4.2.1. Turkish Identity as an Element of Continuity.....	94
4.4.2.2. National, Fatherland, Homeland: Other Indicators of Nationalism.....	96
4.5. Women during the National Struggle.....	98
4.6. The Reflection of Wars in Advertisements	100
CHAPTER 5	
REFLECTIONS OF THE REPUBLIC’S IDEALS.....	103
5.1. Authority, Reforms and Opposition	103
5.2. The Level of Contemporary Civilizations	106
5.2.1. Women Citizens	107
5.2.2. Educating the Nation	109
5.2.2.1. The Issue of War Orphans.....	111
5.2.3. Modern Transportation Means.....	112
5.3. Nationalism.....	113
5.4. Islam and National Identity.....	115
5.4.1. The Downscaling of Islam	115
5.4.2. Islam and National Identity in Advertisements.....	116
5.5. The National Economy	118
5.5.1. The Izmir Economy Congress	118
5.5.2. Ankara as the ‘Heart’ of the New Economy	120
5.5.3. Foreign Products	121
5.5.4. The National Products.....	122
5.6. An Overall View of the Advertisement Profession in the Republic.....	124
CONCLUSION.....	125
APPENDICES	Error! Bookmark not defined.
BIBLIOGRAPHY	131

INTRODUCTION

“...Do not forget that the daily newspapers for ten pennies that sold with some persuasion and with all that fuss have a historical importance. There is no doubt that the newspapers that crumpled up in the hands of an angry reader, would be opened by the future generations with an amazed curiosity, and they would try to spell the secrets and mysteries of present time in the faded columns...”
Cenab Şehabeddin¹

Sometimes written materials, which were not meant to be official documents, are more truthful in order to understand the mentality behind a specific time period; than the carefully composed texts which are supposed to be the witnesses of history. Cenab Şehabeddin, had foreseen the potential of daily publications as a source of valuable information for the future researchers. In this sense, advertisements are more than an economic dialogue between consumer and the producer.² They are the producers of desire, providing a genuine source for understanding what people wanted to hear, or wanted to believe. Therefore, it serves as an insight to the mentalities and discourses of groups in a society, during a specific time period in history. However, in the Ottoman Empire, where strong state tradition dominated every sphere of activity and the early Republican period which could be simply identified as authoritarian; state and its policies appear as external actors directly affecting the genuine medium of the relationship between the provider and the consumer. The main purpose of this thesis is to find the traces of the mainstream political and social discourses, ideas and ideals in the advertisements, in order to understand how these texts, as forms of social discourse,

¹ Orhan Kolođlu, *1908 Basın Patlaması* (Istanbul: BAS-HAŞ, 2005), p.47.

² Gökhan Akçura, *Uzun Metin Sevenlerden Misiniz?* (Istanbul: OM Yayınevi, 2002), p. 9.

could reflect the prose of the authority. The text of an advertisement supposed to be shaped by both what the seller wants to convey and also what the buyer wants to hear. However, advertisements between 1876 and 1928 marked by the impacts of political and state-driven social changes.

The history of consumption has become a hot subject in the past decades. History of consumers and consumption is a way to understand and examine the social history. However, the focus of this study is related to, but not limited to, changes in the consumer patterns of Ottoman society and the relation between Ottoman Empire and European capitalism. This study mainly aims to demonstrate the political dynamics and the elements shaping and affecting advertorial texts. This thesis searches the appearance of various ideas and identities in the Ottoman Empire in the context of self-definition, and the aims of the State which were usually shaped by the necessities of each individual period.

There is a lack of academic literature, except for a few studies dealing with advertorial material for the Ottoman Empire. Advertisements, in their role of capturing the attention of consumers, offer a gold mine for a researcher to become intimate with the trends and ideas in a society during a specific time period. Many studies dealing with history of advertisements or history through advertisements have been done for Europe and America. Britain, as the pioneer of this profession has a large number of studies on this subject. However, Ottoman advertisements still remain as a nearly untouched area with a vast source of information which could be helpful to understand late Ottoman history. *Reklamcılığımızın Yüzyılı, (1840- 1940)*, by Orhan Koloğlu, is one the few studies on the Ottoman advertisements. This study is the most comprehensive work covering the last eight decades of Ottoman Empire and first two decades of Turkish Republic.³

This study provides a guide for an initial step in dealing with the material. Koloğlu has successfully brought out the evolution of this profession in the given geography, by providing useful, but limited insight into the discourses hidden in texts of advertisements. Koloğlu deals with a variety of newspapers during the period he covered, however he left journals and magazines relatively untouched. The vast material he went through for his research provides a general picture for development of

³ Orhan Koloğlu, *Reklamcılığımızın İlk Yüzyılı 1840-1940* (Istanbul: Reklamcılık Vakfı Yayınları, 2000).

advertising profession. He also provides a number of transcribed advertisement texts, alongside images and pages from the newspapers. Although he makes occasional references to events affecting the prose of advertisements, his main focus remains in the limits of examination of this profession. Another work, *Osmanlı Basınında Reklam*, by Hamza Çakır, as suggested by the title of the book, specifically deals with the Ottoman advertisements,⁴ but fails to deliver its promise. Similar to the work of Koloğlu, this study remains as an evaluation of the advertising profession instead of linking the available material with the political and social realities. Going through Ottoman newspapers published between 1828-1864, Çakır focuses on the newspapers instead of advertisements. The occasional reference to the advertisements remains as details and fails to provide an insight for themes and similarities. On the other hand, this seems like an impossible task since the author examines a quite early period, when the advertisements were still in the form of announcements. Between the years Çakır has examined, he uses seven newspapers, but mainly focuses on one of them, *Ceride-i Havadis*.⁵

In addition, a different study by Koloğlu was consulted for this thesis; *1908 Basın Patlaması*, a work that explores the Ottoman press after the Young Turk Revolution, which became liberated from Abdulhamid's censorship overnight. A chapter of this work was reserved for Ottoman advertisements and announcements [*ilanat*]. In this chapter Koloğlu presents quotations by Ottoman journalists on the issue of these new inventions, *ilanat*. The intention of a review article by Uygur Kocabaşoğlu, "Abdulhamid Han ve Reklamlar," goes one step further and displays an interesting feature of the advertisements during the reign of Abdulhamid II. This article, provides an overview for the advertisements during the reign of Abdulhamid II, and displays how the image of Abdulhamid was employed in advertisements in order to promote a business. In this case, what Kocabaşoğlu tries to achieve in his review seems to be closer to the aim of this thesis.

Elizabeth B. Frierson's article on consumer culture in late Ottoman society, "Cheap and Easy: The Creation of Consumer Culture in Late Ottoman Society", serves a valuable model for understanding the nature of the Ottoman consumer markets in

⁴ Hamza Çakır, *Osmanlı Basınında Reklam*, (Istanbul: Elit Reklamcılık, 1997).

⁵ Ibid, pp. 210-226. The bibliography of the newspapers consulted for his research.

relation to issues of religion, gender and citizenship. She illustrates the change in the advertorial prose, even though her research was primarily restricted to a single journal and a very limited timeframe. Gökhan Akçura, in his book *Uzun Metin Sevenlerden Misiniz?*, has presented advertisement texts from Ottoman Empire and Turkish Republic alongside the history of advertising in Ottoman lands. The chapters are classified around themes such as; the history of announcing [*ilan etmek*] before the advertisements, company symbols, advertisements of beers, advertising with long texts and more. He provides interesting material and a different point of view by treating the advertisements as products of a society.

Image & Imperialism in the Ottoman Revolutionary Press by Palmira Brummet has analyzed Ottoman satirical press after the Young Turk Revolution of 1908 to reveal the traces of a transformation from an empire to a nation state. In order to achieve that, Brummet uses cartoons and satirical text to find what this thesis seeks in the advertisements. Therefore, the methodology of Brummet's quest guided this study in several stages of this thesis. Zafer Toprak's numerous works helped this thesis to understand the economic dynamics of Ottoman society during the time frame in question.

This study exploits this opportunity to closely examine society through the lens of a more comprehensive timeframe than most of the aforementioned studies: starting with the first appearance of local advertisements in Ottoman lands by the end of the 19th century until the conversion of the script in the Turkish Republic in 1928; therefore dealing exclusively with the texts in the old script. More than 400 journals and magazines have been scanned; advertisement texts from 51 primary sources have been transcribed in the course of research and cited in this study. In order to find the reflection of political and social changes, the advertisements that are used in the thesis are chosen mainly among local-national businesses. As stated in few occasions during the thesis, the large foreign establishments failed to catch up with the changing political prose in their advertisements. For similar reasons, frequent foreign advertisers, such as Nestle and Singer were not used in this study. On the other hand, local businesses promoting their imported products could be found throughout the research.

In the early stage of advertising *ilanat* sections constituted a very minor space in the publications. The early examples of Ottoman advertisements were more like announcements. The long, descriptive texts, explaining the every single product, where it came from, when it arrived to the Istanbul, how it was produced and many other

details were listed. Another type of announcements that could be found alongside with advertisements under the title *ilanat* was official announcements. These texts had a complex bureaucratic language that conflicted with the very nature of advertisements. They did not promote the product as in the Western advertising, rather explained it in details. Thus, this early *ilanat* are also left outside during the research of this thesis, since their language was not related to the political and social dynamics of the Ottoman Empire.

Orhan Kolođlu points out that the local advertisement exceeded their foreign pioneers during the period 1880- 1908.⁶ By this time, the local *ilanat* went through a transformation from the form of announcements into advertisements. Kolođlu lists the stages of development in the advertising sector as follows: shortening of texts, usage of images and frames, shorter and more catchy titles, widespread usage of stylized calligraphy, testimonies of local customers, repetition of advertisements in following issues and finally, sales and prize campaigns.⁷ Gökhan Akçura explains the late keep up of local business owners with the advertising as a cultural phenomenon. As proposed by Akçura, “*İlan* was regarded as a form of exposure. And exposure is at least considered as an act of disdain.”⁸ On the other hand, as the advertisement market grew large and later small Ottoman businesses started using them more effectively.

While the time frame of this thesis constitutes the late 19th and early 20th centuries, the geography in question is mostly Istanbul and the large cities with dynamic commercial activities such as Izmir and Selanik. Therefore until 1928, the analysis could not be representative for the entire Ottoman and Turkish society. Since Istanbul, Selanik and Izmir had experienced economic and social transformations earlier than the other cities in the Empire, it is only natural to be able find the advertisements that belong to the establishments from these cities and in their publications. Advertisements from Istanbul newspapers and journals constitute a large portion of the material that this study has concerned with. After the establishment of Turkish Republic, the center of this research has relatively shifted to Ankara, the new capital city; however, even after the Republic, Istanbul remained the focus of economic and intellectual activity in the new

⁶ Kolođlu, *Reklamcılıđımızın İlk Yüzyılı*, p. 130.

⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 148- 151.

⁸ Akçura, *Uzun Metin Sevenlerden Misiniz?*, p. 9.

Turkish Republic. The nature of language employed therein is of significant emphasis in this study.

Advertisements are analyzed in order to reveal the common themes in their prose with respect to patriotism, nationalism, Islamism, technology and modernity and the Westernism. Thus, another issue that needs to be mentioned is the standpoints of publications that were used. Except some extreme examples, most of the publications included similar kinds of advertisements or same advertisements. However, some publications such as *Talebe Defteri*, *Donanma*, and *Türk Yurdu* often contain advertisements parallel to their political outlook. Nevertheless, “cheapness” was the most persistent stress in all advertisements. Most of the businesses and establishments in the advertisements stressed their low prices [*ehveniyet*, or *ucuzluk*] regardless their origins and political outlooks. This characteristic of Ottoman advertisements could be traced almost invariably towards the Republican advertisements. But other discourses of emphasis did not remain continuous and changed in respect to shifts in political authority.

The existence of one theme in the advertisement did not obliterate the others. Some of them were used separately, some of them together, overlapping in the same advertisement text, and sometimes they were used interchangeably. There are no clean cut visible transformations from one to another. But all of them related to perception of mainstream ideas and ideologies. Advertisement texts are also reflections of important events that affected the people. The texts include or exclude some remarks in relation to the times of war, migration or economic crisis. Lastly, the language of advertisements is also closely related to the identity of the advertisers than the political standpoint of the publication. Therefore the texts of Muslim businesses are distinguished from non-Muslim businesses and foreign investors from local investors. People belonging to different identities sometimes collaborate with each other and constitute an alliance against a common opponent, as the early years of constitutional rule, when non-Muslim and Muslim citizens both stressed their common Ottoman identity, and promoted the local, against the European businesses and products.

Another rationale for this thesis is to understand the transition of Ottoman subjects into Turkish citizens since advertisements provide a mirror to the transformations in society as well as continuities. Examining this transition is crucial to understand the key concepts such as nation or citizen and their meanings to society in Turkey today. If nationalism is a means to generate political loyalty, advertisers served them to achieve

the next step: economic loyalty. For a century, advertisers and advertisements told the people what they should purchase and who they should purchase from, with the claim to create a perfect citizen, who consumes for the good of his state, religion or nation. Both the consumers and advertisers were mobilized with the claims of serving to the sultan, state, country or the nation, increasingly leaving outside the very dynamics of profit-oriented capitalist economy.

This study examines the changes and continuities in the advertorial prose between 1876 and 1928. In order to trace the relationship between the political authority and the themes in the advertisements, the thesis is chronologically sectioned under five chapters. Chapter 1 deals with the advertisements during the reign of the Abdulhamid II, in relation to his policies, the questions Ottoman Empire had encountered with, and the policies presented by the Sultan and the statesmen for their solutions. Islamism, modernism and traces of Westernism inherited from the *Tanzimat* period are examined through delving into their reflections in the advertisements.

Chapter 2 looks into the change in the advertorial prose after the Young Turk Revolution. The advertorial prose of this period had two main characteristics in the light of the ideas and ideals of the new actors of political authority. Firstly, after the reign of Abdulhamid II, and his Islamist policies, the Young Turks promoted an inclusive Ottoman identity, which supposed to unite the nationalities and religious communities of the Empire. Secondly, as an important pillar of the Revolution, the word, “progress” was stressed by the advertorial prose. The emphasis on science, technology, and knowledge, is found in the advertisements and discussed within the context of the ideas that shaped the mentalities of the Young Turks. In relation to the importance granted to the modern knowledge, the advertisements promoting every kind of reading material on a large variety of subjects are also found and examined in this chapter.

Chapter 3, displays the effects of the Balkan Wars and the Great War in the Ottoman Empire through advertisements. The devastating results of the Balkan Wars, and the decision to enter the WWI, are examined in relation to the growing visibility of Turkish nationalism in the political sphere which was buttressed by the advertisers. The advertisements are evaluated within the context of the authoritarian Young Turk rule with increasing emphasis to the Turkishness of the Empire. Since the definition of this new identity was primarily shaped by the religion as oppose to the “traitor” Greek and Armenian nationalisms, Islam remained as an important element of the advertorial prose in this period. In addition to this shift in the official ideology, the atmosphere of

scientism and progress was replaced by the impacts of wars on the social and economic life in the Empire.

Chapter 4 investigates the post-WWI period, which was marked by treaties pressuring the defeated Empire with severe terms and the activities of nationalist successors of the Young Turks under Mustafa Kemal in Anatolia, which would eventually result with the establishment of the Turkish Republic. The shift of the political authority from Istanbul to Ankara is found in the advertisements, as the advertisements took a more nationalist stance as the national struggle, and later the National Assembly, replaced the activities of the Sultan and the parliament in Istanbul. In addition, the revival of economic activity is seen with the re-appearance of the advertisements in the journals and newspapers during the national struggle, which were absolutely absent during the last two years of the Great War, due to the immense economic burden caused by it.

The last chapter, Chapter 5, dwells into the early Republican advertisements in order to trace the changes and continuities that occurred in the advertorial prose after the fall of the Empire. However, this period did not manifest a radical switch in themes employed in advertisements, except the usage of word, “Turkey” and the emergence of the new capital, Ankara, as an alternative to Istanbul in publishing and economic activities. Another feature of the Republican period, which could be characterized as an emphasis on modernity through creating a model of “contemporary civilizations” is also investigated, which was in fact carried the traces of an older mentality originated in *Tanzimat*, grew under the state supervision during the reign of Abdulhamid, and reach its zenith after the 1908 Revolution.

CHAPTER 1

THE REIGN OF ABDULHAMID II AND THE CRISIS OF IDENTITY

The nineteenth century proved to be a problematic time for European monarchies, who were faced with such high levels of popular protest and activism that the period has been called the Age of Revolutions. The ingrained traditional relation between the rulers and the ruled began to be radically transformed, as the people of the modern world explored new bases for political legitimacy. Benedict Anderson describes the source of legitimacy of monarchies as “divinity, not the support of the populations, since they are not citizens but merely subjects.”⁹ However, in modern times monarchs were no longer able to maintain the old one-way relationship based on obedience, and their subjects started to become more and more active in politics and economics. As the modern world became less hospitable to the traditional forms of legitimization, the Ottoman Empire too, like the other European monarchies, found itself on the edge of a legitimization crisis.¹⁰ In order to maintain position it had to reinvent itself, and to reassure itself about the reasons for its existence both inside and outside of its realm.

1.1 Reconciliation of Different Identities

The *Tanzimat* period in Ottoman history was an attempt to solve this crisis through creating a supra-nation that could unite all the identities in the Empire around the idea of a single Ottoman identity. Ottoman bureaucrats were aware of the radical transformations occurring in Europe; in order to save the Empire, they sought to

⁹ Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities* (London: Verso, 1991), p. 19.

¹⁰ See Selim Deringil, “Legitimacy Structures in the Ottoman State: The Reign of Abdülhamid II (1876-1909),” *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, vol. 23, no. 3 (August, 1991).

understand what the Ottomans lacked. The first answer was the absence of a notion of belongingness, an idea of a “nation.” The Ottoman ruling elite tried to generate a sense of loyalty on the basis of homeland [*vatan*], corresponding to the European concept of citizenship. As Deringil puts it, “the concept of national monarchy was precisely what the Ottoman ruling elite was aiming for with its policy of Ottomanism.”¹¹ But the breathing-space for the Ottomans was getting smaller: European states outside, and the nationalist tendencies of non-Muslim communities at home, were pushing the Ottomans to take immediate measures to reformulate the relationship between people and authority. European influence had become effective at every level of political, cultural, and economic life. The penetration of European capitalism was more visible than ever, and it was clear that the non-Muslim communities were benefitting the most from it. The *Tanzimat* statesmen were hoping that with the help of necessary arrangements to redefine the status of non-Muslims in the Empire, they could gain the support and appreciation of the Great Powers as well as the loyalty of the increasingly restless non-Muslim communities. Initiated with the Rescript of the Rose Chamber [*Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayunu*], a series of reforms were introduced in order to replace community loyalties with a more inclusive, wider, and secular identity of Ottomanism. This attempt to create an imagined Ottoman nation could be seen as being similar to the attempts by Czarist Russia, as described by Anderson, to create a form of official nationalism by retention and naturalization of dynastic power: “but yet again it was an effort to stretch the short, tight, skin of the nation over the gigantic body of the empire.”¹²

The efforts of the *Tanzimat* statesmen did not meet with the response they were hoping for from outside the Empire; nor did the compromises of *Tanzimat* prove to be effective in restraining the restlessness of the non-Muslim communities. Moreover, with the loss of their privileged positions, Muslim communities themselves started to show signs of uneasiness towards the new order. It was amid such turmoil that Abdulhamid ascended the throne in 1876, with a promise to recognize a constitution and a parliament on egalitarian principles. During the crisis of 1875-78, the Ottoman Empire was feeling lonelier than ever among the European powers. Britain, a trusted actor for the well-

¹¹ Selim Deringil, “The Invention of Tradition as Public Image in the Late Ottoman Empire, 1808 to 1908,” *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, vol. 35, no. 1 (January 1993), p. 5.

¹² Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, p. 86.

being of the Ottoman state, held back during the turmoil in the Balkans, Russia's hostility, and the eventual Russo-Ottoman war. At the time of negotiations, the Ottomans were abandoned in the face of constant European pressure to make concessions, ending with the Berlin Treaty – a peace which came at the price of an immense loss of the Empire's European territories, making the Empire's demography more Muslim and its geography more Asian. The catastrophe of 1875-1878 woke the Empire from the *Tanzimat* dream; Abdulhamid suspended the parliament in perpetuity and emerged as a phenomenal absolute monarch from this turmoil.

1.2 The Shadow of the God, or an Enlightened Monarch?

The characteristics of Abdulhamid's reign divide historians into two groups: Europeans came to see him as a blood-thirsty [*kızıl*] and reactionary tyrant. Their perception was adopted by the Turkish nationalist historians who regarded Abdulhamid in a very similar way: as a reactionary against reforms, who restrained the Empire in its regeneration attempts. On the other hand, modern historians see his reign as a culmination or climax of the *Tanzimat* reforms, and focus on the benefits he brought to the Empire and its people. According to Erik Jan Zürcher, "both points of view are correct, but only tell the half of the story."¹³ Abdulhamid's political outlook has been helpfully categorized by Yasamee as being structured around four elements: autocracy, conservatism, reformism, and Islam.¹⁴ The reformist element could be regarded as continuity with the preceding *Tanzimat* era. During the reign of Abdulhamid, the Empire's means of communication and transportation enjoyed numerous developments. The new educational institutions established during the *Tanzimat* period produced graduates who staffed the bureaucracy at different levels; the increase in literacy resulted in a market for the newly emerged Ottoman press; the improvement in technical means resulted in a more effective administration and accelerated the integration of the Ottoman economy into the world capitalist system. The reformist

¹³ Erik Jan Zürcher, *Turkey: A Modern History* (New York: I.B.Tauris, 2004), p. 77.

¹⁴ F.A.K. Yasamee, *Ottoman Diplomacy: Abdülhamid II and the Great Powers 1878-1888* (Istanbul: Isis Press, 1996), p. 20.

elements of Abdulhamid's rule did not contradict his conservatism. He believed in the necessity of continuing *Tanzimat* modernization, which he regarded as crucial for the survival of the Empire. However, he was also aware of the fact that the infiltration of Europe into the Empire gave opportunities for the Great Powers to be more effective in policy-making. He tried to immunize the Empire against European dependency in a period in which the Ottoman state had almost entirely lost its economic independence to Europe.

1.2.1 The Champion of Muslims

The Empire was no longer as powerful as it had been in the sixteenth century. Although still an actor in world politics, the political ground both outside and inside the Empire was slipping from under its feet. Ottoman rule had to face challenges both at home and abroad, necessitating new measures. Deringil argues that “as real power declined, symbolism and ritual acquired a new specificity.”¹⁵ *Tanzimat* attempts proved to be ineffective in creating a legitimization basis around a multi-religious and multi-linguistic Ottoman identity. The territorial losses of the Treaty of Berlin, and the new demography and geographical position of the Empire in the world, gave Abdulhamid an opportunity to find an identity and role for the Empire as siding against the Great Powers and with his people. As a consequence, the legitimization basis of the Empire drastically shifted to an Islamic and anti-Western basis and adopted new discourses suitable for its new role. If one leaves aside the reformist nature of his policies, his rule could be read as reactionary to the compromises of *Tanzimat* and to the Christian demands upon the Empire.¹⁶ Abdulhamid emphasized the role of the Caliph, champion of all Muslims, a symbolic title which still retained some potential political effectiveness in the era of New Imperialism, during which the Great Powers began to reach out and control the whole Muslim world, with the exception of the Ottoman Empire. Thus, the caliphate was built around visible anti-imperialist discourses. Besides all these characteristics, he was an autocrat: “a ruler who represents the last true

¹⁵ Deringil, “Legitimacy Structures in the Ottoman State”, p. 345.

¹⁶ David Kushner, *The Rise of Turkish Nationalism, 1876-1908* (London: Frank Cass, 1977), p. 4.

example of personal rule in the empire.”¹⁷

1.2.2. The Autocrat

Abdulhamid’s natural desire and concern about securing his power resulted in the establishment of a great espionage network. Tens of thousands of reports [*journals*] poured into Yıldız Palace. Because of his concerns, loyalty to his person became the most important “merit”; state services were marked by corruption and favoritism, which opened the way to overstaffed government departments. The Sultan did not approve of the liberal tendencies of the new graduates of modern military schools; therefore he tended to rely on officers who had risen from the ranks. This favoritism led to a sharp division in the army, between the officers from new schools [*mektepli*] and from the ranks [*alaylı*]. Abdulhamid’s greatest achievement was to control the army and the navy.¹⁸ However, he failed to generate loyalty in the new generation of *mektepli* bureaucrats and officers. The *Tanzimat* had been an era of weak Sultans but strong statesmen, with *Bab-ı Âli* enjoying political power. But during the reign of Abdulhamid political power shifted back to the Palace. The Palace and the Sultan were once again the source of authority and legitimacy in the Empire. This shift was a sign of going back to the traditional state order of the Empire, of which Sultan Abdulhamid was the last representative. He reinvented the authority of the Palace in the context of the nineteenth century using familiar discourse. As Deringil points out, the time called for these measures: “although the empire had always stressed tradition, the nineteenth century context demanded its modernization or even its invention.”¹⁹ Accordingly, the invented traditions of the Ottoman Empire were built around the title of Caliph and the image of the Sultan.²⁰

¹⁷ Deringil, “Legitimacy Structures in the Ottoman State,” p. 345.

¹⁸ Niyazi Berkes, *Türkiye’de Çağdaşlaşma* (Istanbul: Bilgi Yayınevi, 2003), p. 302.

¹⁹ Deringil, “The Invention of Tradition as Public Image,” p. 6.

²⁰ The case of the Ottoman Empire under the reign of Sultan Abdülhamid II could be adapted to the frame set out by Hobsbawm for monarchies, or constitutional monarchies. Alongside his examples of the Habsburgs and Romanovs, the Ottoman dynasty was also “exploiting the royal person, with or without dynastic ancestors, on

1.3. The Empire's Place in the Age of New Imperialism

The nineteenth century was also the time of the regeneration of imperialism with the help of the Industrial Revolution, which provided imperialists with new tools of empire-building and marked the second phase of European expansion.²¹ European states started a scramble, that would escalate until the First World War, to incorporate pre-industrial lands as colonies for empire building. Abdulhamid's reign overlapped with this period in world history, between 1876-1914, also known as the New Imperialism. The Industrial Revolution created a widening gap between the colonialist West and colonized or soon-to-be-colonized rest. The world was divided into these two camps, but some got stuck in between. Alongside traditional empires such as China and Persia, the Ottoman Empire was placed in the middle of these two categories. They were still dominantly pre-industrial societies; however, their state structures were relatively strong. In the periphery, conditions of rivalry between the major imperialist powers in order to obtain greater economic and political advantage and influence merged with their relatively strong state structures. According to Şevket Pamuk, the states in this category are marked by "a struggle between the central bureaucracy and the social classes favoring more rapid and direct integration to the World capitalist economy."²² In the Ottoman Empire, the social class supporting a liberal outlook in favor of European

elaborate ritual occasions with associated propagandist activities and a wide participation of the people, not least through the captive audiences available for official indoctrination in the educational system. Both made the ruler the focus of his people's or peoples' unity, the symbolic representative of the country's greatness and glory, of its entire past and continuity with a changing present." Eric Hobsbawm, "Mass Producing Traditions: Europe, 1874-1914," in *The Invention of Tradition*, ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), p. 282.

²¹ The first phase of European empire-building began from the 1500s onwards. During the first phase, which corresponded to the 16th and early 17th centuries, Spain and Portugal were the leading maritime imperial powers. Later in this period, France, England, and the Dutch had started to challenge the dominance of Portugal and Spain. These were long-distance overseas Empires, categorized by Howe as "empires by sea." Stephen Howe, *Empire: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).

²² Şevket Pamuk, *The Ottoman Empire and European Capitalism, 1820-1913: Trade, Investment and Production* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), p. 6.

economic penetration and the Empire's integration into the European economy was dominantly constituted by the members of non-Muslim communities, while the central bureaucracy facing them were Muslims. The bureaucracy failed to accumulate the necessary capital to emerge as a social class and carry the Ottoman Empire into the modern era. Unlike the Muslim bureaucracy, the non-Muslims managed to avoid the Sultan's control over their accumulated resources.²³ However, the status of non-Muslims in the Empire before the *Tanzimat* restricted them from investing in Ottoman society; when the *Tanzimat* came, it was too late. The economy Abdulhamid took over was dominated by non-Muslims and European powers. The Empire seemed to be only one step away from falling under the absolute control of European states and becoming a part of the 'New World Order' designated by the new imperialism as a market and a source of manpower and resources for the imperialists. Fearful of becoming ruled where once they had been the rulers, the Ottomans had to adopt some themes and ideas to ensure they still belonged alongside the Great Powers as a crucial actor. These themes and ideas – such as Orientalism, the civilizing mission of the civilized, racism, and glorification of science and technologies went hand-in-hand with the New Imperialism. The Islamism and the modernism of Abdulhamid were not coincidental choices of policy; both were tightly related to the conditions of the nineteenth century.

The ideas that the Ottomans adopted triggered dramatic changes not only in the way that they represented themselves to others, but also in the way that they perceived themselves. As Deringil observes, "Sometime in the nineteenth century the Ottoman elite adopted the mindset of their enemies, the arch-imperialists, and came to conceive of its periphery as a colonial setting."²⁴ Deringil names this situation "borrowed colonialism,"²⁵ when the late Ottoman elite came to feel that they had a civilizing mission in their provinces. The image of Abdulhamid, as the Caliph of Islam, functioned to generate legitimacy in the face of external challenges to the Empire – namely imperialism – and also against domestic challenges, namely nationalism. Yasamee also

²³ Fatma Müge Göçek, *Rise of the Bourgeoisie, Demise of Empire: Ottoman Westernization and Social Change* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), p. 92.

²⁴ Selim Deringil, "They Live in a State of Nomadism and Savagery: The Late Ottoman Empire and the Post-Colonial Debate," *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, vol. 45, no. 2 (April, 2003), p. 311.

²⁵ *Ibid*, p. 312.

regards Abdulhamid's Islamism as "fitful, and to a degree opportunistic," and claims that that it "occupied no more than a peripheral place in his conception of the Ottoman Empire's external relations."²⁶ The Caliph of all Muslims was only a single dimension of his image as presented to all sources of challenges; he also adopted the image of a modern European monarch supported by modernist and progressive policies. Even though they seem to be conflicting, these two different representations helped each other's successes. The modern and European image presented to the world gave the Ottomans an advantage in dealing with the Europeans and improved their bargaining in European diplomacy. On the other hand, the Muslim caliph image of Abdulhamid portrayed him as a traditional ruler and minimized the reactions to reforms from the conservative groups in the society.

1.4. Advertisements in the Hamidian Era

During these times of legitimacy crisis and efforts at image-making, the advertisements in the Ottoman press were transformed from mere announcements to full fledged ones. It was a time to stress image and identity, and to propagate what the consumer wanted to hear. However, they still lacked the features – for instance, of being short and effective – of professional advertisements. These advertisements were not sophisticated: the most notable feature of them in the period between 1876 and 1908 was the length of their text. The texts during this period were marked by descriptive, detailed, and even sincere first-person narration. A clothing store *Gülizar*, which "competed with stores in *Beyoğlu*" for example, ran an advertisement that was one-and-a-half pages and two-and-a-half columns long. The store wanted to announce a discount in the prices of two hundred and fifty items it had been selling; and in the advertisement, along with varieties, qualities and features, all two hundred and fifty items were listed.²⁷ In the same issue, right next to the advertisement by *Gülizar*,

²⁶ Yasamee, *Abdülhamid II and the Great Powers*, p. 29.

²⁷ *Gülizar Mağazası, Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, April 23, 1903: "*Beyoğlu ve İstanbul tuhafiyeye mağazalarına rekâbet eden Gülizâr Mağazası Sultan Hamamı Caddesi, no: 11,13. Bu defa güşadına muvaffak olduğumuz Gülizâr Mağazası mevcut bulunan eşyalardan yalnız ikiyüz elli kalem eşyayı 11 kuruş fiyatla rekâbet için meydan-ı fîruhta çıkarılmıştır.*"

another store, *Istanbul Bazarı*, gave a list of their goods ending with an announcement saying that “they are giving a sample of their best perfume as a gift to their consumers who purchase goods of value over 100 *guruş*.”²⁸ A long, descriptive text written in first-person narration in a genuine tone of voice, almost in the form of a personal letter, lacks the immediate persuasive power of an advertisement which is supposed to persuade the consumers to buy a certain product with few effective words. During this period, most of the advertisements were written by the advertisers, not by advertisement companies and professionals.²⁹ The lists of merchandise, their quality, materials, models and even the ornaments on them were described in great detail. Even though the language of the advertisements shows that the form of communication between the consumer and the provider was still in its early stage, campaigns with gifts or discounts could be perceived as sophistication in economic activity. However, whether they are selling underwear or pianos from France, almost all the advertisements stressed the cost-effectiveness of their prices: “Our prices are extremely economical” [*Fiyatlarımız fevkalade ehvendir*] or “our prices are by far the most economical” [*Fiyatlarımız rekabet kabul etmeyecek derecede ehvendir*] were the expressions most commonly used. Regardless of the merchandise or its quality, even if it was a luxury commodity, the ‘suitable price’ is the feature most frequently emphasized in all the advertisements.

1.4.1. Censorship and Reading Habits

The censorship of Abdulhamid’s rule is known as one of the most repressive features of his reign. However, despite the censorship, the press progressed in terms of circulation further at that time than it did during the *Tanzimat* period. On the other hand, censorship limited the subjects that could be raised in the Ottoman press. Politics and any other related subject were out of the question. Since the press could no longer discuss high literature and ideologies, it focused on subjects such as popular sciences and technology. The Ottoman journals became “something close to mere information

²⁸ *Istanbul Bazarı*, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, April 23, 1903.

²⁹ “Come to my store”, “visit me”, “I assure you”, were common phrases of first-person narration. One should keep in mind that, in a period when personal relations still dominated economic activities, business owners might have thought that giving their own word could be helpful for gaining the trust of their customers.

bulletins, giving account of official news or ‘harmless’ international events or else to the form of popular scholarly and scientific magazines, discussing world history or new technological inventions.”³⁰ These encyclopedic journals took the *Tanzimat* mentality one step further and created an atmosphere for an intellectual accumulation which would reveal itself with the outbreak of the 1908 Revolution. However, until that time the Ottoman journals focused on the developments in Europe in science, literature, and technology. Although this was, so to speak, an ‘obligatory choice’, it found and created its own clients in an atmosphere of glorification of everything related to science and technology.

This environment is reflected in the advertisements announcing European books and journals, which constitute a large proportion of all the advertisements from 1876 to 1908. As an example: *Umran*, a typical journal of the period focusing on science and literature, announced their delivery service of a science journal from Paris.³¹ This curiosity towards science and literature also shows itself in bookstore advertisements. During this triumphant period of reading in the Ottoman Empire, the *Bab-ı Âli* street became the center of publishing, bookstores, and the press. *Avrupa Kütüphanesi* (European Bookstore), a bookstore on *Bab-ı Âli* street, informed its customers about its new service: “They could bring every kind of foreign books in fifteen days and sell it at the same price as in Europe.”³² Notably, the name chosen by the owner of the bookstore worked together with the text of the advertisement to attract the attention of the right audience.

³⁰ Kushner, *The Rise of Turkish Nationalism*, p. 14.

³¹ La Science en Famille, *Umran*, August 18, 1888: “*La Science en Famille Paris- 72, rue d'Assas 72- Paris. Paris'de intişar eden risail-i mevkûtelere şerefrazı olub fûnun ve fennin sanayiye tatbikinden bahis işbu musavver risaleyi bilhassa karilerimize tavsiye ederiz. Abonesi senevi 10 frankdır. Abone olmak için ya doğruca bâlâda muharrer adrese ve yahud idarehanemize müracaat olunmalıdır. Mezkur adrese (25) santimlik pul irsal olunursa numunelik nüshalar gönderilir.*”

³² Avrupa Kütüphanesi, *Umran*, August 18, 1888: “*Sekiz seneden beri Berberciyan Efendi tarafından tesis olunarak ahab-ı müracaatın her cihetce memnuniyet ve hoşnudiyetini celb iden bu kütübhanede her dürlü kitab-ı ecnebiyye mevcud olduğu gibi her nev'i ecnebi kitablara sipariş üzerine nihayet on beş günde celb olunarak hemen Avrupa fiyatına tevdi' olunur. İşbu kütübhanenin bilhassa Avrupa kütübhaneleriyle muamelat-ı daimisi bulunduğundan her bir sipariş mükemmelliyet ile ifa kılındığı gibi alet-i hekimiye ve fenniye ve cerrahiye celbinde dahi tavassut olunur ve dünyada neşr olunan bilhassa gazete ve risail-i mevkûteye abone yazar.*”

The period is also marked by a radical change in the very meaning of “reading” as an activity. Reading was no longer related to religion. The novels and stories from Europe showed the Ottomans the existence of unexplored worlds; and the Ottomans were enchanted by what they had seen. Advertisements for novels appeared in almost all the magazines and newspapers. Some of these advertisements did not even emphasize the content, nor even the subject of the novel: the information on the book was limited to its name, author, translator, page numbers, and its price.³³ A work of drama was also advertised in a similar way, and only the number of episodes and the quality of the publishing were provided.³⁴ According to the advertisement, since the book was published in a quite exquisite [*nefis*] way, everyone was recommended to read it. One might think of these kinds of advertisements as advertisements for the bookstores or printing houses rather than the books.

Ottomans could access popular and famous European authors just as anyone else in Europe could. Jules Verne,³⁵ Alexander Dumas,³⁶ and Shakespeare³⁷ were among European authors read by Ottoman readers. There are also advertisements for novels by Ottoman authors. *İki Refika veya Bir Numune-i İzdivaç* [Two wives or an exemplary marriage], a novel, was advertised as crucial for all woman and was written by Halil Edib Efendi, the owner of the magazine *Hadika*.³⁸ The text is also a sign that Ottoman

³³ Latif Roman, *Ümran*, November 7, 1888: “*Fransız müelliflerinden (Etyen Anol [?] ve Lui Jordis [?])in müştereken tahrir ve üç sene mukaddem müdürümüz Ahmed İhsan Bey tarafından tercüme ve neşr olunan işbu latif romanın nesh-i mevcudesi fevkalade kesb-i nedret edilmiş ise de mücerred Ümran abonelerine bir hizmet olmak üzere yine fiyatı olan 10 guruşa verilecek ve taşra için ayrıca posta ücreti alınmayacaktır. Mezkur roman iki sütunlu yüz sahifeyi mütecavizdir. Talib olacak abonelerimizin idarehanemize müracaatı iktiza eder.*”

³⁴ La Dam o Kamelya, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, August 13, 1903: “*La Dam o Kamelya [La Dame aux Camelia]Beş perdelik dram bâlâda muharrer kitablar Kütübhane-i İslam ve Askerî sahibi İbrahim Hilmi Efendi tarafından gayet nefis surette tab' edilmiş olduğundan mütâlaasını cümleye tavsiye ederiz*”

³⁵ Buzlar Arasında Bir Kış, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, August 13, 1903.

³⁶ Monte Kristo Kontu, *Mirat-ı Vatan*, no. 3, 1874.

³⁷ Venedik Taciri, *Tarik*, June 6, 1884 as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 6, June 1984.

³⁸ *İki Refika veya Bir Numune-i İzdivaç*, *Hadika*, July 20, 1888: “*Gazetemiz sahib-i imtiyazı Halil Edib Efendi'nin âsârındandır. Âdâb-ı millîyemize her cihetle muvaffak ve*

women were among this new crowd of readers. There were also books specifically targeting women readers. In the introduction of the advertisement, a couplet was used to attract the attention of the readers: “If a lady is necessary for every house in the world, this book is just as necessary for all the ladies” [*Alemde her eve nasıl lazım ise hanım, Her hanıma da işbu kitap öylece lazım*]. While this line acknowledged the importance of women for a household – probably by keeping in mind that it was published in a ladies’ magazine and advertising a book for them – it also limited the area in which a women had importance to the private sphere. *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, a state-sponsored newspaper, was important in the sense that it created an intellectual area of activity for the Ottoman women. However, “the ideal women image” it represented was still within the limits of a good wife, a good mother, and a good Muslim. A similar mentality is visible in the advertisement for a book called *Evkadını* (Housewife). This book was presented as necessary for all women in order to learn the details of being a good wife in the kitchen. Alongside recipes and tips for cooking, the content of the book was described as providing manners of hosting such as table setting.³⁹ Even though similar books, and *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, limited women to the private sphere, there were also some signs of an intellectual activation. Despite its aforementioned stance, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, for a newspaper specifically targeting Ottoman “Muslim” women, advertised books on quite a variety of subjects, from Ottoman

*Âlemde nasıl her eve lazım ise hanım,
Her hanıma da işbu kitap öylece lazım.
Beyti hakkında târif-i natuk olan bu küçük hikayenin fiyatı 5 guruşdur.”*

³⁹ Ev Kadını, *Sabah*, February 25, 1897, as transcribed in Subutay Hikmet Karahasanoğlu, “Osmanlı Gazetelerinde Kitap Haber ve İlanları,” *Tarih ve Toplum* no.96 (December 1991) p.328. :“*Alemde her eve nasıl lazım ise hanım, her hanıma da işbu kitap öylece lazım: Fazilet'i Şehire-i Osmaniye'den Fahriye Hanım Efendi tarafından telif olunmuş olan bu eser-i faide-i kester [sic.], matbuhat hakkında ihtarat-ı nühimme-i umumiyyeden sonra günagün etler, sebzeler, börekler, şurublar ve saire velhasıl icab eden alaturka ve alafranga bine karip etma-i lezize, meşrube-i nefisenin tabh ve istihzarına, terakkiyatı hazireye tab'an sofraya vaz' ve tertip olunmasına dair bir çok usul ve kavaid-i müfideyi havi olduğu gibi bazı levaci-i mühimme derc ve ilâve, ince kiler ve kaba kiler namiyle tefrik olunan cedvel-i mahsusunda dahi bir hayli tafsilat-ı lâzime irade olunmuş ve herkesin anlıyacağı bir lisan ile lüzum-i kavaid -i tabh arz ve izah edilmiş olduğundan ramazan-ı şerifde ağız tadıyla yemek yemek, yediği yemekten memnun ve maddeden müstefid olmak ve bu istifadeyi zevat-ı saireye bahşedebilmek arzusunda bulunanlar için lüzum ve ehemmiyeti derkârdır.(...) Fiyatı 3 guruş.” The couplet that was used in the beginning of this advertisement was also seen in the advertisement of *İki Refika veya Bir Numune-i İzdivaç*.*

Generals [*Osmanlı Kumandanları*] to Scientific Gardening [*İlmî Bağçivanlık*].⁴⁰

1.4.1.1. The Variety of Books

Besides the novels, dramas, and stories, books on popular subjects were also published and advertised. A book on modern warfare written by Von der Goltz, a Prussian marshal commissioned by Abdulhamid to organize the Ottoman army, appears in a yearbook.⁴¹ According to Niyazi Berkes, the importance of the development of reading habits lies not in what the Ottomans read, but in the very fact that they acquire the practice of reading.⁴² Ottomans were aware of the importance of reading. The creation of a future generation of readers was regarded important for the well-being of the Empire. Therefore, books for children were also available for the Ottoman readers, and were advertised by stressing the word “knowledge” [*malumat*]. An advertisement for a children’s book written by an author named Mehmed Şemseddin mentions his previous works and how beneficial they were for children’s development. The name of the book, *Çocuklara Talim* [Education for children], gives a hint about its content. Since knowledge and education had become important qualities, the book addresses parents “who want their children get good and rich knowledge.”⁴³ The books they were reading do provide an important insight into interests, trends, and ideas among the Ottoman readers.

⁴⁰ Osmanlı Kumandanları, İlmî Bağçivanlık, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, August 13, 1903.

⁴¹ Gölts [Goltz] Paşa, *Rebi-i Maarifet (Ebuzziya Takvimi)*, 1892/1893. “*Almanya Erkan-ı Harb miralaylarından Ferik Fon der Gölts [Von der Goltz] Paşa’nın asr-i hazrın ahvâl-i askeriyyesi hakkındaki eser-i bî-nâzirinin tercümesidir. Mütercimi Binbaşı Tahir Bey.*”

⁴² Niyazi Berkes, *Türkiye’de Çağdaşlaşma*, p. 325.

⁴³ Çocuklara Talim, *Tarik*, April 7, 1888, as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 52, April 1988: “*Muharriri: Mehmet Şemseddin. Mehmet Şemseddin Bey’in ‘Anahir’, ‘Arkadaş’ isimleriyle neşr eylemiş olduğu eserlerden çocuklar hakkında ne derecede fâideli şeyler yazdığı malûmdur. Bu defaki ‘çocuklara tâlim’ nâmında olan bu eseri ise on yaşından on altı yaşına kadar olan çocukların şâir risâlelerden öğrenemedikleri pek çok malûmattan bahis olduğundan evlâdının hem fâideli hem de ziyade malumat kazanmasını arzu edenlere tavsiye olunur.*”

Some book advertisements are indirectly related to politics. A booklet called “Russia’s Political Situation” was advertised as published on the 10th anniversary of the Russo-Ottoman war of 1878.⁴⁴ Curiosity is visible in the advertisements for books concerned with other parts of the world. Areas with Muslim populations are among the subjects of books advertised in Ottoman newspapers, journals, and yearbooks. Arabia, the Arabs, and their history, culture, and literature are among the especially popular subjects. *Rebi-i Maarifet* (and also known as EbuZZiya Calendar), promotes several books on Islam, Muslim thinkers, and Arabian culture and literature.⁴⁵ A book called the “Arabic School” provides an example: for the word “school,” *medrese* was used, which has a more traditional and Islamic character than its more recent and secular counterpart *mekteb*. In the body of the advertisement, the content of the book was more clearly explained: Arabs, the founders of Islamic civilization, their literature, influences, and their beautiful works created with their knowledge in all areas of sciences and arts were set out in this book. It is noteworthy that the overall impression from the advertisement reflects a respect and esteem toward the Arabic civilization, which might be related to the Islamist tendencies of Ottoman diplomacy under Abdulhamid II.⁴⁶

The curiosity towards these lands could be read as a reflection of Abdulhamid’s Islamism in society as an interest toward their brothers in faith, but may also have another interpretation. For the sake of interaction, Hamidian men were visiting Muslims all around world in order to gather information. However, keeping in mind the character of the readers in Ottoman society, these books could also be seen as reflecting an orientalist curiosity toward these unknown lands and people. It is very likely that a book on Ethiopia [*Habeşistan*], for example, was read with the latter kind of curiosity.⁴⁷

⁴⁴ “Rusya’nın Ahval-i Siyasiyesi,” *Tarik*, April 17, 1884, as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 4, April 1984: “Rusya’nın Ahval-i Siyasiyesi işbu risale Bâb-ı Âlî Caddesin’de kitapçı Garabet Efendi’nin dükkanında ve diğer kitapçılarda satılıyor.”

⁴⁵ *Rebi-i Maarifet (EbuZZiya Takvimi)*, 1888/1889, 1889/1890-1890/1891, 1892/1893.

⁴⁶ Medresetü’l-‘Arab, *Rebi-i Maarifet (EbuZZiya Takvimi)*, 1892/1893: “Bâni-yi medeniyet-i İslâmiyye olan ‘Arabların edebiyat ve hikemiyet ve ulûm ve fînûn ve sanayiîn kâffe-i aksamında ihraz ettikleri kemalât ile vücuda getirdikleri measir-i celileyi muarîfdir. Fi 10 guruş.”

⁴⁷ Habeşistan Hakkında Malumat-ı Mücmele, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, August 13, 1903: “Muharririn-i Osmaniyye’den izzetli Ali Muzaffer Beyefendi’nin bu nam ile

Borrowed orientalism is not so very different than any other borrowed aspect of Western ideas. It was a sign of the internalization of Western ideas, a way of being a part of the big game alongside the winners. These winners were the ones with the civilizing mission, ones from the *Düvel-i Muazzama*.⁴⁸ However, at the very same time, Christian missionaries were walking these lands, trying to civilize and convert the “ignorant savages.” During the reign of Abdulhamid II, American missionaries were especially effective in the Empire. In opposition to missionary activities, the Ottoman State started a program which Deringil describes as counter-propaganda.⁴⁹ The problem was that those savages were the Ottoman Sultan’s savages, and only he had the right to civilize them. This effort involved the active encouragement of conversion to the Hanefi sect, and for the first time the Ottomans envisioned using missionary zeal to fight missionary zeal. According to an advertisement in the newspaper *Tarik*, Ahmed Midhat Efendi, a celebrated Ottoman intellectual, wrote a book as a counter-defense against missionary activities. Upon the reply from the head of the American Protestant missionaries, Mister Dwight, he had published a second book on the matter. It is worth noting that the seller of the book in this case is a non-Muslim Ottoman.⁵⁰

tahrir eyledikleri kitab bu kere Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete matbaası'nda tab' olunarak mevki-i fûruhta vaz' edilmiştir. Ali Muzaffer Beyefendi'nin iktidar-ı kalemleri herkesin malumu olacağı cihetle kitab-ı mezkurun mütâlaasını cümlelerin şitaban olacağı şübhesizdir. Merkez-i tevzi'i köprüde Adalar İskeleyi'nde kitabcı Nasrah [?] Efendi'nin dükkânıdır”

⁴⁸ See Deringil, “They Live in a State of Nomadism”.

⁴⁹ Deringil, “The Invention of Tradition as Public Image”, p. 14.

⁵⁰ Müdafaaya Mukabele ve Mukabeleye Müdafaa, *Tarik*, May 14, 1884, as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 5, May 1984: “Saadetli Ahmed Midhat Efendi hazretlerinin ehl-i Islâmı kabul-ü nasraniyyete teşvik eyleyen misyonerlere karşı bir müdafaa olmak üzere . . . neşr eyledikleri kitaba Amerikalı Protestan misyonerlerinin reisi Mister Dwight hazretleri tarafından idilen mukabele ile bu mukabeleye dahi Ahmet Midhat Efendi hazretlerinin yaptığı müdafaayı şâmildir ki evvelki müdafaaya cild-i sâni ittihaz olunmuştur. Gerek bu ve gerek ilk defa çıkan birinci cildi eczalan 10 alafranga mücellidi 15 gurus fiyatla Bab-ı Âlî Caddesi'nde Arakel Efendi'nin 46 numarolu kitabhanesinde satılmaktadır.”

1.4.2. For Islam, Buy Muslim

The words “Islam” and “Muslim” appear in the advertisements in two different forms. First, in relation to Abdulhamid’s policies, Islam becomes an important theme in the advertisements. Abdulhamid used the caliph title, “*Halife’i Müslimin, zıll’ullah-ı fi’larz,*” reflecting both his Pan-Islamist desires as well as his absolutism.⁵¹ Şerif Mardin describes Abdulhamid’s understanding of Islamism as a flag to unify his subjects under, an apparatus for Muslims outside the Ottoman domains to resist imperialism, and a weapon of his own against the increasing pressure of imperialism.⁵² Even though the emphasis was on Islam, however, according to Deringil, “Ottoman nationality was beginning to be envisioned in more and more secular terms despite the religious language in which it was couched,” and “in fact it was implementing the concrete policy of a rational secular programme.”⁵³

Abdulhamid gained the respect of Muslims inside and outside of the Ottoman Empire with his image of a religious caliph.⁵⁴ In accordance with his image, Abdulhamid initiated the construction of the Hedjaz Railway, connecting the sacred city of Medina to Istanbul. This was a project with a symbolic value, stressing Abdulhamid’s title, and also with practical benefits.⁵⁵ He authorized the collection of donations [*iane*] from all the Muslims all around the world. In an advertisement for cigarette papers, the profit from which would be used for the Hedjaz railway, the product was promoted with the name of the Sultan himself. The advertisement includes a drawing of the cover of this cigarette paper. On the cover was a steam-spewing train passing a canyon between two mountains on a stone bridge. Both the train and the stone bridge between two

⁵¹ İlber Ortaylı, *İmparatorluğun En Uzun Yüzyılı*, 8th ed. (Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2001), p. 176.

⁵² Şerif Mardin, *Türkiye’de Din ve Siyaset*, ed. Mümtazer Türköne and Tuncay Önder, vol. 3 of *Makaleler* (Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1990), p. 16.

⁵³ Deringil, “The Invention of Tradition as Public Image”, p. 6.

⁵⁴ Berkes, *Türkiye’de Çağdaşlaşma*, p. 300.

⁵⁵ William Ochsenwald, *The Hijaz Railroad* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia, 1980) pp. 76-77, as quoted by Deringil in *The Invention of Tradition as Public Image*, p. 25: “The opening dates were made to coincide with the sultan’s accession anniversary. By this means they gained a symbolic importance and were linked to the ruler personally . . .”

mountains are effective images of technological progress. Another interesting point here is that below the image of the train on the other side of cover, there is a notification: The content “is analyzed at the Royal Medical Academy” [*Mekteb-i Tıbbiye-i Şahane'de tahlil olunmuştur*]. It is noteworthy that even though this cigarette paper is described as “produced in France, in one of the most famous cigarette paper factories, the factory of Joseph Bardo, and superior to any existing paper in use in the countries of Ottoman,” even such a superior quality product had first to be analyzed by the Royal Medical Academy. The advertisement also provides the ingredients of the paper, to erase questions on the issue of health and safety.⁵⁶

1.4.2.1 The Muslim Woman as Consumer

As mentioned before, this awakening of Islamic identity was also reflected in the books that Ottoman society was reading. They became more interested in the Islamic world and history. Secondly, the words “Muslim” and “Islam” appeared in advertisements in order to mention a specific target group for an advertisement. The advertisements used these words in order to announce merchandise or services specifically for Muslim customers. For example, Şamlı Ali Cevadzade sold imported goods from Iran just for Muslim ladies [*Muhadderat-ı İslam*].⁵⁷ In another example, a female dentist from Vienna targets Muslim women, saying that the women of Islam

⁵⁶ Hicaz Demiryolu Sigara Kağıdı, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, August 13, 1903: “*Hamidiye Hicaz Demiryolu Menfaatine Mahsus Sigara Kağıdı Bâ-irade-yi seniyye-yi hazret-i padişahî imal olunmuştur. İşbu kağıd Fransa'nin en meşhur sigara kağıd fabrikalarından "Josef Bardo'nun" imalathanesinde yapılmakta ve ezher ciheti Memalik-i Osmaniyye'de sarf ve istihlak edilen kağıdlara faik bulunmaktadır. Terkibi şerait-i sıhhiyye haiz olduğu ve piriç ve keten ile bir miktarda muzadd-ı taaffün maddeyi havi bulunduğu bâd-il tahlil Mekteb-i Tıbbiyye-i Şahane'nin 17 Şubat sene 319 tarihli tasdiknâmesiyle isbat edilmiştir.*” See, Appendix 1.

⁵⁷ Şamlı Ali Cevadzade, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, September 10, 1903: “*Hayli zamandan beri mağaza-i acizanemde fûruht olunmakta olan İran mamulat-ı haririyesinden olub ahâli-i kiramımızın indinde mazhar-ı rağbet buyrulan canfeslerimizin metaneti dahi herkesce müsellemdir. Memleketimize bir hizmeti bulunmuş olmak üzere bu kere Avrupa emsaline kat be-kat faik ve muhadderat-ı İslamiyye'ye meşlah, elbise ve çarşaf imalatına salah bir surette nesc ettirip son modaya muvaffak en zarif ve en kibar çeşidlerinden celb etmiş olduğum cihetle bir kere görmek için mağaza-i âcizâneme teşrife rağbet buyuracak zevat-ı kiramın herhalde memnun kalacaklarından eminim*”

[*Nisvan-ı Islam*] do not have to resort to male dentists anymore.⁵⁸ *Tiring*, as mentioned earlier, an Austrian department store with a wide range of merchandise and a regular advertiser in *Kadınlara Mahsus Gazete*, announces that it has solved a longstanding problem for Muslim women. Muslim women no longer had to face male salespersons: *Tiring* is providing them with a female tailor [*terzi*] and salespersons [*memurlar*], as well as a special room.⁵⁹

As seen above, some advertisements specifically targeted the women consumers. *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete* reserved more than four full pages to advertisements in almost all its issues. These advertisements directly addressed women readers. Women professionals were quite common among the Ottoman advertisers, since they filled a gap in the needs of Muslim women. In a world in which women were traditionally restricted to the private sphere, a transformation from mere mothers and wives into consumers widened their sphere of activity. Therefore, new regulations and services were provided to win over this new consumer group. Dentists, medical doctors, tailors and instructors are among the common female professionals one might find on the pages of *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*. However, the economic activity of Muslim women is still dominantly limited to being consumers. All advertisements with women advertisers that were encountered within the scope of this research were by foreigners, except for a female embroidery tutor. For this Muslim woman, however, being outside of her traditional realm did not place her outside the scope of suspicions or questions. The qualities of the embroidery tutor, as explained in the advertisement, were not limited to her gender, abilities, or experience: her character, marital status [*zat-üz-zevc*], and even her chastity [*namus*] were included in the list of her good features.⁶⁰

⁵⁸ Matmazel Dişçi, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, April 23, 1896.

⁵⁹ *Tiring*, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, April 23, 1896: “*Kadınlara Mahsus hazır elbise için yeni bir şube tesis edilmiştir. İşbu mağazada kadife havlu kumaş ve moda kumaşlardan mamul hayli ferace ve ceketler küçük kızlar için elbise küçük çocuklar için mantolar, Paris modelleri, her bir son moda elbise ehveniyet-i fevkalâde ile fûruht olunmakta olup Osmanlı hanımları için kadın fûruht memurları ile kadın terziyi havi ayrıca salon dahi tertib edilmiştir*” See, Appendix 2.

⁶⁰ Nakış Muallimesi, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, August 13, 1903: “*Alaturka ve alafranga nadir-ül emsal envai muhtelifede el işleri ve nakış ve dantela ve çin ve kurdela ve emsali tüylü işler genç hanımlara son derece lazım ve misli görülmemiş zarif el hünerlerinden maharet-i kamile sahibi gayet namuskar ve terbiyeli muhadderat-ı islamiyeden zat-üz-zevc bir hanım kendi hanesinde lede-l -hace konaklarda ehven ücretle muallimelik arzusunda bulunduğundan talib olanlar Salkımsöğüd Mahallesi*

Alaturka and *Alafranga*, various sorts of embroidery, ornamentations, lace works, feathered works similar to Chinese and ribbon works are taught, which are extremely necessary and unique for young ladies, by a quite talented, very chaste, well-mannered, married, Muslim woman in her house or in times of need in residences, for very economical terms since she has a wish to be a tutor, ones who are interested may ask for her from the watchman of the *Salkımsöğüü* neighborhood or from the Greengrocer Dimitri across the *Topkapı Taşmektep* as *Usta Hanım* from Izmir.

The duality of *Alaturka* and *Alafranga* seemed to infiltrate every aspect of the Ottomans' life, from clothing to furniture and even to models of embroidery. A Muslim woman advertising her service well exemplifies the depth of the economic transformations in the Ottoman society. However, she still felt it necessary to explain herself and set out her chastity and morality, as much as she explained her craft. In the course of the research for this study, there were no examples of a foreign or non-Muslim woman advertiser trying to explain herself in similar terms. Nonetheless, all these examples addressing women and by women were examples of a society where women are a part of the economy, mostly as consumers, but also as professionals.

1.4.3. Amazing Marvels, Amazed Customers

Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete as a women's newspaper provides a great source of material for this period. Just as there are professionals addressing women, there are also advertisements for merchandise specifically aiming at women consumers, such as a washing machine, which appears to be a manual device, and is announced with the confident title: "good news for the ladies!" [*hanımlara müjde!*].⁶¹ Ziya Efendi, the

bekcisinden veyahud Topkapı'da Taşmektep karşısındaki Bakkal Dimitri'den İzmirli Usta Hanım diye sual etmeleri."

⁶¹ Nev-i İcad Çamaşır Yıkama Makinesi, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, May 14, 1903: "Bahriye mülahız-ı evvellerinden fütüvvetli Ziya Efendi'nin ihtira-kerdesi olan bu çamaşır yıkama makinesi bilcümle ev hanımlarına müfid olup hem iktisâd nokta-i nazarından haiz ehemmiyet bulunmakta hem de gayet az bir zamanda en kirli çamaşırları bile temizlemesi ve küçük bir çocukta bile istimaline kadir bulunması cihetiyle her halde şayan-ı tavsiye bulunmaktadır. Bu makine ile bir günlük çamaşır dört saatte ve kemal-i rahatla itmam edilir. Mezkur makine iki buçuk lira fiatla eski zabita civarında meydancık caddesinde 14 numaralı Ohannes Papazyan Efendi'nin sobacı mağazasında mevki' fûruhta vaz' edilmiş olup arzu eyleyenlerin mezkur mağazaya müracaatla tafsilât-ı lazime ahz eylemeleri hanım efendilerin hanelerine

“inventor” of this marvel, is introduced to the potential buyers as a first lieutenant in the Ottoman Navy, probably to arouse trust in the product, and the advert stresses how economical the device is, and the relief it provides for women from such hard and laborious work. However, it transpires that one still needs to exert physical effort to use this marvel. This, of course, is not an example of how modern the Ottoman households were in the early twentieth century; however, it is a sign of how *modernist* Ottoman society was that the use of words like “new invention” [*nev-i icad*] was a way to propagate a certain commodity. In fact, washing machines had arrived in Ottoman lands long before Ziya Efendi thought of inventing them. Seven years earlier than its indigenous counterpart, in an advertisement, an American washing machine had been promoted, which supposed to be a manual device as well, in a less excited way. In this advertisement featuring the American washing machine, the target audience was not envisioned as women – the ones familiar with the activity – but the public laundries; it did not mention anything about domestic use, but emphasized how the public laundries utilized this new machine.⁶²

The first example of a washing machine by a local entrepreneur could be an attempt at import substitution, an effort by an interesting and patriotic Ottoman inventor. Another machine for agriculture, probably an early prototype of combine harvesters [*Biçer Döğeri*], was described as an exotic marvel from a distant planet. While referring to the harvester, the advertisement uses the phrase “fire machine” [*ateş makinesi*], since it operates with “fire”, which was indicated also by a reference to its steam engine, *islîm kuvveti*.⁶³

makine ile beraber izâm olunarak tarz-ı istimâlini öğretmek üzere bir memure-i mahsusa tedarik edilmiş olduğuda ayrıca beyan olunur.” See, Appendix 3.

⁶² Çamaşır için Amerika Makinesi, *Tarik*, February 6, 1886, as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 26, February 1986: “Bütün çamaşırhanelerde işbu makinenin fevâidi tecrübe ve takdir olunmuştur. Saatte yarım libre sabun ile seksen parça çamaşır oğuşturulmaksızın kar gibi beyaz olarak yıkanabilir. Hem ehveniyet hem de süratle beheri kırk beş Franga talibin mahall-î ikâmetine bilâ-masârif gönderiliyor.”

⁶³ Ateş İle Mütiharrik Makine, *Tarik*, October 5, 1884, as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 10, October 1984: “Ateş İle Mütiharrik Makine [*Biçer Döğeri- Öğütür*] Trieste şehrinde küşad olunacak sergiye bu defa vâz’ olunmak üzere müceddeden imâl olunan ateş makinesi orak biçmeğe ve gerek harman yapmağa ve arzu olunduğu halde değirmene tahvil olunarak istimal olunabileceği, mezkûr makine şayet istimalinde şikest olur ise suhuletle tamiri için fazla alât ve edevatı hazır ve mevcut olduğu, mezkûr makinenin kazanının islîm kuvveti altı beygir kuvvetinde, 3700 kilogram ağırlığında olduğu, makinenin fiyatı 5500 frank olup Yunanistan’ın Pire şehrinde teslim

1.4.4. Style and Fashion in Advertisements

Regardless of the motive behind the employment of the word, it is characteristic of this period's advertisements that they describe commodities in terms of their being European, or being of the same level of quality as European goods. French, British, and later German and Austrian commodities are the main goods that were promoted in the advertisements. Sometimes business owners mentioned how they brought [*Avrupa'dan celb*]⁶⁴ or imported [*Avrupa'dan ithal*] their commodities from the European cities. Tailors usually praised their work by asserting that their merchandise was the latest fashion [*son moda*]. A store selling clothes in Beyoğlu, *Kamelya*, was so sure about the excellence of its latest imported products that it claimed that upon seeing these goods the customers' "eyes would be lightened and their hearts would be filled with joy."⁶⁵ This almost artistic style of advertisement is quite interesting, especially when considered alongside the discount campaign the store ran every Thursday. In all these senses, this advertisement seems to be ahead of its contemporaries.

Some advertisements try to appeal to Ottoman women through referring to their social interactions with other women. Regular gatherings at private houses are subjects for the advertisements in women's magazines. Phrases such as "for the gatherings" [*cemiyetler için*] and "special to the gathering" [*cemiyetlere mahsus*] were used to

olunacağından mubayaasına talip olanlar ve lâyıkiyla malûmat almak isteyenler Pire'de mukim zîrde muharrer imza sahibinin acentasına veyahud Deraliyye'de Galata'da Karantina sokağında numero dokuz Mösyö Hermin [?] Helbin [?]'in mağazasına müracaat eylemeleri ihtar olunur."

⁶⁴ A. Mayer ve Şürekası, *Tercüman-ı Hakikat*, January 17, 1884, as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 1, January 1984: "A. Mayer ve Şürekâsı. Beyoğlu'nda Tünel yanında. . . . Erkek ve kadınlar için bu seneye mahsus olarak Avrupa'dan celb edilen müzeyyen, mütenevvi elbise . . ."

⁶⁵ *Kamelya*, *Tarik*, April 19, 1888, as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 52, April 1988: "Beyoğlu'nda Galatasaray Karşısında 194 Numarolu Meşhur Kamelya Mağazası': Son moda olarak bu defa getirdiğimiz meta'ların manzarası gözleri pürnur ve kalpleri mesrur edeceğinden muhterem müşterilerimizin mağazamızı her gün teşrif buyurup tebdil-i nazarla tecdid-i zevk u sürür eylemeleri. Ve her Perşembe günleri top bakıyeleri parça kumaşların evvelce kıymet-i asliyyelerinden nisf-ı tenzil ile satıldığı halde bundan böyle daha pek çok tenzil ile me'mûlün gayri olarak gayet ucuz satılacağından mezkur parçalardan dahi olmak arzu buyuran zevatın Perşembe günleri teşrif buyurmaları."

describe the latest European fashion, the most ornamented textiles.⁶⁶ Tailors also mentioned that they sew what they have seen in the European cities that they have visited, or that they have European apprentices to provide better service to the Ottoman ladies and their refined tastes [*zevk-i selim*].

Fashion was a point of emphasis in advertisements, especially those targeting Muslim women: the word “fashionable”, for example, was used sometimes interchangeably with “European.” If the commodities are local productions, then the quality of the goods is expressed in comparison with the quality of similar European goods. This is a problematic point, since this great emphasis on the European could be read in two ways: either an indication of Ottoman penetration into the European capitalist economy, or a cultural phenomenon directly related to modernism and Westernization. Even if the Ottoman women adopted the European fashion as the norm, on the same pages as the advertisements there was also news from Europe, which was criticized and questioned by the authors or the readers. According to Elizabeth B. Frierson, the presence of all the information on Europe and America available in the women’s magazines was not an evidence of a wish adopt the wholesale qualities of the West, “since both negative and the positive aspects of the West could be found in the pages of this newspapers and magazines.”⁶⁷ The earliest examples of advertisements available to the Ottoman public were of European products, and images they used were clichés directly taken from European advertisements. So, as Koloğlu argues, the European people seen in these images could be instrumental in the development of a sense of fashion in the Ottoman Empire.⁶⁸ On the other hand, Müge Göçek sees “the

⁶⁶ For example, Cemiyetler İçün, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, April 23, 1896: “*Cemiyetler için işlemeli ve sırmalı ve her nev’i enfes çiçekli çarşafıklar düz safi ipekli feracelikler son moda bengalin ve fular, her cins ipekli yünlü elbiselikler ve sâfi yünlülüler İstanbul tüccarından hiç birinin rekâbet edemeyecekleri derecede maktu’ ve gayet ehven fiyatla satılmakta olduğundan hem nefis hem zarif hem ehven kumaşlar iştira etmek isteyen hanımefendilerin bu mağazadan pek ziyade istifade edecekleri aşikâr bulunduğundan mezkûr mağazayı umum hanımefendilere bilhassa tavsiye ederiz.*”

⁶⁷ Elizabeth B. Frierson, “Mirrors Out, Mirrors In: Domestication and Rejection of the Foreign in Late Ottoman Women’s Magazines (1875-1908),” in *Women, Patronage, and Self-representation in Islamic Societies*, ed. D. Fairchild Ruggles (Albany NY: State University of New York Press, 2000), p. 178.

⁶⁸ Orhan Koloğlu, *Reklamcılığımızın İlk Yüzyılı 1840-1940* (Istanbul: Reklamcılık Vakfı Yayınları, 2000), p. 145.

adoption of modes of Western behavior, such as clothing made in European fashion, top hats, fancy canes, pet dogs, piano lessons, French language lessons, operas, dances, and balls . . . etc.” as the first “visible signs of the diffusion of Western civilization onto Ottoman society.”⁶⁹ There were several advertisements for European-style entertainment⁷⁰ as well as more traditional ones.⁷¹

1.4.5. Another Dimension of Westernization

Kushner sees the subjects that, as a result of Abdulhamid’s censorship, were featured in Ottoman press – the technological inventions and the discoveries in Europe – as the reason for the “removal of long-standing barriers between the Ottomans and the outside world;” he sees them therefore as the emergence of a way for the educated reader to “acquaint himself with some facets of Western culture” and says that later they had “the effect of arousing people’s desire to follow the West’s lead and Westernize their own country.”⁷² Actually, the Sultan himself used the West and its technology to effect the gradual transformation of the administration system and, especially, the military organization of the Empire.⁷³ In addition, he tried to extend it to his Muslim subjects through modern schools. Graduates of these schools had a chance to learn about and understand a different world, where knowledge had nothing to do with religion. The duality in the intellectual world slowly penetrated into other realms, such

⁶⁹ Göçek, *Rise of the Bourgeoisie, Demise of Empire*, p. 119.

⁷⁰ Geceleyin Mehtabda Tenezzüh Vapuru, *Tarik*, August 1, 1884, as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 8, August 1984.

⁷¹ Haydarpaşa’da Saz, *Tarik*, May 1, 1885, as transcribed in *Tarih ve Toplum, Yüzyıl Önce Bu Ay*, no. 17, May 1985: “Haydarpaşa’da vâkî Emperyal Bahçesi’nde bugünkü Cuma günüünden bed’an haftada üç gün olmak üzere Cuma ve Cumartesi ve Pazar günleri sâzende-i meşhur Civanî’nin saz takimi icrâ-yı âheng eyleyecektir.”

⁷² Kushner, *The Rise of Turkish Nationalism*, p. 15: “Abdülhamid was not only interested in Europe’s technology.” In order to boost his image as a European monarch he also adopted European court manners while receiving foreign guests. For more information, see Hakan Karateke, *Padişahım Çok Yaşa! Osmanlı Devleti’nin Son Yüzylında Merasimler* (Istanbul: Kitap Yayınevi, 2004).

⁷³ Şerif Mardin, *Türk Modernleşmesi*, ed. Mümtazer Türköne and Tuncay Önder, vol. 4 of *Makaleler* (Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1991), p. 17.

as economic production. Even though most of the Empire was still using traditional production methods, the expressions “the European way” [*Avrupa usulunde*] or the “latest system and latest technology” [*son usul*] were used to emphasize that the commodity had been produced in a “modern” way. Ottomans came to think of modernity as the source of Europe’s power and development, and by this Europe became the symbol of knowledge, progress, and the future. This generation regarded technology and industry as a necessary means to save the Empire. This was the beginning of almost an obsession with industry and technology, which could be described as “modernism,” and would become more obvious in the later periods. However, the early signs of the modernist mentality are visible in the images from a few advertisements from this period. A company which dyes textiles and clothes (not in large quantities but targeting the domestic orders) used a landscape with factories and factory chimneys alongside a woman in Western attire.⁷⁴

Abdulhamid supported the establishment of new businesses, especially by his Muslim subjects. The economic program of Sultan Abdulhamid was different than his liberal predecessors. He took over an imbalanced budget on the edge of bankruptcy. Unfortunately, his fears had already become real. The Anglo-Ottoman convention in 1838 was a turning point in Ottoman economic policy, which marked the Ottomans’ economic dependency on Europe up until the abolition of capitulations in 1914. The Ottoman state was no longer able to protect the domestic market, which was desperately in need of industrialization. The international ports such as Istanbul, Izmir, and Salonica prospered by imports and exports, but the benefits went disproportionately to the Christian communities of these cities, since they had become *protégés* of foreign merchants. Thus the integration of the Ottoman Empire into the world economy did not result in a commercialized and industrialized Muslim bourgeoisie. Most of the advertisements belonged to either foreign or non-Muslim establishments. There are a few Muslim businesses with advertisements and only a handful of Muslim industries.⁷⁵ The capitulations did not allow the Ottoman State to abandon liberalism completely or to exert absolute protectionism over the economy. The impact of the German model and the ideas of Friedrich List had a great effect on the Ottoman Empire. After unification and the formation of the German Empire, the protectionist ideas of Friedrich List

⁷⁴ *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, September 10, 1903; see Appendix 4 for the image.

⁷⁵ Such as “Karamürsel Fes ve Çuha Fabrikası İdarehanesi Devlet Şirketi.”

replaced classical liberalism in the minds of students in modern colleges.⁷⁶ However, in the period before the students of these colleges seized power, a non-Muslim Ottoman business owner issued a curious advertisement, promoting the local against the foreign. After describing the goods he sells, this business owner says: “The ones who want to support the local business” are recommended to visit his store. This non-Muslim business owner asks for support from fellow Ottomans (actually, from Muslim ladies), asking them to buy from him and thereby support the local against the foreign.⁷⁷

The Sultan, on the other hand, was supporting the Muslim entrepreneurs. His protection and support for them was a way of showing his greatness. One business owner showed his gratitude to the Sultan for the support and the incentives he provided for the establishment or the development of his business. The owner of Faruki Cosmetics, a company that started by producing perfumes and essences [*itriyat*] and became a prominent trademark, announced his gratitude to the Sultan for supporting him during the establishment of his factory.⁷⁸ The Faruki Cosmetics became brand that was demanded by its consumers, and competed with the Europeans, as they claimed in the early days of their establishment. The use of word “European” has a completely dual connotation in this advertisement, in comparison to the other examples. In other examples, the word “European” represents progress and high quality, but Faruki uses it

⁷⁶ Fikret Adanır, “Imperial Response to Nationalism: the Ottoman Case,” in *Governance, Globalization and the European Union: Which Europe for Tomorrow*, ed. Henry Cavanna (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2002), p.65.

⁷⁷ Berberyan ve Mahdumu, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, April 23, 1903: “*Dakes* [?] *Berberyan ve Mahdumu İslam Hanımlarıyla Hanım Kızlara Mahsus Her Nev'i Elbise Düz ve dallı, ipekli kumaşlardan son moda üzere dikilmiş işlemeli ve işlemez elbiselerle yeni çıkma şanjanlı çiçekli kadifelerden ve düz peluşlardan mamul zarif pelerinler ceketler ve paltolar fûruht olunmaktadır elbise-i hazirenin kumaş biçim ve dikişleri gayetle metin ve nefis olduğu gibi ismarlamalar dahi sür'at-i mümküne ve dikkat ve ihtimam ile yapılır. Sanayi'-i mahalliyeyi teşvik etmek isteyen zevat-ı kiramın mezkur mağazaya müracaat etmeleri tavsiye olunur.*”

⁷⁸ Faruki Itriya, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, December 17, 1903: “*Üç seneden beri imal ve istihzar edildiği revaç-ı latife ile müşam erbab-ı nezaheti ta'tir eden (Darülistihzar Faruki) saye-i maa-l vaye-i hazret-i hilafetpenahide mazhar olduğu teşvik ve rağbet semeresi ile âlât ve edevatını ikmal ederek Avrupa'nın en son usulde ve edevatla mücehhez itriyat fabrikalarının ufak mikyasda bir numunesi halini iktisab etmiş ve bu seneye mahsus olarak imal ettiği (Dar-ül Sina-i Faruki)nin kendisine has bir târz-ı latifede imal ettiği itriyat-ı nefisenin Avrupa itriyatının kâffesine vücuh ile faik olduğu itriyat-i mezkûreyi istimâl edenlerce malumdur. Binâenaleyh Avrupa'nın mağşuş ve sunî kokularına tercihen Faruki itriyatının mazhar-ı rağbet olacağı şüphesizdir.*”

firstly as an example, a standard – but also a level which it is possible to reach and eventually surpass. The idea of competing with and exceeding Europe would become a common theme that the local producers and businesses used in later advertisements. Faruki, as an Ottoman businessman, shows early signs of such a change in mentalities.

As seen in the Faruki case, the late Ottoman advertisers used famous people to sell their goods – just as they do today. And who could be more famous and more effective in promoting a good than Sultan Abdulhamid Han himself? The Sultan’s monogram and the Ottoman dynasty’s coat of arms⁷⁹ were represented in the advertisements. If a professional or a merchant provided goods and services to the Ottoman palace, they used the Ottoman coat of arms or the monogram of the Sultan in order to emphasize the high quality of their goods.⁸⁰

Being visible in the advertisements, Abdulhamid’s reign was not a period of isolation, a distant closed society away from the rest of the world. Even the Sultan’s Islamism and autocracy were necessary measures, affected by the realities of the Imperialist Era. The Sultan's choices on the other hand, were welcomed and buttressed by local business-owners and employed in texts of the advertisements.

⁷⁹ The design of the coat of arms had been commissioned during the reign of Mahmud II. According to Deringil, by the time Abdülhamid II came to sit on the Ottoman throne, it was a well-established part of Ottoman official symbolism.

⁸⁰ For further examples of official iconography used by various business owners in advertisements during the reign of Abdulhamid II, see Selim Deringil, *The Well-Protected Domains: Ideology and the Legitimation of Power in the Ottoman Empire, 1876-1909* (London, New York: I.B.Tauris, 1998), pp. 34-35. For employment of Abdülhamid’s monogram and the Ottoman “coat of arms” in the advertisements see Uygur Kocabaşoğlu, “Gazi Abdülhamid Han ve Reklamlar,” *Tarih ve Toplum* no. 35 (November, 1986), pp. 57-60.

CHAPTER 2

TRANSFORMATION OF A STATE, TRANSFORMATION OF A SOCIETY: THE YOUNG TURK REVOLUTION OF 1908

The 19th century Ottoman intellectual effort was characterized by a search for explanations of the shortcomings of the Ottoman Empire. The answers were to be found in the West, in new technology, and in the science this represented. As discussed in the previous chapter, the *Tanzimat* period was a product of such an intellectual effort. The Young Ottomans, the *Tanzimat* statesmen and Abdulhamid himself were aware of the fact that the West was superior in science and technology. A recognition of this situation was apparent even behind Abdulhamid's Islamist policies – in fact, in a sense he had used Islam to suppress possible reactions from conservatives against the modernization and Westernization activities which were being perpetuated, following on from the preceding attempts.

2.1. Progress and Unity: The Young Turk Movement

In the course of this transformation, the words *fen* and *ilm* both became used to correspond to the word 'science'. The term *ilm* had referred to both religion and science in the Ottoman Empire for centuries; and *fen* usually had a connection with the traditional fine arts. However, influenced by the writings of Muslim intellectuals who were educated in Europe, an alternative connotation was attributed to *ilm* (pl. *ulum*) and *fen* (pl. *fünun*)⁸¹ in the accounts of travelers, in official documents, and lastly in journals and newspapers: they began to acquire a pure positivist meaning, free from any religious associations. Once religious and traditional concepts, they began to serve the

⁸¹ İsmail Kara, *Din ile Modernleşme Arasında: Çağdaş Türk Düşüncesinin Meseleleri* (Istanbul: Dergâh Yayınları, 2003), p. 127.

process of modernization by providing an association with the activity of ‘knowing’ and natural sciences. They gradually supplanted their traditional meanings; as Hanioglu points out: “the concept of ‘modern science’ began to usurp the authority of religious constructs in traditional Ottoman thought, and scholarly discourse studied questions from a ‘scientific’ viewpoint rather than invoking religious proofs.”⁸² The intellectuals of this period believed that “It was necessary for public administration to be in the hands of men who understood science,” a mentality which would be inherited by the Young Turks.

Ottoman students were sent to Paris to learn the latest advances in science and technology, in order to come back and apply them in the Empire. The plan, however, was in tension with reality, and once the young Ottoman men saw the sharp division between their worlds and the world that the Europeans represented, they wanted to get to the roots of the ideas rather than just learning what was necessary and coming back, without asking, and without wondering why and how. A similar shock was awaiting the Ottoman students in the modern professional academies established during the *Tanzimat* era and which were increasing in number under the reign of Abdulhamid II. Young Ottoman men from middle and lower middle class backgrounds, from all around the Empire, filled these new schools which were staffed by European-educated teachers. These students were also shaken by the sharp difference between the West and their civilization, and alongside adopting science and technology they adopted ideas from West as they understood it, and tried to tailor them to their own civilization. The intellectual frames that were adopted from the West – positivism, social Darwinism, materialism, and elitism – shaped the ideas and ideals of two generations, namely the Young Ottomans, and their followers the Young Turks.

2.1.1. The Foundation, Motives and Triumph of the Young Turk Movement

The Ottoman Committee of Union and Progress [*Osmanlı Ittihad ve Terakki Cemiyeti*], which would become known as the Young Turk Movement, was founded in one of these modern schools, the Imperial Medical Academy, in 1889. The name at the time of its

⁸² Şükrü M. Hanioglu, *The Young Turks in Opposition* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995), p. 11.

foundation was the ‘Ottoman Union Society’ [*İttihad-ı Osmanî Cemiyeti*], a name that already gave hints that their dreams and purpose were very similar to their predecessors: namely, “saving the Empire.” In a short period of time they established cells in other academies, and eventually achieved the creation of a movement that was different than its predecessor in the sense that it was not an upper-class opposition group. In the space of a few years the movement was adopted by the Ottoman intellectuals as well as the students of other collages. The Young Turks were primarily divided into two camps: the Unionists (Ottoman Nationalists under the leadership of Ahmed Rıza) and the Liberals (a group led by Prince Sabahaddin, also known as *Adem-i Merkeziyetçiler*). In the second Young Turk Meeting in 1907, the Unionists gained the upper hand within the movement. This was an important turning point, since the language of the movement would then become dominantly pro-centralization and Ottoman nationalist. The Unionist camp was organized and very active in Macedonia, and at the same time attained the support of young officers in the army. This highly politicized military group would obtain a political character under the name of the Committee of Union and Progress. The Revolution of 1908 was the product of this group, especially the branch in Macedonia. All these people, with their different backgrounds, were united by a common desire to save the Empire.⁸³ In the early stages of the movement the Young Turks had several ideas on how to do this;⁸⁴ however, the primary goal and idea on which everyone agreed was that “a tyrant [*müstebit*] Sultan like Abdülhamit II,”⁸⁵ “whose reign had been corrupted by favoring loyalty over merit”⁸⁶ stood in the way of

⁸³ For a contrary view, arguing that the 1908 Revolution was not an attempt to save the state but to destroy it, see the epilogue to the Turkish edition of Aykut Kansu’s *1908 Revolution: Aykut Kansu, 1908 Devrimi*, 2nd ed., trans. Ayda Erbal (Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2001), p. 361.

⁸⁴ The ideas for salvation discussed in the following lines were compiled from Tarık Zafer Tunaya, *Türkiye’de Siyasal Gelişmeler: 1876-1938* (Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2001), pp. 90-102; and Hanioglu, *The Young Turks in Opposition*, pp. 7-33.

⁸⁵ Tunaya, *Türkiye’de Siyasal Gelişmeler*, p. 93.

⁸⁶ Hanioglu, *The Young Turks in Opposition*, pp. 7-33. Hanioglu emphasizes a certain misperception of the characteristic of the Abdülhamid reign: “The regime’s patrimonial façade was misleading,” in that Abdülhamid did not rule the country as an absolute leader as well as being a patrimonial leader; rather “he was a patrimonial leader ruling with the help of a rational bureaucracy.”

salvation. If Abdulhamid represented the corrupt and irrational present of the Empire, the constitution was its honest and rational tomorrow. Restoration of the constitution of 1876 [*Kanun-ı Esasi*], and the creation of a parliamentary regime on the basis of it, were other objectives that all the Young Turks had settled on. The idealization of the 1876 constitution was manifest in the works and ideas of several Young Turks; however, they lacked a consistent concept of what the constitution should be.⁸⁷ Since for the Young Turks the idea of a constitution and a parliamentary regime were romantic symbols associated with Western civilization and modernity, they did not feel the need to have a comprehensive knowledge of the content of the 1876 Constitution, which they wanted to restore desperately.⁸⁸ Science, technology, and every idea and theory that the Young Turks had adopted were connected to the concept of modernity. One of the most dominant of the ideas accepted among the Young Turks was the necessity of ‘progress’ in every sphere of life. They put immense intellectual effort into understanding the means towards progress which, in the end, was perceived both as a vehicle and as a destination by the Young Turks. Progress [*terakki*] was the keyword for understanding the mindset of the Young Turks. Modernization of institutions, ideas, and the minds of the people were all connected to progress, which meant reaching the European level in every sphere possible. As already mentioned, ideas related to contemporary European science and philosophy – such as scientific materialism, elitism and social Darwinism – were introduced into the intellectual framework of the Young Turks along with a desire to learn and understand. They believed in the absolute supremacy of modern knowledge and therefore tried to introduce it to the masses in the hope of supplanting the dominant position of religion in society for the sake of progress.

2.1.2 Science, Reason and Progress

Materialists like Abdullah Cevdet attempted to Islamize materialist ideas with free interpretations of Islamic resources, such as *Hadith*,⁸⁹ for propaganda purposes.⁹⁰ A

⁸⁷ Tunaya, *Türkiye’de Siyasal Gelişmeler*, p. 17.

⁸⁸ See “the confess of Doktor Nazım” in Hanioglu, *The Young Turks in Opposition*, p. 32.

⁸⁹ Şükrü M. Hanioglu, “Blueprints for a Future Society: Late Ottoman Materialists on Science, Religion, and Art,” in *Late Ottoman Society: The Intellectual Legacy*, ed. Elizabeth Özdalga (New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2005), p. 42.

⁹⁰ Hanioglu, *The Young Turks in Opposition*, p. 18.

successful reconciliation of Islam and materialism, it was thought, would also prove the compatibility of Islamic civilization and modernity. On the other hand, social Darwinism was used by the Young Turks as a tool to explain and to examine real-life situations within the limits of reason and science. Some of the intellectuals who initiated such reformist ideas and activities belonged to the bureaucracy, and had received their education in the modern types of schools.

In comparison to their revolutionary Western counterparts, however, they had a problem: they were products of schools which were “designed to serve the country.”⁹¹ The education they pursued would get them offices in that State’s structures. Therefore their project had to strike a delicate balance between “saving the Empire” and “control[ing] the transformation of the social structure while safeguarding their privileged positions (as civil and military bureaucrats).”⁹² This urge was combined with Gustave Le Bon’s ideas on group psychology, which suggested that “constantly indoctrinating the masses with the tenets of a new belief system would make them accept it over time;”⁹³ the merging of these two ideas took the form of elitism. Thus, they aimed to channel the popular unrest against traditional rule by creating masses who would believe their beliefs and speak their words. The dominance of European ideas in the plans for the salvation of the Empire is interesting in the sense that they proposed solutions in the context of ‘Europe’. In other words, Ottoman intellectuals no longer sought special treatments suitable for the Ottoman Empire or Islam, or models they could mold to their own civilization; rather, they accepted their universality and believed that the Ottoman Empire was an unexceptional case which could be treated with established prescriptions. Thus, the execution of ready-made solutions on people by convincing them of their usefulness would create the opportunity for Young Turks to launch the desired transformations in the Empire.

⁹¹ Çağlar Keyder, *State and Class in Turkey: A Study In Capitalist Development* (New York: Verso, 1987), p. 50.

⁹² Ibid, p. 51.

⁹³ Hanioglu, “Blueprints for a Future Society”, p. 52.

2.1.3. A Revolution or an Occupation of Power?

Challenging this view of the 1908 Revolution as an essentially top-down phenomenon, Aykut Kansu asserts that the Revolution was a mass movement motivated by the desire for liberty. Taking a decidedly revisionist stance, Kansu tries to create a direct parallel with the dynamics of the French Revolution. This attempt leads him to give his full support to the Ottoman bourgeoisie.⁹⁴ Kansu builds his arguments on the Taxation Revolts of 1907-1908, a period of unrest previously discussed by Donald Quataert. However, Quataert did not offer conclusive results that proved that 1908 was a “real” revolution. Since a similar experience (crop failure and the price rises of 1898-1899) did not create a revolutionary spark, 1907-1908 could not be seen as a sole motive force of the 1908 Revolution.⁹⁵ Thus, while a number of historians believe that Ottoman Modernization falls under the category of modernization from above as in Japan and Germany, Kansu implies that, concerning the reasons for and the effects of the 1908 Revolution, the Ottoman case should be considered as following the French and British examples, in which the modernization attempts were led by a strong bourgeoisie.

These insights into the reasons and ideas of the Young Turks, and later the CUP, should not be considered as representative for every individual who took -small or large- part in the 1908 Revolution. The Young Turk revolution had an opportunity to seize the support of people, not necessarily by their ideas or ideals, but with a promise of a better life. The taxation burden and the ossified poverty constituted a strong motivation for the masses.

Turning now to the advertisements of the era, we note that they do not provide a clear outlook on the reasons for the 1908 Revolution, and this could be because the ideas promoted by the Young Turks were still predominantly foreign. However, they are helpful in bringing out the reaction of the people to such a fundamental transformation in the political and, later, social spheres. In most of the advertisements it is possible to trace the discourses of the Young Turk revolution, with its emphases on the constitution and Ottoman supra-identity. Just like the mementos of the Revolution, some reflections

⁹⁴ See Aykut Kansu, *The Revolution of 1908 In Turkey* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1997).

⁹⁵ Donald Quataert, “The Economic Climate of the ‘Young Turk Revolution’ in 1908,” *The Journal of Modern History*, vol. 51, no. 3 (September 1979). p. D1161.

of Young Turk thought are also visible in the texts and visuals of the advertisements. Interestingly, before the Committee of Union and Progress re-seized power with a coup d'état in 1913 – the moment when Turkish nationalist ideas and policies became outspoken – there were no visible traces of Turkish nationalism or Turkish identity in the material examined for this research. On the other hand, other forms of identity and nationalisms, or proto-nationalisms such as Ottomanism and Islamism are more evident. Since the time frame of materials examined for this chapter is limited to 1908-1912, it only provides an insight for the period in question.⁹⁶ The increasing centrality of Turkish nationalist ideas in the Young Turk worldview was a gradual, inconsistent process that was subject to numerous influences.⁹⁷ Some of these influences became effective during, or even before this period.⁹⁸ However, since the primary sources of this research are advertisements, existing ideas and ideologies in the Empire will be handled as they appear in the material.

2.2. Advertising: The Birth of a Profession

The general characteristics of Ottoman advertisements at the end of the first and the beginning of the second decades of the 20th century differ professionally from their predecessors. As discussed in the previous chapter, early examples of Ottoman advertisements were distinguished by long descriptive texts, and lacked catchy phrases and titles that could attract consumers. However, three or four decades later, Ottoman advertising had evolved into a more experienced and skilled profession. An unnamed

⁹⁶ This study does not suggest that Turkish nationalism appeared right after the Balkan Wars, or even later during WWI or during the establishment of the Turkish Republic. Turkish nationalism was not a spontaneous ideological and political phenomenon. However, in the course of the 1908 Revolution, the tendencies toward Turkish nationalism could be hidden in the mainstream discourses of Ottomanism.

⁹⁷ Şükrü M. Hanioglu, “Turkism and the Young Turks, 1889-1908,” in *Turkey Beyond Nationalism: Towards Post-Nationalist Identities*, ed. Hans-Lukas Kieser (London: I.B.Tauris, 2006), p. 8.

⁹⁸ For example, influences such as the penetration of the organization by members of Turkish descent, the influential work (*Üç Tarz-ı Siyaset, 1904*) of Yusuf Akçura, and the rise of nationalisms among Muslim communities such as Albanians.

journalist in the journal *Muhit* and his perception of advertising proves that the Ottomans understood the 'true nature' of advertisements. The journalist addressed the reader, asking: “Do you know the reason behind the abundance of advertisements?” and replied: “because the axis [*mihver*] of the advertisements is money . . . and all the advertisers from the charlatan who claims he can treat incurable diseases to the fraudster who promises to give one-hundred-percent interest for one’s money want to rob the readers.”⁹⁹ Indeed these ‘robbers’ found better and sweeter ways to deceive their readers. The advertisements had started to use interesting and appealing titles with large fonts to draw the attention of their audiences, such as: “Would Not You Want To Regain Your Youthful Strength?” [*Gençlik kuvvetinizi kazanmak istemez misiniz?*]¹⁰⁰; also, some advertisements were positioned sideways, possibly to save space, but this also served to distract the reader away from the articles to the advertisements.¹⁰¹ Moreover, they started to use memorable catchwords, or single line phrases which replaced the long texts of the past: “Faruki Cologne, The Best Cologne” [*Faruki kolonyası, kolonya sularının en alası*].¹⁰² In the meantime, business owners apparently realized the advantages of special offers in attracting more customers. A rubber-soled shoe business selling Russian products announced that they offered a written contract [*Taahhüd Senedi*] valid for a month, assuring that they would exchange the product in case of a customer complaint.¹⁰³

⁹⁹ Orhan Koloğlu, *1908 Basın Patlaması* (Istanbul: BAS-HAŞ, 2005), pp. 63-64. “İlanlarda bu bolluğun, sebebini biliyor musunuz? Çünkü ilanların mihveri paradır; cihanın gerçek hükümdarı, sevgilisi ve itaatine girileni olmuştur. Tedavisi olanaksız hastalıkları ustalık sihri ile yok edeceğini vadeden şarlatandan yüzde yüz senelik faiz vermeyi taahhüt eden dolandırıcıya kadar bütün ilancılar okuyucuları soymak ister . . . ilanlar çoğunluğu itibariyle pek temiz amaçlara yardımcı olmadığı halde okuyucuların çoğunluğu kaldırılmasına razı olmazlar. Çünkü ilanlar arasında özellikle Avrupa gazetelerindeki ilanlar araunda öylelerine rastlanır ki adeta birer kolay anlaşılır şüirdirler . . . [text simplified]”

¹⁰⁰ Gençlik Kuvvetinizi Kazanmak İstemez Misiniz? *Musavver Hale*, December 1909/January 1910.

¹⁰¹ See *Resimli Kitap*, November 1909, and *Nay*, March 23, 1912. Orhan Koloğlu, dates the appearance of sideways advertisements to the early days of the 20th century. Koloğlu, *Reklamcılığımızın İlk Yüzyılı*, p. 148.

¹⁰² Faruki Kolonyası, *Nay*, March 23, 1912.

¹⁰³ Lastik Meselesi, *Musavver Hale*, December 1909/January 1910: “Lastik Meselesi Bu sene hangi lastik dayanıklı ve kullanışlıdır?? Son sistem Çekiç Markalı

In a newspaper called *Nay*, on one side of its advertisements page, discount tickets and coupons [*kupon*] for various businesses were published for readers to cut out and use.¹⁰⁴

Quite a number of advertisements still used long texts in this period; however, they started to become more interesting and more promoting rather than mere explanations of commodities. For example, a cigarette paper advertiser constructed the body of the advertisement as a dialog between two cigarette addicts [*tiryaki*].¹⁰⁵

During this period one can observe the first advertisements run by advertising agencies, promoting their services.¹⁰⁶ This might explain the changes in the advertisements in general, which seemed to get more professional. The developments in

Kolomb Rus Lastiği!!Zira en muteber hassaları haizdir. Tabanlarının metaneti en birinci tanınmış lastiklere tevaffuk ettiği gibi yüzleri asla çatlamaz ve yanları açılmaz. Katiyyen kaymak tehlikesi yoktur. Bu gûna sakat dahi zuhur etmez. Ettiği takdirde meccanen tebdili taht-ı taahhüddedir. Arzu edenlere bir aya mahsus taahhüd senedi verilir. Kolomb markası piyasada mevcut umum lastiklerin biçim ve zarafetlerine faik erkek, kadın ve çocuklar için ecnas-ı muhtelifeyi camidir. Lastik çeşidleri çoğaldığı gibi âlemi iğfal edecek surette yekdiğerine müşabih bulunduğundan hakikâti tefrik müşkil idi .”

¹⁰⁴ Kuponlar, *Nay*, March 23, 1912: “*Sami Bey’in Tuhafiye Mağazası Kuponu*”, “*Şemsi Fotoğrafhanesi Kuponu*,” and “*Aziz Mahmud ve Mahdumu Burhaneddin Bey Ticarethanesi*.”

¹⁰⁵ Hangi Sigara Kağıdını İstimal Etmeli, *Hak*, no. 43, March 11, 1911: “*İki tiryaki arasında*

– *Oh, . . . gel keyfim gel . . .*
– *Tiryaki kardeş bugün maşaallah keyfin yerinde*
– *Şübhe mi var?*
– *İcab-ı esbabını öğrenebilir miyim*
– *Öğrenebilecek bir şey değil. Altmış senedir sigara içiyorum. Tabiatıma muvaffak bir kağıd bulamamış idim. Yeni çıkan Selânik Hastahanesi menfaatine sigara kağıdı ele geçince aradığım her türlü lezzet ve nefaseti buldum.*
– *Lütfen o kağıddan bir defacık da bana ver de tecrübe edeyim.*
– *Buyurun.*
Yaptığı sigaradan bir nefes çekdikden sonra
– *Hakikaten ne nefis kağıd, oh. . .Memnun oldum teşekkür ederim.-*
– *Mezkûr kağıddan içmeli hem bir emr-i hayra hizmet ve hem de gayet nefis kağıd.”*

¹⁰⁶ İlan Acentası, *Musavver Devr-i Cedid*, June 14, 1909: “*Direkler arasında birinci daire-i belediye karşısında ilân acentası sahibi: Niyazi*” and “*Her nev' ilânat-ı ticariye ve tiyatro ilânları vesaire tab' ve mevaki-i umumiyeye ilsak olunur. Elden dahi ilan tevzi' verilir.*”

the advertisement business, such as the appearance of advertisement agencies, coupons, discounts and special offers, could be seen as signs of more advanced and complicated economic relations in comparison to the first appearance of advertisements. Local businesses adjusted themselves to the competition, and one notes a growing number of local advertisements, as both local and foreign businesses, and the variety of products, had increased.

2.3. The Changing of the Reading Habits

Advertisements for books convey the atmosphere of science and a curiosity towards any subject related to science which marked the subjects of the books available during this period. Readers would frequently come across the words *İlm* and *Fen* (the two words used for ‘science’, *ilm* being more traditional and *fen* more positivist) in the names and descriptions of the books. Virtually any subject can found being explained in terms of science in the books that were translated and written in this period. Even the activity of eating became the subject of a book published under the name “How Does the Body Nourish?”¹⁰⁷ Another advertisement announced a book called the “science of soul” [*Fenn-i Ruh*], prepared by Abdullah Cevdet, a leading materialist.¹⁰⁸

Pioneers of modern ideas such as Abdullah Cevdet prepared and published journals which focused on literature, finance and social sciences, as seen in the case of the well known journal *İctihad*.¹⁰⁹ In the era of free press, after Abdulhamid’s

¹⁰⁷ *Vücut Nasıl Beslenir?*, *Karagöz Salnamesi*, 1910: “*Fitrat Hakkı Ekrem. Vücudu beslemek için ne yemeli, ve ne tarzda yemelidir. Çocukları nasıl tağdiye etmelidir. Mevad-ı azotiyeden zengin fakat kıymetce ucuz şeyler nelerdir? Bunlardan yevmiye ne mikdar yemelidir. Bütün bu mesail-i mühimmeden bu ufacık risale her aile için lüzumludur. Fiyatı altmış paradır .*”

¹⁰⁸ *Fenn-i Ruh*, *Ay*, October 14, 1911: “*Fenn-i Ruh Ruh hakkında fen ve tecrübeye müsteniden yazılmış birinci kitabdır. Bir çok eşkâli havidir. (Kütübhone-i İctihad)ın 25nci adedini teşkil eder. İlm-i ruh tecrübi mütebahirlerinin âsâr ve tahkikâtından tercüme, telfik, teşrih suretiyle doktor Abdullah Cevdet Bey tarafından vücuda getirilmiştir. Bahası her yer için 5 guruştur*”

¹⁰⁹ *İctihad*, *Ay*, October 14, 1911: “*Doktor Abdullah Cevdet Beyefendi'nin iktisadî, ictimâî, edebî, ayda iki defa neşrolunan mecmuasıdır. Senelik abonesi 40 ve nüshası 2 guruştur.*”

ensorship, the advertisement pages were filled by announcements of intellectual and artistic activities, and newly published or translated books on politics, philosophy, social sciences and economics. The intellectual atmosphere of the period was so liberal that one might say that the political revolution was being followed by a social one, just as the Young Turks wanted. Advertisements of published notes from a conference,¹¹⁰ a dance tutor from Europe,¹¹¹ or the staging of a play¹¹² could be found in the pages of Ottoman newspapers and journals. However, the most important sign of social revolution was that the books and intellectual works which had deeply affected the Young Turks were now being published and promoted for ordinary people. In an advertisement for the “Innovation of Science and Philosophy Bookstore” [*Teceddüd-i İlmî ve Felsefî Kütübhanesi*], which was owned by a prominent Young Turk intellectual, Baha Tevfik, a list of available books was given. One of the items on this list is “Force and Matter by Louis Büchner,” the book that the Young Turk materialists had inspired by was now available for the common people.¹¹³

The ideas of innovation [*teceddüd*], and reform [*inkılab*] reflected the progressive and positivist stance of the Young Turks and were also employed in the texts of other advertisements.¹¹⁴ The word ‘reform’ [*İnkılab*] was widely used, especially together

¹¹⁰ Bir Konferans, *Musavver Emel*, January 4, 1910: “*Ser Muharririmiz Hamid Sabahi Bey’in İstanbul ve Eretya [?]da verdiği bu müfid konferans bir zarif küçük kitab şeklinde tab’ edilerek bir guruh kadar cüzû bir fiyat mukabilinde idarehanemizde satılıyor. Bilhassa bütün karilerimize tavsiye ederiz.*”

¹¹¹ Raks Muallimi, *Musavver Hale*, December 1909/January 1910: “*Raks Muallimi Jozef Psalti [?] mükemmel ve çabuk dans öğrenmek arzu eden zevat-ı kiram Beyoğlu’nda Bon Marşe karşısında Bolonya Sokağı’nda sekiz numarada meşhur raks muallimi mösyö Jozef Psalti’nin salonuna müracaat etmelidir. Gündüz dersleri pazartesi perşembe günleri alaturka dörtten öğleye kadar akşam dersleri ise pazartesi, çarşamba ve cuma günleri geceleri saat alaturka üçden altıya kadar devam eder. Gerek kendi hanesinde gerek arzu edenlerin ikametgâhında hususi ders verir.*”

¹¹² İyi saatte olsunlar, *Musavver Hale*, February/March 1910: “*İyi saatte olsunlar!!...Bir perde komedi, Muhariri: Baha Tevfik. Burhaneddin Bey kumpanyası tarafından müteaddid defalar mevk’i temaşeye konulan bu latif eser yakında tefrika suretle karilerimize takdim edilecektir.*”

¹¹³ *Teceddüd-i İlmî ve Felsefî Kütübhanesi*, *Zeka*, August, 1912.

¹¹⁴ Muhab, *Ay*, October 14, 1911: “*Edebî, fennî, ictimâî, teceddüd ve inkılâb-ı fikriyeye hadim ve sütunları kabiliyetli kalemler ile tanınmış bir çok muharririn-i Osmaniyye’nin cilvegâh-ı efkârı olan bu sevimli ceride-i üsbüiyeyi erbab-ı mutâlaaya tavsiye ideriz.*”

with ‘literature’ [*edebiyat, edebiyeye*],¹¹⁵ since it was regarded as the starting point of a cultural revolution; Turkish nationalism would also articulate, in the literary circles, ideas for purification and simplification of the language.

Abdulhamid’s centralized and autocratic rule was not regarded as evil by all groups in society. The Muslim lower classes in particular, resentful of *Tanzimat* concessions, supported him as a religious and traditional leader. However, just as the Muslims were resentful of *Tanzimat*, non-Muslims felt threatened by Abdulhamid’s definition of an Ottoman identity around Islam. On the other hand, Abdulhamid staffed the bureaucracy and court with non-Turkish Muslims, especially Albanians, Arabs and Kurds. Young Turks seized on this situation to blame his regime for spoiling non-Turkish Muslim groups and neglecting the Turks. Oddly enough, the first Young Turks shared the Ottomanist vision of Abdulhamid, an identity bringing together Albanians, Kurds, Turks and others around the common Muslim identity.¹¹⁶ Thus, after the 1908 Revolution, reflections of Islamism continued to appear in the advertisements as a common theme. Alongside the scientific journals, an Islamist one ran an advertisement which still used the word *ilm*, but in its traditional sense. This journal described itself as a publication of the Society of Islamic Thought [*Cemiyet-i İlmiyye-i İslamiyye*].¹¹⁷

¹¹⁵ İnkılab-ı Edebiyye, *Zeka*, August, 1912: “*Bu memleketde iflas etdiği söylenilen edebiyat vadisinde hakiki bir inkılâb yapmak maksadıyla genc ediblerimiz tarafından İnkılâb-ı Edebî namıyla neşrine başlanan risale-i edebiyenin son nüshasında bir çok edebi parçaları muhtevî olarak neşr olunmuştur. Karilerimize bir kere görmelerini tavsiye ederiz.*”

¹¹⁶ As summarized by İshak Sükûtî (one of the original founders of the CUP): “Albanians and Kurds, among others, must unite with the Turks against the West, for they shared a common goal: to defeat European schemes aimed at detaching their lands from the common fatherland in the interests of Balkan and Anatolian Christians.” Quoted in Hanioglu, *Turkism and the Young Turks*, p. 8.

¹¹⁷ *Beyan-ül Hak*, *Ay*, October 14, 1911: “*Cemiyet-i İlmiyye-i İslamiyye'nin neşri-efkârı olarak neşr edilmekte olan ve ilm-i İslam'a hizmet-i fevkalâde ibraz eylemekte bulunan (Beyan-ül Hak) ceride-i üsbuiyyesinin bu defa -nci nüshası neşr edilmiştir.*”

2.4. The Boycott of Austro-Hungarian Goods and First Steps into the National Economy

The echoes of Islamism were also apparent in the advertisements of local Muslim businesses. Free competition and free trade characterized the economic policies after the 1908 Revolution. Between the two available economic directions, namely the German School (shaped by the protectionist ideas of Friedrich List) and Manchester Capitalism,¹¹⁸ it was the latter policy which marked the economic policies of the new regime in the first years after the Revolution. Cavit Bey, the minister of finance, was a supporter of the classical economics represented by Manchester Capitalism and its father, Adam Smith. He encouraged the establishment of Muslim businesses; however, he was absolutely against state intervention. Therefore the economy should develop on its own, without any support, in an atmosphere of free competition. Amid this atmosphere of liberalism and free competition, *Selanik Bonmarşesi*, this large, well-known Muslim business, announced that they were the oldest Muslim business in the whole of the Ottoman lands, signaling that the identities started get involved into the 'free competition'.¹¹⁹

This advertisement could be regarded as proof of the existence of a ferment of alternative identities ranged against the prevailing notions of Ottomanism; it could also be related to the recent calls for a boycott of Austro-Hungarian businesses and products. On 5 October 1908, Austria-Hungary annexed two Ottoman provinces, Bosnia and Herzegovina. The Ottoman Empire was an important market for Austro-Hungarian goods – for example, a large proportion of the Ottoman’s “national” hats, the fez, were imported from Austria-Hungary. However, the boycott took on unexpected dimensions in a short period of time with the support of people, especially workers from the docks, who took the initiative out of the hands of the state and turned it into a civil uprising fueled with hatred towards Austria-Hungary. The state offices did not support the boycott; but, on the other hand, the official fez production facility in Istanbul

¹¹⁸ Zafer Toprak, *Türkiye’de ‘Milli İktisat’ 1908-1918* (Ankara: Yurt Yayınları, 1982), p. 25.

¹¹⁹ Selanik Bonmarşesi, *Karagöz Salname*, 1910: “İpekçi Kardeşler İstanbul’da: Bağçekapusu’nda numero 43-51 merkezi Selânik’de Memalik-i Osmaniyye’de en kadîm İslâm müessesesi tarih-i tesisi 1228.”

simultaneously increased its output.¹²⁰ *Tiring*, a large and very prominent Austrian establishment, was the focus of the reactions.¹²¹ *Selanik İlsi*, which was another large establishment that sold the same range of goods as *Tiring*, was probably seizing the opportunity to underline its identity against its rival in its aforementioned advertisement. Overall, the boycott created reactions against *Tiring* and other Austrian businesses. The editor of a short-lived advertisement journal, *Reklam*, warned his readers against *Tiring*:

Let's not go to *Tiring* instead of buying Ottoman products. Besides, there are several harms for us in buying from *Tiring*. I would like to name all of them. However, there were plenty of articles and advertisements in our newspaper, so I could not list them [the harms]. Nevertheless, I will not let this go, [and I] will name all the harmful stores and recommend you the good ones. Let's leave it for this week. But let me repeat it once more for you, do not buy from *Tiring*, buy Ottoman goods, or you will be deceived.¹²²

This boycott could be seen as the first step towards the nationalization of the Ottoman economy. A growing number of businesses had started to stress the Ottomanness of their businesses or advised choosing local products and establishments over foreign ones. This marked a change in the mentality of consumers in comparison to earlier periods, in which the Europeanness of a product was enough to recommend it. In the newspaper *Tanin*, a Muslim store addressed Ottoman consumers with the caption: "Ottoman money should stay with Ottomans!" [*Osmanlı Parası Osmanlılar'da Kalmalıdır!*].¹²³ However this did not mean that the Ottoman Empire would close its economy to Austro-Hungarian products forever. Five months after the initiation of the

¹²⁰ Donald Quataert, *Osmanlı Devleti'nde Avrupa İktisadi Yayılımı ve Direniş (1881-1908)*, trans. Sabri Tekay (Ankara: Yurt Yayınları, 1987), p. 105.

¹²¹ *Tiring* was one of the most frequent advertisers in the Ottoman journals. For example: "*Tiring Galata Şarkın En Büyük Elbise Mağazası*.

Hakiki ehven fiyatla mal satılan birinci sınıf müessese. Erkekler, kadınlar ve çocuklar için. Son moda elbise, başlıklar, serpuşlar, iç çamaşırları, ayakkabıları, seyahat eşyası, spor ve jimnastik levazımı ziynet eşyası"; in *Şehbal*, December 14, 1912.

¹²² Koloğlu, *1908 Basın Patlaması*, p. 66.

¹²³ *Osmanlı Parası, Tanin*, September 4, 1911:

"*Osmanlı Parası Osmanlılar'da Kalmalıdır!*

Sağlam fanile, çorap, çamaşır takımı, çocuk elbiseleri, hanımlara mahsus bluzlar ve fistanlar ve etekler mezkûr mağaza geceleri dahi açıktır Hanımlara mahsus daire güşad edilmiştir." As transcribed in Koloğlu, *Reklamcılığımızın İlk Yüzyılı*, p. 189.

boycott, trade relations between the Ottomans and the Austrians went back to normal.¹²⁴ Nevertheless, those five months foreshadowed a growing unrest among Muslim producers and business owners which would manifest at its peak in a destructive economic war between Muslims and non-Muslims.¹²⁵ But already the voices shouting “buy local” were becoming louder. An advertisement for natural mineral water announced that its “ingredients were approved by the Ottoman medical doctors” [*terkibatı ettiba-i Osmaniyyece onaylanmış*], and recommended this mineral water over the European ones that had unknown ingredients.¹²⁶ An Ottoman dairy, described as sanitary [*sıhhi*] and scientific [*fenni*], ran a very interesting – and rather offensive – advertisement, announcing that as the “*südü bozuklar*” (literally, people with bad milk), the reprehensible people, had “left our country,” this establishment had saved people from bad milk!¹²⁷ It was unclear which people this advertisement was accusing of being reprehensible; however, it is possible that it meant the fallen statesmen and the Sultan.

¹²⁴ Three years after the boycott, an insurance company openly announced that they were Austrian: “*Sigorta Umumiye 1910 senesi bilançosu mucibince teminât akçesi (392,146,965) Frank yani takriben (on sekiz milyon Osmanlı Lirası) raddesinde bulunan kumpanyamızın mamulatındaki istikâmet ve ciddiyeti ve selâmet ve cesâmeti hasebiyle birinci derece en son sigorta kumpanyalarından biri olmakla müftehirdir. Bidâyet-i tesisinde beher tahvili yüz Fransız Lirası’ndan ibaret iken bugün beheri tamam (bin dörtyüz Fransız Lirası’na) baliğ olduğunu arz etmek iktisab ettiğimiz itibar emniyet-i ammeye delil-i kâfidir. Harik, hayat, nakliyât sigortalarıyla meşgul olan kumpanyamız Avusturya- Macaristan Devleti’nin imtiyaz-ı mahsusunu haiz ve nezaret-i mütemadiyesi tahtındadır. Bilâd-ı meşhurede kumpanyanın mutasarrıf bulunduğu emlak ve akarattın (iki milyon lira-i Osmaniyyeye)karib bir kıymeti olduğu gibi ahiren Dersaadet’te Galata’da Osmanlı Postahanesi karşısında müceddidin inşa ettirdiği cesim binaya altmış bin lira sarf etmiştir. Kumpanya hakkında fazla malumat almak isteyenler mezkûr akarımız derurunda Dersaadet’de müdüriyet-i umumiyesine müracaat bulunabilirler.*” in *Cem*, no. 28, May 21, 1911.

¹²⁵ Quataert, *Avrupa İktisadi Yayılımı ve Direniş*, p. 121.

¹²⁶ Kiserna, *Musavver Hale*, December 1909/January 1910: “*Tabi’i maden sularının en birincisi olub havas-ı şifabahşesi ve terkibatı etibba-i Osmaniyyece masduk ve her halde Avrupa’dan celb edilen terkibatı meçhul maden sularına faik olub mezkur sulara tercihen Kisarna maden suyu istimalini tavsiye ederiz*”

¹²⁷ Osmanlı Südhanesi, *Karagöz Salnamesi*, 1910: “*Sıhhi ve Fenni Osmanlı Südhanesi Oh! Müjdeler Südü bozuklar memleketimizden gitti. Bu müessesede bozuk südlerden âhâli-i kiramı kurtardı, nefis temiz ve hilesiz olan bu südlerden tedarik etmek isteyenler Aksaray’da Edhem Pertev, Fatih’de Kâzım, Bağçekapu’da Haleb eczahanesi vasıtasıyla südhaneye müracaat buyursunlar.*”

2.5. Long Live the Constitution!

Before the surfacing of differences, a romantic wave of Ottomanness dominated the Ottoman advertisements. An increasing number of businesses used ‘Ottoman’ in their names (in the forms *Osmanlı*, *Osmaniyye*), in comparison to the previous period. Non-Muslim business owners seemed to embrace the Ottoman name widely in their establishments. A Greek merchant providing goods for small shops adopted the name “Great Ottoman” for his business.¹²⁸

The importance people attached to the constitutional revolution is evident in the emphasis of constitutional rule [*meşrutiyet*] in the advertisements. As an example, “The Ottoman Fraternity Company” [*Uhuvvet-i Osmaniyye Şirketi*] used ‘Ottoman’ in its name, and also manifested its rightful pride at being the “the first established business of the Constitutional period” [*Meşrutiyetin ilk teşekkül eden şirketidir*].¹²⁹ Fraternity,

¹²⁸ Kebir Osmaniyye Bakkaliye Deposu, Ay, October 14, 1911: “*Kebir Osmaniyye Bakkâliye Deposu. Kostantin Karayapulo. Kumkapu İstasyon Caddesi numero 11 Ehveniyet, Nefaset, Emniyet.*

İştira edilen malın müşterilerinin haneleri her nerede olursa gönderilmekte teshilât gösterilir.”

¹²⁹ Uhuvvet-i Osmaniyye Şirketi, *Karagöz Salname*, 1910: “*Uhuvvet-i Osmaniyye Şirketi meşrutiyetin ilk teşkil eden şirketidir. Ayda bir lira çaryeki verilerek hiç hiss edilmeksizin on lira yüz lira sermaye tedarik edecek iktisad sandığıdır. Müessisleri piyasada maaruf tüccardan ve tecrübedide halıcılık sanat ve ticaretinde erbab-ı ihtisasdır. Hisselerden para toplanmasına intizar edilmeksizin müessislerin vaz ettikleri üç bin lira sermaye ile işe başlanmış ve kemal-i muvaffakiyetle terakkiyat görülmüştür. Sermayeyi umumiyeyi teşkil eden üç bin hisseden geçen sene ihrac edilen bin hisselerin mazhar olduğu rağbete binâen bu sene için dahi bin hisse ihrac edilecektir. Şimdilik yalnız hissedarane mahsus olarak taksitle ödenmek üzere veresiye halı ve kilim fûruhtu fikrinin umumu âhâliye teşmiliyle memleketin Avrupa kanaviçelerinden kurtulması esbabına tevessül olunmak üzeredir. Binâenaleyh Uhuvvet-i Osmaniyye Şirketi hisselerinin fiyatları ileride bir misli tezeyyüd ve terfi' edeceğine şübhe yoktur. Hisse kaydı ve taksitlerin tahsili emrinde hissedarane suhulet olmak üzere Dersaadet'te mahallelerde ve taşralarda vilayet ve kaza ve nahiye merkezinde müneffel aidatlı ajanslar bulundurmağa lüzum verildiğinden memurin ve tüccardan sanaat-i asliyeye hâlel getirmeyecek olan işbu vazife ile de iştigâl etmek isteyen zevatın bizzat veya tahriren şirketin merkez mağazasına müracaatla itimadnâme almaları lazım gelir. Herhangi mahalde ajans ihtas edilirse gazetelerle ilân olunacaktır. Şirketin bankası Selânik Bankası'dır. Her dürlü sipariş kabul olur.”* The image provided for this advertisement was a photograph of a carpet atelier, with two women and a little girl sitting in front of a weaving loom, and two men standing at the both sides of the loom; one with a Western and the other with a traditional attire. See Appendix 5.

[*Uhuvvet*] was adopted by the 1908 Revolution from the famous motto of the French Revolution; “Liberty, Equality Fraternity.” The advertisement of this business was not promoting any goods, but was announcing that they were looking for shareholders for their incorporated company [*anonim şirketi*]. The new regime and its statesmen were aware of the absence of the necessary accumulated capital for the emergence of a strong national bourgeoisie. Therefore, the state encouraged and initiated incorporated businesses wherein small capital owners could join together and create a national economy.¹³⁰ An additional effect of the French Revolution, and also an inheritance from Young Ottomans, was manifest in the extensive use of the word ‘fatherland’ [*vatan*].¹³¹

In another example, a butter merchant, with reference to the ‘national economy’, addressed the ones “who love their fatherland” to “come and buy their butter from him,” since “his butters are Ottoman products.”¹³²

Cabarets and theatrical companies also used ‘Ottoman’ in their names. A cabaret group constituted by traditional actors, conjurers and shadow-players named their group the “Ottoman Constitutional Drama Company” [*Meşrutiyet-i Osmaniyye Dram Kumpanyası*].¹³³ Another theatrical company, this time from Izmir, chose the name “National Ottoman Theater” [*Milli Osmanlı Tiyatrosu*],¹³⁴ while another example, the

¹³⁰ For more information on the establishment of incorporated companies in the Empire after the 1908 Revolution, see Zafer Toprak, *Türkiye’de “Milli İktisat” 1908-1918*, and idem, *Milli İktisat, Milli Burjuvazi* (Ankara: Yurt Yayınları, 1995).

¹³¹ Vatan Mağazaları, *Alem*, March 18, 1909: “*Veznecilerde, Çarşı’da Kalpakçılar’da, en müşkülpeşend erbab-ı zarafeti memnun edecek, eşya-i tuhafıye.*”

¹³² Osmanzade Cemaleddin, *Tanin*, 1910: “*Balıkpazarında ekmekçi fırını ittisalinde Alemdağı tereyağı ticarethanesi sahibi Osmanzade Cemaleddin Efendi Memalik-i Osmaniyye mamulatından olan yağlarla mahsulatı saireye hasrı ticaret etmiş olduğundan vatanını seven ihvanını mağazasına davet eder.*” Transcribed in Koloğlu, *Reklamcılığımızın İlk Yüzyılı*, p. 190.

¹³³ Dram Kumpanyası, *Resimli Kitap*, May, 1910: “*Meşrutiyet-i Osmaniyye Dram Kumpanyası evvelce Muzıka-i Hümayûn’da bulunmuş olan sanaatkâr bazı efendilerden mürekkeb olarak teşekkül eden mezkur kumpanya Dersaadet’te icra-i lubiyâta mübâşeret ettiği gibi düğünler için orta oyunu, karagöz, hokkabaz, ve envai lubiyât deruhte edecektir...*”

¹³⁴ Milli Osmanlı Tiyatrosu, *Musavver Emel*, January 4, 1910: “*Bir müddetten beri şehrimizde İsporting Kulüp’te verdiği güzel oyunlarıyla mazhar-ı rağbet olan milli Osmanlı Tiyatrosu heveskâran Cemiyeti tarafından yakında Kirli Çamaşırlar ve Lelebici Horhor nam güzide piyesler mevkî-i temaşaya vaz’edilecektir. Lelebici Horhor’u iyi oynamak için daha yirmi beş otuz aktör ve aktris getirmek üzere tiyatro*

Ottoman Performance Place [*Darü'l Temsil-i Osmani*], concluded their advertisement with a remark that their settings were prepared by artists of the Academy of Fine Arts.¹³⁵

A business selling military equipment used the term 'Ottoman' for a relatively different reason in its advertisement, in which a number of goods were listed but the focus was on a single commodity: binoculars: "The only location of sale for the world famous military binoculars, the fog binoculars, in the Ottoman lands is our store. These fog binoculars, being superior to all other examples, are officially accepted by the Ottoman Army."¹³⁶ This advertisement was thus trying to promote its business by stressing that the binoculars they sold were the exact ones that were used by the Ottoman army.

In an interesting example from Izmir, in the advertisement of an apparently non-Muslim shoe-maker, the high quality of his work was promoted. What is notable here is that the owner was introduced as "from the Ottoman citizens, Frera Efendi" [*teba'-i Osmaniyye'den Benyamin Frera Efendi*], twice in a single text; evidently Frera Efendi was proud of being an Ottoman. Another interesting aspect of this advertisement is its reference to being 'civilized' – by linking wearing nice shoes to the issue of civilization. According to Frera Efendi, "in civilized countries [*memalik-i mütemeddine*], people give an extra importance to their footwear and wear elegant shoes just like women's shoes."¹³⁷

müdürü Reşad Rıdvan Bey İstanbul'a azimet etmiştir. Bu mükemmel oyunlarda bulunarak istifade etmelerini umum karilerimize tavsiye ederiz."

¹³⁵ Darü'l Temsil-i Osmani, *Musavver Hale*, February, 1910: "*Dârü'l Temsil-i Osmanî Üdeba-i Osmaniyye'den bir heyet-i fazılanın taht-ı idare-i edebiyesinden olarak ahiren teşekkül eden "Dârü'l Temsil-i Osmani" riyaset-i temsiliyesi sanatkar-ı şehir Hüseyin Gami Bey'e tefviz edilmiş ve ilk temsil olara "İkinci Ramses" in mevkî-i temaşeye vaz' edilmesine takarrur etmiştir. Dekorlar Sanayi-i Nefise Mektebi ezkiya-i sanatkâranına tevdi olunmuştur."*

¹³⁶ Dürbün, *Karagöz Salname*, 1910: "*Dünya'nın en meşhur askeri dürbünü olan sis dürbünlerinin Memalik-i Osmaniyye'de yegane mahal-i fûruhtu mağazamızdır. Sis dürbünleri umum-u emsaline faik olub, Osmanlı ordusuna resmen kabul edilmiştir. Dürbünler ve umum-u askeri eşyamız Osmanlı zabitanına taksit ile tediye edilmek üzere de satılır"*

¹³⁷ Osmanlı Tebaası Frera, *Musavver Emel*, January 4, 1910: "*Metanet Ehveniyet Zarafet: "Tabi' beşer daima zarafete meclubdur. Herkes yediği, giydiği, şeylerin güzel olmasını arzu eder. Memalik-i mütemeddine de kunduralara pek ehemmiyet verilir. O sebepten nefasetperestlerin ayaklarında daima pek zarif kadın iskarpinleri gibi mini mini ayakkablarına tesadüf edilir. Bizde de 'dost başa düşman ayağa bakar' derler*

In an announcement in a small frame, crammed between all these advertisements and using the language of the new era, was a reminder the ancien regime, like an echo from a distant mountain: “Recently a chest full of *journals* was found in the Yıldız Palace and were dispatched and transferred to the Document Investigation Commission.”¹³⁸

2.6. The Books and Schools for Learning Foreign Languages

French had long been preferred by the higher classes in the Ottoman Empire. However, the many advertisements for language schools and self-study books demonstrated that learning a foreign language, especially French, was no longer a monopoly of the elites and intellectuals.¹³⁹ Some advertisements were very confident in their capability to teach the language. As a teacher and a writer for the Magazine of Language [*mecmua-i lisan*], Aznavur Efendi wrote a book which was recommended to those who “wanted get familiar with reading and translating French in a short period of time.”¹⁴⁰ Right next to Aznavur Efendi’s advertisement, Macid Bey spoke to the readers,

şehrimizde öyle latif ayakkabları yapan ustalarımız pek mahduddurki bunların birincisi balık pazarında teba’-i Osmaniyye’den Benyamin Frera Efendi’dir. Benyamin Frera Efendi İzmir’de hayli müddetten beri rağbet-i fevkalâdeye mazhar olduğundan bayram zamanlarında adeta dükkâna girecek yer bulunmaz. Benyamin Efendi’nin sanatındaki maharetini bilmeyen yoktur. Metin zarif şık ayakkabları yaptırmak isterseniz Balık Pazarı’nda teba’-i Osmaniyye’den meşhur Benyamin Frera Efendi’ye gidiniz. Zira İzmir’de onun kadar mahir kunduracı yoktur. Aceleye gelmemek için tabiatlarına muvaffak iş yaptırmak isteyenler siparişlerini bayrama bırakmayıp bir an evvel vermelidirler. Benyamin Efendi siparişden maada hazır almak isteyenlere beğendirecek her nev’ ayakkablarını bir koleksiyon olarak şimdiden hazırlamış olduğundan acele isteyenlerin de tabiatlarına muvaffak ayakkabları bulurlar.”

¹³⁸ *Jurnaller, Hak, March 13, 1911: “Ahiren Yıldız’da bir sandık derununda jurnaller zuhur etmiştir. Jurnaller Tedkik ve Evrak komisyonuna havale ve irsal olunmuştur. Şuray-ı Devlet’ce Bahriye Nazareti’ne teşkil edilen Divan-u Heyet-i Meclis layihası tedkik edilmektedir.”*

¹³⁹ *Fransızca Konuşalım, Nay, March 23, 1912: “Fransızca Konuşalım. Fransızca’yı kendi kendine öğrenmek için İbrahim Edhem Bey tarafından tahrir olunmuş bir eserdir. Bilenler için dahi istifade-i bahş kaideler vardır. Mevcud nüshaları pek azdır, fiyatı 3 guruşdur.”*

¹⁴⁰ *Kendi Kendine Fransızca, Nay, March 23, 1912: “Kendi kendine Fransızca Öğrenmek Usulü. Az bir müddet zarfında Fransızca’nın tekellüm ve tercümesine alışmak isteyen zevata bu eseri hasseten tavsiye ederiz. Mekteb muallimlerinden ve*

presenting them with an alternative way of learning a foreign language, “in painting lessons.”¹⁴¹

The languages that were available were not limited to French. A language school in Beyoğlu gave lessons for quite a variety of languages, including French, English, German, Greek, Arabic, and even Turkish.¹⁴²

Europe might be superior in technology and sciences; however, according to one advertisement, Ottoman smokers used the best cigarette papers in the world. An Ottoman cigarette paper company proudly declared that it had obtained several golden medals in exhibitions all around the Europe.¹⁴³ Creating consumer consciousness was not limited to the encouragement of local and national businesses against foreign ones. A good consumer should also be aware of his budget and try to save money on every occasion. A stove advertisement constantly underlined how economical [*tasarruflu*] their stoves were:¹⁴⁴ apparently the large foreign businesses did not feel a need to revise the language of their advertisements to surpass the claims of local businesses. The texts

‘mecmua-i lisan’ muharirlerinden (Elif.) Aznavur Efendi’nin eseridir. Son zamanlarda Fransızca’nın tahsili için meydana getirilen eserlerin cümlesine faikdir. Bahası 5 guruştur.”

¹⁴¹ Resim Dersinde Fransızca, *Nay*, March 23, 1912: “*Resim Dersinde Fransızca Öğrenmek, Koca Mustafa Paşa Rüüşdiye-i Askeriyesi resim muallimi Yüzbaşı (Elif.) Macid Bey’in eseridir. Umum mekteplerde tavsiye ederiz. Fiyatı 6 guruştur.*”

¹⁴² Berliç Mektebi, *Nay*, March 23, 1912: “*Beyoğlunda Cadde-i Kebirde Numara 356 Fransızca İngilizce Almanca Rumca Türkçe Arabca ilah. Lisanları tahsili için hususi mekteb. Tecrübe Dersleri Meccanendir. Taleb edildiğinde katalog gönderilir.*”

¹⁴³ Bafra Sigara Kağıdı, *Musavver Hale*, February/March 1910: “*Bafra Sigara Kağıdı’nın en âlâ sigara kağıtlarına faik olduğu erbab-ı merakın malumu idi. Mezkûr kağıdın muvaffik-ül sıhha ve nefis olduğu Londra, Paris, Berlin ve Avrupa’nın sair bilâd-ı meşhure sergilerinde ihraz edildiği altun madalyalar ile tasdik olunmuştur. Bu kağıdın nefaseti için muhtelif sergilerden mükafatlar ihraz etmesi iktisab ettiği rağbeti bir kat daha tezyid edecektir. Bafra Kağıdı’nı alınız. Ve her yerde arayınız.*” See appendix 6.

¹⁴⁴ Çini Sobaları, *Karagöz Salnamesi*, 1910: “*Her cins çini sobaların fevkalâdeleri. Tasarruflu yemek sobaları, hamam kazanları. Çamaşır kaynatma kazanları, tulumba banyo, levazımatı saire, hem yemek pişirmek hem hamam ısıtmak hem de çamaşır için istenilen miktarda sıcak su ihzar etmek üzere kaloriferli yemek sobaları da yapılır. tasarruflu yemek sobalarımız Osmanlı aşçılarımız tarafından fevkalâde mazhar-ı takdir olmuştur. Yemek sobalarımız tasarruflardan maada sühuletide vardır. Bunlarla yemek ihzarı gayet temiz ve kolaydır. her nev’ ve biçimde ölçü üzerinde verilecek sipariş kabul ve imal ve yerlerine vaz’ edilir. Taşradan sipariş kabul olunur.*”

of their advertisements remained almost the same as the pre-revolution examples.¹⁴⁵

The ideas and ideals that were introduced by the Young Turks, found their reflections in the Ottoman advertisement. Despite some continuities, the new ideas of the new regime replaced the previous ones. Unity of the different elements around Ottoman identity, progress, that was manifested by the stresses in science, technology, and modernity marked the advertisements in this period.

¹⁴⁵ Tiring, Maison Baker, and İştayn (Stein), *Şehbal* December 14, 1912, and *Cem* March 4, 1911.

CHAPTER 3

WARS AND THE NATIONAL AWAKENING

3.1. The History of the Problem

The Balkan Wars were a traumatic turning point for the Young Turks and the Ottoman people. They created a suitable atmosphere for a Unionist coup, and, politically, marked their absolute victory over the Liberal wing. However, the wars were at the same time a bitter defeat for the Unionists, since it was now an undeniable reality that the elements of the Empire could no longer unify under a single name with a common will. Before the rise of nationalisms in the Balkans, Serbs, Bulgarians, Greeks, and Turks had lived together without national identities. The *millet* system was based on religion, which had been the primary identity before the rise of nationalisms. According to Mark Mazower, Ottoman rule in the Balkans provided the area with three advantages.¹⁴⁶ Firstly, the Ottoman Empire provided a defense for the Patriarchate against the threats of Catholicism. Ottoman rule gradually gave the Patriarchate a new role in politics and administration as “a voice for the Empire’s Orthodox subjects,” in addition to its spiritual functions.¹⁴⁷ Secondly, the non-Muslim communities of the Balkans, especially Greeks, prospered from trade and collecting revenue; and lastly, Ottoman rule provided a freedom of movement and thought which allowed the horizons of Balkan Orthodoxy to expand “from the Mediterranean to the Black Sea, from Northern Italy to Russia.”¹⁴⁸ However, the relationship between religious communities

¹⁴⁶ Mark Mazower, *The Balkans* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 2000), pp. 50-52.

¹⁴⁷ *Ibid*, p. 50.

¹⁴⁸ *Ibid*, p. 52.

changed over time. The rise of Orthodox Russia and Catholic Austria created tension which was reflected in the Christian communities in the Balkans. On the other hand, the rights granted to non-Muslims by the *Tanzimat* had created resentment on the Muslim side. Nonetheless, as Mazower points out, “Greek and Serbian nationalist movements challenged Ottoman attitudes toward Orthodoxy.”¹⁴⁹ Therefore, at the turn of the century, in the Balkans, one could feel the tension in the air.

The tension that led to the Balkan Wars was not spontaneous. Long before the wars, Islamist, pan-Islamist, Turkist, Pan-Turkist and Turkish nationalist ideas were being debated in intellectual spheres. The re-definition of Ottoman identity after the first nationalist uprisings in the Empire enabled further separatist movements. As Karpát puts it, in his account of the memoirs of Nicolae Batzaria,¹⁵⁰ “Young Turk nationalist policies were a great blow to the Vlachs and to other small Christian groups in the Balkans because it left them with no alternative but to cooperate with other Christians. Thus, by 1912, all Christians, notwithstanding their bitter quarrels with one another, found themselves united against the Young Turks.”¹⁵¹ Indeed, they united against what they saw as a common enemy, the Ottoman Empire. Bulgaria, Serbia, Greece, and Montenegro signed treaties in spring 1912 to join forces against the Ottomans to drive the Empire out of the Balkans. After a quick defeat in the fall of 1912, the Ottomans retreated to the Çatalca line, the last holding point for the Ottomans before the capital. By spring 1913, three cities under siege had fallen to the Balkan states, including the former capital of the Ottoman Empire, Edirne. On January 23 1913, Unionists under the leadership of Enver and Talat launched a coup d'état, with promises to retrieve the former capital, and exploiting the rumors that Edirne had been handed over by the government without any struggle. After the coup, Mahmut Sevket, who was not a Unionist, became the head of the government. Meanwhile, an attempt to recapture Edirne failed, which created a great loss of prestige for the CUP and Enver Pasha. When

¹⁴⁹ Ibid, p. 67

¹⁵⁰ Nicolae Batzaria was a Vlach, born in Manastir in Ottoman Macedonia. He was a member of Selanik branch of Union and Progress. In the 1920s he wrote a book called *Islam Din Lumea Islamului, Turcia Junilor Turci* [From the World of Islam, the Turkey of the Young Turks], which is analyzed and discussed in Kemal H. Karpát, “The Memoirs of N. Batzaria: The Young Turks and Nationalism,” *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, vol. 6, no. 3 (July 1974): pp. 276-99.

¹⁵¹ Karpát, “The Memoirs of N. Batzaria,” p. 295.

Mahmut Sevket Pasha was assassinated, the Unionist element finally—after five years of struggle—seized political power. A new cabinet was formed under Said Halim Pasha, which included a Christian Arab, an Armenian and important Unionist names, yet—as a result of the effect of the Balkan Wars—not a single Greek member. Meanwhile, a war broke out between the Balkan States which was related to the issue of the distribution of conquered territories. The situation presented an opportunity for action, and the Committee asked the cabinet to make another attempt to save Edirne. However, the cabinet was cautious, cowed by its previous failure. Thereupon, Enver Pasha took the initiative with a group of army officers, and moved onto Edirne. Finally, the Unionists fulfilled their promise to regain the former capital—though at the cost of violating the Treaty of London, in which Edirne had been given to Bulgaria. The retrieval of Edirne gave both the Unionists and Enver Pasha a great deal of popular support.

Caucasian Muslim refugees and other Muslim populations from Bulgaria and Eastern Rumelia had fled to the remaining Ottoman territories during the Balkan Wars; whereas Muslims had formerly constituted a significant portion of the population in the Balkans. Correlatively, the remaining Ottoman lands were less Christian, and the constant fear and discomfort from European influence in non-Muslim communities merged with Abdulhamid's Islamism to sharpen the inter-religious boundaries between Muslim and Christian Orthodox communities in the Empire. There were even nationalist Balkan intellectuals who attacked the Patriarchate for being corrupt and dependent on Ottoman rule, since the nationalist uprisings in the Balkans, as mass movements, were attached to Orthodoxy. After the Balkan Wars, the newly emerged states perceived themselves in religious terms. As Mazower states: "Religion became a marker of national identity in ways not known in the past, and therefore more sharply marked off from neighboring religions."¹⁵² However, the creation of Balkan nationalisms is more complicated than simply being the effects of religious identities: another dimension of the Balkan nationalisms and their discourses was connected to the relationship between the individual Balkan communities and the West. According to Müge Göçek, two important external factors led minorities to gravitate toward political independence: "the nature of their interactions with the Western powers, and the impact of the notion of nationalism generated in the West."¹⁵³ Therefore, in the evolution of

¹⁵² Mazower, *The Balkans*, p. 76.

¹⁵³ Fatma Müge Göçek, "Ethnic Segmentation, Western Education, and Political

self-identity among the Ottoman minorities in the Empire, the Western line of thought became influential, and was followed by demands for autonomy.

3.2. Echoes of the Balkan Wars and the Decision to Enter WWI

The Balkan Wars deeply affected the Muslim population in the Balkans. As the Balkan states advanced further into Ottoman lands, they pushed the Muslims to the east. Yet this mass migration was only one of several impacts. Bulgarian, Serbian, and Greek nationalist guerrilla bands turned the war into a ‘race war’, terrorizing the Muslim cities and villages. Death was the most visible result of the war, a consequence of raids by guerilla bands, as well as disease and starvation. Those who fled to lands still under Ottoman rule were relatively lucky. As in the Russo-Ottoman war of 1877-78, the effect of the war on demography was immense.

Millions of Muslims migrated to the Ottoman Empire. They fled to the Empire without any possessions, just with their lives. This migration caused changes in the identity perceptions of Ottoman Muslims, and affected the Ottoman Empire through the conditions and the stories of the Muslim refugees. The situation of the refugees drew great reactions from among the Muslim population in the Ottoman territories. Public reactions about the Balkan Wars were embodied in a work called *Kırmızı-Siyah Kitab* [The black-red book]. In the advertisement for it, the book claims it was written to show “the atrocity and the tragedy,” that “our poor brothers of religion went through at the hands of the local Christian population.” In addition, the book also included “photographs, calling the whole nation [*millet*] to an awakening [*intibah*].” The word *millet* was used in the advertisement, but since it had a dual meaning in the Ottoman Empire, referring both to a ‘nation’ and a ‘religious community’, the motive behind its use here is unclear.¹⁵⁴

Outcomes: Nineteenth-Century Ottoman Society,” *Poetics Today*, vol. 14, no. 3 (Autumn 1993) p. 531.

¹⁵⁴ *Kırmızı-Siyah Kitab, Talebe Defteri*, Feruary 12, 1914: “*Kırmızı-Siyah Kitab. Neşr-i ve Saik Cemiyeti katib-i fahrîsi ve mecmuamız reis-i tahriri Ahmed Cevad Bey tarafından 1328-1329 Balkan Harbi’nde müttefikin orduları ve yerli Hristiyan âhâli tarafından zavallı Müslüman dindaşlarımıza karşı irtikab olunan fecai’ ve mezalimin tafsilâtını hulki olmak üzere yazılan ve bütün milleti intibaha davet eden ve bir çok*

With their political power legitimized by the victory in Edirne, the Unionists seized the opportunity to initiate a series of reforms. Enver Pasha, now with a secure position in the CUP, was promoted to Minister of War. This position gave him the means to launch a massive reorganization of the army, with the help of German officers led by General Liman von Sanders. Meanwhile, Enver was also in charge of an informal action group inside the CUP known as the ‘volunteers’ [*fedais*]. They were the Committee’s shock troops, who handled the ‘dirty work’—such as political assassinations—for the Committee. These men were active in Thrace after the recapture of Edirne; they arranged guerilla groups from among local Muslims in order to pressure the Bulgarians in the region. The organization existed informally under the name ‘Special Organization’ [*Teşkilat-i Mahsusa*] in 1913. After 1914, the organization was formally organized under the same name and the direct control of Enver Pasha. The *Teşkilat-i Mahsusa* took an active role in World War I, by preparing terrorist attacks against Greek businesses and suppressing Arab separatist movements. Using Islam, the CUP tried to organize Muslim resistance movements among the people under the rule of Russian, British, and French administrations. They are also known for taking part in the “relocation” of Armenians in 1915.

Deceived and disappointed, the policies of the Young Turks radically changed from liberal (in comparison to Abdulhamid’s *istibdat*) to autocratic and highly repressive. In Findley’s words: “The parliamentary system, for example, soon proved to be no more than a façade for a new kind of neopatrimonial domination, that of the Committee of Union and Progress.”¹⁵⁵ As well as all these internal disappointments, they also encountered diplomatic isolation after the Balkan wars. Edirne had symbolic meaning as the old capital of the Ottoman State, and even though it had been recovered, the initial impact of this loss had demoralized and provoked the masses at the same time. Forsaken and broken, the Unionists saw their future as becoming once again a part of the world order, which could only be possible through an alliance with one of the two blocks in Europe. Despite their constant criticisms of the *Tanzimat*, the Unionists were products of that period, having overthrown the repressive regime of Abdulhamid and re-

fotoğraf levhalarıyla müzeyyen bulunan bu eser Neşr-i ve Saik Cemiyeti tarafından tab’ edilmiş ve 7,5 guruş fiatla meydan-ı intişara vaz’ olunmuştur.”

¹⁵⁵ Carter Vaughn Findley, “The Advent of Ideology in the Islamic Middle East (Part II),” *Studia Islamica* no. 56 (1982), p. 166.

established the constitution on the way to becoming a modern state. However, rather than being treated as one of the European powers, the Unionists encountered several shocks that further weakened the Empire's situation. The decision to enter World War I was partly a result of the complicated feelings that the Balkan Wars had left behind. They had hoped to re-capture the recently lost territories by fighting with honor alongside the Great Powers: being their 'equal', at least on the battlefield. In addition, fighting alongside the European powers would give the Ottomans a final chance to prove that they belonged to the 'first division', that they were still one of the 'Great Powers.'

On November 14, 1914, the Sultan declared jihad, expecting a response from Muslim groups, especially those under Russian rule. But the result was a disappointment: Russians were able to attack the Caucasian front in November and the Ottoman army, under the command of Enver Pasha, was seriously defeated in Sarikamış. The memories of 1877-78 were still fresh, and, with the strength of the Russian attack, interest turned to the Armenians and their position in the war. The Armenians constituted a noteworthy portion of the Anatolian population, especially in the regions abutting the Eastern front. There had been unrest in the region since the second half of the nineteenth century, which had prevailed during the Russo-Ottoman War and under the rule of Abdulhamid II. The Russian presence in the region was once again perceived as a threat to the entire future of the war. Using this threat as an excuse, the cabinet decided to relocate the Armenians to Syria. In 1915-1916 the migrations were enforced, including of Armenians outside the limits of possible Russian zones of influence; and a large number of Armenians "perished" in the process. In 1917, the Bolshevik Revolution took place. Russia demanded a ceasefire, and this was a turning point for the Ottoman Empire both in war and in policies. The retreat of the Russian army gave a boost to pan-Turkism,¹⁵⁶ because the Turkic regions in Central Asia were considered as a compensation for the territorial losses in the Near East; thus, the imperial nature of the state could be preserved. On the Western front, there was a life-and-death struggle going on in the Dardanelles to protect the straits from the French and British navies. After enormous casualties and bloodbaths on both sides, Ottoman army emerged as 'victorious', proving that the straits were impassable. Gallipoli was the first victory for many years, and the campaign was regarded as a David and Goliath myth.

¹⁵⁶ Zürcher, *A Modern History*, p. 130.

Turks, with their ‘bare chests’, had faced down the modern, strong, and mechanized battle-fleet of ‘imperialist’ Europe, and so saved the national pride; the campaign, and in particular the repulse of the first wave of attack on March 18, 1915, was turned into one of the most celebrated moments in Turkish history. Enver and Talat enjoyed a wave of popularity and national pride soared as a result of the victory. According to Moorehead, at that specific point, a sudden emotional transition occurred: “from fear to not-fear, from weakness and doubt to strength and certainty.”¹⁵⁷ Instead of canalizing the desire for revenge towards the ‘imperial powers’ or even ‘traitor’ Greeks, they turned their faces toward their territories and found their scapegoat: the Armenians. It is important to note that Moorehead does not reduce the reasons for such a violent act to a single victory, but it did help the CUP to find an opportunity to solve a “problem.” On October 31, 1918, the Ottoman Empire signed the ceasefire treaty, defeated, but in possession of the myths of bravery and pride which would be inherited by Turkish Republic.

3.2.1. The Turkish Nationalism: From Idea to Reality

The Balkan Wars created a more homogeneous Empire, which could utilize the idea of Islamism. However, the most active intellectual platform of the Turkists and Turkish nationalists was a Unionist social and cultural organization, *Türk Ocağı*, and its journal *Türk Yurdu*. Turkism and Turkish nationalism were intellectually available among the elites, and now could be canalized to common people through ideas and policies. The Balkans had been the Ottoman Empire’s heartland; over centuries the region had provided the Empire with food, people, soldiers and, in the end, an organized oppositional movement: the Young Turks. The loss of the Balkans created demoralization in the Empire. The songs and flags of unity and liberty were proven to be a mere illusion; even the Revolution itself could not keep the Empire from falling apart.

After the 1908 Revolution, many Young Turks openly supported the idea of Ottomanism. Since the primary objective was to save the Empire within the boundaries of the remaining territories, any official emphasis of an alternative identity could result in the marginalization of other elements, which would lead to more demands for

¹⁵⁷ Alan Moorehead, *Gallipoli* (Hertfordshire: Wordsworth Editions, 1998), p. 82.

autonomy and separation within the Empire, and more European intervention from outside. Even though there were pan-Turkist, Turkish nationalist and Islamist members in the Committee, who, intellectually, seemed to support Turkist movements, it was necessary that their public discourse should remain within the boundaries of Ottomanism. Being incompatible with the prime goal of saving the Empire with its existing territories and communities, Turkish nationalism and Turkism manifested themselves louder and more visibly after the failure of Ottoman supranationalism. Besides the realization of the unavailability of an identity formed around Ottomanness, there were several other impulses that cleared the way for Turkish nationalism and Turkism. The Russo-Japanese War of 1904 had been a major victory of an Asian race against a European superpower, and became an inspiration for the Ottomans. Turkish nationalism had some anti-Western tendencies; at the turn of century, according to Hanioglu, the “great powers’ economic penetration and political intervention in the Empire were catalytic forces that propelled the Young Turks’ development of Turkish nationalism.”¹⁵⁸ In addition, the works of European Orientalists on Turks and the Turkish language arrived in the Ottoman Empire, and were translated and read. However, the most visible intellectual awakening of Turkism flourished with the Turkic immigrants from Russia. Akçuraoglu Yusuf, one of these immigrants from Russia, published the article *Üç Tarz-ı Siyaset* in 1904 in Egypt. In this article the author created a vision of a possible future without Ottoman identity, in which Turkishness was the prime factor. Another important individual was Ziya Gökalp, probably one of the most influential intellectual figures of the Turkish national movement, and deeply influenced by the ideas of Émile Durkheim. The supremacy of society over the individual was adopted by Gökalp, who, in addition, proposed replacing society with nation [*millet*]. Carter Findley describes Gökalp’s role in the nationalist movement as “to take the lead in transforming what had been a movement of literary Turkism into a movement aiming at a social revolution to complete the political revolution of 1908-09; since he saw social revolution as requiring new values, this amounted to calling for cultural revolution, as well.”¹⁵⁹ As Kushner points out, “The expressions of Turkish national sentiment among the Turkish educated elite became more and more evident”; by the turn of the century, it had become the norm for most educated people to identify

¹⁵⁸ Hanioglu, *Young Turks in Opposition*, p. 210.

¹⁵⁹ Findley, “The Advent of Ideology”, pp. 159-160.

themselves as “ethnically (or ‘racially’) Turkish.”¹⁶⁰

3.2.2. The Increased Visibility of Turkish Identity

Starting from the Balkan Wars and continuing on to the Great War, all the territorial losses, wars, poverty, and the availability of Turkist ideas, journals and associations, paved the way for Turkish nationalism—which was already available among the intellectuals—to take root in the minds and hearts of common people. However, like the Balkan nationalisms, Turkish nationalism also would imagine itself on the basis of religion. Contrary to the legal discourse of the future Turkish Republic, this identity formation would manifest itself in state policies and people’s perceptions. In some advertisements, ‘Muslim’ and ‘Turk’ were used together—even, one might say, as interchangeable. Parallel to claims for a ‘national economy’, Muslim and Turk businesses had started to emphasize their identities in their advertisements, asking for the support of the people. A tailor’s shop, The Light of Awakening [*Nur-u İntibah*], started an advertisement with a question for the readers: “Wouldn’t you support a real Muslim artisan?” And it answered its question in the name of the patriotic Muslim readers: “We know that you are affected by this sacred desire.” According to the advertisement, this young Turkish man, Osman Zeki, was trained by the most distinguished tailors of Europe; and with his knowledge and talent “he became a source of pride for Turkishness.”¹⁶¹

Even the name of theatrical companies differs from their counterparts of five years earlier. Most of the companies and theatres had earlier adopted the name ‘Ottoman’. In 1914, an advertisement announced the staging of a performance of *Genç*

¹⁶⁰ David Kushner, “Self-Perception and Identity in Contemporary Turkey,” *Journal of Contemporary History*, vol. 32, no. 2 (April 1997), p. 221.

¹⁶¹ Nur-u İntibah, *Donanma*, December 20, 1914: “*Nur-u İntibah. Hakiki bi Müslüman Sanatkârını Teşvik Etmez Misiniz? Sizin bu hiss-i muazzez ile mütehassis olduğunuzu biliriz. Onun için şöhret ve muvaffakiyetini ancak sanatına maharatine ve istikametine medyun bulunan biricik Müslüman terzisi Osman Zeki’yi size tavsiye ederiz. Avrupanın en mümtaz terzi üstadlarından ders gören bu Türk genci yeni postahane karşısındaki büyük ticarethanesinde kadın ve erkek elbisesini kendisine has letafet ve metanetle diker. Kendisinin himmet-i sanatkâranesi bu memleketin ekabirini mağazasına celb edecek derecede tesir göstermiş Türklüğün medar-ı iftiharı olmuştur.*”

Osman, “a great historical play” in the ‘National Theatre’, for the benefit of the journal *Gençlik Duygusu*. The staging also included reading of a poem specifically written for the occasion by Emin Bey (Mehmet Emin Yurdakul), a Turkish nationalist poet and one of the writers of *Türk Yurdu*.¹⁶²

The utilization of phrases including ‘Turk’ or ‘Turkishness’ was not specific to advertisements for intellectual outputs. Similar to the tailor Osman Zeki, several businesses chose to emphasize their ‘Turkishness’. A photography studio was advertised with a reference to Turkishness,¹⁶³ and a piano tutor was represented as “a Turk, educated in the Vienna Conservatoire.”¹⁶⁴ Faruki Cosmetics, founded with the support of Abdulhamid II, grew into an international business, declaring itself as “one of the most well-known industrial establishments in our country.” In this advertisement, dated 1914, Faruki Cosmetics stressed the development it had experienced since its foundation by pointing out that it “became subjected to demands, fame, and medals in every corner of the Ottoman lands, Europe and America.” In addition to several products by Faruki Cosmetics, ‘Turkish Cologne’ [*Türk Kolonyası*] was now available,

¹⁶² See appendix 7 for Millet Tiyatrosu, *Gençlik Duygusu*, March 28, 1914:

“Şehzadebaşı’nda Millet Tiyatrosu’nda
Maa’rif-i Umumiye Nâzır-ı Âlisi Şükriü Beyefendi Hazretlerinin Taht-ı Himaye-i
Devletleri’nde

Martın 15’nci Cumartesi günü.

Gündüz hanımefendilere
alaturka saat iki buçukta

Gece beyefendilere
alaturka saat altıda

tarihi büyük müsamere:

“Gençlik Duygusu” gazetesi menfaatine

Genç Osman

Vaka-i Dilsuz-u Şahadet

Şahane piyes 2 perde

Gece Beylere: Türkler’in yegane Şair-zi iktidarı Emin Beyefendi tarafından bu geceye mahsus olarak yeni kaleme aldıkları bir manzume-i garra kıraat edilecektir.

Gündüz Hanımefendilere: Memba-ül İrfan Mektebi’nden mini mini Hürrem Bey tarafından Osmanlılığa aid manzumeler. Mini mini bir hanım tarafından gayet suzişli bir manzume.”

¹⁶³ Fotoğrafhane, *İctihad*, March 19, 1914: “Fotoğrafhane-i Mim. Safa Beyoğlundanda cadde-i kebirde bonmarşe ittisalında numara 680. Her nev’i fotoğraf ve ağrandizman-karakalem yağlı boya, sulu boya ve renkli fotoğraflar gayet nefis olmak üzere yapılır. Fotoğraf aldirmek arzu iden zevatın bir kere bu Türk fotoğrafına teşrif buyurmaları rica olunur. Fiyatlar son derece ehvendir.” See Appendix 8.

¹⁶⁴ Piyano Muallimi, *Şehbal*, February 14, 1914: “Piyano Muallimi Hüseyin Hüsni Efendi: Viyana Konservatuari’nün programı dairesinde tahsil görmüş bir Türk.”

which was ‘superior’ to all the famous colognes. It is significant that a business which once promoted itself as Muslim now named its product ‘Turkish’.¹⁶⁵

3.2.2.1. ‘Türk Yurdu’

In the first decades of the 20th century, Turkist associations and journals were established and served as useful mediums for the transition of Turkish nationalism from a cultural movement to a political discourse. Türk Derneği (1908), Türk Yurdu Cemiyeti (1911), and Türk Ocağı (1912) were among these establishments. Türk Yurdu was the first joint organization of Ottoman and Turkic immigrants from Russia,¹⁶⁶ and it also published a journal with the same name. The Türk Yurdu organization was established in the light of these circumstances. A short time after the establishment of Türk Ocağı, the members of Turk Yurdu joined this new organization, and the journal *Türk Yurdu* continued to exist under this new organization. The initial aim of this journal was the simplification of the Turkish language, which would rescue it from the invasion of Arabic and Persian, and to inform the Ottoman Turks about other Turks. Important Turkist intellectuals, such as Mehmet Emin, Ahmed Agayev, Hüseyinzade Ali, Köprülüzade Fuad, and Akçuraoğlu Yusuf, contributed research and articles to *Türk Yurdu*.¹⁶⁷

¹⁶⁵ Faruki İtriyat, *Donanma*, June 29, 1914: “*Memleketimizin en maruf daire-i sinailerinden Faruki İtriyat Fabrikası mamulatı. Gerek Memalik-i Osmaniyye’nin gerek Avrupa ve Amerika’nın her tarafında fevkalâde şöret ve rağbete mazhar olmuştur. On beş seneden beri Avrupa’nın en büyük şehirlerinde güşad olunan umumi sinai ve ticaret sergilerinde fevkül müsabaka mükâfatler; altun madalyalar kazanmış beynelmilel itriyat (jüri) heyeti âzâ-i fahriliğine intihab olunmuştur. Şarkın en latif ezher-i rayihalarından istimal olunan lavantaları cildin zarafet ve ve latafetini tezyide hadim pudra, tuvalet su ve sabunları saç boyaları cidden her dürlü medh-ü senaya layıktır. Bilhassa ahiren mevki-i fûruhta vaz’ olunan Türk Kolonyası bütün dünyanın en meşhur kolonya sularının hepsinden âlâdır. Deposu: İstanbul’da Sultan Hamamı Caddesi’ndedir. Telefon Numarası: 24.*”

¹⁶⁶ Three among the six founders of the Türk Yurdu organization were immigrants from Russia: Ahmed Agayev, Hüseyinzade Ali and Akçuraoğlu Yusuf.

¹⁶⁷ Masami Arai, *Turkish Nationalism in the Young Turk Era* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1992), p. 57. There were articles written by Turks from Russia and Central Asia in the column *matbuat*. There was also a series of articles on the culture and history of different Turkish groups. Most of the articles written by immigrants could be regarded as Pan-Turkist.

The *Türk Yurdu* was a frequent advertiser in the other Ottoman journals. These advertisements were almost always in form of statements that set out the political and intellectual position of *Türk Yurdu*. In one of the advertisements, the journal declared: “This journal works for Turkish nationalism [*Türk Milliyetperverliği*], and introduces Turks to the national consciousness [*milli vicdan*].” It continued: “The aim of *Türk Yurdu* is Islamness and Turkishness [*İslamlık ve Türklük*].”¹⁶⁸ In another example, *Türk Yurdu* declared that “it [*Türk Yurdu*] is the only journal of Turkic world, and it is managed by the greatest Turkish journalists. *Türk Yurdu* shows the way to the nation.”¹⁶⁹ The contents of these two advertisements spoke clearly for the aims and ideas of Turkist and Turkish nationalist intellectuals. The claims in the advertisements were similar to the declarations in the first issue *Türk Yurdu*: “We want to serve Turkishness, be beneficial to Turks.” In the same issue, the nature of the journal was described as: “the one and only Turkish Nationalist journal that declares it openly.”¹⁷⁰

In addition to journals that spoke for Turkish nationalism, intellectuals had also published books to further promote their ideas and the national consciousness. The book *Turkishness*, written by Hüseyin Ragıp, was recommended for all Turkish brothers “who love their nation.” As stated in the advertisement, the book contained “important opinions” on Turkishness, including articles by Mehmed Emin, Şahabeddin Süleyman, and Köprülüzade Fuad on the ideas of Hüseyin Ragıp, and an oration addressing the Turkish youth. Here it is noteworthy that the authors of the aforesaid articles were the writers from *Türk Yurdu*, manifesting that there was an intellectual circle that generated ideas, theories, and solutions regarding Turkishness. In the end, the advertisement declared its aim to change wishes into words: “In order to make our nation not to stay as

¹⁶⁸ *Türk Yurdu*, *Donanma*, September/October 1913: “İki yıldan beri çıkan bu mecmua Türk milletperverliği için çalışır; Türkler’e milli vicdanlarını tanıtır. ‘Türk Yurdu’nun hedefi İslamlık ve Türklük’tür. Geçirmekte olduğumuz felakete çareler arar. En güzide muharirlerimizin yazılarını basar, en çok okunan ve aranan bir mecmuadır. Türk Yurdu’nun bir sayısını altmış parayadır. Senelik abonesi otuz guruşdur. Müracaat Mahali: Nur-u Osmaniyye’de 40 numaralı “Türk Yurdu” idarehanesidir.”

¹⁶⁹ *Türk Yurdu* (2), *Çocuk Dünyası*, July 23, 1913: “Türk Alemi’nin yegane gazetesidir. Ve Türkler’in en büyük muharirleri tarafından idare olunur. Türk Yurdu millet yolunu gösterir. Bir seneliği 30, altı aylığı 16 guruşdur.”

¹⁷⁰ Füsun Üstel, *İmparatorluktan Ulus-Devlete Türk Milliyetçiliği: Türk Ocakları, 1912-1931* (Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1997), p. 43.

an important idea, but to make it established in all minds.”¹⁷¹ Indeed the idea was available, what was important at that point was to convince people that the ideas were real, and to help them to internalize them. In order to spread the national consciousness to the masses, a journal called ‘Towards the People’ [*Halka Doğru*] was published by the authors of *Türk Yurdu* for artisans and tradesmen [*esnaf*], and peasants [*köylü*].¹⁷² This journal was founded by the CUP, in line with their populist discourse.¹⁷³ A striking discontinuity is visible between the advertisements of journals after the 1908 Revolution and after the Balkan Wars. The journal advertisements after 1908 had a positivist tone, with references to science, philosophy, progress, and the future; journals after the Balkan Wars spoke of identities, national consciousness, immediate action, and the present.

3.3. Fertile Lands, National Banks

Desire to create a national economy was widely discussed in the new journals such as the *Türk Yurdu* and the *İktisadiyat Mecmuası*.¹⁷⁴ In these journals the ideas of Friedrich List were adopted and German economic progress was explained in relation to their ability to create a national economy in the light of his ideas. Turkish nationalists like Tekin Alp (Moiz Kohen) and Ziya Gökalp were among the most enthusiastic

¹⁷¹ Türklük, *Çocuk Dünyası*, July 10, 1913: “Türklük Hüseyin Ragıb Bey tarafından neşr olunan Türklük hakkında mühim mütaalâti ihtiva eden bu kitabı milletini seven bütün Türk kardeşlerimize tavsiye ederiz. Bu kitabda Ragıb Bey’in fikirlerine dair Mehmed Emin, Şahabeddin Süleyman, Köprülüzade Fuad Beylerin birer makaleleri vardır. Bilhassa eserin son gündeki Türk geçliğine yazılan hitabeyi çocuklarımız mutlaka okumalıdır. Milletimizin mühim bir fikir halinde kalmayarak bütün dimağlarda esaslı bir surette yerleşmesi için Hüseyin Ragıb Bey’in kitabını bu yolda atılmış umumi ve faydalı bir hutve olmak üzere telakki ediyoruz. Fiyatı iki guruş, merkez-i tevzî Bab-ı Âli Caddesi’nde Zaman Kütübhanesi’dir. Diğer kütübhanelerde dahi bulunur.”

¹⁷² Halka Doğru, *Çocuk Dünyası*, July 23, 1913: “Türk Yurdu heyeti tarafından, esnaf ve köylü için çıkarılır. En faydeli haftalık bir mecmuadır. Bir seneliği 12 guruşdur. Türk Yurdu ve (Halka Doğru) için şu adrese müracaat ediniz. İstanbul- Nur-u Osmaniye numero 40.”

¹⁷³ Zürcher, *A Modern History*, p. 130.

¹⁷⁴ Toprak, *Türkiye’de Milli İktisat*, p. 26.

advocates of the nationalized economy. According to Tekin Alp, “the place of Friedrich List in the hearts of Germans [was] alongside Bismarck.”¹⁷⁵ In another statement he said: “Turks did not lack heroes similar to Bismarck in the battlefields, however, they did not have a single Friedrich List.”¹⁷⁶ Highly influenced by Durkheim’s ideas, Gökalp explained the dynamics that would expand the national economy by way of the division of labor: “A modern state was created by the division of labor of a homogeneous population whose members share common feelings.”¹⁷⁷ Political revolution had been followed by social revolution; now it was the time for an economic one. In 1914, the unilateral abolition of capitulations marked a turning point in Ottoman and Turkish economic history. The Committee of Union and Progress immediately adopted protectionist and statist economic policies. A soap producer, *Sabuncuzade Hacı Şakir ve Mahdumu*, found advertisements to be an opportunity to give thanks for the new policies, especially the new law on ‘incentive for industry’ [*teşvik-i sanayii kanunu*], which had helped them to improve their establishment in accordance with the new sciences [*fenn-i hâzır*].¹⁷⁸

¹⁷⁵ Ibid, p. 27.

¹⁷⁶ Ibid, p. 28.

¹⁷⁷ Ibid, p. 32.

¹⁷⁸ Hacı Şakir, *Donanma*, June 29, 1914: “*Memalik-i Osmaniyye’nin ve Hatta Bütün Dünyanın en nefis sabunu. Artık başka sabunu almayınız. Fenni raporlarla nefaseti tasdik ve yerli mamulatından utriyat ile tatir edilmiş gül rayihali tuvalet ve çamaşır sabunları. “Arz-ı Teşekkür ve Şükrân-ı Nimet”. Teşvik-i sanayii kanununun bahş ettiği teshilat yaşamak ve mevcudiyeti iktisadiyemiz için vatan mallarına rağbet fabrikamızı fenn-i hazırın emir ettidiği derecede ıslah ve tevsîa hizmet eyledi. Sabuncuzade Hacı Şakir ve Mahdumu damgalı sabunların hilesiz ve saf olduğu müteaddit raporlarla masdukdur. Çamaşır ve kokulu nezafet sabunlarıyla tuvalet sabunlarımız Avrupa’nın mağşuş sabunlarına cins ve fiyat itibariyle faikdir. Bir tecrübe isbat ve güşad ettiğimiz şubelerimizde muhterem âhâliyi mahlut yağlardan kurtarmak için toptan ve perakende olarak filtre edilmiş en birinci Ayvalık zeytinyağları şişe ve tenekelerle satılır. Taklidinden ictinab için (Sabuncuzade Hacı Şakir ve Mahdumu) isimlerine dikkat edilmesini tavsiye ederiz. Ve mahlutiyeti isbat edene ikramiye verilir. Şubelerimiz: Asmaaltında Çukur Han karşısında numero 5. Bursa’da Osmanlı Lastik Şirketi’nin bakkaliye mağazasıdır.”*

3.3.1. Agriculture and the National Economy

The Ottoman Empire, despite its statements on industrial progress, was still a dominantly agricultural economy. The settlement and relocation of the immigrants was another problem the war had created. The Ottoman Empire had already received waves of migration after the 1877-78 war and the 1905 Revolution in Russia. The Empire was now more Muslim than ever. Refugee camps outside Istanbul were formed, where immigrants tried to survive diseases such as typhus and cholera. The number of immigrants increased after the population exchange with Bulgaria, and at the same time Greece and Turkey had a partial population exchange, replacing the Muslims in Greece with Greeks from Thrace and Anatolia. A boost in the agricultural production of the Empire was thought to be possible and beneficial, given the available human resources and vast empty lands. A development in the agricultural outcome of the Empire seemed a more immediately plausible measure toward the creation of a national economy than the establishment of new industry.

The Committee of Union and Progress paid special attention to agriculture. Peasants were encouraged to produce for the market, with no fear of confiscation of their productions, and with high prices, even under war conditions.¹⁷⁹ The Great War had closed the Ottoman economy to the outside and thereby created a demand for local production.¹⁸⁰ In 1917 and 1918, the lands far from the fronts were opened to agricultural production and the extent of cultivated lands was expanded in comparison to the pre-war period.¹⁸¹ The population of Anatolia once again dropped, however, and as the war moved to the new fronts these cultivated lands were abandoned: overall, the lands lost in the war and the immense loss of manpower surpassed the developments in agriculture and could not stop the decrease in agricultural output.¹⁸² In the first year of the war, before the side effects hit agricultural production, the aforementioned progress in the sector was more visible.

¹⁷⁹ Zafer Toprak, *İttihad-Terakki ve Cihan Harbi: Savaş Ekonomisi ve Türkiye'de Devletçilik, 1914-1918* (Istanbul: Homer Kitabevi, 2003), p. 93.

¹⁸⁰ *Ibid*, p. 94.

¹⁸¹ *Ibid*, p. 94.

¹⁸² *Ibid*, p. 96.

A weekly journal on agricultural production from Paris was advertised in the journal *Felahat*, in which almost all the advertisements were related to agricultural production. In this advertisement, the address of a library in Paris was provided for those who wanted to subscribe to a French journal called *La Vie Agricole et Rurale*;¹⁸³ this journal was advertised alongside a book on cotton production, written, according to the advertisement, by the editor of the journal *Felahat* based on his research and experiences in Egypt. In all likelihood, cotton production in Egypt provided an important example of success for Ottoman producers. The importance of Egypt and cotton production is visible in the body of the advertisement: “Cotton has been cultivated in several regions in our country [*memleketimizin pek çok taraflarında*], therefore consulting with scientific renovation [*fennen ıslah*] solutions is an important issue related to life of the fatherland [*vatanın hayatına taalluk*].”¹⁸⁴

3.3.2. The Ottoman Bank and The National Bank

The issue of modernization and the development of agriculture was only one aspect of the economic policies of the Committee of Union and Progress. The Ottoman Bank [*Osmanlı Bankası*] was regarded as the first state bank of the Ottoman Empire. In its foundation, the Bank was described as a state establishment, founded on the Sultan’s permission.¹⁸⁵ However, the capital behind this institution was initially French and British, and was later incorporated with the Austrian Ottoman Bank. The Ottoman Bank had been working with a large proportion of the credit loaners of Ottoman Empire: the

¹⁸³ *La Vie Agricole, Felahat*, April 14, 1914: “*La Vie Agricole, et Rurale Paris’de münteşir ve 44 sahifeyi muhtevi işbu resimli haftalık ziraat gazetesine yarım Frank gönderildikde bir ay mütemadiyen beş numune olarak meccanen gönderilir. Yazdığınız mektubda Felahat’ın ismini zikr etmeyi unutmayınız. Adres: Librairie J.-B. Bailliere & Fils 19, Rue Hautefeuille. Paris.*”

¹⁸⁴ Pamuk, *Felahat*, April 14, 1914: “*Pamuk Ziraat ve Ticareti. Ser muharirimizin yedi seneden ziyade Mısır’da bizzat icra ettiği tecrübelerin bir mahsul-ü mücmeli olan bu nefis amelî ve gayet sade bir lisanla yazılmış kitabını pamuk misüllü gayet faydeli bir nebat-ı sanayieden istifade etmek isteyenlere ve ba-husus fen memurlarınıza tavsiye ederiz. Mısırluların “altun nebatını” teşkil eden pamuk memleketimizin pek çok taraflarında yetiştiği nazar-ı itibare olarak ol fennen ıslahî çarelerine tevessül edilmesi vatanın hayatına taalluk eden bir mesele-i mühimmedir. Fiyatı yirmi guruşdur.*”

¹⁸⁵ Toprak, *Cihan Harbi*, p. 52.

“Ottoman Public Debt Administration [*Düyun-u Umumiye*] partly owed its existence to *Osmanlı Bankası*.”¹⁸⁶ Therefore Unionists realized the necessity of a national bank for the success of their attempt to nationalize the economy. In order to establish a national bank, several banks were founded with national capital, such as *İtibar-ı Milli Bankası*. The Turkey National Bank [*Türkiye Milli Bankası*], despite having ‘Turkey’ and ‘National’ in its name, was neither Turkish nor national: it was actually established with foreign capital.¹⁸⁷ In an advertisement, *Türkiye Milli Bankası* announces that it was established by Sultan edict. It is noteworthy that even a foreign business was seeking to approach customers by making local or nationalist claims.¹⁸⁸

Creating a national economy required a rearrangement of Ottoman foreign trade, which became possible only after the abolition of capitulations. Foreign establishments mainly active in the Ottoman Empire were obliged to submit to Ottoman laws and legislation. The government attempted to replace French with Turkish as the language of trade and business. However, all these attempts to restrict the area of effectiveness of foreign businesses did not change the reality that foreign capital was vital for the economy. Unionists could not trust that the Empire was economically mature or independent enough to establish the necessary economic activities. Therefore, during the attempts establishing a national economy, the Ottoman government paid extra attention to give reassurances and “not to scare the foreign investment.”¹⁸⁹

3.3.3 ‘The Fez Wars’

‘National’ [*milli*] eventually replaced ‘Muslim’ or ‘Ottoman’ in advertisements promoting the local against the foreign. Before the Balkan Wars, ‘Ottoman’ could easily be contrasted against the foreign, in the quest to create a protective consciousness in Ottoman consumers. However, the Balkan Wars had proven that not all Ottoman was

¹⁸⁶ Ibid, p. 53.

¹⁸⁷ Ibid, p. 47.

¹⁸⁸ Türkiye Milli Bankası, *Kadınlar Dünyası*, November 29, 1913: “*Türkiye Milli Bankası 29 mart 320 ve 11 nisan 1309 tarihli iradesiyle hazreti padişahı mucibince tesis etmiş. Osmanlı Anonim Şirketi. Sermaye-i Şirket: 1,100,000 lira-i Osmani . . .*”

¹⁸⁹ Toprak, *Türkiye’de Milli İktisat*, p. 98.

national. *Çocuk Dünyası* [World of Children], was, as its name suggests, a magazine for children, and it advertised itself by saying that it was the one and only national magazine for children.¹⁹⁰ *Milli*, alongside with *yerli* [local] and *Türk*, appear in quite a number of advertisements, replacing both Islam/Muslim and Ottoman, two dominant themes in the previous advertisements. A carpenter who produced furniture also used *yerli* to distinguish his production. Besides being *yerli*, the furniture was described as cheap [*ucuz*] and superior to European counterparts [*Avrupa'ya faik*].¹⁹¹

The boycott of Austro-Hungarian merchandise made the *fes* the symbol of national economic resistance to European goods. *Selanik Bonmarşesi* seized the opportunity of this “national awakening” to move against its long-time business rivals such as İştayn (Stein) and Tiring. Through using the national and symbolic features of the *fes*, it became a constant promoter of the national and the local. In an advertisement, slogans such as ‘national hat’ [*serpuş-u milli*], ‘Istanbul *fes*’, or ‘product of local industry’ [*yerli sanayii mahsulü*] encircle a picture of a *fez*.¹⁹² In another example, *Selanik Bonmarşesi* again tried to attract the attention of the readers with large fonts, writing the same sentence on all sides of the advertisement: “Use the Local, National Istanbul Fez” [*Yerli Milli İstanbul Feslerini Kullanınız*]. Even though the main body of the advertisements promoted a variety of products from watches to shirts and photography cameras, and only the last line mentions the *fes*, by framing the advertisement with a slogan stressing the local and national, the business owners clearly announced the origins of their establishment.¹⁹³

Selanik Bonmarşesi, a Muslim business established in Selanik, was one of the

¹⁹⁰ *Çocuk Dünyası, Kadınlar Dünyası*, November 23, 1913: “*Çocuk Dünyası. Bu sevimli ve milli yegane çocuk mecmuasını kariyelerimize tavsiye ederiz.*”

¹⁹¹ *Mobilya, İctihad*, March 19, 1914: “*Yerli, Zarif, Mobilya, İmalathanesi: Mekteb-i Mülkiye-i Şahane karşısında kain çıkmaz sokakda numara 12, hem zarif hem metin hem Avrupa mamulatına faik aynı zamanda yerli ve ucuz mobilya: Kütüphane, yazıhane, ve bibliyotek tunant [bibliothèque tournante] ...ilah. Almak, ısmarlamak ve vaad olunan zamanda almak isterseniz yukarıdaki adrese müracaat ediniz.*”

¹⁹² *Fes, İctihad*, March 19, 1914.

¹⁹³ *Milli Fes, Şehbal*, February 14, 1914: “*Yerli Milli İstanbul Feslerini Kullanınız. Selanik Bonmarşesi: İpekçi Kardeşler Ticarethanesi: İpekli, yünlü, kumaşlar, dantela ve hurc çeşidleri. Fanila, çorab, gömlek, mendil, boyun bağları, lambalar, saat, şamdan takımları, yazı takımları, oyuncaklar. Her dürlü levazım-ı askeriye. Fotoğraf makineleri, cam kağıd ve eczalar. Sinema makineleri, kurdelları. Yerli malı İstanbul fesleri.*”

frequent advertisers in Ottoman newspapers and journals. Even though the business was established in a cosmopolitan city like Selanik, it quickly adopted the claims of national identity. A few years earlier, it had stressed that it was a Muslim business; now with the rise of nationalist and protectionist economic policies, it adopted a more national voice. It is also noteworthy that, at the time these two advertisements were published (19 and 14 February 1914, respectively) the city in which this establishment was founded had already been lost to Greece, and the advertiser in these two examples was the Istanbul branch. The language of this advertisement should be evaluated with these facts in mind.

Another business which laid an emphasis on the ‘national economy’, perhaps in a more direct way, is *Umum Mektebler Terzihanesi*, a tailor’s shop for school uniforms. The advertisement instructed the young men of the country to buy from them in a rather determinant tone: “Let’s Act Economical From Now On!” [*Artık İktisadi Çalışalım!*], approaching the consumers by emphasizing the importance of being economical. At the end of the same advertisement, to ensure the consumers that they were acting in accordance with their own advice, they stressed that all the fabrics used in their business were local products [*Kumaşlarımız Yerli Malıdır*].¹⁹⁴

3.4. How Does a State Ask to Borrow Money?

The Young Turks tried to revive the Ottoman army by establishing a new and more modern navy. In addition to purchasing new battleships and submarines, they also wished to upgrade domestic ship production to the level of building dreadnoughts,¹⁹⁵

¹⁹⁴ Mektebler Terzihanesi, *İdman*, June 14, 1913. For a later advertisement by the same business, which did not include any references to local and national products, see *İdman*, March 19, 1914: “*Bab-ı Âli Caddesi’nde Umum Mektebler Terzihanesi. Bab-ı Âli Caddesi’nde gaz şirketi ittisalinde daire-i mahsusa. İstanbul, Beyoğlu, Mercan Vefa, Üsküdar, Kabataş, Gelenbevi, Davudpaşa, Sultanî ve bilimum mekteb-i rüşdiye ve iptidaiye efendilerine! Mekteb elbiseleriniz tanzim olunan numuneleri vechle imali derhde olunduğu ilan olunur. Taşra Mekteb idarelerine kemal-i ciddiyet ve istikametle çalışan umumî mektebler terzihanesi elbiseleri dersaadet mekteb idarelerince şayan-ı kabul görülmüş olduğundan taşrada elbise sipariş edecek mekteblerin bâlâdaki adrese müracaat ettiği takdirde derhal makasdâr kumaş ve elbise numuneleri irsal olunur. Her nevi elbise imâli mümkündür.*”

¹⁹⁵ Jonathan Grant, “The Sword of the Sultan: Ottoman Arms Imports, 1854-

which would also serve as a preliminary step towards the establishment of heavy industry in the Empire. Their vision was constantly interrupted and hampered by the wars. Furthermore, the Ottoman Empire did not possess the money to make such huge capital investments, and therefore they initiated a popular subscription campaign in January 1914, following the example of Abdulhamid and the Hijaz Railway.¹⁹⁶ The contribution money collected from the people was placed under the control of the Ottoman Navy League [*Donanma-yı Osmaniyye Cemiyeti*], which frequently asked for donations from people in *Donanma Mecmuası* [Journal of the Navy]. *Donanma Mecmuası* also announced in its advertisements that the subscription money for this journal would be used for the navy. In one of these advertisements, readers were reminded about the Ottoman defeat in the latest war [*Harb-i Ahir*], referring to the Balkan Wars, and were asked to take out a subscription, since “the readers properly perceived the harms caused because of the Navy’s weakness.”¹⁹⁷ The journal also published a book, all the profits from which were dedicated to the contribution campaign.¹⁹⁸ In March 1914, a business owner thanked his consumers, his “patriotic brothers and sisters,” for purchasing from him, and thereby enabling him to pay his seventh weekly payment of the navy donations that he would continue to pay “as long as he lives.”¹⁹⁹

1914,” *The Journal of Military History*, vol. 66, no. 1 (January 2002), p. 29.

¹⁹⁶ Stanford J. Shaw, *The Ottoman Empire in World War I*, vol. 1 (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu, 2006-2008), p. 587.

¹⁹⁷ *Donanma Mecmuası*, *Şehbal*, February 14, 1914: “*Donanma Mecmuası. Harb-i ahirde donanmamızın zaafından ne zararlar gördüğümüzü hakkıyla takdir ettinizse ey kari, ve kariler bu mecmuaya abone olmak suretiyle mini mini bir hisse-i ianenin size teselli satın alacağını unutmayınız. Ayda bir neşr olunur. Her nüshası 48 sahifeden müteşekkil ve resimlidir. Abonesi 35 guruşdur. İdarehanesi: Bab-ı Âli Caddesi’nde Osmanlı Donanması Muavenet-i Milliye Cemiyeti Merkez-i Umumiyesi.*”

¹⁹⁸ *Donanma Cemiyeti*, *Donanma*, October 18, 1914: “*Hasılatı donanmamıza aid olmak üzere Donanma-i Osmaniyye Muavenet-i Milliye Cemiyeti tarafından tab edilmiştir. Düstur tertib-i sani üç cildi cemiyetimiz menfaatine tab edilmiştir. İlan-ı meşrutiyeti müteakıb vaz ve akd idilen kavanin ve nizamât ve muahedât[?] ile umuma mütealîk şerefsüdüür iden iradât-ı seniyyeyi camidir.*”

¹⁹⁹ Safyağcı Cemaleddin, Tanin, March 13, 1914: “*Hamiyetmendani ihvane teşekkür. Sizin, yalnız sizin hamiyetinize istinaden umum ömrüm oldukça tediyesini taahhüt ettiğim donanma ianesinin yedinci haftalığı olan yetmiş beş kuruşu vermeye muvaffak oldum. Mazhar olduğum rağbet ve teveccühü umumiye karşı minnettarlığımı arz ederim. Elfakir safyağcı Cemaleddin.*” As transcribed in Koloğlu, *Reklamcılığımızın*

By the end of World War I, people's contributions had spread beyond the Ottoman Navy. With an economy that had already collapsed, the war conditions were not easy on the Ottoman treasury. Another campaign was launched, this time asking for domestic borrowing from the citizens [*istikraz-ı dahili*]. One announcement addressed the people in direct terms: "Give!" [*Veriniz!*].²⁰⁰

Domestic borrowing would be the reason for victory and peace, the Army's and the Navy's expenditures, officers, holders', orphans' and widows' allowances, the needs of our schools, subsistences, the debts of our treasury, everything rests on domestic borrowing. The money you would lend to the government would provide you with direct and indirect gains.

In another example, the newspaper *Zaman* tried to stimulate the people of Istanbul by introducing the element of competition. The announcement reported that the first place in domestic borrowing belonged to Istanbul. And if the city dwellers wanted to keep their city's position in this race of patriotism, they should act immediately, because "the city of *Aydın* [was] about to get the first place from Istanbul."²⁰¹

3.5. Ladies to Women

Educated women were expected to assume the duty of modernizing society as educators of future generations. However, they also became more visible in the public domain, in comparison to previous years, and education and even finding a job became relatively more accessible. In 1917, with the Decree on Family Law, women gained the

İlk Yüzyılı, p. 190.

²⁰⁰ *İstikraz-ı Dahili*, *Zaman*, April 18, 1918: "Veriniz. *İstikrazı dahilî, amilî zafer ve sulh olacaktır. Ordu ve donanmanın masarifi, memurin, mütekaidin, yetim ve dulların maaşları, mekteplerimizin ihtiyacı, iaşe işleri, hazinenin borçları her şey, istikrazı dahiliye muhtaç bulunuyor. Hükümete borç vereceğiniz meblağ, hem doğrudan doğruya hem de dolayısıyla size mühim yararlar temin edecektir.*" as transcribed in Koloğlu, *Reklamcılığımızın İlk Yüzyılı*, p. 206.

²⁰¹ *İstanbul İstikrazı*, *Zaman*, May 22, 1918: "İstanbulullara: *İstikrazı dahilide birincilik şimdiye kadar bizdedir. Dokuz gün sonra kayıt muamelesi şehrimizde kapanyo. Aydın vilayeti birinciliği almak müsabakasındadır. Gayret; vaktimiz vardır. Bu vatani hizmet ve kârlı işte dahi birincilik bizde kalsın.*" As transcribed in Koloğlu, *Reklamcılığımızın İlk Yüzyılı*, p. 206.

right to divorce, and polygamy became subject to women's consent. Feroz Ahmad sees the extension of women's rights as "a part of creating the national bourgeoisie."²⁰² Indeed, women were perceived as important for the social revolution that was following the political revolution. Making women partners in creating a nation manifested itself in women's journals after 1908. A women's journal, *Kadın*, in the line of Young Turk ideas, presents an insight into what the Young Turk regime expected from the Ottoman women. Unlike its predecessor, *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete*, which advised Ottoman women to be good mothers, wives and Muslim, the journal *Kadın* charged women with the economics of the household.²⁰³ Alongside traditional chores new duties were expected from women, such as budget management and charitable works. The content of articles published in *Kadın* were filled with warnings and advice on "budget management, to avoid the lure of fashion and wastefulness."²⁰⁴ The lack of fashion²⁰⁵ and advertisement sections was another characteristic of *Kadın*, which separated it from its Hamidian and contemporary counterparts. The absence of an advertisement section was a reflection of its proud, serious image.²⁰⁶ *Kadın* was published between 1908 and 1909 for thirty issues.²⁰⁷ Even though it belongs to an earlier period than the scope of this chapter, it is important to understand the change in the language of advertisements between 1913 and 1918.

Advertisements for women that stressed fashion or beauty were still available; however, the issues of budget management, charity, and support of the national economy became more visible in the advertisements aiming at women. This could be viewed as an expansion of Young Turk ideas regarding the women in the aftermath of

²⁰² Feroz Ahmad, *The Making of Modern Turkey* (London: Routledge, 1993), p. 86.

²⁰³ Even the names of two journals reflects a change in the mentalities. While *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete* preferred the word 'lady' [*hanım*], the journal *Kadın* openly assumed the name 'woman'.

²⁰⁴ Fatma Kılıç Denman, *İkinci Meşrutiyet Döneminde Bir Jön Türk Dergisi: Kadın* (Istanbul: Libra Kitapçılık ve Yayıncılık, 2009), p. 109.

²⁰⁵ Ayfer Karakaya-Stump, "Debating Progress in a 'Serious Newspaper for Muslim Women': The Periodical 'Kadın' of Post-Revolutionary Salonica, 1908-1909," *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*, vol. 30, no. 2 (November 2003), p. 162.

²⁰⁶ Denman, *Kadın*, p. 60.

²⁰⁷ *Ibid*, p. 13.

the Balkan Wars. In an advertisement, Beginning of Wealth Ottoman Incorporated Trade Company [*Mebde-i Servet Anonim Osmanlı Ticaret Şirketi*] announced its gratitude to the patriotic ladies who had proven that they were in the service of the fatherland's prosperity and were among the nation's most beautiful members, since they responded to the previous advertisements by the company and visited the company center with a desire to buy company shares that were worth one Ottoman gold.²⁰⁸ Apparently, the founding of the company had a connection with Osman Zeki, the aforementioned tailor, since every woman who bought a share got a discount from his business. It is striking that a company could reduce proof of patriotism and nationalism to a single action of buying shares. Thus, it claimed, if those who had not yet bought them still felt they too were patriotic and members of the nation, they should become a shareholder. The advertisement, published in March 1914, after the Balkan Wars and few months before the Great War, could be a reflection of the tense atmosphere in the Empire, where the cries of loyalty, patriotism and nationalism were getting louder.

Apparently, discussions on the role and the position of women in this rapidly changing society were also taking place in the intellectual circles of the Empire. The journal *Müdafaa-i Milliye ve İktisadiye* [Defense of nation and economy] announces a book, *Kadınlarımız* [Our Women], described as the latest book in the Islamic World to address issues concerning the women of the fatherland [*nisvan-ı vatan*] in relation to the latest psychological and sociological ideas.²⁰⁹

²⁰⁸ Anonim Osmanlı, *Kadınlar Dünyası*, March 7, 1914: “*Mebde-i Servet Anonim Osmanlı Ticaret Şirketi: Hamiyetli hanımlarımıza rasimen teşekküratı takdim eder. Çünkü siz hakikaten vatanın saadetini temine hadim olduğunuzu, milletin şayeste-i tecmil-i efradından bulunduğunuzu isbat ettiniz ve ediyorsunuz. Şirketimiz için gazetelerle neşr edilen bu Kadınlar Dünyası sahaifi arasında hanımlara hitab yazılan ilânlarımızın mündericatu- atebe-i iffet ve rağbetinizde hüsn-ü kabule mazhariyet buldu. Bugün beş on hanım efendilerimizin idarehanemizi teşrifle hisse senedatı mübayaasında bulduklarını ve aynı zamanda her nev’i eşya üzerine “peşin” “veresiye” mamulatu ifa buyurdukları ve kemal-i ibtihac ve mefharetle görüyoruz. buna bu cümleyi mahsusa olmak üzere Bab-ı Âli Caddesi’nde Orhan Bey Hanı’nda Osman Zeki Bey’in (Hanımlara Mahsus Terzihane)siylede veresi muamelesi yapılmakda olduğunu tebşir eyler ve müracaatınızı tavsiye ederiz. Merkez idarehanesi ve yazıhanesi: İstanbul Bağçekapusu’nda Birinci Vakıf Hanı’nda birinci kat numero 13. Beher hisse senedi bir Osmanlı altınıdır.”*

²⁰⁹ *Kadınlarımız*, *Müdafaa-i Milliye ve İktisadiye*, February 23, 1914: “*Kadınlarımız Âlem-i İslâm’da son nazariyet-i ruhiye ve ictimaiyeye göre yazılan yegâne kitabdır ki bilhassa nisvan-ı vatanın samin hukuku nokta-i nazarından en müfid ve en ziyade amel-i tedabiri ihtiva eder. 7 buçuk guruşdur.”*

3.5.1 Smooth Skins, Wasp Waists

The Young Turk period witnessed fundamental reforms in several areas, laying the foundation for the future Turkish society. Administration, education, women's rights, creating a national economy, and religious affairs were among the spheres of reform. Turkism, as a solution for the Ottoman state, offered a blueprint that involved a transformation of society at different levels, starting with the simplification and the unification of the language. Education also went under several changes: Turkish became the only language of education, and the importance of the Turkish ancestries of the Ottomans and the Anatolian peasants, as the sources of Turkish culture, was widely promoted.

The reforms regarding Ottoman women did not only create 'sisters' for the nation, but also made them more visible. In the previous periods, advertisements targeting women were limited to textiles, books, tailors, and a few cosmetics. Several new cosmetic products were introduced, especially the facial cream brands offering Ottoman women a variety of products in the pages of women magazines.²¹⁰ These advertisements appeared in the contemporary counterparts of the journal *Kadın*; however, their stance was completely different. Corsets were another product which became widely advertised in this period.²¹¹ Most of these used images of women in their advertisements. Another notable point is that all these new products were promoted along with their 'instruction manuals' [*suret-i istimali*].²¹²

²¹⁰Dermos Balsamı and Antirid Antik Pomadı, *Kadınlık*, May 30, 1914: *Sivilceleri, kızarıklıkları, ve cilde arız olan her dürlü tahrişatı süratle izale eder. Cildi parlattır, düzeltir, ve deriyi inceltir. Suret-i istimâli: Muhtac-ı tedavi olan kısma sürüb kuruttuktan sonra sabaha kadar muhafaza etmeli*" and "Antirid antik Pomadası cildin gıda-i tabiisi, çehrenin elyafına hayat ve elastikiyet verir. Tesiri pek seridir. Suret-i İstimali: bütün yüze bir az pomada sürüb hafifce masaj yapılmalı ve yahud gece yatarken sürüb sabahleyin ıslak bir sünger ile silmeli."

²¹¹Huri Korseleri, *Kadınlar Dünyası*, November 29, 1913: "Madam Ferdinand." For the image, see Appendix 9.

²¹²Krem Afrodit, *Kadınlık*, May 30, 1914: "Krem Afrodit her dürlü çilliği vesair lekeleri ne kadar eski olursa olsun izale eder. Cildi beyazlatır. Ve fevkalâde neticeler verir. Suret-i istimâli: lekelerin üzerine yatmazdan evvel Krem Afrodit sürüb sabaha kadar muhafaza etmeli ve sabahleyin ılık su ile yıkadıktan sonra biraz pudra ekmeli. İhtar: Cildi ince olanlarda Krem Afrodit'in bir aks'ül-amel intac edeceği muhtemeldir. Bu gibiler evvela iyi bir pudra istimâl etmeli ve Krem Afrodit'i ilk hafta mikdarını azaltarak ve sonra hal-i sabıkına irca ederek sürmelidirler. Kutuyu daima kapalı olarak"

However, most of these ‘politically neutral’ advertisements for women were run by non-Muslim and foreign businesses. Some of these foreign businesses seem to have been carried away by the nationalist discourse in the Empire. A curious advertisement by George Chisnell & Sons Co Ltd. [*Corc Çiznel ve Mahdumları İngiliz Kumpanyası*] promoted their establishment as the most prominent, well-known, and serious business of ‘our country’ [*Memleketimizin bu en eski, maaruf ve ciddi ticarethanesi*] and the largest provider agricultural machinery in, once again, ‘our country’ [*Memleketimizin en büyük ziraat makineleri ticarethanesi*].²¹³

No matter how distinct this period’s highly politicized advertisements might seem, there were also continuities. The large foreign stores like Stein and Tiring continued to run advertisements without major changes in their texts.²¹⁴ There were also businesses which promoted the ideas and identities of the previous age, still using the words ‘Ottoman’²¹⁵ and ‘Islam’.²¹⁶

muhafaza ediniz.”

²¹³ Corc Çiznel ve Mahdumları, *Felahat*, April 14, 1914: “*Corc Çiznel ve Mahdumları İngiliz Kumpanyası. George Chisnell & Sons Co Ltd. Memleketimizin en büyük ziraat makineleri ticarethanesi Der’âliyyede Galata’da Mahmudiye Caddesi’nde numero 142- 146. Mezkûr ticarethane meşhur Rudsak [?] Fabrikası’nın Amerikan Makkormik Fabrikası’nın İngiliz Plakston Limited Şirketi’nin, Rişard Gareth ve Mahdumları’nın, Davi Paksaman [?] ve kumpanyanın Hayvard Tayler vesair bir takım şirketlerin Memalik-i Osmaniyye Acentası olub, ziraat ve sanayiye aid her dürlü küçük büyük âlât ve edevat ve bunlara mahsus yedek parçalar satmaktadır. Memleketimizin bu en eski, maruf ve ciddi ticarethanisini bütün çiftçilerimize çiftlik sahiplere ve fen memurlarımıza bilhassa tavsiye ederiz. Ticarethanenin kataloğu meccanen gönderilir.”*

²¹⁴ Stein, *Şehbal*, December 14, 1912: “*İştayn [Stein] Şarkın En Büyük Elbise Pazarı: kışlık yeni çeşidler*”; and Stein (2), *Felahat*, April 14, 1914: “*İstanbul- Galata. Erkeklerle, kadınlara, çocuklara mahsus her dürlü elbiseler ayakkabları, çorablar, şabkalar, çamaşır takımları, yolculuk çantaları fevkalâde ehven fiyatla satıyor. Vilayattan vuku bulacak siparişler peşinen tediye edilmek şartıyla kemal-i intizam ve süratle irsal olunur. Taleb vukuundan resimli katalog meccanen gönderilir.”* See, Appendix 10.

²¹⁵ Saç İmalathanesi, *Kadınlar Dünyası*, December 20, 1913: “*İstanbul’da yegane Sunî Saç İmalathanesi: Hanımlara mahsus her boyda her renkte hazır ve ısmarlama saçlar, başlıklar. Bukleler ve arşun üzerine muhtelif renklerde file, hülâsa saça mütealîk her çeşid saç maşaları ve tuvaletler bulunmaktadır. Memleketimizde ilk defa bir Osmanlı tarafından teşebbüs edilibde böyle bir imalathane tesisindeki muvaffakiyeti görmeye şitab ediniz...”*

²¹⁶ İslam Manifatura, *Kadınlar Dünyası*, December 20, 1913: “*İslam Manifatura Ticarethanesi:*

İstikamet Kanaat Metanet.

Bosnalı Osman Bey. Şehzadebaşı'nda Şehzade Camii karşısında çarşaflık, esvablık, yünlü, lastikoton ve pazen üzerine fevkalade çeşid. Daimi sergimizin latifen ziyareti bilhassa rica olunur."

CHAPTER 4

THE YEARS OF NATIONAL STRUGGLE AND THE ROLE OF THE OFFICERS

The period between 1908 and 1922 was dominated by the new officer class of the Ottoman Empire. The events in this period created the discourse of Turkish nationalism, with an emphasis on territorial integrity, and with anti-imperialist and anti-minority tendencies. The Ottoman Empire died and was revived as the Turkish Republic in this period, a transformation which was marked by several continuities. The fear of partitioning by the Great Powers, of becoming the ruled where once they had been the rulers, and the feeling of having been betrayed by the non-Muslim communities during the occupation by the Allies were the prevailing determinants of the policies of the new republic. The military officers were the ones who took the initiative after the humiliating despair caused by the Treaty of Mudros, as they had done a decade earlier. Both Unionists and the followers of Mustafa Kemal took action with similar impulses: to save the state, the people, and their honor. Rustow links the role of the army in this period to the issue of availability, saying that the “officer corps were propelled into action because all other political forces were, at least for the moment, disqualified from offering any effective initiative.”²¹⁷ However, though they were the most important actors of the nationalist resistance, they were not alone. The period 1918-1922 was marked by efforts, plans and bargains made by diverse actors, including the Unionists, Istanbul statesmen, the Sultan, and other actors in Anatolia, aimed at preserving the Empire.

²¹⁷ Dankwart A. Rustow, “The Army and the Founding of the Turkish Republic,” *World Politics*, vol. 11, no. 4 (July 1959), p. 520.

4.1. The Armistice

The president of United States, Woodrow Wilson, delivered the speech of ‘the Fourteen Points’ to Congress on January 8, 1918. These ‘principles’ were designed to prevent the victorious states seizing further colonies, and were welcomed in the Ottoman Empire. The Ottoman statesmen believed that the Fourteen Points would bring a peace with just terms.²¹⁸ The points regarding the Ottoman Empire were aimed at securing the dominantly Turkish territories of the Ottoman state and giving an opportunity for other nationalities in the Empire to develop political autonomy. The Dardanelles would be open for ships of commerce under international guarantee. The secure feeling created by the Wilson principles opened the way for retreats.

On September 30, 1918, in the HMS *Agamemnon*, the armistice between the Allies and the Ottomans was signed. The terms of the treaty were severe, and in conflict with the Fourteen Points set out by Wilson. Alongside the opening of the Straits and allowing the Allies access to the Black Sea, the Allies could occupy the fortresses along the Dardanelles and the Bosphorus, and control the railroads. The armistice also stipulated the immediate demobilization of the Ottoman troops, except for a limited number which would be used to maintain internal order. The most important and exploitable point in the armistice gave the Allies the right to occupy any strategic point in the event of a disturbance that could be regarded as a threat to security of the Allies.

Several concessions were made during the bargaining in the *Agamemnon*. Although the Ottomans were in no position to negotiate further,²¹⁹ the only point that they could not concede was the Greek army setting foot on Ottoman lands. During the

²¹⁸ Fahri Belen, *Türk Kurtuluş Savaşı: Askeri, Siyasi ve Sosyal Yönleriyle* (Ankara: Kültür ve Turizm Bakanlığı, 1983), p. 7. Adıvar also displays the encouragement and inspiration caused by the declaration of the Wilson principles in the Ottoman lands. She mentions the establishment of an association called the Wilsonian League, which was formed in Istanbul by a number of writers, publicists and lawyers. In her words: “In the midst of blind hatred and the cry of no quarter to the defeated the only gleam of justice and common sense seemed to come from those principles”; see Halide Edib Adıvar, *The Turkish Ordeal: Being the Further Memoirs of Halide Edib* (New York: The Century Co., 1928), p. 15.

²¹⁹ The morale and the economic conditions of the Empire were at a low point, and since the Allies’ army had already disrupted the Bulgarian front and was moving on İstanbul, the Ottoman delegation did not have many choices.

negotiations, the Greeks were excluded from the Entente forces which would be stationed along the Straits and at critical posts in the Empire in accordance with the armistice.²²⁰ The allies army was moving towards the city, entering the Ottoman territories from Thrace. French and British forces landed on the Beyoğlu and Rumeli shores of the Bosphorus. On February 8, 1919, the Allies' general, Franchet d'Espèrey, entered Istanbul on a white horse and was greeted ceremonially as a conqueror. The march of the army to the capital, the "occupation" of Istanbul, and the inclusion of Greek ships created unease among the Ottomans by proving that the Allies did not intend to operate along the lines of the armistice.

Occupied Istanbul was marked by the war and its outcomes. The effects of war on the dwellers in Istanbul were clear to the visitors. The wife of a French commander assigned to Istanbul, Véra Dumesnil, portrays a city of contrasts in her memoirs. On the one hand there was a city of delights and entertainment; a city of occupation forces and Ottoman statesmen collaborating with them, attending dinner-parties and receptions in mansions in the most beautiful parts of the city. On the other hand, there was the city of immigrants,²²¹ marked with poverty and despair, roads full of the hungry, sick and homeless.²²²

While Istanbul was split between victory and despair, an international effort was initiated in order to decide the fates of the defeated states. After the armistices, the Paris Peace Conference was held in order to discuss the terms of peace between the victorious and defeated sides, a process which would create the League of Nations. A series of treaties were discussed individually concerning the defeated states. The Central Powers, who had had hopes for the Wilson Principles, were disappointed and crushed by the severe terms of the peace treaties. This series of treaties began with the Treaty of Versailles regarding the fate of Germany on 28 January 1919, and ended with the Treaty

²²⁰ The execution of these terms began immediately after the signing of the treaty. The mines in Dardanelles were swept, and German soldiers in posts along the Straits turned their positions over to the Allies' forces. The Allies' battleships, including a number of Greek ships, passed through the Straits and arrived in Istanbul.

²²¹ The refugees from Russia after the fall of the Tsarist regime were also added to the thousands on the streets of Istanbul.

²²² Véra Dumesnil, *İşgal İstanbul'u*, trans. Emre Öktem (Istanbul: İstanbul Kitaplığı Yayınları, 1993).

of Sèvres, which was the final blow to the Ottomans' hopes of recovery.²²³

Following the armistice, the wartime leaders of the CUP including the Unionist trio (Cemal, Enver and Talat), the architects of the situation, were blamed for defeat and had fled the country. They left behind them a power vacuum in Istanbul, which was to be filled by several actors, such as the Sultan, the Liberal party, the occupation forces, and the remaining Unionists.²²⁴ The flight of the Unionist leaders was regarded as treason by the state, which, supported by the occupying Entente forces, held them responsible for the massacres of Armenians and the re-locations of the Greeks. After the acknowledged defeat, the Armistice of Mudros, and finally the flight of its leaders, being a Unionist was perceived as a blemish on one's reputation, and a witchhunt for the leading members was initiated in Istanbul.²²⁵ Those blamed for participating in the massacres were brought to court martial, and sixty-two people, including army generals and statesmen, were exiled to Malta.²²⁶ The CUP had no choice but to dissolve itself.

4.2. The National Resistance

In 1909 the Young Turks had promulgated compulsory military service for all male Ottoman citizens. Zürcher asserts: "Conscription failed as an attempt to create a sense of 'Ottoman nation,' since the Ottoman army remained an army of Anatolian Muslim Turkish peasants."²²⁷ Although the motive behind this attempt had proven to be unworkable, it created a functional basis for the national resistance in Anatolia, under

²²³ According to Belen, the reasons why the treaty with the Ottomans was signed resided in disagreements between the Allies on the fate of the Ottoman state, control of the Straits and Istanbul, the possibility of a mandate rule, and the future of the Arab provinces. In addition, there were the conflicting demands of the Armenians and Kurds, the Italian and Greek scramble for Western Anatolia, and several more clashes of interests. Belen, *Türk Kurtuluş Savaşı*, pp. 20-28.

²²⁴ Zürcher, *Turkey: A Modern History*, p. 137.

²²⁵ Belen, *Türk Kurtuluş Savaşı*, p. 39.

²²⁶ *Ibid*, p. 39.

²²⁷ Erik Jan Zürcher, "The Ottoman Conscription System in Theory and Practice," in *Arming the State: Military Conscription in the Middle East and Central Asia* (London: I.B.Tauris, 1999), p. 91.

the leadership of Mustafa Kemal. In addition, after the war, although the Arab regions were lost, Anatolia remained untouched by the enemy armies. Thus a possible national resistance could only be launched in dominantly Muslim and Turkish Anatolia. However, the wars, which had lasted for years and ended with defeat, had left a poor country and an exhausted people. The army and the people were impoverished, war-weary, hopeless, and indifferent. At the time of the occupation of Izmir by the Greek Army on May 15, 1919, Anatolia was already crushed under the immense burden of the Great War.

However, the occupation led to a spark, not initially among the common people of Anatolia, but among the patriotic officers—most of them ex-Unionist—of a resurgence to save Anatolia, land of the Turks, from Greek occupation. Like the officers, the people of occupied Istanbul who could still access news from Anatolia were struck by the occupation of Izmir, and arranged meetings and demonstrations in protest. It is interesting that the occupation of Izmir caused a greater public reaction than the entrance of British and French forces into the Capital, the city of the Caliph, following the armistice of Mudros. Facing an occupation by the Greeks, the former subjects of the Empire, was worse than being crushed and defeated by the Great Powers of Europe, or even by Russia. Several accounts give the date of the occupation of Izmir as the beginning of the nationalist resistance, as opposed to the traditional date of May 19, the day Mustafa Kemal landed in Samsun.²²⁸ On the other hand, although Unionists had already set up an underground network which would be used by the national resistance, the occupation of Izmir proved to be an effective mobilization factor.

The news of atrocities by the advancing Greek army provoked the Muslim people in large Anatolian cities and in Istanbul. However, overall it is not possible to call this an uprising, since most of the Anatolian population was either unaware of the invasion, or was preoccupied with their own problems. The Greek army advanced inside Anatolia without meeting any serious military resistance. However, the news hit the nationalist circles, and created the spark they needed to carry on fighting; once again, the feelings of discontent, failure, and shame were directed to another enemy than the source of

²²⁸ Kazım Karabekir, *İstiklal Harbimizin Esasları*, ed. Faruk Özerengin (Istanbul: Timaş, 1990), p. 47: “Vaktiyle oraya müteşebbis bir arkadaşımız herhangi vaziyette gitmiş olsaydı İstiklâl Harbimizin başlangıcı bu kadar acı bir günle başlamazdı.”

these feelings: in this case, the Greeks.²²⁹ It is also important to note that Mustafa Kemal's arrival in Samsun happened four days after the occupation of Izmir. There was an uncertainty over the fate of the Ottoman State, since the plans of the Allies had changed after the Bolshevik Revolution. As Russia withdrew from its 'share', the Greeks emerged as another claimant on the Ottoman territories, driven by the desire to revive the glories of Byzantium by expanding their territories and integrating the Greek population of Anatolia.²³⁰ The Greeks attempted this adventure under the leadership of Venizelos, the prime minister. However, the Greek occupation of Western Anatolia cost Greece more than they had expected. The economic burden the occupation put on the shoulders of the young state created an opportunity for different political factions to act against Venizelos. The political conflict between Venizelists and the Royalists sapped the morale of the Greek forces in Anatolia.²³¹ The discontent of the Greek population manifested itself in the November elections, which carried the Royalists to power.²³²

Triggered by the occupation of Izmir, militias were organized under the name 'national forces' [*Kuvayi Milliye*] around associations called 'societies for the defense of rights' [*Müdaafa-i Milliye Cemiyetleri*]. According to Belen, these were established through the desires of common people, outside the control of any state apparatus.²³³ The body of the militias was constituted by gangs, deserters, and whatever remained of the

²²⁹ "For the Greeks not so long ago had been the subjects of the Ottoman Muslims: now, without having even fought in the war, and taking advantage of European Christian sympathies, they presumed to despoil and humiliate those who had been their masters only yesterday." Elie Kedourie, "The End of the Ottoman Empire 1918-19: From War to Peace," *Journal of Contemporary History*, vol. 3, no. 4 (October 1968), p. 20.

²³⁰ Kedourie, "The End of the Ottoman Empire", p. 19.

²³¹ Michael M. Finefrock, "Ataturk, Lloyd George and the Megali Idea: Cause and Consequence of the Greek Plan to Seize Constantinople from the Allies, June-August 1922," *Journal of Modern History*, vol. 52, no. 1 (March, 1980): p. D1055.

²³² However, the situation in Greece was indeed desperate: the value of the drachma fell 54 percent in the year and a half between the landing at Smyrna and the elections of November 1920, and fell another 166 percent during the ten months of Royalist rule following the Greek defeat on the banks of the Sakarya. See Finefrock, "Ataturk, Lloyd George and the Megali Idea", p. D1055.

²³³ Belen, *Türk Kurtuluş Savaşı*, pp. 42, 49. Belen calls the motivation behind the establishment of *Kuvayi Milliye* a 'national awakening' [*milli intibah*]. According to him, they were established by people with national spirit [*milli ruh*].

Ottoman army, under local bandit-leaders such as Demirci Efe and Çerkes Ethem. However, Belen includes political parties, factions, and student and charity organizations within the body of the *Kuvayi Milliye*.²³⁴ Even if they were established by the initiative of the people, by the time they became effective organizations in contact with each other, they were dominated by officers and state officials, most of them Unionists. Thus the movement had a hierarchical, top-down structure, with authority flowing from officers, via officials, men of religion and notables, to the people.²³⁵ Furthermore, these nationalist bands did not always receive the people's support. As the organization expanded, the burden of the militias fell on the shoulders of the Anatolian people, and the organization started to harass people to supply its needs.²³⁶ As a reaction to their demands, the dwellers of Konya, Niğde and Nevşehir dispatched telegraphs to Istanbul, complaining about the *Kuvayi Milliye*.²³⁷ Selek also points out the violence that the national forces employed against the common people of Anatolia.²³⁸ On the other hand, as the Greeks advanced through Western Anatolia, the network of associations and militias expanded, and similar *Müdaafa-i Milliye* associations were established in Eastern Anatolia against the Armenians.

²³⁴ Ibid, p. 43: “*Vahdet’i Milliye, Millî Ahrar, Sulh ve Selâmet gibi siyasî partîleri, fakülteleri, dernekleri, ocakları, hayır cemiyetlerini içine alan 60 kurumdan meydana gelmiş, Kuvayi Milliyeyi müşterek amaca yönetmek maksadı ile kurulmuştur. Böylece, ilk önce “Kuvayi Milliye” deyimini kullanılmıştır.*”

²³⁵ Therefore these people were not independent, free from any state apparatus, or acting through their own free will as proposed by Belen. For example, Çerkes Ethem had connections with the Special Organization [*Teşkilat-ı Mahsusa*] and its former head, Kuşçubaşı Eşref.

²³⁶ Ibid, p. 78.

²³⁷ Karabekir, *İstiklal Harbimizin Esasları*, pp. 208, 210. However, Kazım Karabekir changes his point of view two pages later while talking about the nature of the telegraph and describes it as ‘reactionary’ [*irticakâr*], the same term used for the 31st March Incident and later, all oppositional movements with religious and traditionalist discourses during the first years of Turkish Republic: “*Konya ahalisinin irticakar telgrafı.*”

²³⁸ Sabahattin Selek, *Anadolu İhtilali*, vol. 1 of *Milli Mücadele* (Istanbul: Güneş Matbaacılık, Sıralar Matbaacılık, 1963), p.104.

4.3. The Nationalists and the National Congresses

Many observers with anti-nationalist standpoints, including Turkish liberals, the pro-British Damat Ferit Pasha, and British intelligence, were convinced that the nationalist movement was “a Unionist plot.”²³⁹ The resistance movement was dominated by officers who were the former participants of the Young Turk movement; among these officers, Mustafa Kemal was the most prominent name, having been a part of the Young Turk Movement since as early as 1906.²⁴⁰

The effects of the Great War were severe everywhere. The belligerents had been expecting a short conflict; it turned out, however, to be an immense bloodbath on all sides. For four years, the Central Powers had demanded immense sacrifices from their people, sweetened by promises of victory; when the war ended with defeat, public pressure and discontent crashed down upon the shoulders of decision-makers, demanding their political retreat. The CUP was no longer welcomed in Istanbul, although it participated in the post-armistice period by ‘underground’ from Anatolia. The CUP leaders were the ones to blame for the degradation and the defeat, and had fled from the country rather than accept responsibility. The CUP was discredited, despised, and even hated in the post-armistice atmosphere; therefore the nationalist officers following Mustafa Kemal (and including him himself) would not be inclined to mention the fact that they had once been members or supporters of the Committee.²⁴¹ Hence, suspicions of association between the movement and the Committee would be a reason to discredit the movement in the eyes of the people and of possible political or social allies. Accordingly, during the congress of the nationalist movement in Sivas in the summer of 1919, the members “swore that they would not work for the revival of the

²³⁹ Erik Jan Zürcher, *The Unionist Factor: The Rôle of the Committee of Union and Progress in the Turkish Nationalist Movement 1905-1926* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1984), p. 68.

²⁴⁰ Rustow, “The Army,” p. 522.

²⁴¹ On the other hand, Mustafa Kemal had been in touch with fallen Unionists during the nationalist movement. For the telegram correspondence between Enver, Cemal and Mustafa Kemal, see Kazım Karabekir, *İstiklal Harbimizde Enver Paşa ve İttihat-Terakki Erkanı* (Istanbul, 1967).

Society of Union and Progress.”²⁴²

The perception of the nationalists by the anti-nationalist circles in Istanbul was best represented by an official message [*tezkere*] from the grand vizier, Damat Ferit Pasha, dating August 3, 1919. In his message, Damat Ferit Pasha states that: “The ones who could not reach their intention after ten years of misery they brought upon the Ottoman state have now started to bother the Anadolu region.”²⁴³ It is clear by this statement that the grand vizier identified the nationalists with the Unionists. On the other hand, nationalists had attacked Istanbul by claiming that they were the true representatives of the people, and were questioning the legitimacy of the parliament and the government.

Amid this atmosphere of mutual accusation, the people approached the nationalists with suspicion. The reasons behind this lack of trust could be found in the long war years that had deprived the people economically and emotionally. People still looked up to the Sultan and saw the Caliphate in Istanbul as their protector. People were confused and did not know who to trust. Those who had once been heroes were now declared traitors; the social balance had turned upside down. Also, the nationalists in Anatolia were suppressing, threatening and even using violence against the rural population in order to supply their organization. In addition to coercion, propaganda (as well as counter-propaganda) was another important factor which would be used both by Istanbul and the nationalists. The nationalists especially, who were receiving support from a large portion of the press,²⁴⁴ used the advantages of modernity both in utilizing technology and spreading ideas. These means introduced an idea to the common people, that of sacrificing oneself for nation and country, which was as much an invention of modern times as telegram or railways. The armistice period was the heyday of Anatolia.

²⁴² Ibid, p. 521.

²⁴³ Karabekir, *Istiklal Harbimizin Esasları*, p.116: “Osmanlı Devletini on senedenberi uğrattıkları felâketlerden hâlâ meramına eremiyenler, şimdi Anadolu kıt’asına musallat olmaya başladılar. Aynı sebepler, aynı sonuçlan doğuracağından taşrada bulunan bütün memurlar, geçirdiğimiz şu nazik ve zor zamanda. Hükümetin icraatını zorlaştıran ve bu sebeple vatanın büyük menfaatlerini ve milletin mühim hukukunu bozabilen hallerden kaçınmaları lüzumu, yüksek huzurunuzda izaha lüzum olmamakla beraber, halin icaplarına uygun hareket edilmesi ve her tarafta kanuna uyulması, icab edenlere tebliğ edilmesi için bu tezkere takdim kılındı.”

²⁴⁴ Ibid, p. 26: “The press which was used for informing the society in the beginning of the struggle, was later used as a tool to create public opinion.”

Nationalist Congresses were gathered in Erzurum and Sivas under the leadership of Mustafa Kemal. The nature of these congresses was not revolutionary, not an act of *ihtilal* coming from the people of Anatolia. In fact, Mustafa Kemal and his followers were still emphasizing their loyalty to throne and Caliphate. The Congress of Erzurum was closed with a prayer at the end of Mustafa Kemal's speech: the congress prayed for their success in protecting Islam, the throne and the Caliphate, and the congress sent a telegraph to the Sultan declaring their loyalty.²⁴⁵ In fact, the nationalist movement in Anatolia had not been initiated with the aim of declaring a republic. Most of the members of the movement were fighting for country, religion and the Sultan.²⁴⁶ The decisions of the Congress shaped the ideals and aims of the nationalist movement under the name National Pact [*Misak-ı Milli*], which was demanding national unity within the borders of the Empire as they were at the time the armistice was signed; and any possibility of a mandate was refused. Thus, it aimed to prevent further territorial losses, and to stress the unity of the people (Muslims) inside these borders, without any foreign protection or involvement in its affairs.

4.4. Discontinuities and Continuities through the Advertisements

4.4.1. Discontinuities

In March 1920, British forces formally occupied Istanbul and arrested members of the parliament who were sympathetic to the nationalists in Anatolia. This gave Mustafa Kemal the opportunity to declare the government of Istanbul as non-functioning, and to establish a new parliament, the Grand National Assembly, which claimed sovereignty over both legislative and executive matters. Mustafa Kemal and his followers established the Grand National Assembly in Ankara in April 1920. The Assembly was

²⁴⁵ Belen, *Türk Kurtuluş Savaşı*, pp. 95, 98.

²⁴⁶ Zürcher supports this view by pointing out that the medals after the Battle of Sakarya were Ottoman medals, and that the birthday of the Sultan was celebrated in Ankara throughout the national struggle; see Zürcher, "Siyaset Adamı", p. 11

established, once again, with oaths on the aim to save the House of Osman and the Caliphate from the hands of the enemy.²⁴⁷ The Grand National Assembly laid down in its new constitution that sovereignty belonged without reservation or condition to the nation, and granted political legitimacy only to parliament—which gave signs of the future abolishment of the Sultanate, whereby the Caliphate would become an honorary title, a spiritual position, devoid of any political sanction. Therefore, Ankara emerged as a center of authority from the national struggle, a change which could be traced in the prose of advertisements as a slight shift from the line of Istanbul government to the nationalist stance of Ankara parliament. As the Ankara elevated as an alternative authority in Anatolia, the advertisement increasingly adopted nationalist proeses, sometimes with direct references to national struggle.

The advertisements during the national struggle do not seem to manifest a political language as strong and apparent as the advertisements during the Balkan Wars and the Great War. The last years of the Great War were quite unproductive in terms of advertisements, an indicator of the severe war conditions. However, by the end of 1918, the frequency of advertisements seemed to return to near the pre-war conditions, perhaps even improving on it. Most of the advertisements were presented inside beautifully decorated frames²⁴⁸, some journals started to print the advertisements and other pages in color, and the employment of images became more widespread. It is important to note that most of the advertisements that were studied for this research were run in the journals and newspapers of Istanbul, which was under the Allied occupation, and might be distant from the situation in Anatolia. On the other hand, there is a possibility that since even the streets of Istanbul had been turned into garrisons for the Allies, their residence in the city center might have lightened the advertising businesses to some extent.

There were relatively more neutral advertisements in this period, including those from Muslim and Turk businesses. A certain tailor shop which was, judging from the names of the owners, Arif Zeki and Ali Kemal, a Muslim establishment, showed a shift of emphasis from ‘Muslim’ and ‘Turk’, back to stylish [*şık*] and cheap [*ucuz*]. An

²⁴⁷ Ibid, p. 171. The oath of the representatives of the assembly was: “*Hilâfet ve Saltanatın, vatan ve milletin kurtuluş ve bağımsızlığından başka amaç gütmeyeceğime and içerim.*”

²⁴⁸ See Appendix 11.

interesting aspect of this advertisement was that while the owners of the business were Muslims, the main tailor was a foreigner, which differs from the previous eras. Formerly, the foreign artisans, especially if they were as famous as was claimed in this advertisement [*şöhreti fevkalade ihraz etmiş olan*], could establish their own businesses. This advertisement might, then, manifest an effect of the Unionist policies of nationalizing the economy.²⁴⁹

4.4.2. Continuities

The national struggle initiated in Anatolia did not seem to cause radical shifts in the language and contents of the advertisements. The social revolution that was attempted by Unionists seemed to give results in the area of education, with many advertisements regarding schools and school books. There might be traces of the Greek presence in Anatolia hidden between the lines of the advertisements; however, there was never an open mention of their existence. The Greek ambitions on Anatolia might have created a need to emphasize the Turkishness of the territory. The new Turkish nationalism, which was created by the conditions of past and present wars, turned its face towards the Turkish peasants of Anatolia, rather than Central Asia, for the roots of Turkish identity. Indeed, the new state on the verge of being established would consider Anatolia as its basis, and would “found loyalty in both homeland Anatolia, and the Turkish nation which inhabited it”²⁵⁰—an idea which had already been launched by the Turkish nationalist intellectuals during the Great War.

The people of Anatolia were presented as the pure possessors of Turkish morals and ideals in a corrupted world; a mentality which would reach its apex in the Republican period. In one advertisement, a grammar book was presented as “The Book of the Anatolian Juvenile” [*Anadolu Yavrusunun Kitabı*].²⁵¹ Judging from the

²⁴⁹ Arif Zeki, *İnci*, October 1, 1919: “*Gayet şık ve Ucuza Giyinmek İsteyenlere! Arif Zeki ve Ali Kemal Ticarethanesi’nde Beyoğlu’nun en namdâr ticarethanesinde şöhreti fevkalâde ihraz etmiş olan makasdâr Mösyö Jan tarafından ısmarlama elbise imal edilmektedir. Hazır dahi bulunur. Taşradan sipariş kabul edilir.*”

²⁵⁰ David Kushner, “Self-Perception and Identity in Contemporary Turkey,” *Journal of Contemporary History*, vol. 32, no. 2 (1997), p. 222.

²⁵¹ *Anadolu Yavrusunun Kitabı*, *Işık*, November 1, 1922: “*Bu sene kurra ve*

advertisements on the issue of education, the war measures did not seem to interrupt the educational reforms and restorative efforts carried out by the Unionists. A group of schools that was probably private, *Aşiyân İdadileri*, was a frequent advertiser,²⁵² describing the qualities of education in their schools and the advantages they provide for the future of children. In one of the advertisements announcing these schools, French was said to be the obligatory foreign language, alongside optional German, English, and Italian. Parents who wanted their children to be ‘active’ [*faal*], ‘moral’ [*ahlaklı*], and to possess ‘knowledge’ [*ilm*], it said, should choose *Aşiyân* schools.²⁵³

4.4.2.1. Turkish Identity as an Element of Continuity

Bünyamin Ayhan, in his work examining the press during the national movement, points out that two political concepts were propagated in particular, namely religion and nation. According to Ayhan, these concepts were used to represent salvation and to encourage fighting, and additionally sometimes to encourage populism.²⁵⁴ In the advertisements, Turkishness seemed to surpass other identities during the national struggle, and more and more businesses added their nationality to the advertisement

merakiz mekteblerine kabul olunan Anadolu yavrusunun her kitabı ile Altun Elifba ve elifbadan sonra okunacak kıraat: Eşiyok Kütüphanesi'nde İstanbul fiyatına satılmaktadır. Taşradan sipariş kabul eder.”

²⁵² *Aşiyân İdadileri, Inci, December 1, 1919: “İstanbul’un en mükemmel terbiye ve tâlim müessesesidir. Kadıköyü’nde ve İstanbul’da şubeleri bulunan yirmi bin lira sermayeli leylî, neharî, ibtidaî, talî, zükur, inas Aşiyân İdadileri payitahtın en son ve en mükemmel terbiye ve tâlim müesseseleridir. Memleketin en kibar muhitinin çocukları Aşiyân Mektepleri’nde leyli olarak tahsil etmektedirler.”*

²⁵³ *Aşiyân (2), Büyük Mecmua, no. 16, December 1919: “Memleketimizin yegane ilm ve irfan müesseseleri Aşiyân İdadileri yirmi bin lira sermayeli (Aşiyân Şirketi) geçen sene İstanbul’da ve bu sene Kadıköyü’nde (Aşiyân İdadileri) nâmıyla iki güzide mekteb açmıştır. İbtidai, tali, leyli, nahari, zükur ve inasa mahsus olan Aşiyân İdadileri ticaret ve fenni şubelerini ihtiva eylediği gibi mecburi olan Fransızca’dan başka Almanca, İngilizce, İtalyanca lisanlarını tâlim eder. Çocuklarını hayat mücadelesinde faal, ahlâk ve ilm sahibi yetiştirmek isteyenler Aşiyân Mektepleri’ne müracaat etmelidir.”*

²⁵⁴ Ayhan, *Milli Mücadele’de Basın*, p. 158.

texts and captions.²⁵⁵

Quite a variety of businesses started to use the Turkish identity extensively in order to attract their customers. Meanwhile the themes of Islam and Ottomanism, which had still existed although in a very small number during the Balkan Wars and the Great War, were almost absent in this period. According to one advertisement, Ahmed Necati Bey, a Turkish war photographer working for the newspapers, had recently established his own studio. The advertisement mentioned that “since he employed the best finishing artist [*rötuşcu*], and pose arranger [*pozcu*] the photographs he took are excellent in a level of surpassing the ‘Beyoğlu’ photographers.” Since Beyoğlu at that time was still dominantly a location for non-Muslim and foreign businesses, this advertisement could be read as a challenge to non-Muslim photographers by a Turkish one. The advertisement continued as follows: “patronage of Turks and supporting Turkish businesses are our obligation.”²⁵⁶ The effects of Unionist projects to nationalize the economy seems to get stronger: one noteworthy point here is that although the targets of criticism in this advertisement were the non-Muslim and the foreign businesses of Beyoğlu, their opponent identifies himself on the basis of nationality rather than religion. On the other hand, there were also Muslim and Turk businesses in Beyoğlu. The Tailors’ Bazaar [*Terziler Pazarı*] was one of the most frequent advertisers in journals, especially in the women’s magazine *Pearl* [*İnci*]. One advertisement for the Tailors’ Bazaar, published in this women’s magazine, was certainly aware of its target audience: the language of the advertisement was definitely poetic—“there is a place (in Beyoğlu) where bunches of beauties are sprinkling in front of your hearts.” This place was “also [founded by a] Muslim and Turk” and “you could find anything you want and

²⁵⁵ Yeni Açılan Türk Müessesesi, *Diken*, November 6, 1919: “*Her yerden ucuz ve hepsinden halis zeytin yağı almak istiyorsanız bir defa Kutucular’da Yeni Han’da 6 numeroda Edremit Havranlı Terzizade Biraderler’in mağazasına müracaat ediniz. İştiratmeden evvel ufak bir şişe meccanen numunelik takdim edilir.*”

²⁵⁶ Ahmed Necati Fotoğrafhanesi, *Büyük Mecmua*, no.6, April 24, 1919: “*Uzun müddet gazetelerde, harb cebhelerinde fotoğrafçılık ve sinemacılık eden Necati Bey, şimdi Eminönünde (Stein) mağazası karşısında husus-i bir fotoğrafhane açmıştır. Necati Bey şehrimizin en meşhur ve en mahir rötuşcusu ile pozörünü almış olduğu için yaptığı fotoğraflar Beyoğlu fotoğrafçıları bile geride bırakacak derecede mükemmeldir. Türkler’i himaye ve Türk müesseselerine yardım da borcumuzdur. Binâenaleyh fotoğraf çıkaracak karilerimizin her yerden evvel Ahmed Necati Fotoğrafhanesi’ne uğramaları tavsiye olunur. Gazetemizin daimi kari ve abonelerine yüzde elli tenzilât yapılır.*”

more, at your service”; hence, “would you go to other places?”²⁵⁷ *Güleryüz* (Smiling face), a satirical journal, claimed to be the “one and only political satirical journal that is being published by a Turk,” and since it was the ‘reality’ it announced this “without fearing the refutation of this claim.” Regarding this claim, the advertisement introduced another fact: “thereof, it exists in every corner of Anatolia.”²⁵⁸ Being read in Anatolia, apparently, was enough to prove the Turkishness of a journal without further arguments.

4.4.2.2. National, Fatherland, Homeland: Other Indicators of Nationalism

Alongside the stress on Turkishness, other indicators of nationalism, such as ‘national’ [*milli*], ‘fatherland’ [*vatan*] and ‘homeland’ [*memleket*] seemed to become dominant reflections of identities in the advertisements.²⁵⁹ A previously mentioned mineral water brand reminded in its advertisement that consuming this “precious water of the sacred fatherland” [*aziz vatanımızın bu kıymetli suyu*] would also mean pursuing the well-being of the national economy.²⁶⁰ A tailor who was also a regular advertiser in

²⁵⁷ Terziler Pazarı, *İnci*, October 1, 1919: “*Beyoğlu’nda Cadde-i Kebir’de numero 350, Beyoğlu’nu süsleyen büyük vitrinler önünden geçerken Cadde-i Kebir’de Moskof Sefarethanesi karşısında köşe başında en müşkülpeşent ruhları tevkif eden bir yer var. Orada sizin bediâperest kalbleriniz önüne serpilen demet demet güzellikler tamamen sanatın, sır-ı tezyinin ___ ___ mahsulleridir. Türk ve Müslüman bir sermaye her aradağınızı orada fazlasıyla emirlerinize amade bulduktan sonra artık başka yerlere gider misiniz?*” See Appendix 12.

²⁵⁸ Güler Yüz, *Yeni İnci*, June 1, 1922: “*Güleryüz memleketimizde bir Türk tarafından neşr olunan yegane siyasi mizah gazetesidir. Güler yüz bu iddiasının tezkip edilmesinden korkmayarak ilan eder. İşte bunun içindir ki “Güleryüz” Anadolu’nun her tarafında dahil olmuş, ve her yerde herkesin teveccühünü kazanmıştır. Güleryüz Anadolu’nun ve memalik-i ecnebiyenin 40 merkezinde satış mahali olan yegane mecmuadır.*”

²⁵⁹ Selanik Bonmarşesi, *İnci*, May 1, 1920: “*İpekçi Kardeşler, Beyoğlu şubesi Galatasaray’ında Tokatlıyan karşısında. İstanbul’un ve Beyoğlu’nun en müzeyyen en mûtena mağazasıdır. Beyoğlu ve Şişli sakinlerinin millî müesseseden mübâyaaatta bulunmalarını temin maksadıyla Selanik Bonmarşesi pek büyük fedakârlıklar ihtiyariyle Beyoğlu’nun en zarif ve müzeyyen mağazasını muvaffak olmuştur. En son modaya muvaffak kumaş, çorab, lavanta, kundura, konfeksiyon, fotoğraf, oyuncak, ve seyahat eşyasına aid olarak ayrı ayrı vücuda getirilen dairelerde türlü ihtiyacınızı temin edebilirsiniz.*”

²⁶⁰ Kisarna (2), *Istanbul Seririyatı*, April 1923: “*Kisarna, Maden Suyu. Maden sularında hekimler aradıkları hisse-i şifaiyeleri ziyadesiyle Kisarna maden suyunda*

the previous periods, reappears in the pages of magazines during the armistice period. Just as he stressed his Turkishness in his earlier advertisements, now he showed “his gratitude to his nation” for the popular demand he was subjected to.²⁶¹

The nationalist journals did not seem to run advertisements as widely as they did during the Balkan Wars and the Great War. However, a new publication, *Monthly Youth Associations Journal*, ran an advertisement naming their objective as being “to assure that the youth of our homeland be raised as useful to the fatherland emotionally, physically, and spiritually. Therefore all the young men and fathers who love their homeland should read this journal.”²⁶² The advertisement also added that the price of the journal was only enough for its publication, thus they did not seek for profit. On the other hand, the journals which were interested in the future of the country were not the nationalist ones. A journal named Salvation [*Kurtuluş*] described itself as the art and science journal which talks about socialism.²⁶³

bulurlar. Hastalarının sıhhatini, memleketinin iktisadını, gözetmeyi vicdan borcu bilen doktorlarımız her maden suyundan evvel aziz vatanımızın bu kıymetli suyunu hatırlamalıdır.”

²⁶¹ Terzizade Osman Zeki, *İnci*, December 1, 1919: “*Terzizade Osman Zeki. Mahir sanatkarımız Osman Zeki Bey inci kadar parlak, cazib ve kıymetdâr bildiği sanaatı muhterem milletinden gördüğü rağbet ve teveccühle kazandığından bugün eser-i sanaatı inciler içinde takdim ve teşhir etmekle ihtihâr ider. Beyoğlu’nda: Paris ve Berlin terzi akademileri âzâsından Terzizâde Osman Zeki ticarehaneleri müdürü.*” It is noteworthy that in the previous years where he was introducing himself as ‘a young Turkish man’, in this advertisement he seemed more confident, mentioning that he was a member of the Paris and Berlin tailoring academies.

²⁶² Aylık Genç Dernekleri Mecmuası, *Ümid*, no.16, December, 1919: “*Aylık Genç Dernekleri Mecmuası. İşbu mecmua bilhassa memleketimiz gençlerinin ve vatana hadim birer uzv olarak yetişmelerini ve bu hususda hissien, fikren, ruhen, bedenlen neşv-u nemalarını temin maksadıyla neşr olunmaktadır. Memleketi seven her genç ve her evlad babası bu mecmuayı okumalıdır. Sırf gençlerin inkişâfına hadim olmak terbiyevi ve ictimâî mübahsi havi bulunmak şartıyla makale gönderecek zevatın makalatı matetşekkür ve ma’l iftihar neşr olunur. Senelik abone bedeli 42 guruşdur. Bu para ancak tertibine kafi gelmektedir. Gençlerin inkişâfı için her dürlü fedakârlığa katlanan müfettişliğin bu hizmetine karşı gençlere ve çocuklara mütâlaası tavsiye olunur. Abone olmak arzu idenler doğrudan doğruya süleymaniyede matbaa’i askeriye müdüriyetine müracaat etmelidir.”*

²⁶³ Kurtuluş, *Büyük Mecmua*, no. 17, December 11, 1919: “*Sosyalizmden bahs eder ilm ve sanat mecmuası. Üçüncü nüshası da intişâr etmiştir.”*

4.5. Women during the National Struggle

In Istanbul under occupation, Turkish women were probably more active in the public sphere than ever before. The extraordinary conditions of war had multiple impacts on the lives of people in every sphere. The phenomenon of war always changes social realities, norms, and perceptions, inverting the economy, social organization and roles. Under these circumstances, Turkish women were more visible after World War I than in any previous period, both in advertisements and in public. In an advertisement published in *Büyük Mecmua*, an establishment for the education of women was announced. The features of the education in question were not so very different than the classical education the daughters of high-class Ottomans had in the 19th century, in their private houses and by private tutors. The classes mentioned in this advertisement were language, music, and arts;²⁶⁴ however, now women could get this education outside their houses, together with other women, in a public sphere created for them. The involvement of women in the public space at different levels was also reflected in the advertisements. For example, one woman contributed to Turkish nationalism by writing a book on Turkish ideals.²⁶⁵

The wartime conditions did not change the situation of women overnight. The Unionist approach to women, which assumed for them the role of an important part of society, mothers of the future generations and partners in the modernization of the society, culminated under the extraordinary circumstances of war and occupation. Due to mass conscriptions and deaths and diseases during the wars, a shortage of labor force arose, especially in Anatolia. Thus, women were employed in variety of jobs in order to sustain the economic activity vital for life in the country. In addition to the women labor battalions in the army, and providing agricultural labor in Anatolia, *Kadınları*

²⁶⁴ Türk Kadını Dershanesi, *Büyük Mecmua*, no. 5, April 1919: “*Türk Kadını Dershanesi Şehzadebaşı’nda Millet Tiyatrosu arkasındaki sokakta hanımlara (lisan, musiki, kanun ve sanat) dersleri göstermeye mahsus faideli bir müessesedir. Heyet-i talimiyesi münevver ve güzide hanımlarımızdan müteşekkildir. Keman derslerini meşhur muallime kemanî Kevser Hanım vermektedir. Her gün kayıd ve kabul icra olunur.*”

²⁶⁵ Aydemir, *Büyük Mecmua*, no.5, April 1919: “*Aydemir büyük ve güzide edibemiz Müfide Ferid Hanım’ın Türklük mefkûresi üzerine yazılmış his ve heyecanlı bir eserleridir, Halk Kütüphanesi tarafından nefis bir surette tab ettirilmiştir (40) guraştır.*”

Çalıştırma Cemiyeti (Association for Employment of the Women) had been founded during the Great War in Istanbul, under the supervision of Enver Pasha. As a reflection of this need in the armistice period, an association was founded for women in July 1919 for teaching women tailoring and thus providing them with a profession with which to participate in the economic sphere.²⁶⁶ This association established ateliers for the women in Istanbul, and frequently ran advertisements to announce that families who wanted their daughters to be artisans should send them to this establishment of Islam [*İslam müessesesi*].²⁶⁷ One and a half months later, in another advertisement of the same establishment, *İslam müessesesi* was replaced by Turkish Women [*Türk Kadınları*] Tailoring School.²⁶⁸ As could be seen from the advertisements, its predecessor, *Kadınları Çalıştırma Cemiyeti*, was also active at the time.²⁶⁹

A publication called the *Journal of the Turkish Woman* [*Türk Kadını Mecmuası*] seemed to assume the role of its predecessor, the Unionist women's journal, *Kadın*. In an advertisement it emphasized its standpoint as: "Our country's [*memleketimizin*] serious [*ağır başlı*] and dignified [*vakur*] journal for the woman."²⁷⁰ Women also became a part of the advertisements through providing faces for products and services. Businesses increasingly used pictures and photographs of women in their advertisements. In an interesting example, *Şans Sigara Kağıdı* [Luck Cigarette Papers], a picture was used of a woman in modern attire, sitting on an armchair, smoking her

²⁶⁶ Zeki Sarıhan, *Kurtuluş Savaşı Kadınları* (Istanbul: Remzi Kitabevi, 2007), p. 125.

²⁶⁷ Biçki Yurdu, *Diken*, October 23, 1919: "Biçki ve Dikiş Mektebi. Her zaman kayd edilebilir. Şehrimizin en mükemmel bir İslam müessesesidir. Şimdiye kadar pek çok talebe yetiştirmiştir. kızlarını sanatkâr yetiştirmek isteyen veliler biçki ve dikiş mektebinin mevcudiyetinden istifade etmelidirler."

²⁶⁸ Biçki Yurdu (2), *İnci*, December 1, 1919: "Türk Kadınları Biçki Yurdu İstanbul'un yegane biçki ve dikiş akademisidir. Her zaman kayıd olunabilir."

²⁶⁹ Moda Salonu, *İnci*, December 1, 1919: "Moda Salonu, Kadınları Çalıştırma Cemiyet-i İslamiyesi: Beyoğlu şubesi: Beyoğlu Cadde-i Kebir. Telefon: 1090. İstanbul'un en büyük ve en kibar terzihanesi. Pay-i tahtın mahafil-i âliyyesine mensub hanımefendilerin muavenet ve nezaretiyle Avrupa'nın en son modellerine tevfi ken mantolar, tayyörler, tuvaletler, iş takımları, ve bütün kadın levazımâtı bulunur. Kuaför salonu." See, Appendix 13.

²⁷⁰ Türk Kadını Mecmuası, *Büyük Mecma*, no. 5, April 1919: "Memleketimizin ağırbaşlı ciddi, vakur bir kadın risalesidir. On beş günde bir çıkar. Tanesi 5,7 Seneliği 150 guruştur."

cigarette and reading her book.²⁷¹ It is important to note that the woman was represented reading, a sign of increasing literacy among women.

4.6. The Reflection of Wars in Advertisements

The Ottoman Empire had been in a state of war almost relentlessly since the beginning of the Balkan Wars. The extraordinary situations that were created by the constant state of war were reflected in the advertisements. The national movement was not a full-fledged war between two armies: it was a successful mobilization which included common people in its ranks. Calls for donations for the soldiers and to the veterans [*gazi*] could be seen between the advertisements. One business declared that they produced the first quality underwear to be sent to Anatolia, as gifts for the brothers who had been fighting for ‘national independence’ [*istiklal-i milli*]. Probably, the dwellers of Istanbul who wanted to send something to the soldiers could purchase this underwear and have it sent out to the troops by the business owner.²⁷² A department store was established right after the end of the World War I under the name “Market to Help Disabled Veterans” [*Malul Gazilere Muavenet Pazarı*]. The establishment addressed its customers as follows: “every individual who both wants to buy good and cheap goods and help disabled veterans who have shed their blood at the fronts” should supply their needs from this store.²⁷³ Besides the advertisements, the war was also the subject of books. Falih Rıfkı, who was assigned to Syria in World War I, collected his

²⁷¹ Şans Sigara Kağıdı, *İnci*, January 1, 1919. See Appendix 14.

²⁷² Anadolu Hediyesi, *Akşam*, September 16, 1921: “Anadolu Hediyesi. Anadolu’da istiklâl-i millî namına çarpışan kardeşlerimize İstanbul âhâlisi tarafından hediye edilecek çamaşırları en âlâ birinci ‘Mısır kaputundan’ imal edilmek şartıyla gömlek ve uçkuruyla donuyla 100 guruşa mâl etmekteyiz. Adrese dikkat ediniz: Mahmud Paşa’da Kürkçü Hanı sırasında 113 numarada Yazmacı Rıza ve Hulusi.” As transcribed in Koloğlu, *Reklamcılığımızın İlk Yüzyılı*, p. 189.

²⁷³ Malul Gaziler, *Diken*, January 1, 1919: “Malul Gazilere Muavenet Pazarı Bağcekapu Birinci Vakıf Han: Hem iyi ve ucuz mal almak ve hem de cebhelerde kanını döken malûl gazilerimize muavenet etmek isteyen her ferd bütüün levazımını (Malulin-i Guzzat Muavenet Pazar)ından tedarik etmelidir. Gömlek, çorab, iç çamaşırları, lastik, ayakkabı, müzeyyenat, itriyat, sofrâ ve çay takımları, ilah. Rekabet kabul etmez ucuzluk, metanet.” See Appendix 15.

memoirs on desert battles in a book called *Fire and Sun* [*Ateş ve Güneş*].²⁷⁴

The war was also employed in advertisements to underline the negative effects it had caused in the economic, social and intellectual life of the Ottoman Empire. A cigarette paper manufacturer announced that they were back to producing cigarette papers, which they had had to cease due to war conditions.²⁷⁵ A bookstore also voiced similar problems, but with pride: “we are exhausted from printing new books, despite the privation caused by the war.”²⁷⁶

The national movement had been initiated under the effects of World War I. The movement was constituted by several actors, but was, however, dominated by young officers. As the Istanbul government and the Sultan proved to be ineffective, the center of political authority had switched to Ankara. By the time the National Assembly came into its own,²⁷⁷ there two groups in the parliament: Kemalists and the opposition. Until the suppression of the opposition in 1925, different voices were still apparent among the members of the parliament. Kazım Karabekir and the Eastern Army’s success, in autumn 1920, in retrieving three eastern provinces [*elviye-i selase*]²⁷⁸ which had fallen under Russian rule in the 1878 war, forced the Armenians to retreat with the help of the Bolshevik occupation in Armenia. While the Eastern borders were secured, according to *Misak-i Milli*, the war against the Greeks on the Western front was still continuing.

In early 1921 and late 1922, British and French forces started to evacuate the

²⁷⁴ Ateş ve Güneş, *Büyük Mecmua*, no. 5, April 1919: “Ateş ve Güneş. Dört sene Suriye’de ve Filistin’de bulunan Falih Rıfki [Atay] Bey çölün ve çöl muharebelerinin menkıbelerini havi kitabını neşr etmiştir. Bu kitab Osmanlı harbine dair yazılan ilk eserdir. Kitabda şu parçalar var: Mukaddime, Çöle Kadar, Eski Çöl, Çöl’de Hayat, Birinci Defter, İkinci Defter, Yeni Çöl, Üçüncü Defter, İki Genç Hecinsüvar, Neferim Mehmed, Kahramanlar, Medh ve Sena. Fiyatı 30 guruştur.”

²⁷⁵ Makaslı Kağıt, *Diken*, November 6, 1919: “Müjde! Harb dolayısıyla tatile uğrayan halis İmpros Makaslı Sigara Kağıdı tekrar intişara başladı.”

²⁷⁶ Sevdî Kütüphanesi, *Büyük Mecmua*, no.5, April 1919: “İstanbul’un en faal en namuslu kütüphanesidir. Harbin mahrumiyetlerine rağmen yeni yeni kitaplar çıkarmaktan hali kalmamıştır. Ahiren neşr ettiği fihristi arayınız.”

²⁷⁷ The nationalist members of the parliament in Istanbul had passed through Anatolia to reach Ankara following the formal occupation of Istanbul. Kazım Karabekir, *İstiklal Harbimiz* (Istanbul: Merk Yayıncılık, 1988), pp. 546-47.

²⁷⁸ For Karabekir’s account of the Eastern Campaign, see Kazım Karabekir, *İstiklal Harbimiz*, pp. 847-67.

occupied cities of Anatolia. The national movement focused on the Western front and the Greek invasion. Under the command of İsmet İnönü, the first victory of the Turkish army was won against the Greeks. Despite the Greek offensive, the Turkish army won again in the battle of Sakarya. In the autumn of 1922, the national army started to recapture western provinces from Greek occupation. On September 1922, Turkish troops were in Izmir, recapturing the city after the three and a half years since the beginning of the national movement.²⁷⁹ On October 11, the Armistice of Mudanya was signed, putting an end to war and laying the foundations for further negotiations and the final settlement of the Treaty of Lausanne. On November 1922, the sultanate was abolished, and a year later Mustafa Kemal centralized power around the Republican People's Party, which would dominate Turkish politics for twenty-three years.

By the end of the national struggle, the Turkish side had suffered total losses of 9,167 dead and 31,173 wounded, which was half of the number who died from diseases in Anatolia around that period.²⁸⁰ During the national struggle, the only army that Turkish soldiers had confronted was the Greek army, and to some extent Armenians in the East. Thus, even though the period was remembered as a full-fledged war against the great powers of Europe, and romanticized as a struggle for independence, the Turkish lands were never colonized by an imperialist state. However, starting from the national anthem, all the narratives of the 'war of independence' carry anti-imperialist tones, which could be seen in the discourse of new-established Republic.

²⁷⁹ Two days later the great fire of Izmir began, which would destroy almost the entire non-Muslim district of the city.

²⁸⁰ Ayhan, *Milli Mücadele'de Basın*, p. 133.

CHAPTER 5

REFLECTIONS OF THE REPUBLIC'S IDEALS

Contrary to official historiography, the establishment of the Republic was not a radical breaking away from the Ottoman past. Most of the institutions, as well as specific mentalities, were inherited from the Ottoman Empire. The absolutist tradition and Islamic identity were replaced by a single party regime and Turkish identity. However, these were not overnight changes. The chain of events which led to this replacement had been initiated in 1908. Therefore, it would be more consistent with the facts to say that the establishment of the Republic was not a revolution, but the zenith in a process of reforms. According to Mardin, the 'Turkish Revolution' lacked the qualities of a revolution.²⁸¹ The establishment of the Republic and the overthrow of the sultanate was not caused by a 'violent' movement "buttressed by mass support," and the reformist agenda of the revolutionaries was not "paralleled by popular demands."²⁸² The social structure did not undergo a dramatic change, apart from the Sultan's house itself, and the Republican state also inherited the elites and officers of Ottoman state. On the other hand, the reforms and practices following the establishment of the Republic were marked by a more visible disengagement from the imperial past.

5.1. Authority, Reforms and Opposition

Poulton regards war as an important factor which enabled the establishment of relatively more radical reforms. He draws attention to the role of the war as "the engine of social transformation," which also accelerates the advancement of nationalism. Under

²⁸¹ See Şerif Mardin, "Ideology and Religion in the Turkish Revolution," *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, no. 2, no. 3 (July 1971), pp.197-211.

²⁸² *Ibid*, pp. 198, 199.

the severe economic conditions that were created by war, the population came to see the economic changes as beneficial.²⁸³ Also the importance of Mustafa Kemal, and his character and image was an important factor: “He was the Ghazi. Reforms introduced by him were not seen as forced under duress by the outside; they could thus be accepted with pride rather than shame.”²⁸⁴

Perhaps Poulton paints a rather optimistic picture, which may not be entirely applicable to the first years of the Republic, where the legitimacy and the practices of the Republican People’s Party and Mustafa Kemal were still in question. The 1930s, on the other hand, might provide a more secure basis for his argument, when the image of *Gazi* and the Republican People’s Party was identified with the state. On the other hand, until 1925, the opposition voices in the party were still apparent, and thus there was a relatively democratic atmosphere in the parliament.

The Republican People’s Party (RPP) had created strong basis of legitimacy. The party was dating its foundation to the Congress of Sivas in 1919, which party members regarded as their first party session.²⁸⁵ Therefore, they assumed the central role in the national struggle, alongside the army, the saviors of the Turkish people. The national movement was transformed into a political entity, the founder and ruler of the new Republic. The network of Societies for the Defense of Rights [*Müdafaa-i Hukuk Cemiyetleri*] increasingly adopted political characteristics, being active in both the last parliament of Istanbul and in the Grand National Assembly in Ankara. The Grand National Assembly was in this sense a successor of the *Müdafaa-i Hukuk* associations, and turned its members into representatives of the Assembly. Therefore, when the Party described itself in these terms, any opposition or discontent towards the new rule could be treated as disloyalty, and even treason.²⁸⁶ This claim employed against all the

²⁸³ Hugh Poulton, *Top Hat, Grey Wolf, and Crescent: Turkish Nationalism and the Turkish Republic* (London: C. Hurst & Co. Ltd., 1997), p. 89.

²⁸⁴ *Ibid*, p. 90.

²⁸⁵ Erik Jan Zürcher, “Kazım Karabekir ve İstiklal Harbimiz Kitabı,” in *Savaş, Devrim ve Uluslaşma: Türkiye Tarihinde Geçiş Dönemi (1908-1928)*, trans. Ergun Aydınoglu and Melis Behlil (Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2005), p. 12.

²⁸⁶ The similar accusatory discourse had been used to describe the counter-revolutionary attempts against the 1908 Revolution or public opposition to the nationalists during the national struggle.

oppositions starting with the Sheikh Said revolt. They were described as reactionary [*irticakâr*], and this discourse would continue into the Turkish Republic, and '*irtica*' would be used on several more occasions, and for several more ideas.

The suppression of the opposition and the evolution of political system into an authoritative single-party regime was launched after the Sheikh Said Revolt in Eastern Anatolia.²⁸⁷ This revolt presented the opportunity for the RPP to silence the opposition and put an end to the short multi-party experience. This stage of the Turkish Republic would become known as the *Takrir-i Sükûn* (Law to Maintain Public Order) period. The measures of the *Takrir-i Sükûn* would be carried by the independence tribunals.²⁸⁸

The opposition in the Assembly had broken away from the Republican People's Party and formed the Progressive Republican Party [*Terakkiperver Cumhuriyet Fırkası*] in 1924.²⁸⁹ The new party was formed by the distinguished leaders of the national struggle, such as Rauf (Orbay), Ali Fuat (Cebesoy), Refet (Bele), and Kazım (Karabekir).²⁹⁰ The severe suppression of the Kurdish Revolt and the extraordinary measures that were taken afterward should be considered as a pretext for not allowing a popular and powerful challenge to reside under the roof of the Grand National Assembly. After the surfacing of an assassination attempt against Mustafa Kemal, the

²⁸⁷ The nature of the Sheikh Said Revolt has been identified as a religious reactionary movement, in line with the presentation of it by the RPP; however, it actually carried nationalist tones under a religious guise. Mete Tunçay, *Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nde Tek Parti Yönetimi'nin Kurulması (1923-1931)* (İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları, 1999), p. 136.

²⁸⁸ The independence tribunals [*İstiklâl Mahkemeleri*] were an apparatus of the national struggle, which were used for trials of infiltrators, thieves, deserters and 'counter-revolutionaries', and those who conducting counter-propaganda against the nationalist movement. As was clear from the variety of the people who were judged and sentenced at the independence tribunals, almost all actions negatively affecting the movement could be subject to trial. In May 1923, the independence tribunals were dissolved. However, seven months later, the first independence tribunal of the Republic was established. These remainders of the extraordinary measures were effectively used against insurgents and opposition during the first years of the Republic.

²⁸⁹ Unlike the RPP, which had already declared its transition from a group in the assembly into a political entity. The program and constitution of the Party, which were revealed to the public the day of the Party's foundation, stood for political and economic liberalism and democracy. Tunçay, *Tek Parti Yönetimi*, p. 108.

²⁹⁰ Including these names, twenty-nine members of parliament would join the new party. However, none of them would enter the parliament in the next term.

former CUP members and the leaders of *Terakkiperver Cumhuriyet Fırkası* were accused having a part in this plot against.

The press enjoyed unrestricted freedom until the silencing of the opposition by *Takrir-i Sükûn* and *İstiklâl* tribunals in 1925 under the idle pretext of Sheikh Said's revolt. During the *Takrir-i Sükûn*, the press was once more subjected to censorship, and several newspapers and journals were shut down. Considering that the Istanbul press had been supporting the Progressive Republican Party,²⁹¹ and that Istanbul remained the center of a large portion of publishing activity, the censorship was a means to further silence the opposition. By the silencing possible centers of opposition, the revolt, which was regarded as 'reactionary' to reforms, gave Mustafa Kemal "the opportunity to carry out reforms at a more vigorous pace."²⁹²

These reforms, which affected the ideas and life of society found their reflections in the early republican advertisements. Turkish nationalism, modernism, Westernism, alongside with anti-imperialist tendencies, -a love and hate relationship with Europe-, in short, reaching the level of "contemporary civilizations", which meant the European nation states, were the themes of the period. Apparently, the mind and ideals of the Republican People's Party, the authority, was embraced by the advertisers.

5.2. The Level of Contemporary Civilizations

Mustafa Kemal and his followers deliberately tried to modernize and urbanize Turkish identity on the model of European nation-states (which was the level of contemporary civilizations); thus this 'newly-developed' Westernized Turkish state "could exist on a par with the nations of Europe."²⁹³ This aim was strikingly parallel to that of the CUP, and was shaped by the same desires and fears. In the light of this

²⁹¹ Tunçay, *Tek Parti Yönetimi*, p. 109, 112.

²⁹² Robert W. Olson and William F. Tucker, "The Sheikh Sait Rebellion in Turkey (1925): A Study in the Consolidation of a Developed and Uninstitutionalized Nationalism and the Rise of Incipient (Kurdish) Nationalism," *Die Welt des Islams*, vol.18, no.3 (1978), p. 204.

²⁹³ Robert F. Spencer, "Culture Process and Intellectual Current: Durkheim and Atatürk," *American Anthropologist*, vol. 60, no. 4 (August 1958), p. 640.

objective, Turkish nationalism increasingly detached itself from its Islamic history, and tried to redefine its identity on the basis of an idealized, pre-Islamic Turkish nation-culture.²⁹⁴ This plan was contradictory in the sense that since, according to Turkish nationalism, the uncorrupted and ideal Turks were represented by the people of Anatolia, to shape them into the desired Western and pre-Islamic mold would mean changing the very essence of these people. As Anatolia became the center of Turkish identity, the Turkish population in Anatolia was regarded as representative of the pure and authentic Turkish culture. Folk and folklore became a focus of interest as Anatolia became the focus of the new regime.²⁹⁵

5.2.1. Women Citizens

Another step of these reforms regarded the Turkish women. As their predecessors, Kemalists perceived the women as crucial subjects in their attempt to modernize the society. Yesim Arat defines the introduction of the citizenship in the Turkish Republic as “citizenship from above.”²⁹⁶ Citizens were taken to be passive agents, receiving the political and social rights that were granted to them without participating in the process in any way. Women were also ‘granted’ several rights after

²⁹⁴ Books from the 1890s by a French author, Leon Cahun, who used the nomadic Turks as his subjects, played a considerable role in the process of popularization of this Asiatic, pre-Islamic Turkish image among the Turkish nationalists. In a United States report on Turkey from 1924, reporter Howland Shaw also mentioned the role of Cahun and especially his book, *Introduction to the History of Asia*, in the development of the pre-Islamic stress of Turkish nationalism. G. Howland Shaw, “An Intellectualistic Interpretation of Modern Turkey (September 12, 1924),” in *The First Ten Years of the Turkish Republic Thru the Reports of American Diplomats*, ed. Rıfat N. Bali (Istanbul: Isis Press, 2009), p. 11.

²⁹⁵ Halk Bilgisi, *Irmak*, November 15, 1928: “*Halk Bilgisi Toplayıcılarına Rehber. Halk Bilgisi Derneği tarafından tertib ve neşr olunan bu kıymetli eseri halkiyat ile meşgul bütün münevverlerimize tavsiye ederiz. Erzurum şairleri ve Bayburtlu Zihni kıymetli halkiyatçılarımızdan Ziyaeddin Fahri Bey’in bu yeni eserini mutlaka okumalarını karilerimize hatırlatırız*”; and Nüzhet Bey, *Irmak*, November 15, 1928: “*Sadeddin Nüzhet [Gerçek] Bey’in Eserleri. Memleketimizin kıymetli edebiyat tarihçisi olan Sadeddin Nüzhet [Gerçek] Bey’in ‘Konya Halkiyat ve Harsiyat Halk Şairleri Karacaoğlan, Gevherî’ adlı eserlerini tavsiyeyi vazife eyleriz.*”

²⁹⁶ Yesim Arat, “On Gender and Citizenship in Turkey,” *Middle East Report* no. 198 [Gender and Citizenship in the Middle East] (January-March 1996), p. 29.

the declaration of the Republic. When the civil code replaced the religious law in 1926, women acquired equal rights in matters of divorce and inheritance, while polygamy was abolished and civil marriage became a legal requirement.²⁹⁷

The changes regarding the lives of Turkish women were not limited to legal ones. They were encouraged and expected to be more involved in social life, and the tradition of social gatherings in which women and men attended in separate rooms started to change as Mustafa Kemal and his entourage set a modern and Westernized model at ceremonies and banquets. On the other hand, this change did not immediately find a reflection in wider society. In an advertisement from a yearbook of 1924, a traditional pudding shop chain still added to the end of its advertisement that they had special rooms for ladies at their branches.²⁹⁸ Two years later, another advertisement also announced a special arrangement for women; however, this time the subject of the advertisement suggests several changes. A dance school in Istanbul, whose tutor had been at dance schools in France, Belgium, Netherlands, and Egypt announced that they had a special location for classes of women.²⁹⁹ Another interesting example was a Turkish women piano tutor who was educated in Berlin.³⁰⁰ In comparison to an earlier advertisement run by a Muslim women who was an embroidery tutor, it is striking that the only information the piano tutor provided about herself was her education and nationality. Except for these examples, the advertisements regarding women generally focused on cosmetic³⁰¹ products and services. Hairdressing salons and peruke

²⁹⁷ Ibid, p. 29.

²⁹⁸ Meşhur Hıfzı Usta, *Milli Nevsal*, 1924: “Meşhur Hıfzı Usta Halis koyun südüyle mamul gayet leziz muhallebi, tavuk göğsü, südlaç, kaymaklı ekmek kadayıfı, kaymaklı ve meyveli dondurmalar ile limonata ve envai şurublar yemek ve içmek isteyen âhâl-i meraka şayandır. Bilimum şubelerde hanımlara mahsus salonlar mevcuttur.”

²⁹⁹ Dans Akademisi, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, April 1, 1926: “Dans Akademisi Papa Dimitratos. Beyoğlu İmam Sokak. Fransa, Belçika, Flemenk ve Mısır raks akademilerinden şehadetname ve nişanlara haiz ve beynelmilel koreograf müessesesi reis-i sânisî, Fransa Akademisi mümessili. Her gün saat yirmi ikiden yirmi dörde kadar hususi dersler veriliyor. Kadınların dersi için ayrı mahal tefrik edilmiştir.” See Appendix 16.

³⁰⁰ Piyano Muallimesi, *Asar-ı Nisvan*, June 1, 1925: “Türk Piyano Muallimesi Berlin'de Konservatuvarı ve profesör (Mayerman) talebesinden Kadriye Abdülreşid Hanım talebenin nezdinde giderek son sistem usul ile piyano kullanmağı öğretir.”

³⁰¹ Fatma Tırnak Cilası, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, April 1, 1926. See, Appendix 17.

businesses were among the common advertisers.³⁰²

In short, the reforms were not limited to the abolishment of Sultanate or the replacement of religious institutions with secular ones. After the suppression of opposition, several new reforms were launched, this time regarding the transformation of society into a ‘modern’ nation at the level of ‘contemporary’ civilizations. The reforms were followed by a set of new rules on dress regulations of officials and prohibition of religious insignia. On November 25, 1925, a law was passed making wearing a hat obligatory for male citizens. In order to prevent excessive reaction, there had been no regulations on women’s attire, and the veil and headscarf were untouched.

5.2.2. Educating the Nation

Education would be the most effective instrument of the modernization of society in the process of “replacing the Ottoman Islamic state with a secular Republic.”³⁰³ The importance the new Republic attributed to education was immense.³⁰⁴ That education was the most important means was reflected in the fact that Mustafa Kemal eventually assumed the role of the teacher of the entire nation [*başöğretmen*], and after the transition to the Latin script would personally visit public places to promote the new alphabet.

The duality in the educational institutions which had existed since the

³⁰² Yeni Şark, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, May 1, 1926: “*Yeni Şark Tuvalet ve Perukar Salonu. Müesseseleri: İsmail ve Ahmed Beyler. Eminönü Köprübaşı numero 10. Kuaför, gelin işleri, son moda saç kesme, naturel saç imalatı, sıcak maşa, manikür, muhtelif renk saç boyası mütehasıs Mösyö İlya ve Matmazel Defni Kezaklı [?] tarafından sıhî bir suretde ve fevkalade mükemmelliyetle yapılır*”; and Henri Kasar, *Asar-ı Nisvan*, June 1, 1925: “*Hanımlara mahsus perukar Hanri Kasar [?]. Beyoğlu’nda Cadde-i Kebir’de 242 numarada saçlar imali, kuaför, manikür, ve postiş. Telefon Beyoğlu 317.*”

³⁰³ M.T. Özelli, “The Evolution of the Formal Educational System and Its Relation to Economic Growth Policies in the First Turkish Republic,” *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, vol. 5, no. 1 (January 1974), p. 78.

³⁰⁴ The educational objectives of the Turkish nation were also formulated by Ziya Gökalp, and were summarized in four points. First, education must be national; second, it must be in accordance with the Turkish culture; third, its major aim must be to develop idealists, who would also be nationalists; and finally, the education must teach unselfishness, patriotism and self-sacrifice. Özelli, “Formal Educational System,” p. 80.

establishment of the first modern school in the Ottoman Empire came to an end with the Law of Unification of Education on 3 March 1924, by which the medreses and other religious schools were abolished and the funds of *Vakıfs* for educational purposes were taken over by the Ministry of Education.³⁰⁵ Under the rule of the Sultan the religious communities had been taking care of their own educational affairs under the control and support of the community *vakıfs*. In the Republican Period, as they fell under the control of the central authority, these schools started to Turkify their curriculum according to the dictates of the Ministry of Education.³⁰⁶

The creation of a generation with national consciousness called for a re-formulation of Turkish history in the light of nationalist principles. This need would be fulfilled by the ‘Turkish History Thesis’, which was introduced by and immediately recognized after the first Turkish history congress. The thesis presented a Turkish identity, free from Islamic and Ottoman heritage; a model offering new morals, values and ideals for the nation. However, the claims of the Thesis were not limited to a glorified past: it declared that the Turks were descendants of the founders all the great civilizations, and therefore at the same time that almost all the relevant nations were derived from Turkish ancestors. Beneath this claim lay an old and deep-rooted grievance against European-originated racial theories which classified Turks as an inferior race. Thus the History Thesis exposes an under-recognized side of Turkish nationalism, which made its identity claims in terms of race. The History Thesis would be followed by the Sun Language theory, which suggested that many languages in fact originated from ancient Turkish. For the following two decades, a large portion of Turkish intellectual life was focused on promoting these theses. This ‘intellectual investment’ excluded Islam, and prepared the basis for Westernization attempts “by ‘proving’ that Western civilization was after all, Turkish.”³⁰⁷

It is important to note that, in comparison to the intellectual atmosphere that was created after the 1908 Revolution, was not visible in early Republican advertisements. Except few aforementioned books, the variety of reading materials that were advertised

³⁰⁵ Ibid, p. 79.

³⁰⁶ Rıfat N. Bali, “The Politics of Turkification during the Single Party Period,” in *Turkey Beyond Nationalism: Towards Post-Nationalist Identities*, ed. Hans-Lukas Kieser (London: I.B.Tauris, 2006), p. 46.

³⁰⁷ Özel, “Formal Educational System,” p. 81.

was far behind the post-Young Turk Revolution.

5.2.2.1. The Issue of War Orphans

The fresh memory of war was present in the advertisements. An orphanage for the children of the soldiers who had died in the wars was a constant advertiser in the magazine *Çağlayan*. This establishment, Karesi Orphanage for Children of Martyrs [*Karesi Şehid Çocukları Yuvası*], did not only provide shelter for the children, but also taught them craftsmanship and created a business which provided money for itself. A large variety of goods produced by these children were advertised in the magazine, with a photograph of the children working in one of the ateliers.³⁰⁸ Apparently, this establishment had a sales office of its own, since in another advertisement a book written by one Ruhi Naci and donated to this establishment was being sold in this office.³⁰⁹ On the other hand, selling various goods was not the only means of raising money. In a different advertisement, an establishment announced the staging of four plays written by its director; charitable people “who wanted to help the infants of martyrs and at the same time have an entertaining night,” were invited to attend this event.³¹⁰ (Although the names of the plays—*İftira*], *The Carefree* and

³⁰⁸ Karesi Şehid Çocukları Yuvası, *Çağlayan*, January 1, 1926: “*Duvar Takvimi. Üç senedir halkımızın teberruatıyla yaşayan (Karesi Şehid Çocukları Yuvası) Matbaasında: (davetiyeler, kartlar, senedat, müsvedda, tebyizlik, makbuzlar, el ilanları, etiket, bilet vesaire) tab olunur. Çorabhanesinde: (çorab, fanila, son moda yelekler, ceketler, bluz, kostüm, tayyör, zenne şalları, trikotaja aid bilimum şeyler) imal olunur. Sepethanesi: (muhtelif sepetler, bavullar, kağıd sepetleri, sandık, koltuk, kanepeler, masa gibi mobilyalar) yapılıdır. Hiç bir müessesese yuva imalathaneleriyle rekabet edemez. Nefaset, Ucuzluk.*” See Appendix 18.

³⁰⁹ Hatıra, *Çağlayan*, October 20, 1925: “*Ruhi Naci Bey’in neşr ve Şehid Çocukları Yuvası’na hediye ettiği küçük bir eser-i edebidir. Şehid Çocukları Yuvası satış mağazasında satılmaktadır.*”

³¹⁰ Yuvanın Müsameresi, *Çağlayan*, March 15, 1926: “*Yuvanın Müsameresi. Martın on dokuzunda cuma günü akşamı mahfet-i askerîde. Karesi Şehid Çocukları Yuvası müdür-i muhteremin sırf mektebliler için yazdığı ve bir heyet-i edebiyenin takdirlerle tasvib ettiği:*

İftira
Gamsızla derdli
Korku
Eden Bulur

Aggrieved [*Gamsızla Dertli*], The Fear [*Korku*], and What You Reap Is What You Sow [*Eden Bulur*—sounded neither like a night of entertainment nor suitable plays for children.) Anyhow, the case of *Karesi Şehid Çocukları Yuvası* could be perceived as a continuation or an effect of the social mobilization initiated during the national struggle, or, with respect to its high publicity and its means of raising money, an adaptation of Western forms of ‘charity organizations’, which had been established by foreign women for the immigrants that filled the streets during the occupation Istanbul.

5.2.3. Modern Transportation Means

Modern transportation was another theme in the advertisements. There were a large number of automobile advertisements in the early years of the Republican period.³¹¹ Alongside automobiles, trucks and motorcycles were also advertised.³¹² Airplanes were also the subject of advertisements, not as for sale but as a part of life in changing society. In a movie magazine, a new film was advertised which was about world tour with an airplane. The movie was announced as contemporary, scientific and adventurous.³¹³

Namındaki eserler memleketimizde ilk defa temsil edilecektir. Hem şehid kuzularına yardım etmek hem çok eğlenceli bir gece geçirmek fırsatını kaçırmamasını karilerimizden rica ederiz.”

³¹¹ Milli Oto, *Ankara’da Dellal*, April 1925: “*Milli Oto, Sitroyen [Citroen] Türkiye’nin en mühim otomobil teşkilâtı. Yevmi imalat 500 otomobil. Taleb üzerine katalog gönderilir. Adres: Dersaadet, Şişli’de Milli Oto.*”

³¹² Pejo, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, April 1, 1926: “*Dünyanın en kadim metanet ve zarafeti ile maruf bisiklet, motosiklet, motorlu bisiklet, tenezzüh, yarış hafif sıklet otomobilleri kamyonet ve kamyonlar müthassis Pejo [Peugot] otomobil, motosiklet, bisiklet, anonim şirketinin Türkiye vekil-i umum ve acentesi. Sin. Vav. Altıparmak Biraderler Otomobil Levazım Ticarethanesi. Dersaadet, Beyoğlu, Taksim. Fransız Hastahanesi ittisalinde numero 2. Telefon ticarethane: Beyoğlu 432. İmalâthane: Garaj: Pejo Feriköy 264 Telgraf Adresi: Beyoğlu Altıparmak Biraderler Anonim Şirketi’nin 100.000.000 Frank sermayesi olub, 10 imalâthanesi, 12 şubesi ve 3000 acentesi vardır. Pejo, teminat ve iktisadın temsilidir.”*

³¹³ *Tayyare, Le Film*, November 7, 1926: “*Tayyare ile devr-i alem. İctimaî, asrî, terakkiyat-ı fenniye müsavver seyyah-ı macera ve sergüzeşt filmi”*

5.3. Nationalism

After the declaration of the Republic, citizens were needed for this newly-established nation-state. The people of Anatolia, who were supposed to be the bulk of the new Turkish nation, were far from ready to comprise this desired nation. Re-invention and re-definition of identity was necessary to create the needed homogeneous nation for the new state.

‘Social engineering’, in this era of nationalisms, is a term referring to this ‘project’ of enforcing the necessary measures to trim the undesirable identities (religious, ethnic or communal), and replace or mold them into the desirable boundaries of the official identity. When a modern state assumes the role of social engineer, the ‘tools’ of state, legislation and enforcement are made to serve this process. However, the exercise of these measures carried the aspect of coercion which was accompanied by violence.

The process of social engineering had been already initiated during the Young Turk period. The forced migrations of Greeks and the Armenian massacres were a part of creating a society more suitable for the desired nation, in the light of a Turkish nationalist project. The implementation of CUP policies would form the basis of, and would be carried further in, the Republican Period.

In an atmosphere of nationalism, Turkishness was the main theme in the advertisements.³¹⁴ For example, while a business declared that they were the only Turkish business in the Galata district³¹⁵, a wall paper business³¹⁶ also declared that it was the only Turkish business in this sector. There were also indirect indicators of

³¹⁴ Abdullah Efendi Lokantası, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*: March 1, 1926: “*Birinci derecede Türk lokantası.*” See, Appendix 19.

³¹⁵ Altun Hilal, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, April 1, 1926: “*Galata’da Yegane Türk Mağazası. Altun Hilâl Gümürlüzâde Sadık. Her nevi lüks otomobiller için, "mobil ovil" ve "sekoni" yağlarıyla motor bot, dinamo, traktör, değirmen, ve hızar fabrikaları için her cins makine yağları mevcut olub benzin, gaz, mazot, motorin, gres, valvalin, vazelin, katran, zift, ve silindir yağları bulunur. Fiyatlar rekabet kabul etmeyecek derecededir. Taşra siparişatı kabul ve kemal-i sür'atle icra olunur. Adres: Galata Karaköy Fremenciler 151 numero.*”

³¹⁶ Duvar Kağıdlayıcısı, *Asar-ı Nisvan*, June 1, 1925: “*Yegane Türk Duvar Kağıdlayıcısı. Her nevi kağıd muşammalarla duvarları kağıdlamak odalara linolyum döşemek ve yağlı boya işleri kabul eder. Tecrübedide Usta Abdulrahman Cağaloğlu’nda Kemerli Sokakta 2 numaralı hanede.*”

Turkish identity, like a business which adopted the name *Turan*.³¹⁷

Mustafa Kemal's perception of nationalism seems to have been quite pragmatic at first. Initially, he adopted a "territorial" form of nationalism which was apparently formed inside the boundaries of Anatolia. The discourse of 'natural frontiers' was adopted; however, the natural borders were also those which were "militarily defensible".³¹⁸ Therefore the pan-Islamist and pan-Turkist themes were not credited in the first years of the Republic.

However, the practice was very different than the statement of the idea. Even though Turkish nationalism and the nation were defined around the idea of a fatherland [*vatan*], the citizens inside those defined boundaries were not treated equally by the state. Despite the secular, even anti-religious stance by the Kemalists, religion, and thus Islam, was the main component of the national identity. This approach manifested itself in the mass population exchange between the Republic and Greece, in which religion was the main criterion for both sides in deciding who belongs under which flag.

The Treaty of Lausanne had already defined the minorities in Turkey in terms of religious affiliation. On the other hand, during the Republican Period there would be no further attempts to win over the non-Muslim groups, since they were regarded as not suitable for becoming Turks. The reasons behind this attitude could be dated to the traumas of Balkan Wars, the Great War, and the national struggle against the Greeks and Armenians. The position and alliances of these groups in the past few decades was engraved into the memories of Turks, and the non-Muslim minorities would always be treated with suspicion and their 'ungratefulness' and 'treason' would always be held against them, and the victorious cheers of the non-Muslim communities as the Allies occupied Izmir and Istanbul, would be constantly recalled on every occasion. Therefore, when the population exchange had taken place, the Turkish-speaking Christians were also included in the process, except for the dwellers of Istanbul and the Islands, who were protected by the Treaty of Lausanne.

In short, the Turkish official nationalism in the Republic carried its own contradictions. While the inclusive feature of the definition of nation was stressed by the

³¹⁷ Kırk Ağac: Ucuzluk Meşheri, *Yıldız*, August 1, 1925: "*Kırkağaç'da Resimli Gazete ve Yıldız'ın satış mahali olan yeni Turan Ticarethanesi muhterem müşterilerine ucuzluk eşya sergisi açmıştır. Mallarının nefaset ve ucuzluğu meşhur olan işbu mağazaya koşunuz.*"

³¹⁸ Poulton, *Top Hat, Grey Wolf, and Crescent*, p. 93.

territorial aspect, the religious and—while facing the Kurdish insurrections—the ethnic aspects came to the fore. Therefore, as the definition excluded the ‘suitable’ elements outside the defined territory, Christians inside that very same territory would also be rejected. The contradictions lay in the issue of ‘engineering of the nation’, which entailed assimilation of certain elements. Ziya Gökalp, as the ideologue of official Turkish nationalism, recognized non-Turkish Muslims as suitable for Turkification. On the other hand, both Mustafa Kemal and Gökalp saw non-Muslims, especially Christians, as unsuitable for becoming Turks. For these reasons, the image of the non-Muslims would remain as ‘infidel’ in the collective memories, and would be constantly refreshed by accusations and questioning of their loyalty, and the duality between citizenship by law, and being a ‘member’ of the nation as a social entity would be institutionalized.

5.4. Islam and National Identity

5.4.1. The Downscaling of Islam

A common challenge to the authority of the Young Turks and the Kemalists was the role of religion and religious posts in both the social and the political realm. Young Turks had already established secular institutions which existed alongside religious institutions. As traditional centers of authority, they were also possible centers of opposition.

Islam and its institutions were not only possible centers of political opposition, but also obstacles on the road to contemporary civilizations. In the light of this assumption, several reforms were launched ranging from closing of convents and dervish lodges to unification of schools under the Ministry of Education and to replacement of the lunar calendar and clock with the Gregorian calendar and clock. These changes aimed to exclude Islam as a possible source of opposition in the Republic—and, at the same time, to be able to Westernize and modernize without the restrictions of religion. The introduction of reforms one after another created discontent among the population.

However, the already present Law to Maintain Order and the Independence Tribunals were sufficient to suppress any protest immediately.

5.4.2. Islam and National Identity in Advertisements

Islam was no longer the religion of the state, and no longer basis of interaction in society. The main role for it remained as an important criterion in the definition of the members of the nation. Even though Islam was overthrown from its high position in political and social interaction, it continued to remain an important affiliation of identity. Islam was an important part of the national struggle, therefore, advertisements were still employing the term ‘Islam’ or attributions of the religion, although these were not as widespread as references to Turkish identity. A cigarette paper and stationery business proudly announced that it was a fifty-year-old Muslim business [*elli senelik müessese-i İslamiye*].³¹⁹ This establishment also produced a special cigarette paper in the memory of the victory [*hatıra-ı zafer sigara kağıdı*]. This shows that a business which proudly identified itself as Muslim could embrace a victory which was regarded as national. A store selling imported shoes also mentioned that it was a Muslim business; however, it did not announce this, it only referred to it.³²⁰ Another business, a restaurant, was named ‘crescent’ [*hilal*], which might be an example of silent manifestation of their identity.³²¹ On the other hand, since none of the businesses which

³¹⁹ Sigara Kağıdı, *Milli Nevsal*, 1924: “*Talu Sigara Kağıdı ve Hatıra-ı Zafer Sigara Kağıdı. Umumi deposu: İstanbul Çiçek Pazar. Her ikisi de aynı cinsden mamûl, incelik ve nefaset itibariyle katiyyen emsalsiz olduğundan bilimum sigara kağıdlarına şayan-ı tercihlerdir. Hacı Abbas Kehnmevni [?] kağıd ve kırtasiye ticarethanesi. Elli senelik müessese-i İslamiyye’dir. Bilimum kağıd ve kırtasiye çeşidleri toptan fûruht olunduğu gibi her yerden siparişat dahi kabul edilir.*”

³²⁰ Lastik Deposu, *Milli Nevsal*, 1924: “*Şarkın büyük lastik deposu. Ayakkabı mağazası toptan ve perakende. Lastikçi Hiseyin Şükrü ve Şürekâsı... Rus, İsveç, İngiliz, Fransız Amerika ve Viyana Lastik fabrikalarının en metin ve en zarif cinsleri, meşhur-u âlem İngiliz muşammâları her keseye elverişli gayet zarif ve dayanaklı yerli mamulâtı, potinler Mantol [?] ve Vaspur [?] ayakkabları ve topları tenis için lastikli keten iskarpin, raket ve topları, bir müessese-i İslamiye olan şirketimizin mamulâtı ve malların derece-i nefaset ve metaneti kıymetli muhterem müşterilerimizce musaddıktır. En müşkülpeşend ve en zevk-i selim erbab-ı zevatı memnun etmek ahas-ı emelimizdir. Ciddiyet ve istikâmet şiarımızdır.*”

³²¹ Hilal Lokantası, *Çağlayan*, October 20, 1925: “*Yeşilli Caddesinde Hilal*

stressed their Muslim identities mentioned their national or ethnic origins, one cannot make assumptions about the attitude of non-Turkish Muslim businesses in relation to Turkish nationalism. Also one might think that “Muslim” was used interchangeably with “Turkish”, since the nation was imagined along the boundaries of Islam.

Unlike the non-Turkish Muslim businesses, detecting the advertisements of the non-Muslim businesses is relatively easier—since, in the 1920s, business owners still usually provided their names in their advertisements. Therefore, the attitude of non-Muslim businesses towards the growing nationalist official stance and its reflection in the advertisements seems easier to identify. These advertisements did not make any references to identity: the only indicators of identity were the names of the owners themselves (Moris, Vahram).³²² It is noteworthy that most of the ‘neutral’ advertisements in this period were run by the non-Muslim business owners.³²³ On the other hand, there were also neutral advertisements ran by Muslims.³²⁴

Lokantası: Yeniden (paça) yapmaya başlamıştır. Bundan başka her gün isgara pirzola ve köfteler bulundurulacaktır. Diğer nefis yemeklerde halis tereyağı kullanılmaktadır.”

³²² Moris, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, May 1, 1926: “*Moris Faracı* [?] “*Tarih-i Tesis: 1310. Diş tabiblerine mahsus alet ve edevat itriyat ziyet ve lüks eşya deposu. Meşhur Kolinoz* [?] *diş macunu deposu. En namdâr Avrupa fabrikalarının hakiki müstehzaratı ancak Moris Faracı ticarethanesinde bulmak mümkündür. İstikameti sattığı malların mükemmelliyeti ile ciddi bir şöhrete mazhar olan Moris Faracı Ticarethanesi memleketimizin tavsiyeye-i şayan-ı yegan itriyat müessesedir*”; and Her Nev’i Saz Tamirâtı, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, January 15, 1927: “*Tamire muhtac öyle sazlar bulunurki eğer bir mütehasısınun elinden çıkmazsa bütün kıymetini gayb ider. Bunun için saz meraklıları her önüne gelene itimad etmemelidirler, eğer sazınıza eskisinden fazla bir kıymet bahş etmek isterseniz bamahal: Şehzadebaşı’nda 133 numarolu Vahram Efendi’nin mağazasına müracaat ediniz. İşbu mağazda mücedded ud ve keman ehven fiyatla tedarik edebilirsiniz. İhtiyacı olanların mezkûr mağazayı ziyaretleri menfaatleri iktizasındandır. Bir kere tecrübe ediniz.*”

³²³ Umumi Gözlük Fabrikası, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, May 1, 1926: “*Maher Münaşa* [?] *Her nevi fenni gözlük taşları ve gözlüklere aid teferruât tabib reçeteleri dikkatle tedkik edilir. Fiyatları gayet ehvendir. Toptan ve perakende imalâthane: İstanbul Şamlı Han Numero: 8-9 Satış Mahali: İstanbul Yeni Cami’de Eski Postahane karşısında numero 17.*”

³²⁴ Şark Lokantası, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, March 1, 1926: “*Şark Lokantası ve Südhanehanesi. Müdürü: Mehmed Nuri. Beyoğlu’nun en kibar ve en temiz aile lokantasıdır, yemeklerin nefaseti hizmetin mükemmelliyeti ve sahibinin fevkalâde nezaketi dolayısıyla bilhassa tavsiye olunur. Öğle ve akşam yemeklerini temiz bir muhitde yemek isteyen aileler için Beyoğlu’nun yegane lokantasıdır.*”

5.5. The National Economy

5.5.1. The Izmir Economy Congress

In 1923, before the declaration of the Republic, a congress on the economy was convened in Izmir in order to discuss the issues of the independent national economy that was supposed to follow political independence.³²⁵ The head of the congress was Kazim Karabekir, who had written the decisions, principles and events of the event.³²⁶ In the congress, the ‘economic struggle’ [*iktisadi mücadele*] was regarded as *cihad*—in fact, Yusuf Akçura, who was also a participant in the congress, named the economic struggle as the ‘great jihad’, [*cihad-ı ekber*] and the armed struggle so far as the ‘small jihad’ [*cihad-ı asgar*].³²⁷ The attempt to create a national economy was an important step in the creation of nation states. Attempts to achieve the national economy had already started with the policies of the Young Turks especially during World War I. However, one should examine the aims of this attempt carefully. This aim did not always include the creation of a national economy on the grounds of becoming independent from other states; in the Turkish case, it also aimed to create a suitable

³²⁵ The choice of location is important here. Izmir was a great commercial center; however the economic activity there was dominated by the non-Muslim communities in the city. Muslim neighborhoods was scattered to the periphery of the city, and mainly provided labor. After the population exchange and the great fire of Izmir, the city was re-organized as the economic center of the new homogeneous nation-state, with an attempt to strip it of its multi-cultural and multi-religious past. It is apparent that both the leaders of the national struggle and the Kemalists attributed great importance to capturing the city, first from the hands of the Greek army, then from the economic control of non-Muslim communities. As mentioned in the previous chapter, the occupation of the city was sufficient to start the national struggle. In his memoirs, while talking about the Greek occupation in Izmir, Kazim Karabekir refers the city as: “the heart of our national economy, our beloved Izmir” [*milli iktisadımızın can evi, sevgili İzmir’imiz*] in Karabekir, *İstiklal Harbimizin Esasları*, p. 46.

³²⁶ See Kazım Karabekir, *Hatıra ve Zabıtlarıyla 1923 İzmir İktisat Kongresi: İktisat Esaslarımız*, ed. Orhan Hülügü and Ömer Hakan Özalp (Istanbul: Emre Yayınları, 2001).

³²⁷ *Ibid*, p. 14.

atmosphere for wealth and property to change hands from non-Muslim citizens to Muslim-citizens. The intensification and climax of this attempt would manifest itself in the policies of RPP in the 1930s and especially in the 1940s. The economic congress of Izmir had decided on twelve principles in order to pursue this great and deserved jihad. The principles in general addressed the masses as the “people of Turkey” [*Türk Halkı*]; except for in a few principles, the term ‘Turk’ was used, and there were occasional references to ‘the religion of the Turks’.³²⁸ The reflection of these principles could be traced in the advertisements.

Initially, in the first six years of the Republic the economic policy of the state could be regarded as liberal, which supported private entrepreneurship. The following periods would be increasingly protectionist and interventionist, which would lead to statism. In the Izmir Economy Congress, the tenth principle presented the liberal outlook of the state: “The Turk likes to work freely and with pride, he does not like monopoly.”³²⁹ Principle nine, which was on foreign investment, reflected a similar stance: “[the Turk] is not against foreign investment. However, he does not engage with establishments which do not reconcile with his language and law in his country.”³³⁰

In the fourth principle, the importance of frugality and hard work was declared.³³¹ This mentality was visible in the advertisements from the first years of the Republic, which included statements regarding the importance of economic consciousness and frugality. In an advertisement of a dye manufacturing plant, the importance granted to saving was manifested in a sentence: “the secret of good life is only in saving” [*İyi yaşamının sırrı ancak iktisaddadır*].³³² Instead of spending money for new clothes, a

³²⁸ Ibid, pp. 31-33.

³²⁹ Ibid, p. 33: “*Türk açık alın ile serbestçe çalışmayı sever, işlerde inhisar sevmez.*”

³³⁰ Ibid, p. 33: “[*Türk*] *ecnebi sermayesine aleyhtar değildir. Ancak kendi yurdunda lisanına ve kanununa uymayan müesseselerle münasebette bulunmaz.*”

³³¹ Ibid, pp. 31-32: “*Türkiye halkı, sarfettiği eşyayı mümkün merteye kendi yetiştirir. Çok çalışır; vakitte, servette ve ithalatta israftan kaçır. Milli istihsali temin için icabında geceli gündüzlü çalışmak şiarıdır.*”

³³² Boya Fabrikası, *Asri Türkiye Mecmuası*, January 15, 1927: “*Fatih ister [?] boya fabrikası müessese-i müdürü kimyager Akif Latif. Merkezi Fatih tramvay istasyonunda. Telefon İstanbul 3269. İyi yaşamının sırrı ancak iktisaddadır. Her cins kumaşlar boyanır ve ve elbiselerdeki muannid lekeler fennî bir surette çıkarılır.*” See, Appendix 20.

consumer should consult this establishment, which was dying fabrics and removing stains from clothes, thus recovering them.

5.5.2. Ankara as the ‘Heart’ of the New Economy

Unlike the multi-national, multi-religious Ottoman Empire, the Turkish Republic was remarkably homogeneous. According to the Treaty of Lausanne, the Greeks of Istanbul were exempted from the population exchange; there was also a considerable Jewish and Armenian population in Istanbul. Therefore the former capital city was still a symbol of the *ancien régime* with its cosmopolitan nature. The public offices of Ankara were also dominated by Muslims, since a regulation of 18th March stated that being a “Turk” was the first requirement to work in state services.

On the other hand, the new capital, the heart of the national struggle and the symbol of the new regime, was almost one hundred percent Turkish and Muslim. Even though the location of political authority had been changed, Istanbul was still the heart of economic activity and the contribution of the non-Muslims was still profound in comparison to their small numbers in the new Republic. Therefore, it was desired that Ankara should arise as the new center of the economy of the new state, and with a new Turkish bourgeoisie.³³³ The development of Ankara from an Anatolian town to the capital city was visible in the advertisements. Commercial businesses, companies providing infrastructure, banks and insurance agencies filled the pages of Ankara magazines.

A new established hotel, according to its advertisements worthy of “the center of our government, our new and beautiful Ankara” [*hükümet merkezimiz, yeni ve güzel Ankara’muz*], visualized the luxury and the high standards in its advertisement. This

³³³ One of the advertisements spoke out about the economic ‘rivalry between’ Istanbul and Ankara. A business from Ankara declared that even Istanbul could compete with their employees: “*Memişzade Mehmed Emin. Kereste, doğrama, mobilya fabrikası: Akköprü Caddesi. Telefon: 1833: “Fabrikamız, kırk senelik bir maziye malikdir. Türkiye'nin en eski fabrikasıdır. Çatacak ormanlarının meşhur keresteleri Çatacak’da ki fabrikamızda imal edilir. Ankara’da toptan aynı fiyata satılır. Ankara’nın havasının kuruluşunu düşünerek daima bir iki sene güneşde kalmış kerestelerimizi buraya sevk etmiştir. Müşterilerimizin menfaatini de düşünüyoruz. Doğrama ve mobilya işçilerimiz, İstanbul’un bile güçlkle rekabet edeceği Türk ve Avrupalı fen ve sanat adamlarıdır”*; in *Çankaya*, May 1, 1928.

hotel had an advantage that the hotels in Istanbul did not have at that moment, being hosts for the guests of the president. In fact, the advertisement also announced that the King and Queen of Afghanistan would reside in this very hotel, which was “like a small perfect country with its bath, restaurants, and dancing bar,” as the guests of the president.³³⁴ As Ankara became the city of government, its dwellers also diversified to a great extent. New businesses had to be established in order to supply the needs of the new inhabitants. A carpentry atelier addressed the residents of Ankara, announcing that the most elegant houses of Ankara were furnished by the tasteful artistry of their business.³³⁵ The Ankara electricity and gas company was also among the advertisers. They announced they provided the necessary infrastructure for “the most modern needs of Ankara,” which were electricity and gas in the light of “latest inventions of the science.”³³⁶

5.5.3. Foreign Products

Promoting national products against the foreign could be also observed in the

³³⁴ Ankara Palas, Çankaya, May 1, 1928: “Ankarada İstasyon Caddesi’nde Büyük Millet Mahallesi karşısında: Ankara Palas Oteli. Hükümet merkezimizin, yeni ve güzel Ankaramız’ın en güzel caddesinde, Büyük Millet Mahallesi karşısında bütün tertibatı, hizmetleri Avrupa’nın en yüksek otelleri derecesinde yegane oteldir. Büyük reis-i cumhurumuzun Ankaramız’da misafirleri bulduğça, Afgan Kralı ve Kraliçe Hazretleri’nin Büyük Ankara Palas Oteli’ndeki hususi dairede ikamet buyuracakları otelin ihtişamı hakkında çok güzel bir fikir verebilir. Hususi ve muhteşem daireler, apartmanlar, salon, mükemmel orkestra, Türk ve Avrupa lokantaları, banyo, dansing bar, otel küçük, mükemmel bir memleket gibidir. Telgrafla malumat vermek kafidir.” See Appendix 21.

³³⁵ Müfid, Çankaya, May 1, 1928: “Evinizde zevkin inceliğinin hakim olmasını istiyorsanız (Müfid)e müracaat ediniz. Taş Han altında. Ankaramız’ın en şık evlerini, müesseselerini, sanatın en ince zevkiyle tefriş etmiştir. Müfid Mobilya Ticarethanesi ticaretle zevkin sanatın inceliğini birbirine kaynaştırmış yegane müessesedir.”

³³⁶ Elektrik-Gaz, Çankaya, May 1, 1928: “Ankara Elektrik ve Havagazı Türk Anonim Şirketi. Merkezi Ankara Yenışehir, Gazi Bulvarı Asaf Bey Apartmanı. Ankaramız en asrî ihtiyacı olan elektrik ve hava gazı tesisatını fennin en son keşiflerine icadlarına tevfiken yapmakda ve dönümlerce arazi üzerine tesis edeceği merkez fabrikasının inşaa ve tamamına çalışmaktadır. Bilcülme elektrik malzemelerinizi tesisatınızı şirkete sormadan şirketin hususi deposunu ziyaret etmeden almamak kendi menfaatinizedir. Telefon otomatik: 1860 1846.”

advertisements of previous periods, and this reached its climax in the Republican period. Disparaging European goods and promoting the national, in this sense, ‘Turkish’, was a widespread theme among the advertisements in this period.

The national struggle had ended; however, another struggle was launched in the area of economy, against foreign products. Several businesses added phrases like ‘better than European’,³³⁷ or ‘competing with European’³³⁸ to their advertisement texts. Once again, Europe was setting an example: this time an example to be exceeded. A business which produced threads for several textile purposes described itself in the advertisement as competing with European threads [*Avrupa iplikleri ile mücadele eden*], being owned by the son of a Commander in Chief, the deceased Lefkeli Reha Pasha.³³⁹

5.5.4. The National Products

As expected, the disparaging of foreign products supported the promotion of national products. A large number of advertisements, aside from mentioning their identity, also included direct references to the national economy.³⁴⁰ Another general characteristic of these advertisements was that most of them were not commercial but industrial businesses. The Hereke textile industry, which was already a prominent establishment by the Republican Period, ran an advertisement which mentioned the superiority of their fezes in terms of quality and economicality [*Fesler nefaset itibariyle ecnebi mamulatına faik ve ehvendir*] over foreign products, while introducing several

³³⁷ Beşir Kemal, *Le Film*, November 7, 1926: Beşir Kemal Müstehzeratı, “*Bilimum Avrupa müstehzerâtına faikdir.*”

³³⁸ Radium Lambası, *Milli Nisvan*, 1924: “*Radyum Lambası Ticarethanesi. Türkiye için yegane acentası. Mezkûr ticarethane milli radyum pili imalâthanesi olub, şehrimizde taze pil yaparak Avrupa’yla rekâbet maksadıyla ehven satmaktadır. Gayet ucuz cep fenerleri ve ampuller dahi bulunur.*”

³³⁹ Süreyya İplik, *Milli Nevsal*, 1924: “*Avrupa iplikleri ile mücadele eden Süreyya yün iplik fabrikası. Halı, iplik fabrikaları ile rekâbet eden, Süreyya iplik fabrikası (Serasker Merhum Lefkeli Emir oğlu Reha Paşa Mahdumu).*”

³⁴⁰ Bedr-i İkbâl, *Asar-ı Nisvan*, June 1, 1925: “*Bedr-i İkbâl ve Haffafiye Lastik ticarethanesi. Ali Rıza ve Mahdumu Mehmet. Enva-i ayakkabılar, lastikler mestler, çocuk ayakkabıları vesaire mamulat-ı milliye meraklılarının nazar-ı dikkatini celb ederiz.*”

other goods. At the end of the advertisement, the establishment declared that they recommended their business to those who “want the progression and growth of the national industry” [*Sanayi-i milliyemizin inkişafı ve terakkisini arzu eden*].³⁴¹ Another industrial establishment which produced ethyl alcohol [*ispirto*], addressed the leader from the caption: “use no more foreign ethyl alcohols!” [*Artık Ecnebi İspirtoları Kullanmayalım!*];³⁴² and continued, “if you both want to make sure your money would not go abroad and also want to help a Turkish factory.”

There were also businesses which addressed the national manufacturers. A repairmen and producer of rolling pins for cotton winding wheels announced to the cotton manufacturers that this service was being provided “by the ‘foreign hands’ and therefore money was staying in their pockets.”³⁴³

³⁴¹ Hereke Fabrikası, *Asar-ı Nisvan*, June 1, 1925: “*Türk sanayi-i nesciyesinin enmuzec iftiharı addine şayan olan Hereke Fabrikası’nın mamulat-ı nefisesi terrakkiyat ve teceddüdât-ı âhiresi sayesinde bir kat daha mazhar-ı revnak ve tekâmül olmuştur. İpekli çarşaflık ve esvablık nefis ve metin kumaşlar ile tayyörlük ve mantoluk her nevi diraları [?] pek dilnişin ve en son modaya muvaffak çeşid ve renklerde yapılmıştır. Kazmirler ve kostümlük ve paltoluk kumaşlar zarafet ve metanet ve ehveniyetce cidden emsalsizdir. Fesler nefaset itibariyle ecnebi mamulatına faik ve ehvendir. Gayet kıymetdâr halı ve seccadeler halis yün fanila ve çorabları battaniyeleri ve daha sair bir çok mamulat-ı nefise ve mütenevviyası. Sanayi-i milliyemizin inkişafı ve terakkisini arzu eden nefaisperverâne tavsiye olunur.*”

³⁴² Türk İspirto, *Milli Nevsal*, 1924: “*Artık Ecnebi İspirtoları Kullanmayalım! Eczacı ve kolonyacılarımızın ecza-i tıbbiye deposu sahiplerinin nazar-ı dikkatine: 90 derece saf ve sıhhi ispirto sarf ederek hem paramızın harice çıkmamasını temin, hem de bir Türk fabrikasına yardım etmek isterseniz. “Türk Sıhhi İspirto Fabrikası” ispirtosunu istimal ediniz.*”

³⁴³ Merdane, *Ziraat ve Ticaret Gazetesi*, June 12, 1924: “*Pamuk Fabrikacılarına Müjde.*

Senelerden beri yabancı eller tarafından yapılan ve bedelleride onların keselerinde kalan pamuk çıkrıklarına mahsus merdaneleri (ruloları) gayet sağlam olarak yeniden yapmakda ve eskileri mükemmel suretde tamir etmektedir. Alâkadâr zevatın mevcut merdanelerimizi bir kere görmekle mutlaka beğeneceklerine eminim. Vaktiyle mübayaat ve siparişâtda bulunmak ve fazla malumat almak isteyenlerin imalathanemize teşrifleri rica olunur.”

5.6. An Overall View of the Advertisement Profession in the Republic

The advertisements of the professional advertising agencies could be read as evidence of advancement and sophistication of advertisements as professional texts. An advertisement agent, *Hasan Hulki* announced that it is an international [*benelmilel*] agency which provides membership and contacts for printing advertisements for “all the political, commercial, and humor newspapers” all around the world.³⁴⁴ In addition to its services, the agency also provided advertisement signboards for outdoors. Another agency appealed to possible customers saying: “Do not you want to promote your business?” [*ticarethanenizi tanıtmak istemez misiniz?*] and declared that they issued advertisements in both local [*mahalli*] newspapers, and those in foreign [*ecnebi*] languages. The agency also stressed that they had been in the business of advertising for twenty-five years, which also demonstrates that advertising was no longer a young profession in the country.³⁴⁵

In the bodies of the advertisements, important lines such as the name of the business, catchphrases, or the main feature of the establishment was stressed with bold and larger fonts, in order to attract the attention of the reader. The employment of images in advertisement continued, and photographs became more widespread in comparison to drawings. The business owners from different sizes of establishments, seemed to become accustomed to using advertisements thoroughly in order to promote their businesses. All these details point to the establishment of a more complicated and competitive economic realm.

³⁴⁴ Hasan Hulki, *Ankara'da Dellal*, April 1341: “*Beynelmilel ilânât acentesi. İlânât kısmı İstanbul gazetelerine risale ve mecmualarına en müsait şeraitle ilan derc olunur. En mütenâ yerlere ilân levhaları tâlik olunur. Gazete ve mecmua kısmı dünyanın ticari, siyasî ve mizahî umum gazetelerine abone yapılır ve ilân derc olunur. Umum salnâmelere ilân verilir. Ecnebi gazetelerine taleb üzerine numune gönderilir. Her nevi ticari izahat verilir. İstanbul, Galata Merkez Rıhtım Han Beşinci Kat 11-27 numero.*”

³⁴⁵ İlanat Acentesi, *Ankara'da Dellal*, April 1341: “*Ticarethanenizi Tanıtmak İster misiniz?*

Gerek mahallî, gerekse ecnebî her lisanda münteşir gazetelere umum ilânâtınızı İstanbul'da Beyoğlu Caddesi'nde Kahramanzade Hanı'nda kain ilânât acentasına tevdi ediniz. 25 seneden beri ciddiyet ve istikâmeti ile bu meslekdeki ihtisas-ı muamelâtındaki intizam ve sürati ile temayiz eylemişdir. Duvar ilânâtını tab ve tâlik ve el ilânâtını tevzi ider.”

CONCLUSION

The advertisements present a useful medium to reveal the transformations of a society, people's reactions the changes in political, social, economical and intellectual spheres. This study, starting from the advertisements during the reign of Abdulhamid II, to the adoption of Latin script in Turkish republic in 1928, displays the continuities and discontinuities in ideas, identities, perceptions and ideals of the society. At this point, a definition of the society in question is useful. The large portion of the people in the late Ottoman Empire and Early Turkish Republic were still residing in the rural areas, possibly was not involved with the increasingly complex capitalist economy and its trademark, the advertisements. Since advertisements issued in this study were taken from periodicals and newspapers, they could be only representative for the readers of the specific media, and the businesses which ran advertisements.

The common feature of the advertisements published in the late Ottoman and early Republican period was that the advertorial prose was always following the the official discourse. The advertisements were running parallel to the dominant ideologies of each period. This parallelism displays the influence of the political authority over the economic sphere from the reign of Abdulhamid II, to early years of the Republic.

The business owners and service providers tried to legitimize their economic activities by stressing their loyalty the state, official ideology and ideals. During the reign of Abdulhamid II, Islam was the most dominant theme in the advertisements as a reflection of the Sultan's Islamist policies. The Young Turk revolution launched an inclusive Ottoman identity and a devotion to the idea of progress to the center of official discourse. Consequently, the advertorial prose adopted and extensively used these ideas, until the shift in the policies of Young Turks from an inclusive Ottomanism to an exclusive Turkism during the Balkan Wars. The Balkan Wars, and their effect on Ottoman Empire, were manifested in the advertisements. As the center of authority had shifted to Ankara during the national struggle, the advetisements increasingly employed themes Islam and Turkish in their advertisements and the latter, would reach its zenith in

the early Republican period parallel to the Turkish nationalist discourse of the new regime.

In relation the dominant ideology of the period, the advertisements addressed to Muslims, citizens of the Ottoman Empire, patriots, nationalists, and Turks. The advertisers, tried to create a genuine connection between serving the official ideology and promoting a specific business; and claimed a direct relationship with the well-being of a business and the well-being of the state and the nation. In that case, the state intervention in economic activities took the shape of a complicated relationship between the political authority and the business owners. In this relationship, the business owners looked up to the state for approval, support, and legitimacy for their activities. This “patrimonial guardianship over businesses” can be seen in contemporary Turkey, where businessmen “do not conform to the rationally, but to socially defined norms of behavior.” Ayşe Buğra, in her work which she started with analysis of autobiographies of Turkish businessmen, came to the conclusion that this idea of rationality was not reflected in their autobiographies.³⁴⁶ According to Buğra, one of the most striking dimensions of the Turkish businessmen's self image “seems to be a lack of confidence about the legitimacy of the activities carried out in pursuit of pecuniary gain,” which is reflected in an “almost desperate attempt to justify business as a walk of life with reference to its social value.”³⁴⁷ Most of the business owners and service providers who ran their advertisements during the period from 1876 to 1928, were adopted a similar stance as successors of this mentality. This mentality prevented business owners to claim any profit-oriented motive, instead they used approved social and political prose in the line of the official discourse which was generated by the legitimacy and approval concerns.

The advertisements expose several continuities and discontinuities as well as gradual changes. Since the examples of from Abdulhamid's reign to Turkish Republic, modernity and technology was an important theme in the advertisements. The visibility of these themes was closely connected to the policies that were produced during these periods. The reformist side of the Abdulhamid's rule, which he regarded as crucial for the very survival of the Empire was reflected in the advertisements. The use of words

³⁴⁶ Ayşe Buğra, *State and Business in Modern Turkey: A Comparative Study* (Albany NY: State University of New York Press, 1994), p.4.

³⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p.4.

such as “new invention” [*nev-i icad*] reflected the growing curiosity to anything presented as modern, new or technological. Modern science acquired a more central role in the Ottoman society after the Young Turk Revolution. Modern science succeeded the traditional forms knowledge. The the young Ottoman men, who were educated in Europe or modern professional academies established during the Tanzimat Era and increased in number and capacity under the reign of Abdulhamid II, were affected by ideas which would be canalized into a desire to shape the society. The intellectual frames that they were adopted would manifest itself in the policies of Young Turks, and their successors, the Republican People’s Party. The Young Turks’ fascination with modernity was also manifested in their stress to progress, which was the only way of reaching the desired level. The Young Turk period was marked by this desire to progress, the level was, Europe, which had been the model for the rulers since the *Tanzimat* period. As mentioned before, Progress [*terakki*] was the keyword for understanding the mindset of the Young Turks. The same mindset was inherited by their successors, Mustafa Kemal and his followers, who named their aim as the level of contemporary civilizations [*muasır medeniyetler*]. Therefore, they consciously tried to modernize the nation around the available European model; the attempt was not limited to political and economic spheres but also to social life.

Europe, in this line of thought, constitutes an important side of self-perception and self-making during the periods in question. Therefore, “Europe” and “European” were extensively used in the advertisements. However, as the mentalities and time evolves, they were used with different intentions. In the advertisements during the reign of Abdulhamid, the word “European” was used to define a standard. This standard was high, the highest actually, so the businesses and products wanted to stress their Europeanness. During this period, Europe was almost interchangeably used with the latest, the newest, and the best; since modernity was a European phenomenon as well as its source of power and development. In the course of time, this trademark of high quality and progress also became a level to reach, or even to surpass.

As the science and progress became important components of intellectual and social life, a curiosity towards knowing and exploring became evident in the advertisements. Under the censorship of Abdulhamid's reign, the encyclopedic journals were filled with news of developments in Europe in areas of science, literature, and technology. The same journals also published advertisements of books and foreign periodicals, which marked a radical change in the perception of reading activity by the

society. The advertisements of books and periodicals reached its climax in the Young Turk period, when science and knowledge became both the aim and the means of the regime. Interestingly, even though the Republican period was dominated by similar discourses, the published sources lacked the presence of advertisements on books and periodicals.

Islam, as the religion of the majority in the Ottoman Empire and in the Turkish Republic was a common theme in the advertisements, and one of the most prominent continuity in the prose of advertisements. As Abdulhamid assumed the role of the Caliph, the Champion of the all Muslims, and decided to use it in politics, his pragmatic decision in the era of New Imperialism found its reflection in the advertisements. On the other hand, as Young Turks seized the power and tried to create a new identity around Ottomanness, Islam lost its primacy to the references to Ottoman identity in the advertisements. However, in a short period of time, it gained its effectiveness, during the Balkan Wars and the Great War, as a strong mobilization force. The Balkan Wars and the Great War also revealed the undeniable defeat of the Ottoman identity, which eventually became absent in the advertisements. When the Turkish Republic defined itself on the basis of Turkishness, and initiated a race for secularization, Islam lost its central position in every sphere possible. On the other hand, despite of this widespread secularization, it became an important component of the Turkish identity, and became a criterion to define the members of the Turkish nation. Therefore, Islam, as an important part of the national struggle, was still available – to a lesser extent – in the advertisements. Advertisements also show the silencing of declaring identities. The non-Muslim businesses, which proudly expressed their Ottomanness during the first years of Young Turk rule, seemed to be completely silenced in the Republican period, when other businesses were loudly declaring that they were Turkish, national, or Muslim. Thus, most of the neutral advertisements in this period belonged to the non-Muslim businesses.

Creating of a national economy (even though the description of the nation had changed) another visible state policy in the advertisements. The penetration Ottomans to the European capitalist system as market, woke several concerns about the faith of the State. Ottoman Empire's international ports, such as Izmir, Selanik and Istanbul actually prospered from the international commercial activities. However, the benefits went disproportionately to the Christian communities of these cities, since they had become *protégés* of foreign merchants. In the light of this reality, especially during the times

when the “Islamic” identity surpassed the others, the State favoured Muslim businesses over the non-Muslims. In addition, growingly forms of national consciousness in the economic sphere manifested itself in the advertisements. “Buy Muslim”, “buy Ottoman”, and “buy local” eventually replaced by “buy national”. The boycott of Austro-Hungarian goods and businesses in 1908, was the first mass manifestation of national consciousness in the area of economy. During the boycott, Ottoman businesses and newspapers played an important in mobilization of the masses by their anti-Austro-Hungarian announcements and advertisements. During the Young Turk rule, the desire to complete the political and social revolution by an economic one, reached their epoch by the unilateral abolition of capitulations in 1914.

The advertisement also reflected the recessions in the economy. The immense burden that the Balkan War and the Great War put on the shoulders of the Ottoman state, resulted with absence of advertisements in the journals and newspapers in the second half of the Great War. On the other hand, as soon as the situation relatively “normalized” the frequency of advertisements seemed to reach its pre-war conditions. The Izmir Economy Congress, showed the importance that was attributed the economy by the nationalist movement. Even though the Republic adopted an economic policy, which could be regarded as liberal, the anti-imperialist and almost xenophobic atmosphere after the national struggle manifested itself in the more vigorous cries of national economy (this time nation in question was Turkish) in the advertisements.

Naturally, such an examination of the advertisement throughout these periods also provides a overall look to the development of the profession. In the early examples, the advertisement texts were long and descriptive, distinguished by sincere first person narration, written by business owners instead of professionals. In time, the texts got shorter, more appealing and interesting titles and catchphrases were used in order to attract the readers. During the course of these changes the number of the advertisers also increased. Advertisements started to include special offerings and coupons.

The change in the position of women could be also traced in advertisements. From consumers, they became advertisers. In the social and economic transformations, the rulers expected women to cooperate with them. The changes regarding the women could be seen in the journals and advertisements.

Similar to state-supervised reforms, the wars also resulted with visible social transformations. For example, during the Balkan Wars, which resulted with immense demographic change, and a social reaction towards the non-Muslim communities, the

Ottoman supra-national identity was supplanted by Islam and Muslim identity. The mobilization of the people in the times of need could be also seen in the advertisements. Abdulhamid promoted the subscription campaign for building of the Hijaz Railway by advertisements, while during the Great War state asked for internal borrowings by using the same way; the extraordinary situations requested extraordinary measures. After the end of the wars, the mobilization attempts were directed to relieve the effects of national disasters. Some businesses called for help to veterans and orphans, evoking the national feelings.

The growing effect of nationalism and the constant war atmosphere produced an emphasis on the land. This was manifested in the advertisement by using the phrases such as, ‘fatherland’ [*vatan*] and ‘homeland’ [*memleket*]. With the rise of the Turkish nationalism, Anatolia required an extra importance, as the cradle of the pure, authentic Turkish identity.

Most of these policies that were reflected in the advertisements were shaped concerns and fears for the future. The adoption of themes such as nationalism, Orientalism, glorification of science and technologies were products of these feelings. Important to note that, as the themes were inherited the fears and concerns passed to the next regime. As the regimes and the official ideologies had changed with the impacts of similar impulses, the advertorial prose collaborated with the authority and adopted its discourses.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary Sources: Journals and Newspapers Cited in the Thesis

Akşam (September 16, 1921)

Alem (March 18, 1909)

Ankara'da Dellal (April 1925)

Asar-ı Nisvan (June 1, 1925)

Asri Türkiye Mecmuası (March 1, 1926); (April 1, 1926); (May 1, 1926); (January 15, 1927)

Ay (October 14, 1911)

Büyük Mecmua (no.5. April 1919); (no.6. April 24, 1919); (no.16. December 1919); (no.17. December 11, 1919)

Cem (March 4, 1911); (May 21, 1911); (June 3, 1911)

Çağlayan (October 20, 1925); (January 1, 1926); (March 15, 1926)

Çankaya (May 1, 1928)

Çocuk Dünyası (July 10, 1913); (July 23, 1913)

Diken (January 1, 1919); (October 23, 1919); (November 6, 1919)

Donanma (September/October 1913); (June 29, 1914); (October 18, 1914); (December 20, 1914)

Felahat (April 14, 1914)

Gençlik Duygusu (March 28, 1914)

Hadika (July 20, 1888)

Hak (March 13, 1911)

Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete (April 23, 1896); (April 23, 1903); (May 14, 1903); (August 13, 1903); (September 10, 1903); (December 17, 1903)

Irmak; (November 15, 1928)

Işık (November 1, 1922)

İctihad (March 19, 1914)

İdman (June 14, 1913); (March 19, 1914)

İnci (January 1, 1919); (October 1, 1919); (December 1, 1919); (May 1, 1920)

İstanbul Seririyatı (April 1923)

Kadınlar Dünyası (November 23, 1913); (November 29, 1913); (December 20, 1913); (March 7, 1914)

Kadınlık (May 30, 1914)

Karagöz Salnamesi (1910)

Le Film (November 7, 1926)

Milli Nevsal (1924)

Mirat-ı Vatan (n.3. 1874)

Musavver Devr-i Cedit (June 14, 1909)

Musavver Emel (January 4, 1910)

Musavver Hale (December 1909/January 1910); (February/March 1910)

Müdafaa-i Milliye ve İktisadiye (February 23, 1914)

Nay (March 23, 1912)

Rebi-i Maarifet [Ebuzziya Takvimi] (1888/1889); (1889/1890-1890/1891); (1892/1893)

Resimli Kitab (November 1909); (May, 1910)

Sabah (February 25, 1897)

Şehbal (December 14, 1912); (February 14, 1914)

Talebe Defteri (February 12, 1914)

Tanin (September 4, 1911); (March 13, 1914)

Tarik (April 17, 1884); (May 14, 1884); (June 6, 1884); (August 1, 1884); (October 5, 1884); (May 1, 1885); (February 6, 1886); (April 7, 1888); (April 19, 1888)

Tercüman-ı Hakikat (January 17, 1884)

Ümid (December, 1919)

Ümran (August 18, 1888); (November 7, 1888)

Yeni İnci (June 1, 1922)

Yıldız (August 1, 1925)

Zaman (April 18, 1918); (May 22, 1918)

Zeka (August 1912)

Ziraat ve Ticaret Gazetesi (June 12, 1924)

Secondary Sources

Adanır, Fikret. "Imperial Response to Nationalism: the Ottoman Case." In *Governance, Globalization and the European Union: Which Europe for Tomorrow*. Edited by Henry Cavanna. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2002. pp. 47-66.

Adivar, Halide Edib. *The Turkish Ordeal: Being the Further Memoirs of Halide Edib*. New York: The Century Co., 1928.

Ahmad, Feroz. *The Making of Modern Turkey*. London: Routledge, 1993.

Ahmad, Feroz. *The Young Turks: The Committee of Union and Progress in Turkish Politics, 1908-1914*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1969.

Akçura, Gökhan. *Uzun Metin Sevenlerden Misiniz?* Istanbul: OM Yayınevi, 2002.

Akşin, Sina. *İstanbul Hükümetleri ve Milli Mücadele*. Istanbul: Cem Yayınları, 1976.

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities*. London: Verso, 1991.

Arai, Masami. *Turkish Nationalism in the Young Turk Era*. Leiden, New York: E.J. Brill, 1992.

Ayhan, Bünyamin. *Milli Mücadele'de Basın: Olağanüstü Durumlarda Propaganda*. Konya: Tablet Yayınları, 2007.

Bali, Rıfat N. "The Politics of Turkification During the Single Party Period." In *Turkey Beyond Nationalism: Towards Post-Nationalist Identities*. Edited by Hans-Lukas Kieser. London: I.B.Tauris, 2006. pp. 43-49.

Bali, Rıfat N. *The First Ten Years of the Turkish Republic Thru the Reports of American Diplomats*. Istanbul: Isis Press, 2009.

Belen, Fahri. *Türk Kurtuluş Savaşı: Askeri, Siyasi ve Sosyal Yönleriyle*. Ankara: Kültür ve Turizm Bakanlığı, 1983.

- Berkes, Niyazi. *Türkiye’de Çağdaşlaşma*. İstanbul: Bilgi Yayınevi, 2003.
- Brummet, Palmira. *Image and Imperialism in the Ottoman Revolutionary Press, 1908-1911*. Albany NY: State University of New York Press, 2000.
- Buğra, Ayşe. *State and Business in Modern Turkey: A Comparative Study*. Albany NY: State University of New York Press, 1994.
- Çakır, Hamza. *Osmanlı Basınında Reklam*. İstanbul: Elit Reklamcılık, 1997.
- Çakır, Serpil. *Osmanlı Kadın Hareketi*. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 1994.
- Deringil, Selim. “Legitimacy Structures in the Ottoman State: 'The Reign of Abdulhamid II (1876-1909)'.” *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, vol.23, no.3 (August, 1991) pp.345-59.
- Deringil, Selim. “The Invention of Tradition as Public Image in the Late Ottoman Empire, 1808 to 1908.” *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, vol.35, no.1 (January 1993) pp.3-29.
- Deringil, Selim. “They Live in a State of Nomadism and Savagery: 'The Late Ottoman Empire and the Post-Colonial Debate'.” *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, vol.45, no.2 (April, 2003) pp. 311-42.
- Deringil, Selim. *The Well-Protected Domains : Ideology and the Legitimation of Power in the Ottoman Empire, 1876-1909*. London, New York: I.B.Tauris, 1998.
- Dumesnil, Véra. *İşgal İstanbul'u*. Translated by Emre Öktem. İstanbul: İstanbul Kitaplığı Yayınları, 1993.
- Findley, Carter Vaughn. “The Advent of Ideology in the Islamic Middle East (Part II).” *Studia Islamica* no. 56 (1982): pp.147-80.
- Finefrock, Michael M. “Ataturk, Lloyd George and the Megali Idea: Cause and Consequence of the Greek Plan to Seize Constantinople from the Allies, June-August 1922.” *The Journal of Modern History* vol.52, no. 1 (March, 1980): pp. D1047-D1066.
- Frierson, Elizabeth B. “Cheap and Easy: The Creation of Consumer Culture in Late Ottoman Society.” In *Consumption Studies and the History of the Ottoman Empire, 1550-1922 : An Introduction*. Edited by Donald Quataert. Albany NY: State University of New York Press, 2000. pp.243-260.
- Frierson, Elizabeth B. “Mirrors Out, Mirrors In: ”Domestication and Rejection of the Foreign in Late Ottoman Women's Magazines (1975-1908).“ In *Women, Patronage, and Self-representation in Islamic Societies*. Edited by D. Fairchild Ruggles. Albany NY: State University of New York Press, 2000. pp.177-204.
- Göçek, Fatma Müge. “Ethnic Segmentation, Western Education, and Political Outcomes: Nineteenth-Century Ottoman Society.” *Poetics Today* 14, no. 3 (Autumn, 1993): pp.507-38.

- Göçek, Fatma Müge. *Rise of the Bourgeoisie, Demise of Empire: "Ottoman Westernization and Social Change."* New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- Grant, Jonathan. "The Sword of the Sultan: Ottoman Arms Imports, 1854-1914." *The Journal of Military History* 66, no. 1 (January, 2002): pp. 9-36.
- Hanioğlu, Şükrü M. "Blueprints for a Future Society: Late Ottoman Materialists on Science, Religion, and Art." In *Late Ottoman Society : The Intellectual Legacy*. Edited by Elizabeth Özdalga. London, New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2005. pp. 28-116.
- Hanioğlu, Şükrü M. *The Young Turks in Opposition*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Hanioğlu, Şükrü M. "Turkism and the Young Turks, 1889-1908." In *Turkey Beyond Nationalism: Towards Post-Nationalist Identities*. Edited by Hans-Lukas Kieser. London: I.B.Tauris, 2006. pp.3-19
- Hobsbawm, Eric. "Mass Producing Traditions: Europe, 1874-1914." In *The Invention of Tradition*. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds.), Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992, pp.263-307.
- Howe, Stephen. *Empire: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Kansu, Aykut. *1908 Devrimi*. 2nd ed. Translated by Ayda Erbal. Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2001.
- Kansu, Aykut. *The Revolution of 1908 In Turkey*. Leiden, New York: E.J. Brill, 1997.
- Kara, İsmail. *Din ile Modernleşme Arasında: Çağdaş Türk Düşüncesinin Meseleleri*. Istanbul: Dergâh Yayınları, 2003.
- Kara, İsmail. *Türkiye'de İslamcılık Düşüncesi: Metinler/Kişiler*. Istanbul: Kitabevi, 1997.
- Karabekir, Kazım. *Hatıra ve Zabıtlarıyla 1923 İzmir İktisat Kongresi : İktisat Esaslarımız*. Edited by Orhan Hülagü and Ömer Hakan Özalp. Istanbul: Emre Yayınları, 2001.
- Karabekir, Kazım. *İstiklal Harbimiz*. Istanbul: Merk Yayıncılık, 1988.
- Karabekir, Kazım. *İstiklal Harbimizde Enver Paşa ve İttihat-Terakki Erkanı*. Istanbul: 1967.
- Karabekir, Kazım. *İstiklal Harbimizin Esasları*. Edited by Faruk Özerengin (ed.). Istanbul: Timaş, 1990.
- Karahasanoğlu, Subutay Hikmet. "Osmanlı Gazetelerinde Kitap Haber ve İlanları." *Tarih ve Toplum* 96 (December 1991): 328.

- Karakaya-Stump, Ayfer. "Debating Progress in a 'Serious Newspaper for Muslim Women': The Periodical 'Kadin' of the Post-Revolutionary Salonica, 1908-1909." *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* 30, no. 2 (November, 2003): pp. 155-81.
- Karateke, Hakan. *Padişahım Çok Yaşa! "Osmanlı Devletinin Son Yüzyılında Merasimler."* İstanbul: Kitap Yayınevi, 2004.
- Karpat, Kemal H. *Osmanlı'da Değişim, Modernleşme ve Uluslaşma.* Ankara, İstanbul: İmge Kitabevi, 2006.
- Karpat, Kemal H. "The Memoirs of N. Batzaria: The Young Turks and Nationalism." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 6, no. 3 (July, 1974): pp.276-99.
- Kedourie, Elie. "The End of the Ottoman Empire 1918-19: From War to Peace." *Journal of Contemporary History* 3, no. 4 (October, 1968): pp.19-28.
- Keyder, Çağlar. *State and Class in Turkey: A Study In Capitalist Development.* London, New York: Verso, 1987.
- Kılıç Denman, Fatma. *İkinci Meşrutiyet Döneminde Bir Jön Türk Dergisi: Kadın.* İstanbul: Libra Kitapçılık ve Yayıncılık, 2009.
- Kocabaşoğlu, Uygur. "Gazi Abdülhamid Han ve Reklamlar." *Tarih ve Toplum* no. 35 (November, 1986): pp. 57-60.
- Koloğlu, Orhan. *1908 Basın Patlaması.* İstanbul: BAS-HAŞ, 2005.
- Koloğlu, Orhan. *Reklamcılığımızın İlk Yüzyılı 1840-1940.* İstanbul: Reklamcılık Vakfı Yayınları, 2000.
- Kushner, David. "Self-Perception and Identity in Contemporary Turkey." *Journal of Contemporary History* 32, no. 2 (April, 1997): pp.219-33.
- Kushner, David. *The Rise of Turkish Nationalism, 1876-1908.* London: Frank Cass, 1977.
- Kutlu, Sacit. *Didâr-ı Hürriyet: Kartpostallarla İkinci Meşrutiyet, 1908-1913.* İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2004.
- Lewis, Bernard. "The Ottoman Empire and Its Aftermath." in "Imperial Hangovers," special issue, *Journal of Contemporary History* vol.15, no. 1 (January, 1980): pp.27-36.
- Mardin, Şerif. "Ideology and Religion in the Turkish Revolution." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 2, no. 3 (July, 1971): pp.197-211
- Mardin, Şerif. *Jön Türklerin Siyasi Fikirleri, 1895-1908.* İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1983.
- Mardin, Şerif. *Türk Modernleşmesi.* Edited by Mümtazer Türköne and Tuncay Önder

- (eds.), vol. 4 of *Makaleler*. Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1991.
- Mardin, Şerif. *Türkiye'de Din ve Siyaset*. Mümtazer Türköne and Tuncay Önder (eds.), vol. 3 of *Makaleler*. Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1990.
- Macfie, A.L. *The End of the Ottoman Empire, 1908-1923*. New York: Longman, 1998.
- McCarthy, Justin. *Death and Exile : The Ethnic Cleansing of Ottoman Muslims, 1821-1922*. Princeton, N.J.: Darwin Press, 1995.
- Moorehead, Alan. *Gallipoli*. Hertfordshire: Wordsworth Editions, 1998.
- Ochsenwald, William. *The Hijaz Railroad*. Charlottesville: University of Virginia, 1980.
- Ortaylı, İlber. *İmparatorluğun En Uzun Yüzyılı*. 8th ed. Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2001.
- Olson, Robert W., and William F. Tucker. "The Sheikh Sait Rebellion in Turkey (1925): A Study in the Consolidation of a Developed Uninstitutionalized Nationalism and the Rise of Incipient (Kurdish) Nationalism." *Die Welt des Islams* 18, no. 3 (1978): 195-211.
- Özelli, M.T. "The Evolution of the Formal Educational System and Its Relation to Economic Growth Policies in the First Turkish Republic." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 5, no. 1 (January, 1974): pp.77-92.
- Özen, Hatice. *Tarihsel Süreç İçinde Türk Kadın Gazete ve Dergileri, 1868-1990*. Istanbul: Graphis Ltd., 1990.
- Pamuk, Şevket. *The Ottoman Empire and European Capitalism, 1820-1913 "Trade, Investment and Production"*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- Poulton, Hugh. *Top Hat, Grey Wolf, and Crescent : Turkish Nationalism and the Turkish Republic*. London: C. Hurst & Co. Ltd., 1997.
- Quataert, Donald. *Manufacturing and Technology Transfer in the Ottoman Empire 1800-1914*. Istanbul: Isis Press, 1992.
- Quataert, Donald. *Osmanlı Devleti'nde Avrupa İktisadi Yayılımı ve Direniş (1881-1908)*. Translated by Sabri Tekay. Ankara: Yurt Yayınları, 1987.
- Quataert, Donald. "The Economic Climate of the 'Young Turk Revolution' in 1908." *The Journal of Modern History* 51, no. 3 (September, 1979): D1147-D1161.
- Rustow, Dankwart A. "The Army and the Founding of the Turkish Republic." *World Politics* vol. 11, no. 4 (July, 1959): pp.513-22.
- Sarihan, Zeki. *Kurtuluş Savaşı Kadınları*. Istanbul: Remzi Kitabevi, 2007.
- Selek, Sabahattin. *Anadolu İhtilali*. vol. 1 of *Milli Mücadele*. Istanbul: Güneş

Matbaacılık, Sıralar Matbaacılık, 1963.

Shaw, G. Howland. "A Realistic Interpretation of Modern Turkey" (May 22, 1925)" In *The First Ten Years of the Turkish Republic Thru the Reports of American Diplomats*. Edited by Rifat N. Bali. Istanbul: Isis Press, 2009.

Shaw, G. Howland. "An Intellectualistic Interpretation of Modern Turkey (September 12, 1924)." In *The First Ten Years of the Turkish Republic Thru the Reports of American Diplomats*. Edited by Rifat N. Bali. Istanbul: Isis Press, 2009.

Shaw, Stanford J. *The Ottoman Empire in World War I*. 2 vols. Ankara: Türk Tarih Vakfı, 2006-2008.

Spencer, Robert F. "Culture Process and Intellectual Current: Durkheim and Atatürk." *American Anthropologist* 60, no. 4 (August, 1958): pp.640-57.

Toprak, Zafer. *Bir Yurttaş Yaratmak : Muâsır Bir Medeniyet İçin Seferberlik Bilgileri, 1923-1950*. Istanbul: Yapı Kredi Kültür Sanat Yayıncılık, 1998.

Toprak, Zafer. *İttihad-Terakki ve Cihan Harbi: Savaş Ekonomisi ve Türkiye'de Devletçilik, 1914-1918*. Istanbul: Homer Kitabevi, 2003.

Toprak, Zafer. *Milli İktisat, Milli Burjuvazi*. Ankara: Yurt Yayınları, 1995.

Toprak, Zafer. *Türkiye'de "Milli iktisat" 1908-1918*. Ankara: Yurt Yayınları, 1982.

Tunaya, Tarık Zafer. *Türkiye'de Siyasal Gelişmeler: 1876-1938*. Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2001.

Tunçay, Mete. *Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nde Tek-Parti Yönetimi'nin Kurulması (1923-1931)*. 4th ed. Istanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları, 2005.

Üngör, Uğur Ümit. "Seeing Like a Nation-State: Young Turk Social Engineering in Eastern Turkey 1913-1950." *Journal of Genocide Research* 10, no. 1 (2008): 15-39.

Üstel, Füsün. *İmparatorluktan Ulus-Devlete Türk Milliyetçiliği : Türk Ocakları, 1912-1931*. Istanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1997.

Yasamee, F.A.K. *Ottoman Diplomacy: "Abdülhamid II and the Great Powers 1878-1888"*. Istanbul: The Isis Press, 1996.

Zürcher, Erik Jan. "Atatürk ve Muhalefet: 1924'teki Çokpartili Demokrasi." In *Savaş, Devrim ve Uluslaşma: Türkiye Tarihinde Geçiş Dönemi (1908-1928)*. Translated by Ergun Aydınoglu and Melis Behlil. Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2005. pp.265-272.

Zürcher, Erik Jan. "Kazım Karabekir ve İstiklal Harbimiz Kitabı." In *Savaş, Devrim ve Uluslaşma: Türkiye Tarihinde Geçiş Dönemi (1908-1928)*. Translated by Ergun Aydınoglu and Melis Behlil. Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2005. pp.15-25

Zürcher, Erik Jan. “Ölümlle Fırar Arasında: Birinci Dünya Savaşı'nda Osmanlı Askeri'nin Deneyimleri.” In *Savaş, Devrim ve Uluslaşma: Türkiye Tarihinde Geçiş Dönemi (1908-1928)*. Translated by Ergun Aydınoglu and Melis Behlil. Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2005. pp.173-199.

Zürcher, Erik Jan. “Siyaset Adamı Tarihçi Olunca.” In *Savaş, Devrim ve Uluslaşma: Türkiye Tarihinde Geçiş Dönemi (1908-1928)*. Translated by Ergun Aydınoglu and Melis Behlil. Istanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2005. pp.3-14

Zürcher, Erik Jan. “The Ottoman Conscription System in Theory and Practice.”, In *Arming the State: Military Conscription in the Middle East and Central Asia*. London: I.B.Tauris, 1999. pp.79-94

Zürcher, Erik Jan. *The Unionist Factor: The Role of Committee of Union and Progress in the Turkish Nationalist Movement*. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1984.

Zürcher, Erik Jan. *Turkey: A Modern History*. New York: I.B.Tauris, 2004.