

**SUBJECTIVITY CONSTRUCTION AT MULTINATIONALS:  
TURKISH FEMALE BRAND MANAGERS' CASE**

by  
Demet Ayşe Yıldız

Submitted to the Graduate School of Arts and Social Sciences  
in partial fulfillment of  
the requirements for the degree of  
Master of Arts in Cultural Studies  
Sabancı University  
Fall 2009

© Demet Ayşe Yıldız  
All Rights Reserved

## ABSTRACT

### SUBJECTIVITY CONSTRUCTION AT MULTINATIONALS: TURKISH FEMALE BRAND MANAGERS' CASE

Demet Ayşe Yıldız

M.A. in Cultural Studies 2009

Supervisor: Asst. Prof. Dr. Dicle Koğacıođlu

Keywords: Subjectivity, Discipline, Distinction, Production, Consumption, Agency, Structure

With the advent of capitalism, consumption has emerged as a core activity of companies next to production, increasing the importance of marketing and advertising departments. In this context, brand managers of transnational capitalist class occupy a professional position in the midway between production and consumption. Being consumers themselves they produce the consumption alternatives of people. This thesis aims to explore subjectivity construction processes of young women managers working in the marketing departments of multinational corporations in Istanbul, Turkey. I analyze the ways in which disciplinary processes, ways in which distinctions are made and maintained and the mechanisms that are developed to cope with the daily life are narrated. In this, I analyze the parallels and distances they build between themselves and other members of their groups as well as the consumers. My discussion aims to move away from the reductionist approach that sees the people as passive victims and capitalism as a structure that imposes itself regardless of context or agency.

## ÖZET

### ÇOKULUSLU ŞİRKETLERDE ÖZNEMLİK İNŞAASI: TÜRK KADIN ÜRÜN YÖNETİCİLERİ

Demet Ayşe Yıldız

Kültürel Çalışmalar Yüksek Lisans Programı, 2009

Tez Danışmanı: Yard. Doç.Dr. Dicle Koğacıoğlu

Anahtar Kelimeler: Keywords: Öznellik, Disiplin, Seçkinlik, Üretim, Tüketim, Özne, Yapı

Kapitalizmin gelişimiyle birlikte, üretimin yanında tüketim de şirketlerin ana aktivitelerinden biri olarak ortaya çıkmıştır. Bu gelişmelere paralel olarak, şirketlerin içindeki pazarlama ve reklam bölümlerinin etkileri artmıştır. Bu bağlamda, çokuluslu kapitalist sınıfının üyeleri olarak ürün müdürleri, tüketim ve üretim arasında bir köprü olarak bu şirketlerde önemli görevlere gelmişlerdir. Kendileri de birer tüketici olan bu grubun elemanları, toplumun diğer üyelerine tüketim bağlamında alternatifler üretmektedirler. Bu tezin amacı, Türkiye’de çokuluslu şirketlerin pazarlama bölümlerinde çalışan genç kadınların öznelliklerini inşa etme şekillerini anlamaktır. Bunu yaparken ne tür disiplin faaliyetlerinde geçtikleri, kendilerini nasıl farklılaştırdıkları, ve günlük yaşam mücadelelerini ne tür mekanizmalar aracılığıyla hikaye ettikleri, kendileri ve ait oldukları grubun diğer üyeleriyle nasıl paralellikler kurdukları incelenmiştir. Tez, öznelere pasif kurbanlar ve kapitalizmi de kayıtsız şartsız, kendini bağlam ve öznelere hiçe sayarak empoze eden bir sistem olarak gören özcü bir yaklaşımdan kaçınılarak yazılmıştır.

*Dedicated to my parents*

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank:

**Dicle Koğacioğlu**, my thesis supervisor, for encouraging me to follow my real interests while shedding light on my path while supporting me and offering her friendship continuously;  
**Women**, who were the informants of my research, for opening their lives to me so earnestly and enriching my research with their insights;  
**Ayşe Öncü** and **Ahmet Öncü**, members of my thesis defense jury, for helping me to study the subject of my thesis from different levels of analysis;  
**Nilfer Isvan** and **Behlül Üsdiken** for their insights on various aspects of my thesis;  
**Idil Karababa**, **Zeynep Çetrez** and **Nil Uzun** for helping me selflessly and offering me unconditional moral support;  
**Ivgen Nayman** for trusting me and encouraging me;  
**Ayşe Ötenoğlu** for standing besides me through my Sabancı journey;  
**Zeynep Gürsel** for inspiring me to begin this journey.

## Table of Contents

<b>Introduction</b>	
Background .....	1
Specifics of Marketing .....	2
Specifics of Turkey .....	6
Chapters .....	8
<b>Chapter 1: Method</b>	
1.1 Introduction .....	9
1.2 Choice of sites and informants .....	10
1.3 Specifics of marketing in Turkey and informants .....	14
1.4 Methods Used .....	18
1.5 Conclusion .....	20
<b>Chapter 2: The Production of Consumption</b>	
2.1 Introduction .....	21
2.2 Discipline and Education .....	22
2.3 Impact of the Family .....	28
2.4 Subjection through work .....	30
2.4.1 Interpellation of ‘individuals’ as subjects: Enterprise Culture .....	31
2.4.2 subjection to the Subject .....	38
2.4.3 Mutual recognition of subjects .....	41
2.5 Disciplining the consumer .....	44
2.6 Conclusion .....	46
<b>Chapter 3: Consumption as Socio-cultural Differentiation</b>	
3.1 Introduction .....	48
3.2 The Effect of Allocation .....	49
3.2.1 Social Image of Position .....	50
3.2.2.1 Real Persons .....	50
3.2.2.2 Oppositions .....	53
3.2.2 Prospects .....	55
3.2.3 Accumulation of Culture and Image of Cultural Accomplishment .....	56
3.2.3.1 College Choice .....	56
3.2.3.2 Choice of the company .....	60
3.3 Taste .....	62
3.3.1 Travel.....	63
3.3.2 Space.....	67
3.3.3 Sports.....	71
3.3.4 Body.....	74
3.4 Standard of Living .....	76
3.5 Consumption and Production as Differentiation .....	78
3.6 Conclusion .....	83
<b>Chapter 4: Consumption and Discourse</b>	
4.1 Introduction .....	84
4.2 Personal Crisis .....	84
4.3 Soul Search .....	95
4.4 Discursive subjection .....	99
4.4.1 Taste Unnoticed .....	111
4.4.2 Escape Attempts .....	114

4.5 Consumption and Discourse .....	115
4.6 Conclusion .....	118
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>120</b>
<b>Works Cited .....</b>	<b>124</b>



**Subjectivity Construction at Multinationals:  
Turkish Female Brand Managers' Case**

APPROVED BY:

Asst. Prof. Dr. Dicle Koğacıođlu .....signature.....  
(Dissertation Supervisor)

Prof. Dr. Ayşe Öncü .....signature.....

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ahmet Öncü .....signature.....

DATE OF APPROVAL: 04.02.09

# **Introduction:**

## **Background**

In this thesis, I will explore the process of subjectivity construction of young female managers in Istanbul, Turkey, who work at the marketing departments of multinational corporations. The importance of these women stems from the fact that ‘various cultural discourses, disciplinary practices, and consumer choices said to shape identity do so through the work of various kinds of professionals, bureaucrats, marketers, and practitioners’ (Leidner 431). Their subjectivity production processes are worth studying because they impact others’ identities through the consumption alternatives they produce while the subjectivities of these women themselves are constructed.

With the increase in the fluidity of the financial flows and commodity exchange since the 1980s, multinational corporations opened up new branches around the world. Mostly originating from advanced industrial economies, these companies recruited locals who held degrees compatible with their international peers. In the case of Turkey, young managers of these corporations come mainly from the middle classes, but with the help of newly acquired economic and cultural capital, they act as members of a new social group with tastes and life styles that differ from those of the middle class. This phenomenon has been explored by many researchers such as Sklair who points out the establishment of a ‘transnational capitalist class’ (Sklair 518).

My aim in this research, is to explore the agency of these female managers as they live within a global stratification process as well as their own local context and life course. To explore these transformations, I address the ways in which the position of middle marketing management becomes an objects of desire in their lives through the impact of educational apparatus and other social structures, and I also explore the mechanisms through which these female marketing managers narrate their own spaces of agency.

I situated this enquiry in Istanbul, Turkey, for several reasons. The Turkish business environment is an interesting one for exploring the construction of subjectivity because of its peripheral location in the global economy. Previous research shows that these managers increasingly identify themselves with their colleagues abroad and that their life styles become similar to those who live and work in the center (Yilmaz Sener 121). While previous findings shed some light on this topic, the construction of contemporary subjectivity in the periphery and its gendered nature remain underexplored. My research explores parallels and divergences between their occupation and their subjectivity. In a milieu in which the meaning of work is widely questioned (Beck, du Gay), my work problematizes the construction of the self and acknowledges the role that gender and consumption play in self-expression.

### **Specifics of Marketing**

Since Marx's nineteenth-century critique, liberal capitalism has evolved into the Fordist model of production which in turn has given way to mass production and consumption. Post-Fordist organization of the late- twentieth-century required a more flexible organization of labor and production than the highly organized methods of production of the Fordist model. This development parallels capitalism's transformation of 'the instruments of production, and thereby the relations of production, and with them the whole relations of society' and its global expansion. (Marx, Engels). In contemporary capitalism, 'the products of distant lands and cultures' have become available for many peoples living in different regions of the world.

The basis of capitalism remains the same insofar as it depends on private ownership; however, a fundamental change has occurred. consumption has emerged as a central activity next to production. According to Marx, production 'creat[ed] a specific manner of consumption' that, like exchange, had a secondary character (Smart 56). Production

remains a central activity, but scientific developments in ‘informational’ capitalism have altered its significance (Castells). There is a decrease in the amount of labor required for the accumulation of wealth, and ‘work has become a less prominent feature of people’s lives and less significant in determining their identity’ (Smart 56). The focus has shifted in some cases from a producer society in which adult males join public life through work and acquired a social identity to a consumer society in which individuals ‘acquire identity and status...through participation in consumer activity’ (Smart 60).

While Marx focus[ed] on what he considered as ‘the real conditions of existence, primarily the ways in which people (re)produced their existence’ (Smart 53), some recent theorists point to the shift to a society in which consumption is the prime activity. Bauman indicates that ‘whereas the industrial capitalist society that Marx studied was fundamentally one of production, a work-based society, a society that ‘engaged its member primarily as producers’, our society, in its ‘late-modern, second-modern and post-modern stage... engages its members – again primarily – in their capacity as consumers’ (Baumann 1998, quoted in Smart). Nevertheless, the shift from production to consumption as the main activity has been achieved through wage labor, which is itself an invention of industrial capitalism. Production-oriented society enabled males to become part of the public sphere; however, the transformation mentioned above required more flexible production facilities and thus created a less stable job environment that in the end changed the link between the work and identity.

This flexible structure increased the number of women within the labor market due to the low cost of female employment and the need for the relational skills in a privatized service economy. More importantly, women who generally construct themselves as in positions of less need due to patriarchal values generates the view that they are more adaptable. This view that often women themselves also hang on to overlapped with

flexible conditions of the neo-liberal economy. Some theorists point to the fact that the flexible character of late capitalism caused job debasement and loss for both women and men in the labor market. Thus, time remaining from paid work has come to be spent on building one's own identity through consumption, as opposed to the acquisition of professional status. Consumption leads to what can be seen as a cycle of satisfaction, as it is a never ending process that creates novel needs.

These economic changes brought prosperity and affluence only to some employees such as managers at multinational companies. Even managers are not immune to the problems of consumer society, although they achieve social recognition through the work they do: their prestige increases with the growth of the means that enable them to consume more distinctive goods. The work ethic that Weber describes in *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism* prepared the necessary conditions for the demands of industrial capitalism by connecting work to a religious calling and 'contribut[ing] to the process whereby work came to occupy a pre-eminent significance in the lives of adult male members of modern society...work represented the primary source of our identity – determining who they were from what they did – and contributed powerfully to their sense of self-esteem...In contemporary capitalism (however) consumer freedom has moved into the central place formerly occupied by work in the coordination of 'individual motivation, social integration and systemic reproduction' (Smart 61).

With the crisis of capitalism in the 1930s, it was obvious that a constant demand from the consumer was necessary for the sustainability of capitalism. Like workers, who were disciplined to work as a duty, other people needed to be conditioned: the demand was too important to be left to consumers alone. The demand needed to be managed through 'a huge network of communications, a great array of merchandising and selling organizations, nearly the entire advertising industry and numerous ancillary research

training and other related services' (Galbraith). However, consumers are not only passive victims in this structure. They are not simply conditioned to consume certain products, but rather pursue to distinguish themselves through objects that grant them status and identity.

The significance of the marketing managers in this process is that their ability to control the 'anticipation of enjoyment and expectation of pleasure' through 'advertising and marketing effectively allow[s] corporations to exercise a significant influence over consumer decisions about the purchase of the goods and services' (Smart 67).

As the core focus of companies shifts from production to consumption, marketing and advertising have become more visible. The aim of these activities is to sell not just a product but a 'concept: the brand as experience, as lifestyle' (Klein 21). The retail scene changes with the activities organized by marketers, and so do consumption and its meanings. These activities are important for understanding consumption's close connection with the process of identity building: identity as a not fixed entity parallels the ever-changing retail scene. Smart argues that 'identities are constructed in and through discourse, in and through narratives... identities are now rarely built to last, increasingly lack the foundation of a permanent job, secure work or career' (Smart 74). Bauman makes similar points: 'identities, like consumer goods, are to be appropriated and possessed, but only in order to be consumed, and so to disappear again. As in the case of marketed consumer goods, consumption of an identity should not extinguish the desire for other, new and improved identities, nor preclude the ability to absorb them'.

My research focuses on the 'very' professionals who build the consumption alternatives through marketing practices that impacts others' identities. The tension between structure and agency is discussed by many theorists. Some of them privilege structure while others weigh in more on agency. My research looks for the balance between the two. The subject is influenced by the structure while shaping her identity

through its fissures. Even though work loses its centrality, many subjects replace its former stability with consumption. Those women who work at marketing departments of multinational companies are in an interesting position of being the constructors of this subjectivity. While many researchers focus on the shift in the meaning of work, my thesis concentrates on the significance of its extensions, such as consumption, specifically for those who are involved in this process. By providing symbolic goods and services, these women become members of the ‘cultural intermediaries’ group that exemplifies the consuming self. Thus, their subjectivities are important to others’ expression of their selves.

The construction of brand managers’ selves is important because of its unique position in the middle of production and consumption. This work aims to scrutinize this process in Turkey. At this point, Turkey is an interesting case in which the global brands have their branches mostly in Istanbul, Turkey. Before coming back to this issue, it is important to look at the specifics of Turkey.

### **Specifics of Turkey**

Following the oil crisis in 1973, the advanced industrial countries advocated ‘import liberalization, financial liberalization, privatization of public institutions, getting rid of the big and interventionist state, and reducing the social expenditures’ in less developed countries (Yilmaz Sener 6). Turkey has been one of these countries where the aforementioned policies came into being through the replacement of the import-substitution strategy with an export-oriented model. These changes brought unprecedented numbers of foreign investors to Turkey. This change has not only affected Turkish economy on a macro level, but also influenced cultural practices as stated by Bali: ‘Through the application of free market rules, the income levels of business people and managers started to increase rapidly and their levels of consumption also increased (Bali

2002). International marketing, banking and finance gradually became flourishing professions with fat salaries. This newly acquired money offered young professionals an unparalleled purchasing power in comparison to earlier generations who also earned their living through paid work.

These professionals were far from being arbitrarily chosen to hold middle and upper management positions; on the contrary, they were graduates of top colleges and were at least bilingual to conduct business with their peers in other countries. Their high earnings enabled them to be consumers of newly imported life styles in clothing, home decorating, and distinct recreational activities.

The marketing and advertising industries first targeted people like themselves: new consumption goods were there to help to build an identity that was distinct from those of other classes. Istanbul's significance stems from its importance as the center of neo-liberal developments in Turkey that started in the 1980s, when multinational companies opened branches in Istanbul. These companies have targeted their high income employees by offering the consumption opportunities ranging from luxurious shopping malls to expensive restaurants, from residences within gated enclaves to exclusive fitness clubs. Marketers were at once administrators of these marketing activities and targets of this identity building process through consumption.

It is obvious that the knowledge of how to appropriate new goods is an important element of this dynamic. As Featherstone argues, 'this is particularly the case with aspiring groups who adopt a learning mode towards consumption and the cultivation of a lifestyle' (19). This knowledge is especially important to those people belonging to the new upper classes, for whom 'the consumer culture magazines, newspapers, books...which stress self-improvement...how to conduct a lifestyle, are most relevant (19). These marketers, along with other middle- and upper-level managers working at



multinationals, need guidance for their newly acquired economic capital. Those people whom Bourdieu calls ‘new cultural intermediaries’, who work in media, advertising, design, fashion etc. ‘ransack various traditions and cultures in order to produce new symbolic goods, and in addition provide the necessary interpretations on their use. (19) Although marketing managers do the same for their consumers, they are not associated with artists and intellectuals or recognized as cultural intermediaries who find symbolic goods and services that widen consumer culture. Most of these managers come from middle-class families; they do not build their subjectivity from scratch but build upon existing middle class values.

### **Chapters**

This thesis consists of four chapters. In the first chapter, I will examine the methodology of this research. In the second chapter, the process of subjection will be studied from the perspective of disciplinary mechanisms, contemporary enterprise culture and excellence discourse by drawing parallels between the marketing jobs of my informants. In the third chapter, I will analyze the distinctions and they tastes they build in their own lives, and in the lives of customers through choices in consumption. In the final chapter, personal crises and discursive recoveries are going to be discussed.

# Chapter 1:

## Method

### 1.1 Introduction

This chapter is a close examination of the sites and methods of my research. I aim to explain the choices I made prior to and during my field work and the framework which structures my research.

The core of my research is the subjection process in which the individual is subject to power, i.e. subject to Subject, and simultaneously free to act through disciplinary, distinctive and discursive practices. In this study, I examine the tension between structure and agency as it reflects on the subjection process of Turkish middle managers in marketing departments. In other words I study the ways in which ‘creativity and constraint are related through social activity... (to) explain their co-existence’ (Layder 4). Brand managers are the focus in this study due to their professional position, which is situated midway between production and consumption.

The tension between structure and agency has been one of the fundamental issues in social theory (Korczynski et al). On the one hand, organizations have been considered the ‘building blocks of societies’ (Haveman Khaire 272) and formal rationality of bureaucratic organizations has been regarded as ‘allow[ing] individuals little choice’ (Ritzer). According to this view, it is structures that fundamentally shape agency. On the other hand, some postmodernist literature has taken the opposite position and given full credit to agency in terms of its creative force. Alternatively, theorists such as Bourdieu and Giddens have explained the interconnectedness of agency and structure, by recognizing the constructive force of structures while at the same time acknowledging the ability of the agents to free themselves from being merely passive victims of structures.

Foucault on the other hand has discussed in relation to discipline and governmentality and indicated the importance of discursive practices.

Another important aspect of current discussions regarding the construction of subjectivity concerns the increasing significance of consumption and its use as a tool for constructing one's identity. While classical theorists such as Marx considered production as the central human activity, contemporary theorists including Beck denote that the evolution of capitalism is based on the person as 'autarkic human self', and du Gay and others assign consumption a less subordinate role compared to production and assert the merging of work and non-work.

With these theoretical positions in mind, I examine the tensions between structure/agency as well as production/consumption in relation to activities of female brand managers, whom I interviewed about their pasts, daily experiences, practices and the meanings they assign to their experiences discursively. In the first part, the informants were asked about their educational background, specifically what kind of influences led them to their future professions and how they ended up choosing their majors in college. In the second part of the interviews, I sought to understand what kind of lives they led, and how they assess their job and which benefits they obtain from it. In the last part, I considered the larger picture, asking them to evaluate their lives and work in general. To achieve these goals, I conducted semi-structured in depth interviews, participant and non-participant observations. In the rest of this chapter, I will give details of the methods used and the specifics of the sites and the informants.

## **1.2 Choice of sites and informants**

Since this research has been imagined as a study of subjection, the tension between structure and agency needs to be discussed in the context of formal institutions and real persons. Given that companies are prominent building blocks in the late capitalism, it can

be expected that employees of corporations can shed light on the process of subjectivity construction for individuals in contemporary society. Compared to smaller enterprises, corporations have greater impact on the society as a whole; thus, their members' methods for constructing subjectivity have effects on the society at large. These effects stem from the capacity of those individuals working at major structures to influence the economy and society as a result of the use of symbolic and economic capital.

I chose to study employees of multinational corporations because of the relatively strong impact these organizations have in an economy in which the financial and commercial flow of goods is fast: because multinational corporations hold influential positions, so do their employees. This power is derived from not only financial but also cultural means, which have the capacity to influence people's lives across the board.

As a developing country, Turkey is a perfect venue for observing the local effects of multinationals that originate from advanced industrial countries. Istanbul is the main city where these multinationals have their national or regional headquarters. It is also a noteworthy field in terms of the adaptation of international business practices into the local market. As mentioned earlier, with their economic and cultural capital, multinational corporations are ubiquitous on the retail scene in Turkey. They have not only been successful in attracting consumers but also their employees both in their country of origin and other countries. In terms of education and professional traits, these people are compatible with their colleagues around the world. Turkey is not an exception to this fact, and strongest candidates are attracted to those companies in career fairs or on-campus activities organized by these corporations, as I will discuss in subsequent chapters. In the context of my research, the existence of these people within those corporations was important, because I was looking for individuals whose job selection was not accidental but rather a result of their preference to be there.

These persons are competitive social actors. They have been chosen based on their educational past. All have been through the Turkish education system, which requires taking the university entrance exam (ÖSS) held at the end of the high school, which will be discussed in detail in the coming chapters. After years of preparation including weekend tutorials, each student takes this exam alongside a million other candidates. It is indeed a tough competition for limited opportunity. Those who do receive better scores tend to pursue studies either in administrative sciences/economics or engineering departments that generally create the candidate pool for multinationals.

While one of my aims was to understand the relationship between productive activity and the individual with a focus on its effect on subjectivity construction, the other was to comprehend the relationship between production and consumption and its influence on this building process. Since consumption has become an important undertaking in creating subjectivity, the tension between the consumption and production is important. People working in multinationals stand at a crossroads as they have the financial means to construct the self through consumption and are simultaneously at the core of production. Working at multinationals enables these people to enter dominated fractions of the dominant class. Through their educational training and their professional endeavor, they distinguish themselves from the lower classes through their newly acquired cultural and economic capital.

Since consumption is a significant aspect of late capitalism, it is important to explore the experiences of those who actively participate in this process as intermediaries. Because agents such as marketers and advertisers assign identities to products, their profession has wider impact on society at large. Due to their important role, their subjectivity construction sheds light on an important aspect of the self constructed in late capitalism. Thus, multinationals offer a great space for such an inquiry as well: marketing

departments are places where these professionals work.

After choosing marketing departments of multinationals as the best venue for this research, another important decision was to be made: what type of marketing activity would better serve my inquiry. All corporations are involved in marketing activities as they sell their products and services; however, not all these products or services meet the end consumer. Although companies that target business markets have an effect on the material world surrounding us, their influence is rather indirect. Instead, the main impact is related to the goods and services of everyday life. Instead of interviewing people in other industries such as those in the pharmaceutical sector in which marketing activities target physicians, it was more appropriate for my purposes to study those who are involved in marketing activities in consumer markets. Thus, with their constantly changing advertising campaigns and renewed products, companies which directly target consumer markets offer a more suitable choice, given their close contact with the end consumer and their capacity to provide the consumers with tools to shape their identity. In this respect, it was an advantage to concentrate on multinationals regardless of whether they market beverages or cosmetics. Their tendency to adapt the same campaigns or adapt same life style all over the world has been noted by Naomi Klein: ‘despite different cultures, middle-class youth all over the world seem to live their lives as in a parallel universe’ (Klein 119).

Another question was whom to study within those departments. Although marketing departments tend to have less hierarchy, there are different positions corresponding to several responsibilities. Most of the time, it is middle managers who are responsible for the products. While a top manager such as a marketing manager focuses on administrative issues such as managerial ones regarding departmental or cross-departmental matters, middle managers deal with every aspect of the product from its production to its

advertising campaigns, acting as arbitrators among related parties. Because of their close connection with the process of consumption and as well as their status as consumers themselves, I have decided to focus on those who hold middle managerial positions such as product/brand managers and group product managers.

After deciding on the level of the informants within the corporate hierarchy, the next question concerned gender. Even though women are represented in low ratios at the managerial level, marketing departments consist predominantly of women in Turkey. After college, many women who hold managerial degrees tend to choose to work at marketing departments or advertising agencies. Due to the high percentage of female managers within the marketing field in Turkey, it was obvious that gender was an aspect too significant to be omitted. Thus, I have limited my topic to women and decided to research the possible effects of gender when it comes to subjectivity construction through consumption and production.

### **1.3 Specifics of marketing in Turkey and informants**

Turkey, as the world's seventeenth largest economy and with its high percentage of youth population, is a vibrant market for multinationals and local companies to sell their products. Since its economy opened to foreign investment in the 1980s, marketing has become a giant industry. With the increase in television use and rising numbers of shopping malls and super markets, the retail industry became lively in Turkey, especially in Istanbul, the leading city for economic activities.

Companies attracted consumers' attention through familiar ways that have been used in advanced industrial countries for a long time. These methods include various activities from simple advertisement in magazines to media commercials, from the promotional activities held within stores to sponsorships and direct marketing. These methods adapted to Turkish consumer markets indeed aim at leading consumers' purchase behavior.

Multinational companies hold multiple departments within themselves such finance, logistics and sales, and marketing is one of them. Although it is impossible to tell whether all these companies have identical organizational schemes, the informants approached during the research described similar organizational schemes within their companies. They depicted parallel positions with interchangeable names: there are *brand managers* (some of them called it *product manager*) who are responsible of the marketing strategies of one of the brands of the company. They are usually supported by *assistant brand managers* (*assistant product manager*) who hold some responsibility in shaping the decisions made by the brand manager. *Group product managers* (*product category manager*) are responsible for multiple product lines or product groups. A product line can be described as ‘a group of products that are closely related because they function in a similar manner, are sold to the same customer groups, are marketed through the same types of outlets, or fall within given price ranges’ (Kotler 382). These people are usually supported by *market analysts* who provide a general picture of the whole market as well as specific reports on products within a certain category. Usually a *marketing manager* is in charge of the overall marketing activity of the company and this person is more often than not subordinate to general manager. In terms of organizational dynamics, these departments work in a horizontal fashion rather than a vertical one. One usually enters the company as an assistant brand/product manager. After couple of years of experience, one is promoted to the brand/product manager position, then proceeds to the group product manager positions, and finally becomes the marketing manager.

As for their work environment, my informants work in prestigious working places in Turkey. The headquarters of these companies are usually located in Istanbul, sometimes in prestigious areas and sometimes not. Their common feature, however, is that the buildings are necessarily compatible with international standards in terms of the quality of the



building and the facilities within it. Mid-level managers' offices usually consist of cubicals, whereas higher level managers have private offices.

Women are an important component of the labor market in Turkey. Percentage of women over the age of 12 who are in the labor force is 29.7%. According to State Institute of Statistics, the majority of women work in agriculture (48%), followed by women working in clerical sector (35%) and professional sector (33%) and a giant informal sector where great numbers of women work in occupations such as paid domestic household helpers (Ayca 3). Only 3.7% of women receive college education as opposed to 6.2% of men, and while university educated women have the highest rate of participation to the labor force (73%), it is still lower than men's participation rate in the labor force (86%) (Zeytinoglu et al. 234). Women working for managerial, service and production sectors range from 9 to 13%. Although women constitute 25% of the labor force in companies in greater Istanbul area, only 14% of middle management, and 3% of top management are women.

Although women are underrepresented at the managerial level, marketing is a field in which the female population reaches a relatively higher percentage<sup>1</sup>. Despite their relatively small numbers, the impact of these women is significant. Besides being constructors of consumer society in Turkey –being in a product manager position-, their experience is also noteworthy as they hold strong positions in the construction of business in a male-dominated business world. I seek to understand why they have made the choice to work where they do.

During my field work, I have talked to ten young middle managers whose ages range from 25 to 36. Except one, all work at multinationals which originate from advanced industrial countries; the one exception works at a multinational which originates in Turkey

---

<sup>1</sup> This information is based on personal observation and discussion with experts. There is no data available.

and has branches in Middle Asian countries in addition to former Soviet Republic countries. As I have explained, all of my informants work at retail companies whose area of expertise ranges from cosmetics to beverages, from fitness equipment to detergents. They all hold business related degrees, either directly business administration, or economics, except for one who majored chemistry and did not receive a formal training in a business related program. During this research I have interviewed ten women: four of them were group product managers, four of them product managers, one of them a marketing researcher and the other a human resources executive at a marketing company. The last two were included in the study to gain some insight into macro approaches towards marketing. The HR employee is relatively new to the corporate life and her insights shed light on the narratives created during college years.

All of my informants come from different layers of the middle class. Their mothers are predominantly housewives, except for two whose mothers are teachers; their fathers, on the other hand, are civil servants, entrepreneurs or managers, as Kabasakal also discusses in his findings. They all come from metropolises such as Istanbul, Ankara, Izmir, and Eskisehir.

They are graduates of top universities in Turkey such as Bosphorus, Koc, Bilkent, ITU, Marmara, Istanbul and have majored in departments that accept students who score in the top 1% in the university entrance exam. In addition, it is important to keep in mind that these informants have been through another selection process prior to the university exam, and even prior to their high school education: seven of these informants studied at special high schools, public or private. Despite their successful record as high school students, the informants have differences in their wants and desires; interestingly, they chose similar career paths despite these differences.

The companies of my informants are leading companies in the categories of beverages, cosmetics, personal care products, and cleaning supplies. Although the companies had differences in their marketing budgets, their status as leaders within each category was known by the informants.

#### **1.4 Methods Used**

In 2006, I conducted interviews with young managers for my short documentary *Object, Subject, Predicate* (Nesne, Ozne, Yuklem)<sup>2</sup>. Although this documentary was planned as an independent project, it enabled me to conduct preliminary research on the topic by pointing out that uneasiness with work does not necessarily cause one to leave the corporate environment. Rather, the discourse of complaint co-exists with the work.

Besides enabling me to discover the simultaneous existence of complaint discourse and the reluctance to leave, the documentary indicated that consumption was a very important aspect of corporate business. In the course of making the documentary, I interviewed young managers from various fields: from marketing to finance and advertising to telecom services. This variety led me to concentrate on the production of consumption. Although my findings cannot be generalized, all the informants who left the corporate business were men. None of the women did so. So, my documentary inspired me to explore the gender aspect of production, consumption, and subjectivity.

In this research, I conducted semi-structured in-depth interviews with my informants as my primary research tool. These interviews were arranged with these young women as

---

<sup>2</sup> My aim was to understand the reasons for the people to enter into corporate business, the alienation they experience despite the allure of business, and the ways in which they coped with it. As it is obvious in the title, the documentary was based on certain assumptions regarding the human nature such as the result of being alienated from the paid work in a Marxian fashion. This assumption caused me to concentrate on those who exited corporate life through entrepreneurial endeavors, although the documentary consisted those as well who continued their life within corporate business despite their declaration that they really did not want to continue with it. There is indeed a charm in studying the 'exceptional'; however during the documentary, it occurred to me that staying in the corporate business and continuing one's life as it is no less challenging endeavor than leaving it. Although most people enter business track are not much in control of the events during their education, most of them continue working despite their complaints about their job which is in their words 'incompatible' with their character.

one-on-one meetings, in which there was no one present but the informant. Due to the personal nature of these interviews, the presence of another person, whatever the closeness to the informant may be, could change the stories told by the informants. So, I specifically asked them to be alone during our interviews. Interview locations have varied from their offices to cafes and their houses. The interviews lasted from 45 minutes up to three hours each.

The semi-structured nature of the interviews allowed informants to move more freely within their stories. With little guidance, they told me about their educational life and professional endeavors as well as the benefits and burdens of their jobs. The informants were asked to talk about their jobs: why they chose their profession, their career steps starting from their educational life, the responsibilities in their jobs varying from routine tasks to unique accomplishments, their daily practices, their company cultures, their experiences as women within corporate business, their life styles and their backgrounds such as their hometown and the professions of their parents. These questions were meant to lead them to describe the careered selves and to find out how they fit with their imaginary selves.

The point of origin of this research has been my personal work experience as a product manager at two multinational companies. This background certainly had several advantages; for example, it allowed me to find interviewees relatively easily. However, I believe that the biggest advantage I had in my research has been my continuous relationship with these women. As it will be explored throughout the thesis, discourse is an important element in subjectivity construction. To move beyond a formal discourse that reflects a flawless life trajectory – even though surface narratives are also important – can be achieved through the personal trust. Only one of the informants was someone who I met just before the interview started, and it took more time for her to break the ice and to

express her thoughts about her job and its effects on her selfhood. Thus, my previous participant observation was an important part of this research, catalyzing it and helping me to connect to the informants.

In addition to these points, my continuous relationship with these women helped me to observe various phases of their lives and allowed me to refer to their past experiences during the interview. This offered the advantage of confronting discrepancies that came up during the interview between their discourse and acts and of referring to the changes in their careers or personal lives, such as motherhood. This continuing relationship allowed me to experience focus-group-like encounters with these young women during informal gatherings: although these meetings were organized to share life outside formal working life, the conversations usually addressed working life including the praises and complaints about it.

I would like to stress the fact that this research was not aimed at being a representation of all women working in managerial positions. Due to the limited number of interviewees and the method through which I found these women (I did not use snowball sampling method in all these informants), it is impossible to reach general conclusions about the process of subjectivity construction for all women, or even specifically the ones working in corporate business. It is, nevertheless, an exploratory research that sheds light on the ways in which subjectivity construction takes place for women in marketing.

### **1.5 Conclusion**

In this research, I aimed to understand how young female marketing managers perceive themselves and others who are located between the realms of production and consumption, how they build their subjectivities amidst a tension between agency and structure. In the next chapter, I will look at the educational and corporate institutions as sites for disciplining individuals.

# Chapter 2: The Production of Consumption

## 2.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I would like to elaborate the structural aspects of the subjectivity construction of young Turkish female marketing managers. Particularly, I will go into detail on various disciplinary practices and mechanisms which these young managers go through in their lives. These mechanisms practiced on and through them by the institutions such as education, family and corporation are included within the scope of this thesis because of their explanatory qualities of the informants' choices of professions to begin with. Due to the similarities of the characteristics of the individuals interviewed required an inquiry of the ways in which these individuals have been disciplined instead of discussing all the disciplinary processes that they have been through, I concentrated on those which affected their choices and continuation of profession through different stages of their lives.

Foucault's work on individuals who are instructed to build 'self-disciplined' subjects explained the strength of discipline over punishment through its recursive capacity to recreate certain results even in the absence of it. In Foucault's work, it is discussed that discipline is not only something that restricts and forbids, but also reproduces subjectivities. Thus, the education and upbringing of these young managers are important to study the similar professional choices made by them.

Framework set by Foucault is also useful to understand the professional lives of these young managers. A late-twentieth century phenomenon of 'corporate culture' is very much at work within their companies which aim to increase the commitment of the employee to the company. Although these shifts from bureaucratic organization imply more autonomy to the employers, in fact according to some theorists, 'corporate cultures' aim to change the self conception of employees and commit their selves to the organization. With the disappearance of the stable careers offered by the corporations, the workers are inclined to have mobile

careers: instead of investing the self into a single type of job, the employees look for opportunities to increase their marketability by increasing the number of their transferable skills. In this chapter, I will analyze the impact of this ‘enterprise culture’.

One part of my theoretical framework was based on the poststructuralist and post-Marxist approaches on governmentality and ideology. I would like to focus on governing abilities of organizations over their subjects, i.e. employees. While doing this, I would like to understand the parallels between the self-fulfilling employee and consumer through looking at ‘enterprise culture’ and its excellence discourse in contemporary societies. Despite its prevalence, governmentality issue brings the question of achievability to mind. The misrecognition occurring due to the gap between the ‘real’ and its symbolization is something impossible to overcome (du Gay 70), thus the tensions that emerge as a result of enterprise culture comes as no surprise and causes discrepancies between the aim and the result, in this case the impossibility of the enterprising self.

While corporate culture, education and family discipline individuals, these managers in turn become disciplining subjects and reproduce it through their positions. While this can happen within the corporation through disciplining other employees, it can extend to the professional practices of these women in marketing: disciplining the consumer. While this is challenged by theorists, the traces of disciplining consumers emerged in some of the interviews. This enabled me to expand the role of the consumption in terms of subjectivity production which will be the analytical thread connecting this chapter to the subsequent ones.

## **2.2 Discipline and Education**

Discipline is an important element to understand the subjectivity construction of the young Turkish marketing managers due to its crucial role in choosing their professions. Although I will be discussing the centrality of the work within the later chapters and I do not point it as the foremost important part of the subjectivity construction process, their choice of

profession is indeed very important because it places these individuals into the center of the late capitalism through their accomplishments. Education in this process is decisive in terms of assignment of their professional posts. The fact that these agents come from similar schools brings to mind that schools next to workplaces, military and hospitals are the venues where discipline is employed. In this process, docility is important since it generates the possibility that the subjects' actions not only be lead but also be predicted.

Although power has always had a hold upon the body, since the classical age, the scope and the methods employed rather than the outcome has increased its importance. As a result, 'these methods, which made possible the meticulous control of the operations of the body, which assured the constant subjection of its forces and imposed upon them a relation of docility-utility, might be called 'disciplines' were born (Discipline and Punish, 1995: 137). The birth of disciplines is an outcome of historical economic, juridico-political and scientific processes in the classical age where body, which can be 'useful' and 'intelligible' at the same time, is discovered as 'the object and the target of power' (136). Docility is the core of such an idea since a docile body can be 'subjected, used, transformed and improved' (136). These characteristics of discipline is not only its ability to turn the bodies into more apt and subjective entities but also to increase the obedience of the bodies while making them more useful and to make them more useful while increasing their obedience. This notion lead to a perception of the 'body as a machine: its disciplining... the parallel increase of its usefulness and its docility, its integration into systems of efficient and economic controls' (139).

These young managers are accepted as successful students by the school hierarchy, and they spend long time at educational institutions. Since success is dependent on their performance evaluated by the disciplinary mechanisms, I would like to argue that their success creates more docile subjects. Before elaborating on this matter further, I would like to



give an example of the phenomenon of success within the education system and its impact in the creation of docility of the subjects.

Zeynep, a graduate of Bosphorus University, explains her choice to study economics as a coincidence. She reveals that she did not know the difference between studying management and economics, and her aim was not building a career in finance or banking: 'I'm not sure why I chose economics. Actually, it's probably because I didn't know anything about it, that's the correct answer. I thought management and economics are the same thing...After completing Turkish/Mathematics track, one can only go to management, economics and political science departments ... My score was not enough to get into management and ended up at economics, very coincidental'.<sup>3</sup>

As a good student at high school, while considering her options for her future profession, the only criterion was the descending order of the necessary points to obtain in the exam to be accepted by a department. Her studying economics does not stem from the fact that it was the most suitable major to her considered self, but it was rather a tactical choice to reach the aims which will be contemplated in detail within the following chapter. However, the choices available (to study within this area of study regardless of major differences between the departments) are accepted without much thought. According to her, the choice was 'crystal clear' for her that she needed to obtain a degree from a good university, and find a good job. University entrance exam is the utmost disciplinary tool for the high school students in Turkey; and from mastering abilities in standardized test preparation to selection of profession, disciplinary tools are at work to make the 'most' of the student. Discipline disguises itself in a way that Zeynep does not recognize the disciplinary tools which lead to make important decisions. Before discussing the ways in which discipline is exercised on

---

<sup>3</sup> Ekonomiyi neden sectim bilmiyorum. Aslında hiçbir şey bilmediğim için sectim, aslında doğru cevap bu. İşletme ekonominin aynı şeyler olduğunu... TMden mezun olunca girebileceğim sırayla işletme ekonomi uluslararası ilişkilerdi. Puanım işletmeyi tutmadı ekonomiye girdim. Gayet tesadüfi bir şey.

these individuals, I would like to give another example to point to the continuation of this disciplinary process as long as one is within the educational institutions.

Begum made her decision to become either a computer or electrical engineer before the university entrance exam. Despite her determination, she did not receive the necessary scores due to family problems that year and ended up in majoring in chemistry. Although she hated studying chemistry, she was a good student and she continued nevertheless to a master's degree focusing on 'coal' as her subject.

'I studied my major without liking it, but my grades were really good and the head of the department forced me into the master's program: I started an MS on coal. Why coal? Where could this subject take me to? Would I devote my life to coal?'<sup>4</sup>

Again discipline works in Begum's decision in continuing an advanced degree in an area of her dislike, and yet in a different way than Zeynep. Instead of a vague structure leading her way, the learned submissiveness enables Begum to yield to her professor's wish. An 'authority' figure who evaluates her, who also has the power to decide what to make of her: the professor has the 'say' on her future profession even if this is against her will.

These statements raise couple of problems: Why did Zeynep select a profession without knowing much about it? How did Begum manage to be a top student despite her hatred for her major? And why did she continue her studies for an advanced degree despite her dislike. The common point in both cases is that both of them were among the best exam takers that year. Despite the fact that they had the opportunity to study anything they want, they specifically made certain choices, instead of trying to find the best fit to their characters, they took the engineering path or the business track. Contrary to their higher placement within the student ranking, their role as agencies in this choice remains weak. Instead of the individual who is 'expected' to be capable of making her own decisions and of avowing her likes and

---

<sup>4</sup> Ben bolumu sevmeyerek okudum ama bolum notlarim cok iyiydi, bolum baskani beni master programina aldi zorla, ben komur uzerine master yapmaya basladim tamam mi ben. Neden, bu komur ne olabilir en fazla, hayatimi komure adar miyim'

dislikes agency, the structural forces such as school and other authority figures are dominant in the decision making process of these women. Although these women can pinpoint these structures, this awareness does not explain why they submit to these structures. These are power mechanisms that impact the individuals through multiple sources, including the self. That is why these mechanisms have profound effects on the individual's way of acting. The roles taken by these women are rather similar to the 'docile' pupil who follows the master. Disciplinary mechanisms have their impact on her as described by Foucault: while making most of 'the student', they turn him/her into a controllable and predictable entity. At this point discipline needs to be discussed to go further in this research.

Power should not be regarded as only a mean of restriction and forbiddance, on the contrary, since classical times, it became something constructive: through discipline it makes the 'individuals' which is regarded as 'the fictitious atom of an 'ideological' representation of society' (Foucault 1995: 194). To build the individuals, discipline uses simple instruments which the students encounter through their education: hierarchical observation, normalizing judgment and the combination of the first two, the examination. The 'hierarchical' observation enables the authority figure to monitor its subjects, and in the case of Begum, she is scrutinized by her professor and the power over her is so strong that she decides to go on with her education in a field that does not interest her, a fact that she can only tell retrospectively. It is also true for Zeynep, who was a subject to a hierarchical order at the university entrance exam. It is this hierarchical observation that lead Zeynep and Begum develop a sense of hierarchy after graduating from the college: At the exam, Zeynep was quite successful – by enrolling in her second choice- and Begum considers herself dissatisfied with the result because she ended up in a department where she would not like to study. However, this hierarchical placement of the students at colleges which are ranked from the good to the less good builds up expectations which are parallel to the academic order of the schools that is

not always match with the state of the market. Zeynep for example points out the fact that students at prestigious institutions increase their expectations for the period after graduation: ‘I was in vain: ‘I am a Bosphorus graduate; I received my master’s degree in the USA’ etc. I came back to Turkey in 2000, the problem was the difference between your expectations and what you have found. I thought they will be eager to hire me; nobody invited me to an interview for three months’.<sup>5</sup>

In addition to the discrepancy between the increase in the supply of business graduates and the jobs that do not increase at the same rate as the number of graduates, expectations of some of the graduates are not always met and such was Zeynep’s case.

Begum’s expectations were also parallel to the hierarchical order of colleges and departments. Since she majored in chemistry, she kept her expectations low prior entering corporate world, and let the employer to take the upper hand:

‘I did not receive an education related to this topic. (I have decided on the profession, and) I would start at any position that they give me at a corporate business entity. Then, I was going to see whether it is sales or marketing. I mean whatever position they see me worth’.<sup>6</sup>

Another thing is that whole education system is based on ‘normalization’ of the students and it is achieved through normalizing judgment which punishes to a certain extent, but mostly rewards. Students like Begum are ranked through the entire educational life and more specifically at the university entrance exam, their qualities as students are hierarchized and their aptitudes are valued. Although she sees to end up at chemistry not as a success compared to be accepted to an engineering department, she indeed makes her way up to be a

---

<sup>5</sup> Boyle çok havalardaydım iste, Bogazici mezunuyum, Amerika’da master yaptım falan filan. Ben 2000’de döndüm. Sorun şu beklenti ve buldukların. Ustume atlayacaklar falan filan zannederken, beni üç ay mulakata çağırın falan olmadı.

<sup>6</sup> Ben bu konunun eğitimini almadım. Mesleğe karar verdim, kurumsal bir şirkette bana verecekleri herhangi bir pozisyonda işe başlayacağım. Ondan sonra da bakacağım: bu satış ya da pazarlama olabilir. Hani beni nereden başlamaya değer görürlerse artık

top student at her department despite her dislike. The rewards of being a good student are the approval and encouragement of the professors to pursue in an advanced study within the same department. She differentiated herself from her fellow classmates by being a favorite student and while being 'normal' by staying within the limits appointed by the discipline. Her continuation of her college education saved her from being an outsider, she was doing what she was expected because as she stated 'I had to be placed to a college' meaning that she had no other choice other than continuing her education, because not continuing was going to make her 'abnormal', a high school graduate not having the same opportunities as her friends.

Finally, all the grades they received throughout their university education (and needless to say, the ones they received in their prior education) and the sole reason of Begum and Zeynep's being there --the university entrance exam in Turkey--, are the combination of 'hierarchical observation' with 'normalizing judgment' in the form of an examination. According to Foucault, 'it is the examination which, by combining hierarchical surveillance and normalizing judgment, assures the great disciplinary functions of distribution and classification, maximum extraction of forces and time, continuous genetic accumulation, optimum combination of aptitudes and the fabrication of cellular, organic, genetic, and combinatory individuality' (1990: 191). As we will see in subsequent sections and chapters, these qualities with which the students are endowed will remain effective throughout the adult life, however in the fourth chapter we will see that discipline may not always function as expected.

### **2.3 Impact of the Family**

In addition to school being an important institution to discipline the individual, family occupies a significant role in shaping the subject. In Zeynep's case, instead of telling what to do, silences about her future profession were decisive in her choice. Her family seems to have limited her options so that she was simply unaware of any other choices; retrospectively, she

remembers that becoming an entrepreneur or an artist was not an option for her. While she mainly finds her family responsible for this unawareness, she recalls that the others around her did not offer any other models:

‘I find my family responsible on this matter, I don’t know maybe I am responsible too, but because my parents are people who strip off their ambitions and let me do whatever I want, nobody showed me alternative ways, options, you can do this and that...’<sup>7</sup>

Indeed, Zeynep’s trajectory influenced her professional choices; however, instead of her family discipline her in terms of what to desire, silences kept her unaware of other paths to take. By this, I do not imply that her parents were keeping their knowledge from her, but I would like to point out that her family is not external to the constitution of what is desirable and what is not. The hierarchical observation works through the ordering of the professions, thus the family does not lead their children to those professions which are not on the sight. With a teacher mother and a retired army officer father, the choices were clear as Zeynep expresses: to graduate from a good college and find a good job. Due to the class origin of the family, they perceive that hierarchically the highest ranking job is being a salaried employee in corporate business. It is also noteworthy; the only suggestion coming from Zeynep’s mother is being a doctor, probably the highest ranking state officer job in the minds of state officers (as per their perception.) Although Zeynep objected it, it is possible to say that the hierarchical observation of the family regarding the professions affect these young managers.

The disciplinary acts of families differ from one to another and thus Irem’s family sets a different example. Although Irem made a radical change before the exam and changed her track from sciences to Turkish -mathematics i.e. engineering to management, her initial aspiration to become an engineer stemmed from the normalizing judgment within her family

---

<sup>7</sup> Bu konda mesela ailemi suçluyorum bilmiyorum belki bende de bir sorumluluk vardır, ama hani benim annemle babam da gayet hirslerinden arınmış ya sen ne istersen takil falan filan turu insanlar oldukları için bana herhangi bir şekilde ,bak hayatta soyle soyle farklı yollara gitmek gibi bir opsiyon da vardır bu da yapılır bu da yapılır gibi bir şey gösteren de olmadı

circle. Having an engineer father, her parents desired her to take over the family company, so it would be more appropriate to major in engineering. However, she does not recall any apparent guidance from her family regarding the issue:

‘My father is an electrical engineer, he owns his own company. (My family) implied that I should be the engineer of the family after him; I was treated like the son of the family. It is indeed what my family did but nobody ever said anything to me. I was lead this way by myself, nobody told me which job to choose, but your mind works in that way.’<sup>8</sup>

Although her parents did not force her to take a similar path as the father and did not give any fervent reactions towards her change of track, selecting the father’s occupation was similar to normalizing judgment of the school, the family’s approval was signified through gestures and approvals of the family.

#### **2.4 Subjection through work**

The next step of the subjection of the individual occurs within the work. In the following section, I would like to examine individual’s subjection parallel to Althusser’s scheme of subjection: ‘the interpellation of ‘individuals’ as subjects; their subjection to the Subject; the mutual recognition of subjects and Subject, the subjects’ recognition of each other’ (Althusser). ‘Enterprise culture’ became prevalent following economic stagnation suffered since the late 1970s prioritizes the market as a pre-eminence. It is accepted as the symbol of neo-liberal policies which blamed the anti-enterprise cultural view as being responsible for the stagnation (du Gay 56). The enterprise culture makes ‘the interpellation of individuals’ possible through ‘discourse of excellence’ within which ‘the internal world of enterprise is re-conceptualized as one. In this way the productivity is to be improved; production and service quality is assured, flexibility enhanced, and innovation developed

---

<sup>8</sup> Benim babam elektrik mühendisi, hep böyle iste kendi şirketi var falan filan, ondan sonra sen de mühendis ol da, evin erkek çocuğu gibi davranırlardı bana.... Mutlaka onların yaptığı bir şeydir ama kimse böyle bir şey söylemedi ...Kendimce buna yönlendim bir şekilde, kimse bana ,sen söyle olacaksın böyle olacaksın demedi. Hakikaten kimse demedi ama bir şekilde kafan oyle çalışıyor yani.

through the active engagement of the self-fulfilling impulses of all the organization's members (du Gay 60). The subjection to the Subject is achieved through the disciplinary methods, and finally the 'subjects' recognition of each other' is accomplished through evaluating the coworkers in the company.

#### **2.4.1 Interpellation of 'individuals' as subjects :Enterprise Culture**

After being allocated to multinationals at managerial positions, the subjection process continues for the managers through the corporations. Neo-liberal economic model pointed the dependent organizations and individuals as the malady of the crisis of the capitalism in the late 1970s. Since the problem was the dependence on the government or on bigger structures in general, the enterprise model was the bale-out ticket of the troubled economy and the qualities of an enterprise was to be embraced by all parties.

The characteristics of this enterprise culture are derived from the traits of enterprise; thus, qualities such as 'self-reliance, personal responsibility, boldness and a willingness to take risks in the pursuit of goals' are regarded as human virtues. This culture discursively encourages organizations, (either public or private ones) and individuals to act on these 'virtues'. Accordingly, keeping the entrepreneurial traits in mind, a new management discourse of excellence appeared centering the consumer in the middle. This discourse aimed at reconstructing work-based identities in which the employee was in search of satisfaction in whatever she does at work as the consumer yearns for self-fulfilling in consumption activities. This notion indeed points to a unification process of the economic and cultural realms, as Jameson puts it 'the colonization of culture by the market does not imply the disappearance or extinction of the culture; rather, it suggests a situation in which the corporate is now the culture' (du Gay 58). Nevertheless, the excellence discourse has been imagined as a stable ground against the ever changing nature of globalized economy. This culture is embraced due to its qualities of encouraging the employees being flexible and adapting the changes rather



easily and uniting the company's objectives and their personal aims. Under these circumstances, the distinction between work and non-work identities become unclear. As Kanter states, 'people rely primarily on their human capital [and] they need portable career assets – skills and reputation that can be applied anywhere' to survive within the enterprise culture (Kanter 291). Individual at work place is supposed to take herself as a project as the consumer does.

The enterprise culture which takes entrepreneurial traits as human values is so prevalent that it effects the decision of students before choosing their major at the college. The possibility to choose from among a variety of options makes studying business an attractive choice for those who did not decide on what they are going to do in the future. Defne believed that she would be more flexible in terms of experiencing different jobs:

'I have decided to study economics because I thought it would allow me to do more than one thing. I thought that management suits to my personality and if I study management, I would be able to work at variety of jobs and have the opportunity to try out different things, in that way I won't be stuck at one thing.'<sup>9</sup>

Defne seems to grasp the gist of the enterprise culture which requires the employees to be multifunctional and flexible to adapt themselves to changing conditions of the global economy. Another informant Cagla explains her reason to study business as studying business was a smart choice for someone who does not know what to do in the future

'[My choice of profession] wasn't that conscious. I studied business at Bilkent. When I was at high school, some alumni came to school to inform us [about career choices]...One of them was a business major and she said that 'business majors can do everything, you can work in

---

<sup>9</sup> Birden fazla is olanagina imkan saglayacagini dusundugum icin isletme okumaya karar verdim. Ben dedim isletme benim karakterime uygun ben isletme okursam ondan sonra cok farkli islerde calisabilirim ondan sonra cok farkli seyler deneme imkanim olabilir hani bir seye takilip kalmam, ben en iyisi isletme okuyim falan dedim...

finance or marketing, you can decide later'. I thought to myself 'what a great discipline to postpone my decision'.<sup>10</sup>

The very characteristics of a popular major such as management point to the undefined character of the jobs within the enterprise culture. The fact that the discourse around the major lead her to make her choice accordingly before entering the profession suggests that the discourse of excellence is so intense to penetrate other realms such as educational institutions. While causing a personal crisis which will be discussed in the Chapter Four, Cagla's postponement made room for the excellence discourse of the corporate culture which aims to unite the objectives of the company and the individual.

The excellence discourse takes its full grown role within the corporation. To align the individual's goals with company's objectives is achieved in Irem's case: she is proud of working for a company that sets the rules of the market. She likes her company because of her capability of making the strategic decisions to rule the market:

'To evaluate the market research, decide on the strategy...you learn a lot. It's nice to do something by using logic'.<sup>11</sup>

It should be kept in mind that governing the individual requires free subjects, as Foucault suggests 'power is exercised only over free subjects, and only insofar they are free' (du Gay 55). Irem's preference of marketing over finance is expressed as the desire for freedom within the job:

'Don't make me write a report or tell me to do this or that, or this job is done like that and do it this way! I really hate that... But marketing offers more free space despite the fact you have

---

<sup>10</sup> Çok bilincli olmadı. İletme okudum Bilkent'te. ..biz liseden mezun olurken bize mezunlar konusmaya gelmişlerdi liseye. .. Ben opsiyonlarımı açık tutayım diye işletmeyi seçtim. Çünkü işletmeciler kızlar için dedi, 'işletmeciler her şeyi yapar, finans da yaparsın pazarlama da yaparsın, sonra da karar verebilirsin' dedi. Ben de bunu yapmak istediğimi ertlemek için harika bir bölüm diye işletmeciler oldum.

<sup>11</sup> Mesela araştırmaları ortaya koyup bunlar bunlar böyle stratejimizi böyle belirleyelim falan... Mantık yürüterek bir şeyler yapmak güzel

to stick with some rules, but it allows you to apply novel ideas. It makes you think that you can do non-traditional things'.<sup>12</sup>

She portrays herself not as a cog in the wheel; rather, she depicts herself as someone who is in charge of important decisions and holds the sole responsibility of the success and the failure of her product. In fact, her position as a 'product manager' is parallel to the enterprise culture: she acts as a conductor. Although there are numerous elements cause the success and the failure of a product apart from her accomplishments as a manager such as quality of the ingredients to logistics operations of the product, the company appoints her as the single person whose personal efforts have a fundamental consequence on the destiny of the product. This managerial approach puts the accomplishments of the employees to the center, thus turns the work into an area of self-actualization. Since the enterprise culture is a valued mind set embraced by the neo-liberal economy, the desire for success is not limited within the corporate wall, rather the whole work environment is imbued in it. Irem explains her desire for success is not limited to her corporate job. She says that she needs to accomplish something even if she owned her own company:

'I never accept things as they are. I think that I am the reason why these companies stress me out so much. I can't stand without doing anything...I always say that this doesn't work, we should do this in a different way, and start fighting for it. You can call it as 'improving' things, or not being satisfied... I can't stay home doing nothing, if I didn't have a job I would rest a bit, but would feel useless after a while... Is it only money that motivates me? No, not really. This is the motivation to succeed'.<sup>13</sup>

---

<sup>12</sup> Bana rapor yazdirma ya da bana soyle yaptirma ,bu is boyle yapiliyor hadi al bunu yap falan.... Hani ondan nefret ediyorum mesela o yuzden... Pazarlama daha sey, her ne kadar bir suru kurala uysak da etsek de bir suru sey yapsak da 'a evet bud a cok iyi fikir' dedigin zaman mesela gene de yapabilecegin bir ortam var esasinda. Farkli bir sey yapabilecegini dusunuyorsun pazarlamada.

<sup>13</sup> Olani oldugu gibi kabul etmem...Beni bu sirketlerin bu kadar zorlamasinin sebebi nedenlerinden biri de benim yani.sonucta ben bir seyleri,bu is de boyle yuruyormus boyle takil gibi oldugu yerde surdur de mesela, yapamiyorum... diyorum bunu soyle yapsak daha iyi olur diyorum direkt onun mucadelesine giriyorum mesela...Ben hep bir improve etmek, ya da tam tersine tatmin olmamak da diyebilirsin yani. evde yatiyor olsam mesela o hani bana gore kotu demiyim de bir sure acaip dinlenirim kendi kendime takilirim falan ama bir sure

Her thoughts are in line with enterprise culture which assigns the individual with a project of the self, which expects her to be willing to take risks and be in sustainable progress. Her approach towards pecuniary gains of her job seems secondary compared to the success she desires.

Zeynep's approach is similar to Irem's: she desires to be successful in whatever she does. Although she now and then questions the point of her efforts in corporate life, she finds the business results very important:

'I'm an ambitious type, business results are very important to me. I want to be really successful where I am... I like to do things that I really can...there are some types who're like 'I am not great at it, but I like it anyway'. I'm the opposite, I hate doing things that I'm not good at... When I get good results I get more enthusiastic, when I get more enthusiastic I work more.'<sup>14</sup>

The enterprising subject constantly advances in whatever she does. The self in this culture is based on the constant improvement and yearning for satisfaction. Success here is the core of the work identity because of its paramount position to the mentioned enterprise project. However, as consumption, it is a never ending process since every accomplishment is expected to be followed by another triumph and there is no final destination in the journey of self-actualization.

Defne sees her job as something could not be done by everyone. Because of the nature of retail industry, one has to be quick in making decisions and work under pressure.

---

sonra kendimi ise yaramaz hissedebilirim. Kendim de bir sey yapmiyor olmamam ben yani, kesin bir seylerin pesinden kosuyor olurum yani...O benim icimde engel olamadigim bir sey. Ama bunun motivasyonu ne dersem sirf para mi para degil. Benim mesela motivasyonum daha cok kendi isimde de oyle olur parayla beraber bunu yaptim, yani basarmanin motivasyonu...

<sup>14</sup> Ben normalde hirsli bir tipimdir, is sonuclari benim icin cok onemlidir ... ben iyi yapabildigim seyleri yapmaktan hoslanıyorum, hani ne bileyim bazi tipler vardir ya... 'beceremiyorum ama cok seviyorum' benim hic oyle bir seyim yoktur, beceremedigim sey yapmaktan hic haz almam. Iyi sonuc aldigimda daha cok gaza geliyorum, gaza gelince daha cok calisiyorum falan...

According to her, the real challenge of her job is to keep up with the pace while reaching satisfying results, not only for the company but also for the product manager itself:

‘In companies where they do [marketing] really good, it is not something that could be done by everyone because you work under real pressure. Secondly, I personally like the aspect of my job that you have to be creative... There are lots of people working at ad agencies and you spend a lot of money to accomplish something... But at the end of the day, you are the starting point of all these things, you are the one who should have a vision, then you look for those who can make your thoughts real.... Thus, you have to be really creative. ...The visionary people get attention rather easily in this profession. What extra value will you add to that job? If you quit today and some other person continues to do the same thing, you’re no different than a state officer.’<sup>15</sup>

She thinks that one is only happy as long as one ‘creates’ something and the person itself sets the limits of the quality of her work. Thus, she thinks her job could not be done by everyone and she differentiates herself from those who do not have specific qualities. In her statements, one can notice similar tones to Marxist notion of seeing the creative act as the core of human activity. However, one should remember this is a discourse. It can be concluded that the self as a project includes the creative activity as a means of fulfillment.

As Irem stated before, Defne’s dominant role within decision mechanisms is important in the process of the project of the self. Defne sees herself as the real owner of the job. The

---

<sup>15</sup> Gerçekten hakkiyla yapılan sirketlerde herkesin yapabilecegi bir is degil cunku hakikaten baya ciddi bir baski altinda calismak gerekiyor. İkincisi benim kisisel olarak hosuma giden tarafı hakikaten sahsen bir seyleri, bir yaraticilik gostremen gereken bir is. ... Bir suru insan calisiyor bu ajanslarin icersinde ve bir yillik pazarlama planina bakarsan dunyanin parasini harcayarak bir suru is yapmaya calisiyorsun... Ama gunun sonunda butun bu yaptigin islerin cikis noktasi da ilham kaynagi da asil vizyon sahibi olmasi gereken de sensin sen kafanda bir sey kuruyorsun, sonra kafandakileri hayata gecirebilmek icin uygun insanlari ariyorsun...Dolayisiyla hakikaten sahsen yaratici olmayi gerektiren bir is bence. Ve ben sey diye dusunuyorum, herkesin yetenekleri birbirinden farkli ve vizyon sahibi olan insanlar cok daha kolay sivriliyorlar bu iste, bu organizasyonlar icersinde... Sen sahsen extra ne katacaksin yaptigin ise, sen bugun oradan ayrilsan baskasi gelse ayni seyi devam ettirse senin orada bir zaten hani memurdan farkin yok’.

advertising agencies are ancillary elements within the work hierarchy because they only help product managers:

‘You are the main owner of the work, the one who owns the brand. And that person says the final word, and makes the real decision.’<sup>16</sup>

It is the power of the discourse of excellence that these individuals experience freedom and feel holding the whole responsibility while uniting their interests with those of the corporation.

Ozge likes the fact that she deals with new products and new strategies every year.

While being on the decisive side of the work, she thinks that her link to the advertising agencies makes her job really interesting:

‘You find new agencies, or you meet different people every day, you get new viewpoints every day. I think these are great contributions to your life...I like those agencies, the people at the agencies, the commercials. This is a satisfaction that is absent in other businesses. In the intriguing world of advertising, competition is really nice’.<sup>17</sup>

Competition and the ever changing nature of her job are the traits which makes her job interesting. These qualities are in line with the expectations of the excellence project which positions the subject always relative to others and this way she increases her transferable qualities.

Enterprising subject’s connection with the consumer is also obvious in Defne’s relationship with her job.

‘You do something to impress people, they go to the store and buy it. You say that the sales boomed, and then you go to abroad and tell it as a success story, and they congratulate you ...

---

<sup>16</sup> Isin gercek sahibinin oldugu bir yerde calisiyorum ben... Ve asil sozu o soyluyor ve asil karari o veriyor.

<sup>17</sup> Yeni yeni ajanslar buluyorsun yani boyle her gun, ya da her gun olmasa da yeni insanlarla tanisiyorsun, yeni bir bakis acisi elde ediyorsun... bu ajanslar falan da hosuma gidiyor, ajans camiasi, reklamlar. Onlar orada yok mesela. Hesaplar reklam dunyasinin renkligi rekabet falan onlar hos seyler aslinda.

That is something you can't find in every job... You claim something, and consumers trust you, and buy it!'<sup>18</sup>

Her job is in the intersection between the work and non-work. Her search for satisfaction coincides with the satisfaction of the 'sovereign consumer', a blurred area where work ends and consumption begins is uncertain.

#### **2.4.2 Subjection to the Subject**

While calling the individual as a free subject, the corporation also works as a disciplinary institution. Control is achieved through disciplinary methods such as surveillance. Irem gives an example of such surveillance in her day-to-day job: she exchanges emails everyday with the CEO of the company because the CEO knows all the market shares of the product that she is responsible for to their decimal digits, thus she is well aware about surveillance within the company:

'There is a lot of pressure; they always keep an eye on you. It is not a relaxed environment; generally, it is not a place easy to survive.'<sup>19</sup>

Although a brand manager is considered as the 'parent' of the brand in Irem's company, CEO is directly involved in the daily activities and Irem is constantly scrutinized. Like a pupil who constantly deals with the hierarchical observation, in Irem's case, the setting is the company. Even minute changes in the sales of her product are questioned by not only her immediate superior within the organizational scheme, but also by the highest ranking official within that organization. She, thus, incessantly rated through her market share compared to brands of other companies, and 'worth' as a product manager is questioned by the end of every day. The scrutinizing eye of a higher authority figure never disappears.

---

<sup>18</sup> Bir sey yapiyorsun etkileniyor, kosup satin aliyor, vay satislar patladi hey falan diyorsun, o hakikaten sonra onu yurtdisina gidip basari hikayesi olarak anlatiyorsun oradaki adamlar da bravo falan diyor 'hey' falan diye geri geliyorsun. Her iste olmayan bir sey bu... iddia ediyorsun, sana guveniyorlar, kosa kosa satin aliyorlar onu.'

<sup>19</sup> Cok baski var cok takip ediyorlar, hic rahat bir ortam degil oyle bir durum var yani ... genel olarak, survive etmek cok kolay bir yer degil'

Besides constant eye on the brand manager, there are other methods to observe the manager hierarchically and normalize her through systematical evaluations as in Defne's company. Defne remembers her experience at an assessment center activity of her company where the middle managers were evaluated through a series of presentations, role playing games. In her company, the middle managers are expected to be apt in skills such as problem solving, assertiveness, and customer-orientedness. At the end of assessment center activity, the employee is evaluated according to his/her ability to employ these skills in the simulations as a reflection of her daily routine in the office. Besides the written report which is shared with the superior, two psychologists give feedback to the middle manager for couple of hours about her capacity to make the right decisions as well as her strengths and weaknesses. While receiving a positive feedback regarding her creative abilities and talent in selling those ideas, her superior was warned about her 'over-confident' personality which may make her hard to be 'managed'.

' They have written that 'Defne is very enthusiastic and creative,...however she is a hard to be managed because she is over-confident: There are positive outcomes such as defending her ideas strongly, but also negative ones such as making her a hard-to-manage employee'.<sup>20</sup>

Whether they fit into this expected personality is to be questioned later, they are definitely ranked through this scheme. The observations gathered throughout the session are shared with the manager of the person, so the discipline is employed on the corporate level. As seen in this example, the company categorizes the individual to fit into several predetermined schemes. The employee is expected to fit the 'corporate personality'.

---

<sup>20</sup> Defne soyle heyecanlı bir tip boyle yaratici bir tip iste fikirlerini soyle iyi satiyor' falan baya bi...hatta sey diye yazmislar 'Defne bu tarz bir organizasyon icersinde yonetilmesi zor bir eleman, cunku cok kendine asiri guveniyor' falan benle ilgili elestirileri bu 'kendisine fazla guveniyor' ...Kendisine cok guveniyor bu guvenin getirdigi olumlu seyler var cok heyecanlı bir sekilde isini savunuyor ama iste bu ayni zamanda yonetilmesi zor bir eleman falan filan



The type of personality desired by Irem's company is a politically correct one: one has to have good relationships with everyone, and it is also important who is supporting whom. She tells that one cannot express her beliefs as she wishes. One has to take other people's approval when it comes to making decisions:

'You have to be able to manage people, to show that your decisions seem as if everybody's decision.'<sup>21</sup>

Cagla's self-perception is structured through the hierarchical observation and normalizing judgment tools and she expresses the need for the approval of the authority figure as a 'motivation':

'I could work 'till eternity: if somebody loves me, my manager appraises me all the time but doesn't raise my salary but keeps saying 'you're great' I would work until eternity. I have this foolishness, I am emotional, not ambitious, but I am obsessed with being appraised. I want to enjoy what I do. But then again, if you are an appraisal-addict, then work like crazy to get that appraisal.'<sup>22</sup>

Cagla's position is similar to the 'praise-addiction' of secretaries observed by Kanter. According to Kanter, secretaries at the company she researched became praise-addict due to their limited 'authority and discretion [which] were retained by [their] bosses' (94). Although Cagla holds a much stronger managerial position compared to ancillary positions of Kanter's secretaries, her statement reveals that despite her freedom as a manager she still undergoes limitations within her job that she turns to other sources of power to evaluate herself and receive appraisal from a superior as a reward.

### **2.4.3 Mutual recognition of subjects**

---

<sup>21</sup> İnsanlari idare etmen gerekiyor... (Alinan kararlari) ortak kararmis gibi gostermek...

<sup>22</sup> Yani ben soyle sonsuza kadar calisabilirim: birisi beni sevse, benim mudurum, durmadan sirtimi sivazlasa ama maasimi arttirmasa ama aslansin kaplansin bir tanesindese ben sonsuza kadar calisabilirim boyle bir salakligim var, ben duygusal bir yaratigim, hirsli degilim, takdir gorme acisindan boyle bir takintim var, takdir gormek istiyorum. Yaptigim isten keyif almak istiyorum. Ama bir yandan madem bu kadar takdir manyagisin, o zaman takdir gorecegin sekilde manyak gibi calis

Nevertheless these women are not only the ‘pupils’, but also the ‘teachers’ of the disciplinary functions of the corporation. Begum reveals that she takes the ‘teacher’ role when giving workshops about the corporate culture of her company. The rules of conduct are introduced to the new comers and it is made sure that the new comers act accordingly as the proper members of the company. The company identity is reflected by the employees at all times – so there is no self outside the company self – the self acts in a disciplined and predictable manner in and outside of the company. While one acts accordingly, others treat the person as the embodiment of for instance marketing department. Another example she gave during our informal talks was her coaching responsibilities: she is ‘assigned’ mentees to oversee whether they were suitable for the company’s expatriate positions. She says that she has the whole responsibility of assessing the newcomers: she can report the person as suitable for a post abroad or she can discharge the person from the office.

One is interpellated as a subject; then subjected to the Subject i.e. the company and its culture, through the workshops conducted; and recognized other subjects from other departments and subject’s self recognition; and finally the subjects are convinced that this is the way it should be and that they cannot act as themselves but they have to represent the department that they work in and if they do so, everything will work fine. It is in fact in line with Althusser’s definition of the subject:

‘Subject in fact means: (1) a free subjectivity, a centre of initiatives, author of and responsible for its actions; (2) a subjected being, who submits to a higher authority, and is therefore stripped of all freedom except that of freely accepting his submission... the individual is interpellated as a (free) subject in order that he shall submit freely to the commandments of the Subject, i.e. in order that he shall (freely) accept his subjection, i.e. in order that he shall make the gestures and actions of his subjection ‘all by himself’. There are no subjects except by and for their subjection. That is why they ‘work all by themselves’.

Begum explains the need for these workshops as the acceleration of the work experience for the new comers. These workshops include topics from understanding the self to corporate identity. She elaborates the need for these workshops as follows:

‘Why do we do this? It’s because the new generation interprets things in their own way and acts in different ways. You have to be cautious about what to say to whom. You have to be careful what information to reveal about the company. Even in the friends circle you are supposed to be cautious. You can’t talk everything about your company everywhere. You can’t criticize your company outside’.<sup>23</sup>

The subject becomes the Subject; at least it acts on behalf of the Subject, i.e. the company. The self is interpreted as the extension of the corporate self and in Althusserian sense; it acts by itself without the control of the corporation.

Nevertheless, there are some points that the disciplining self does not work as smoothly as Begum’s case. Irem refers to the ‘new generation’ in terms of the difficulty to make them work. When their boss calls Irem and her colleagues at 11 p.m. asking something to be done by 9 a.m. the next day she notes that they inish it. however in her view the ‘new generation’ has a difficulty to meet deadlines. She thinks that they are different from her generation in terms of dedication to work. According to Irem, it is a problem acknowledged by the human resources department as well so as to imply the company-wide recognition of the problem:

‘They make us work like a mule, you work 24 hours a day...this working environment is not for them, they value different things, unlike us, they ask themselves ‘what’s gonna happen if I work more’. They know there is a different life out there. We were raised like ‘go to a good

---

<sup>23</sup> Bunu da niye yapıyoruz çünkü genç jenerasyon bir takım şeyleri kendisine göre analiz edip kendisine göre değerlendirip çok daha farklı hareket edebiliyor... Hani kimin yanında ne konuştuguna dikkat etmek zorundasın, şirketle ilgili bilgileri verirken dikkat etmek zorundasın... Yani arkadaş ortamında dahi, bir şeyleri paylaşıırken dikkatli olmak durumundasın. ...Hiçbir zaman şey yapmamalısın yani şirketinle ilgili her ortamda her şeyi konuşamazsın. Elestiremezsin, dışarda elestiremezsin

college, get a good job and do this and that'... maybe in ten years from now, when I or any of my colleagues are at the position of my boss, the relationships between the boss and her subordinates will be different, it's not gonna be slave-like'.<sup>24</sup> The difference she recognizes between her and the 'new' generation, seems to constitute Irem's subjection: her subjection to the Subject (company) and her recognition of other subjects (coworkers).

Former pupils acting as teachers today extend their role to the outside of the company as well. Irem's company calls brand managers as the 'parents of the brand' who are responsible for everything related to their 'children'. As parents being involved in raising the child, the brand manager is responsible for making the best out of the brand. While family and educational apparatus shape the individual through disciplinary methods and make the best of it, accordingly the brand manager is expected to enable the brand to reach its 'potential'. In certain periods of the year, they have a meeting where everything about the brand is discussed and evaluated according to a global structure 'disciplining' the brand. The global 'structure' of these meetings gives the scheme of these meeting by describing how this meeting is organized, and its invitees. As Irem explains in these meetings, the issues such as opportunities, weaknesses are discussed and at the end summarized in a written document: 'Following the written report, as part of the process you ask yourself what you need to do to reach these ends in the given country. I just make it up but I express it in a more appropriate manner i.e. 'I need this kind of communication, I need this kind of product etc.'<sup>25</sup>

## **2.5 Disciplining the consumer**

---

<sup>24</sup> Esek gibi calistiriyorlar seni, 24 saat calisiyorsun. beklentileri bizden cok farkli yani cok daha farkli seylere deger veriyorlar, bizim gibi degil, ne yapacagim ki o kadar calisip gibi sey yapiyorlar... Baska bir hayat oldugunu biliyorlar. Bilmiyorum biz bence oyle yetistik... iyi biri universiteye git, sonra iyi bir ise gir,bilmem ne yap sonra falan cok bundan 10 yil sonraya baktigin zaman ben benim patronumun yerinde oldugum zaman ya da benim su andaki seviyemden insanlardan biri orada oldugu zaman digger alttakiinsanlar geldigi zaman daha farkli bir iliskisi olacak bence, bizim simdiki gibi cok sey olmayacak, kolevari olmayacak

<sup>25</sup> Hakikaten bunlar yazili olarak cikiyor ve onun uerine de diyorsun ki ... benim bunlari bunlari yapmam icin bu ulkede ne lazim. Atiyorum bana soyle bir komunikasyon lazim, ondan sonra boyle bir urun lazim. Soyle bilmem ne lazim...

The crisis of the capitalism in 1930s pointed to the fact that the demand of the consumer should be stimulated as much as the labor power to be disciplined. A sustainable demand is the basis for continuous production, thus needs of the consumer must be conditioned. Thus, the consumer demand was discovered ‘too important to be left unconditioned consumer choice’ (Smart 63). To achieve this goal, ‘a huge network of communications, a great array of merchandising and selling organizations, nearly the entire advertising industry, and numerous ancillary research training and other related services’ are mobilized in order to manage the consumer’s demand. According to the early critics of the management of demand such as Galbraith, ‘through the psycho-sociological apparatus of advertising and marketing, consumer demand is stimulated and shaped and behavior is accommodated to ‘the needs of the producers and the goals of the system’ (Galbraith 1969 quoted from Smart 63). While not agreeing with Galbraith on all aspects of his criticism of consumer culture, Baudrillard states that ‘the freedom and sovereignty of the consumer are mystification pure and simple. This carefully sustained mystique... of individual satisfaction and choice, which is the culmination of a whole civilization of ‘freedom’, is the very ideology of the industrial system, justifying its arbitrary power and all the collective nuisances it generates: dirt, pollution, de-culturation. In fact, the consumer is sovereign in a jungle of ugliness where *freedom of choice is forced upon him*’ (Baudrillard, 72). The consumer’s ‘freedom of choice’ is parallel to these managers’ freedom to choose such as the choice of school and profession. This freedom is also in line with the excellence discourse within the company, the consumer goods are there to fulfill the desire of self-actualization of the consumer. However, this first approach to the consumerist culture is based on the notion that the increasing number of goods and services created more opportunities for controlling the society. This control and manipulation is achieved, according to this view, through ‘education of publics through advertising and other media’ and ‘the reception becomes dictated by

exchange value' (Featherstone 14). The initial use value is forgotten and the exchange value enables the product to take 'secondary or ersatz' use value. The public is served on the level of the lowest common denominator where individualization is erased by the consumption. It can be described to persuade societies that the material belongings are the basis of a 'meaningful existence' (Sklair 5). Nevertheless, every new innovation or any product extension i.e. increasing the variety of the same product with different features is aimed at convincing the consumer that for a more meaningful life the person needs to possess that item. Thus, docile subjects created through disciplines are important to sustain the capitalist markets: they are disciplined to become good consumers.

My research shows that they try very hard to impact the consumers through the direct communication they maintain. Although this first approach to consumer culture is not an end product of corporate cultures, the methods used by the corporation to reach its employees and the marketing managers to the consumer seem parallel.

Defne, a product manager in a cosmetics company desires to sell products in ways that are similar to disciplinary methods taught to children at school. In the past years within the industry, she finds the communication to the consumer very sophisticated. She gives the simple educative method used by the shampoo commercials which explain the simple fact that it is easier to comb one's hair when one uses shampoo instead of soap. According to Defne, after establishing the usefulness of shampoo they differentiated between products applying to different needs:

'Look at the cosmetics commercials: except a few, they are very complicated. They target those few happy crowds who can understand those messages... Buy this: in how many days your mimic's wrinkles are going to disappear, or buy that: bio-whatever complex for your cellulites, we tell the consumer things that even I can't understand.'<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>26</sup> Reklamlarına bak çok seyleri haric az sayıda reklam haric geri kalanlar çok komplike. Sadece o reklamları anlayabilen mutlu azinliga yönelik... Yok bilmem kaç günde mimik kırışıklıklarınızı bir şekilde acar, yok

Her suggestion is to educate the consumer about the basic benefits of the products and then gradually increase the complexity of the messages reaching to the consumer. According to her, the job of cosmetics companies is to teach the basics to the consumers, thus discipline them. To conclude, as the consumerist elite prompts the consumption through educating the consumers and creating needs, they have been through the same process of discipline: they learn how to behave and what to want.

## **2.6 Conclusion**

In this chapter, I wanted to argue that these managers working in marketing field are like other individuals in modern business: they go through subjection process while going through different institutions mainly schools, family and corporations. This subjection process is a part of government which is a ‘form of power referring to the ‘conduct of the conduct’: ‘to govern in this sense to structure the possible fields of actions of others’ (Foucault quoted in du Gay 54). In this sense, throughout their educational life these managers are subjected by the school through the occupational choices they are given and governed by disciplinary tools such as hierarchical observation, normalizing judgment and the examination. In addition to educational institutions, the family guides the individuals through silences or direct interventions. Last but not least, governance of the work-based subject is strengthened through the enterprise culture and the ‘excellence discourse’ within the corporation. The enterprise culture encourages individuals to be flexible and align individual goals with the company: while doing this, the freedom is the key to govern as it is in the school and the family. As Foucault states it ‘the individual or collective subjects who are faced with a field of possibilities in which several ways of behaving, several reactions... are realized’ (Foucault quoted in du Gay 55). While this model offers room to the individual, it still uses classical disciplinary methods to govern such as hierarchical observation and this subjection is also

---

selulitlerin icersindeki bio bilmem ne kompleksiyle bilmem ne yapar falan boyle benim bile anlamadigim bir suru sey anlatiyoruz

requires the mutual recognition of the subjects. These steps summarized by Althusser as ‘the interpellation of ‘individuals’ as subjects; their subjection to the Subject; the mutual recognition of subjects and Subject, the subjects’ recognition of each other, and finally the subject’s recognition of himself and the absolute guarantee that everything really is so, and that on condition that the subjects recognize what they are and behave accordingly, everything will be all right’ are in line with enterprise culture. It is also noteworthy that subjection of brand managers in Turkey is constrained also by the fact that they apply established marketing strategies or campaigns which are developed in headquarters of the multinationals. As a matter of fact, these brand managers are identified as free subjects to market their products within the local markets according to their discretion, however, they are restricted by the rules set within the headquarters of the multinationals.



# Chapter 3: Consumption as Socio-cultural

## Differentiation

### 3.1 Introduction

Socio-cultural differentiation accomplished through taste is an important feature of subjectivity building process, in which the tension between the ‘creativity’ of the agency and the ‘constraint’ of the structure is felt. In addition to the subjection processes discussed in the previous chapter, taste enables its beholder to classify the others. While distinguishing the person from those belonging to other groups, it also acts as a code to signify those who belong to the same group. The school, family and the work are still influential in acquiring a taste.

As part of my theoretical framework, I concentrate on ‘habitus’ defined by Bourdieu referring to the ‘unconscious dispositions, the classificatory schemes, and taken-for-granted preferences which are evident in the individual’s sense of the appropriateness and validity of his or her taste for cultural goods and practices. These dispositions do not ‘only operate at the level of the knowledgeability, but are also inscribed onto the body’”(du Gay 83). In addition to the involvement of the school and the family in the decision making process, these institutions are also effective in creating sensitivities, tastes, distinctions of subjects as in the case of brand managers. These dispositions and distinctions are part of their everyday process of subjectivity construction and they engage with these distinctions on everyday basis.

First of all, I will discuss the effects of allocation because it was one of the primary concerns of this study especially regarding how these women ended up at similar schools and holding similar positions in corporate business. The informants are analyzed with regard to the ‘effect of allocation’ as it is a significant element in evaluating certain positions and their prospects. The weight of the taste which has been acquired through the educational and professional experiences build up on the family trajectory is studied in terms of their role

during subjectivity construction of my informants, whether they were consistent with Bourdieu's findings under the subtitles of travel, space, sports and body. My informants emphasized the concept of 'standard of living' in which centers consumption in their 'life-style'. In addition to taste in Bourdesian terms, Boudrillard's theory of consumption, Featherstone's analysis of life-style framed the theoretical aspects of the unnoticed nature of taste and its reflections on escape attempts.

As a result of the intermingled nature of work and consumption, I studied these women's role as the constructors of consumption as socio-cultural differentiation while being the consumers at the same time. The ways in which they conveyed the meaning of their product to the consumer was a critical element. Within this theoretical framework, I will discuss the degree of involvement of the desires and aspirations of these individuals in professional choices made throughout the course of their lives and their role as individuals within subjectivity construction process.

### **3.2 The Effect of Allocation**

In addition to the disciplinary mechanisms, 'effect of allocation i.e. assignment to a section, a discipline, or an institution' is at work during the choice of profession. Bourdieu states that it 'mainly operates through the social image of the position in question and the prospects objectively inscribed in it, among the foremost of which are a certain type of cultural accumulation and a certain image of cultural accomplishment' (25). While telling their stories, all of my informants brought up a decisive point prior to their selection of their profession. The difference of this experience lies in its particularity to enable the individual to select the necessary information among many and come to a conclusion about her future. It may be an encounter with real a person or social imagination, this information affected their choice of profession and college, and eventually these choices lead them to other acts such as deciding on type of the

workplace. While their experiences before and during college years is behind by now, a general impression acquired during college years establishes the basis of their efforts to distinguish which is also required by their new social class and has a strong influence on their daily operations as managers in marketing. The ‘social image of the position’ and the prospects, and the cultural accomplishment are the motivations for them to choose a position at marketing.

### **3.2.1 Social Image of Position**

In this section, I will explore some of the dynamics in the generation of the meanings attached to their professional position.

#### **3.2.1.1 Real Persons**

Random encounters with real persons who work for marketing positions have a strong impact on some of my informants. These engagements with corporate people allowed them to imagine themselves as members of managerial class when they were students. The image of these positions was so appealing which caused them to change their track in some cases.

Ozge’s inspiration was her cousin’s wife, the daughter of a famous Turkish poet. As being the daughter of a blue collar father and a housewife mother, her meeting with a member of the dominant class reinforced her desires to become a member of the elite. While being convinced about the ‘pleasure’ taken from a managerial position is higher than from an engineering post based in a factory, she relates to the cultural capital of her cousin’s wife to her job by referring her as being very ‘polite’ and ‘refined’ although these traits are probably result from her upper class origins:

‘My aunt has a daughter-in-law... She was working at a pharmaceutical company...as a manager. I took her as my role model. Her manners... She was Behcet Necatigil’s daughter. She was very elegant, very refined... She told to me that management positions are more fun

because you deal with people, you manage people, and you make decisions... And I had cold feet about being an engineer at that instant'.<sup>27</sup>

Although Ozge was aiming to be an engineer specializing in chemistry, she decided to concentrate on an area which involves managerial issues such as industrial engineering, which eventually became a major she longed for so much that she even accepted to fail at the university entrance exam at her first trial causing her to waste a year between high school and college. So, the way Ozge links this young manager's desirable characteristics with her profession demonstrates the connection between the class and the profession selection. Her cousin's wife became the symbol of the longed for life for Ozge. The very fact that she believed that being a manager is more 'fun' when it is told by her cousin's wife is an indicator of Ozge's perception of this young woman as a superior which is not only a result of difference of age and experience, but also the authority.

Encounters similar to Ozge's are not only unique to prior to the selection of major at college; one of my informants mentioned a similar experience during her college years. Although Begum did not like her major from the beginning due to reasons explained in the previous chapter, a non-campus event shaped her professional aspirations. When she was working as a part-timer for a multinational in consumer goods sector to publicize a new product at a fair booth, her encounter with the manager of that product changed her thoughts about her future profession. Her meeting with a brand manager was her first encounter with a person in such a corporate position, and this experience shaped her imagination of a marketing position. This encounter has a

---

<sup>27</sup> Benim bir teyzemin gelini vardir. O zaman bir ilac firmasinda, kendisi kimya muhendisi olup sonra isletme masteri yapmis, ve artik yoneticisi tarzi, isletmeci gibi calisiyordu. Mesela onu kendime biraz rol model gibi aliyorum. Hali hareketleri, Behcet Necatigil'in kizi...Cok kibar, cok egitimli, baktigin zaman acaip prezentabl bir sey...Sonucta isletme cok daha keyifli insanlarla ugrasiyorsun, insanlari yonetiyorsun, kararlar aliyorsun. Muhendislikten bir anda sogudum cunku.

specific meaning beyond meeting a professional. Because it was a meeting with the very person who creates the symbolic meaning of a product and by being himself, the manager was representing a whole way of life which can be associated with consumer culture: the person was the 'live' example of the very culture in which she lived: with both the material and symbolic attachments --from her clothes to her relatively higher ranking within the social hierarchy-- due to the respect paid to the occupation. What she encountered is a key to understand the consumer culture surrounding her, and convinced Begum to change her professional track despite the lack of education in the marketing field.

'The brand manager came to the booth and he gave me directions like 'you're gonna do this or that'. That life... I felt better there. I decided that (Chemistry) wasn't my thing; I had to do something else... I felt that the agenda in marketing was constantly changing, and it was going to keep me up-to-date all the time and I would have the chance to demonstrate my creativity....that's why I switched to marketing.'<sup>28</sup>

Begum's aspiration was based on her realization of the consumer goods' characteristic of continuous change. The image of the profession reflected the contemporary culture which was embodied in the person of the brand manager.

Cagla's case is similar to Begum's but with a difference: this time, the influential figure was a peer rather than a professional. Her roommate, who was also a business major, influenced Cagla after a summer internship at a marketing department:

'My roommate told me stories about what an interesting department marketing was, and I said 'Oh, they do fun stuff, I can do this' She told me that they were working with advertising

---

<sup>28</sup> Brand manager geldi, bana iste sey verdi, soyle soyle yapacaksin, sunu bunu yapacaksin. O hayat, kendimi mesela orada daha iyi hissettim. Bilmiyorum ben baska bir sey yapmaliyim, bu degil benim olayim diye karar verdim... Pazarlamada gundemin surekli degistigini hissettigim icin, beni hep canli tutacagini dusundugum icin, ve kendi yaraticiligimi da ortaya koyma sansi verdigi icin...bu nedenle pazarlamaya gectim.'

agencies, decided on the label of a product... She told me these with great enthusiasm and I thought it is a wonderful job after finishing studying business.’<sup>29</sup>

Not only are the members of the elite, but also friends are important in creating the social image of a position. The ‘fun’ element seems decisive in Cagla’s choice, a word which converted easily into a college student’s vocabulary.

To summarize, young students’ desire for an elite status is personified in different people around them.

### **3.2.1.2 Oppositions**

Not only persons personified desires, but also cultural oppositions were influential in generation of their professional desires. While some of my informants mentioned encounters with those who represent the managerial culture, some named more abstract terms in terms of the social image of the position. This social image of a position is indeed shaped by the help of the other, and establishes a hierarchy between the two. As young students, my informants considered other areas of study besides majoring in management to weigh their decision and eventually were convinced that studying business as a better choice. For Zeynep, subjects such as medicine were the other options considered next to business. She talked about her idea of being a doctor in relation to low economic capital. She thought that doctors do not make enough money and a career in medical profession did not seem a bright one when she was making her department choice prior to the university entrance exam:

‘I was not attracted to the profession because I was imagining myself as a desperate doctor who works at a state hospital with long night shifts.’<sup>30</sup>

---

<sup>29</sup> Oda arkadasim, pazarlamanin ne kadar renkli oldugunu vs vs anlatmisti ben de ‘Aaa ne kadar zevkli isler yapiyorlar, bak ben bu iste calisabilirim’ demistim. Sey demisti, reklam ajanslariyla konusuyoruz, iste bir urunun etiketlerine karar veriyoruz...Bana da o kadar keyifli ballandira ballandira anlatti ki ben de isletmeden mezun olup boyle zevkli bir is de var diye dusunmustum.

Despite the fact that having a practice can turn into a lucrative business for a doctor, she did not see her as one who can build up her own business and imagined herself as a state officer in the profession. Her imagination of being a ‘poor’ doctor points to her comprehension of the difficulties associated with being the daughter in an ‘officer’s family’ (in established disciplines such as) medicine and law that she believed required social and economic capital inherited from family to climb up within the profession. Thus, in order not to be a ‘desperate’ person, she made a choice conforming to a better image of her. Although what she had in mind was not a prophecy to be fulfilled for everyone, the social image of being a doctor was not appealing for a bright student at high school with lots of ‘better’ options.

The ‘social image of the position’ seems not only effective for established professions but also for other majors within the social sciences. Although studying business was a happenstance for Irem, it was certainly one among a limited number of choices. She describes how she decided majoring business, economics or political science and considered other majors as non-options:

‘Sociology and psychology were not areas promoted in my mind. In a way, I thought if I were to study something related to management and economics I would do better things after graduation compared to holding a BA in sociology and psychology. One acts rather according to patterns instead of one’s wants. I didn’t even have any question marks about it.’<sup>31</sup>

Alternative to studying a management related topic was majors such as sociology which she described as not ‘promoted’ in marketing terms. Obviously, the ‘the social image’ of studying something related to corporate world was positive.

---

<sup>30</sup> Kendimi hep boyle devlet hastanesinde sabahlara kadar calisan boyle zavalli bir doktor olarak hayal edip hic cazip bulmuyordum

<sup>31</sup> Sosyoloji psikoloji gibi dallar bir sekilde benim kafamda promote edilen seyler degil. Bir sekilde o zamanki seyimle isletme ekonomi mesela, psikoloji sosyolojiye gore mezun oldugumda daha iyi bir sey yapacaktimim gibi falan.ne istedigimden cok seni orada kaliplarla bir sekilde hareket ediyorsun. Ben psikoloji yazayim, sosyoloji yazayim gibi bir soru isareti bile olmadi kafamda.

Apart from Begum and Azra, all my informants have degrees in the fields of economics or management. All of them were good students to get into any department that they wanted within the scope of humanities and social sciences, their choice of studying something related to business indicates that this preference is more than just a coincidence. One of my informants pointed to the reason why some of them studied business:

‘What is management? Typically, it’s a trendy subject. You would study management, economics or international relations as the rising professions.’<sup>32</sup>

This ‘trend’ is explained as the rising profession. The social image of studying managerial subjects became desirable for these individuals either through the persons they meet or simply the positive social image of the profession. The social image of the profession includes not only their desires but also the opposites of their desires. As seen in this section, to build a desirable image of the profession, they resort to the opposites: being desperate and unemployed. The flexibility of these type of professions is mentioned to be desirable within an entrepreneurial culture, however the reflection of this desirability to those who are not a part of that culture seems to be through social images of the positions.

### **3.1.2 Prospects**

In addition to the social image of the position, the prospects of that profession is important when it comes to selection of the future profession. The students pay attention whether their future position after the college match their expectations. Yonca, daughter of a customs officer, explains her future aspirations but her father desires that his children have a better standard of living:

---

<sup>32</sup> Isletme nedir cok tipik bir sekilde o gunun trendi seydir. Yukselen deger olarak isletme okursun ekonomi okursun ya da uluslararsi iliskiler falan.



‘I clearly remember wanting to study archaeology. It was one of my favorite subjects, but I think my father affected my decision by saying that ‘study management, you find a good job in the future.’<sup>33</sup>

She relates her father’s advice to the unstable Turkish economy. According to Yonca, one can study ‘more artistic or more likable’ things, however she sees departments like business and engineering as the ones which can provide one a ‘certain’ standard of living, live more comfortably and ‘look at the future with more confidence’. Studying something related to management, in this case, promises to enter the dominant class from her parent’s class. The prospects of a position that she can get after the college are better than the prospects of being an archeologist in which case she would be a professor at the college however still in a state university meaning that she would be a civil servant as her father. In an economy where life-long careers lack, the prospects gain importance.

### **3.1.3 Accumulation of Culture and Image of Cultural Accomplishment**

Assignment to institutions is a significant part of why these women are educated at certain institutions and they are working at multinationals. Accumulation of cultural capital is acquired through the education at certain institutions and the sense of cultural accomplishment is effective in the choice of these institutions. College and workplace choice are not independent of each other and the college influence these young women in the process of workplace selection.

#### **3.1.3.1 College Choice**

Next to the selection of profession and major, the assignment to a college appeared as a significant element for some of these women. Not only the positions are affected by the social images with promising rise within the social hierarchies, but also the institutions are

---

<sup>33</sup> Mesela ben arkeoloji okumak istedigimi hatirliyorum cok net. En cok istedigim seylerden birisiydi, ama galiba babamin sey demesi etkili olmus olabilir ortaokulda. Isletme oku bak, iyi is bulursun ilerde

susceptible to the effects of it. Irem mentions about her desire to study at a private college rather than a state university, although the state university that she mentions is harder to get in and supposedly have a higher historical reputation compared to the relatively newly established private college. This can be due to the fact of her understanding that an education at a private college will guarantee her more than a bachelor's degree in management. After completing her education at a state high school –although a special one –, she may require the ‘possession of a ‘general culture’ whose breadth is proportionate to the prestige of the qualification’ (Bourdieu, 25). It seems that a general culture exceeds the importance of the competence acquired at school, since she explains her decision to go to a private school in terms of ‘better opportunities’ that she could find at a non-state institution.:

‘My desire was ‘not to study at a state school’. I said that to my self that I will study at a private university, either at Koc or Bilgi. I visited Koc and Bosphorus, it was the facilities...I asked myself ‘why should I suffer if I have the financial means’. Because I believed that it was better at Koc, I decided to study there.’<sup>34</sup>

Irem chose to go to a private college because of the adequate financial means of her family. It is noteworthy that private colleges are relatively new in Turkey, this specific college did not exist when some of my informants made choices about their colleges; thus, it was not an option for some of them. The perception of additional cultural accumulation compared to a state university influenced Irem to prefer a private college over a prestigious state university. The college education is perceived as an opportunity for a change in the volume of cultural and economic capital.

Another example of this guarantee is expressed by Azra, who choose the state university that Irem did not prefer:

---

<sup>34</sup> Istegim ‘ben devlet okulunda okumayacagim’di universitede. Ozel okulda okuyacagim dedim, ya Koc’ta ya da Bilgi’de Koc’a gittim Bogazici’ne gittim, imkanlarini gordum falan...benim finansal olarak da imkanim varsa niye kendimi zorlayayim [dedim] daha iyi olduguna inandigim icin bir sekilde.

‘I thought it would be more appropriate to go to Bosphorus University after Robert College... I said to myself that the ‘notion’ you get at the university is more important than your major and I wanted to be in a place where I can continue with that.’<sup>35</sup>

Azra articulates openly that the choice of the university was more important than the subject one is supposed to study. Although she vaguely knew that she did not want to study something related to sciences, she preferred an institution which guarantees more than the major which is guaranteed by the diploma, thus, ‘general culture’ is thought as a continuation of her prestigious high school education.

A parallel attitude is apparent in Ozge’s approach to an acceptance for an MA at Bosphorus University’s Economics department. Despite being an engineer from a prestigious engineering school, Istanbul Technical University, she confesses that she only wanted to study there to add up ‘being a Bosphorus alumna’ into her qualifications rather than to study economics.

‘I was accepted not by management but economics department. I just wanted it to be at Bosphorus: Although it was economics, I could be patient for two years and take the Bosphorus alumna title’.<sup>36</sup>

Although she did not finish an MA at Bosphorus, she seriously considered to reject a job offer in order to be a Bosphorus student. Ozge’s case is parallel to those of Irem and Azra: she considered the gains of being a Bosphorus Alumna compared to an immediate job offer which was enough to support herself and stop being dependent on her middle class family. This is indeed an indication of the value of cultural accumulation perceived by these managers.

---

<sup>35</sup> ‘...Mesela sey yaptim isletmenin,seyleri yazdim hep Robert’ten sonra Bogazici olsun diye hep yazdim. ...Ben soyle dedim bence universitede ne okudugundan cok aldigin nosyon onemli onu devam ettirecek bir yerde olmaliyim onun icin mesela istedim.’

<sup>36</sup> Ben isletmesini kazanamayip ekonomisine girmistim. Bir sekilde Bogazici olsun diye. Ekonomi olsun, iki yil sabredeyim, Bogazici adini aliyim dedim

Until now, I studied examples of perception of the cultural accumulation that was expected to be acquired at the end of the college education. Yonca's case refers to her experiences at the college: her extra curricular activities. In her freshman year, she attended some classes, but quickly discovered that school by itself was not enough for her. She immediately joined a student club which was bridging between the school and corporate business. While organizing extra curricular activities for the students such as career fairs, she was able to find several internships during her college years:

'I started studying at the college; I attended some classes in my freshman year. After realizing that it is not for me, I hang out at the student club. In reality, with the club, you get to know the companies. I started my internship as early as the summer of my English prep year[...]. I enjoyed it a lot and decided that I shouldn't do anything academic or anything like that... It wasn't actually like a summer internship, it was like a full time job...'<sup>37</sup>

Although school gave her the diploma to work, she practically skipped classes and concentrated on working as an intern. Although the school's task is to give the skills needed after school, it pushes its students to acquire skills which are basically not taught at any educational institution. It is expected from a student to have an experience of working as an intern even though this means negligence of the educational institution itself. Yonca's experience is parallel to Bourdieu's statement: 'educational institution succeeds in imposing cultural practices that it does not teach and does not even explicitly demand, but which belong to the attributes attached by status to the position it assigns, the qualifications it awards and the social positions to which the latter give access.' Nevertheless, in this case, Yonca's school was implying to get its students ready for the challenges of the corporate business. Her

---

<sup>37</sup> 'Universiye girdim sonra, ilk sene baktim uc bes derse girdim, baktim bana gore degil dedim, hemen kulube sardirdim. Kulube basladim, kuluple beraber aslinda sirketlerle tanismaya basliyorsun. Daha hazirligin yazinda staj yapmaya basladim ...cok keyif almistim aslinda o zaman karar vermistim, ben akademik bir sey yapmamaliyim. Ya da baska bir sey yapmamaliyim. Hergun ise gittim yani boyle yaz staji gibi degil..

experience confirms that the expectations prior to the college education regarding the cultural accumulation are fulfilled.

### **3.1.3.2 Choice of the company**

Besides its influence such as encouraging attending extracurricular activities and internships during the course of college years regarding cultural accumulation, the college choice influences the individual in terms of a sense of accomplishment positions and institutions to be associated over the others. Zeynep had preferences over others such as the type of the company at which she will be working. At the college, she thought that her criterion of success was to work at a multinational company: it was related to the image and the salary you get from those companies rather than the content of the work you do. In retrospect, she thinks that events like career fairs or corporate games that took place at Bosphorus motivated and ‘shaped’ the individuals to desire posts at those multinational companies following the graduation. The connection between the accomplishment and multinationals was strong and is apparent in her following remarks:

‘There was a kid in our department who started working at Central Bank and we all were sorry for him and said ‘what a shame, he probably could not find a job’. To work for the state means you’re a loser, it happens if you can’t find a job... You are in an environment where you hear the companies names, you’re surrounded by people who are working at those companies, you’re like ‘wow, she works there after graduation!’ The type of the company you work at is the measure of your success. So, if you start working at a multinational, they people say ‘Bravo’, but if you work at a local company, they say ‘Damn!’ etc.’<sup>38</sup>

---

<sup>38</sup> Bizim bolumden merkez bankasinda calismaya baslayan bir arkadasimiz oldu ve biz hepimiz ona cok acidik. ‘ay yazik is bulamadi herhalde’ dedik. Yani devlet icin calismak mesela ‘looser’indir, is bulamasissindir, o zaman olur... Zaten oyle bir ortamdasin ki hep iste onlarin isimleri, orada calisan insanlar idolundur. ‘Vay be mezun olmus bilmem nereye girmis? calistigin sirket calistigin sirketin tarzi senin basari olcutun falan gibi gorulur orada... Yani multinational’a girebildiyse aferin, multinational’a giremeyip bir turk sirketine girdiyese ‘tuh’ falan.’

The school plays an important role in pointing to the type of desired accomplishment through allowing the presence of companies on campus. Similarly Irem mentions that the criteria of success was equated with working at a multinational company and she points to the career fairs held on campus as the origins of this notion. While the companies are also active in creating the image of multinationals as ‘the place to be’ in the minds of the students, the educational institutions also collaborate in this image making process:

‘I remember that when the company X came to the career fair at school they were building gigantic booths, the young employees of those companies came to school and told us things like ‘I’m working there for a year or so’. When I was watching them I was thinking ‘wow, look at her, she works there’. When they create this image by saying ‘we pay this much to our new recruits’. You think yourself ‘this is a place hard to get in’ and you describe the success like this. As a matter of fact the companies create this image.’<sup>39</sup>

The corporations act as self-promoters to create a perception in the minds of students that working at multinationals is an accomplishment and the sign of success. It is also interesting that these companies which promote themselves as the ‘place to be’ mostly focus on marketing, such as fast-moving consumer goods companies. It is a widespread practice that these companies bring alumna of those colleges and make them talk about their experiences at work. This also contributes to the fact of working at that company as an accomplishment.

Cagla relates her desire to work at multinationals to the fact that she took courses such as organizational behavior as a business major. She now realizes that she could have done many things other than working in corporate business and she was grown into the job as if nothing else was possible:

---

<sup>39</sup> X geldiği zaman okula kariyer günlerinde esek kadar bir stand kurup böyle insanlar ‘ben X’de bir yıldır çalışıyorum’ falan diye anlatırlardı mesela. Onları izlediğim zaman böyle şey olurdu ‘vay be kız çalışıyor, kız X’e girmiş’ ‘su kadar maaş veriyoruz’ dediklerinde falan onlar senin gözünde falan böyle bir algı yaratıyorlar bence. Sen ‘vaayy burası o zaman girmesi bu kadar zor bir yer’ falan, bu sefer başarıyı kendi gözünde aslında oyle tanımlıyorsun... (Şirketler) de yaratıyorlar alsında

‘In retrospect, I think that I graduated from the college as if my whole world, my space consisted solely of corporate business. It didn’t have to be like that, real world is not like that’.<sup>40</sup>

Educational institutions are influential in pointing the direction to take. Although family is significant in taking the student so far, with the beginning of the college education, school takes the primary role in professional direction. In addition to school, Cagla explains the reasons to work at a multinational with higher marketing budgets where one can do more things which are distinguishing from the rest of industry. She also points to the fact that one earns more and works in a better position. ‘Socially, it is more prestigious to say that you work at a multinational company or your salary is supposedly better.’<sup>41</sup>

### **3.3 Taste**

Being a manager at a multinational distinguishes the individuals from others. This distinction is directly related to the symbolic meanings of goods and services that these managers consume which were allegedly given by those who hold similar positions in marketing. Although I will revisit the issue of attachment of meaning in the last section of the chapter, for the time being, I will focus on taste as a distinction element from others. Bourdieu describes taste as ‘the practical operator in the transmutation of things into distinct and distinctive signs...Taste is thus the source of the system of distinctive features which cannot fail to be perceived as a systematic expression of a particular class of conditions of existence, i.e. as a distinctive lifestyle, by anyone who possesses practical knowledge of the relationships between...the universe of objective properties...and the no less objective universe of lifestyles which exists for and through ordinary experience’ (Bourdieu 174).

---

<sup>40</sup> Simdi dusunuyorum da dunyam uzayim private sector companies seklinde mezun olmusum. Aslinda oyle olmak zorunda da degildi yani, dunya o degil sonucta

<sup>41</sup> Sosyal olarak uluslararası firmada çalışıyorum demek daha prestijli bir şey, ya da ne bileyim, maas olarak daha iyi...

A post in corporate business distinguishes these women from their peers either at school or work. Nevertheless, after being placed into corporate positions and being acquainted with their job, there begins another step of being a member of the dominant classes: the distinction process to join – or maintain their position – in the dominant class. Being a member of the dominant class indeed requires ‘taste: the propensity and capacity to appropriate a given class of classified, classifying objects or practices, [which] is the generative formula of life-style, a unitary set of distinctive preferences which expresses the same expressive intention in the specific logic of each of the symbolic sub-spaces, furniture, clothing, language or body hexis (173).

With the beginning of their career at such corporations, they start making choices that require ‘a systematic commitment which orients and organizes the most diverse practices’ from preferences in clothes to residences, from the sports to travel (Bourdieu 55). Although in Bourdieu’s France, those coming from the down-classing fractions of the bourgeoisie enter into the jobs which are not determinate and rigid structures, such as jobs in advertising and media. These fractions in Turkish bourgeoisie? reveals itself similarly so that the children of middle class families tend to take the path to work for the corporate business. Nevertheless, taste is an element to distinguish themselves from other classes. Even the remote areas of their lives are neutralized from urgencies, and their taste is reflected in areas such as traveling, spatial settings space, sports activities and last but not least the body.

### **3.3.1 Travel:**

Withdrawal from economic necessity is the first condition to distinguish the self through form rather than function. They mostly explain this by asserting that their income enable them to travel wherever they want to, eat whichever restaurant they would like to go. Irem reveals her plans about going to Australia, Bali and Italy within the same year. She feels very happy



about these trips and thinks that they motivate her a lot. ‘We spend a lot of money on things such as traveling, eating, dining.’<sup>42</sup>

There is no doubt, she feels her self happy about these excursions, and however this does not change the fact that tourism is an activity connected to a necessity. Traveling is the common denominator among these young professionals: they distinguish themselves through their choices such as traveling abroad whenever their time and financials are available; it is also similar to the pleasure taken from an art work which is linked to the world as a representation. Travel distinguishes the person from those who cannot do leisure traveling due to the pecuniary concerns. It is also noteworthy that not everyone who has the necessary financial means travels the same amount. I would like to speculate that for these managers to travel or to get to know different cultures is a short-cut education through ordinary experience in order to distinguish oneself without any rigorous training.

Most of my informants referred to travel as their passion of their life. Some of them mentioned their secret desire to quit their jobs and travel around the world for a year in their life. This ‘secret’ plan, however, is not planned as a total refusal of the corporate life, but as a detour which includes a return to the job as a safe haven. Irem mentions traveling also as a pleasant side effect of her job:

‘(This company) is a very multinational place. I e-mail to a man in Manila, I collaborate with another in Dubai. You become exposed onto so many things. I go to a meeting in Japan, into another in Argentina. I like it and I like to visit different places’.<sup>43</sup>

Zeynep talks about her desire to travel when she was a child. She explains that one of the allures of her first corporate position was to travel. Through the travel opportunities, she fulfills her childhood desires, which can be connected to a dominant class life: ‘I loved it in

---

<sup>42</sup> Mesela biz bunlara acaip para yatiriyoruz, gezelim gorelim falan

<sup>43</sup> (Bu sirket) cok multinational bir yer aslinda. Hakikaten soyledigim gibi calisiorum. Manila’daki adama yaziyorum, Dubai’deki adamdan bilmem ne yapiyorum. Gerçekten bir suru seye expose oluyorsun yani....ben bir toplantiya japonyaya gidiyorum, diger toplantiya arjantine gidiyorum. Bundan hoslaniorum ben. Ben farkli yerleri gezmeyi seviyorum.

my first year at the corporate business. Trips abroad, like you dreamed of as a child: you travel with your luggage to distant lands'.<sup>44</sup>

However, Defne distinguishes herself from others who go to a luxury hotel for their holiday: 'I don't choose to go to Hillsidesu for a holiday. I say I don't want to have a holiday there like everyone else. Believe me you pay the same amount of money. The money I spent for this trip [to Africa] is almost the same with staying at Hillsidesu. I mean those who can afford this. Those are the ones who want to be like everyone else, those who don't bother themselves for something different. It's a comfort to be there, for some comfort zone is important and they want to stay within that zone. And they don't want to spend more effort, it's enough for them. 90% of those who make the same amount of money as I do go to a holiday resort. I chose Hillside was a symbol of that. There are those who go to their parents' summer house or to an apart hotel, however, they are a minority but the majority does the other one, to be a part of the crowd is comforting, because that's what is desirable. At the end of the day, it's like going to 360 Restaurant<sup>45</sup>, these are the same behavioral patterns. The feeling of belonging to a social circle[....]I belong to another social circle, and the number of those people who are in my circle are less, and being on this side one has to do stuff which requires endurance. It's more comfortable compared to the other side. On this side, you describe yourself in a format, there are so many who describe themselves like that and maybe more extremes. There are people who aim to accomplish things that you don't have the courage. There are people who are more independent, living here and there for five years. I don't belong to that group. I am a member of corporate life, and from their point of view I'm a phony'.<sup>46</sup>

---

<sup>44</sup> ilk sene falan acaip hosuma gitti, yurtdisina seyahatler falan filan boyle hani cocukken hayal ettigin seyler vardir ya, elinde bavulunla gezmeceler falan...

<sup>45</sup> A very expensive restaurant in Istanbul

<sup>46</sup> Hani hillsidesu ya gider tatil yaparim bir hafta ama oyle bir seyi secmiyorsun. Ama onlarn arkasinda yatan seyler de ben herkes gibi hillside su'da tatil yapmak istemiyorum diyorsun. Emin ol ayni parayi harciyorsun o insanlarla daha bugun konustuk cunku benim su tatil icin harcadigim paranin biraz daha azina millet hillsidesu'da bir hafta tatil yapıyor.Ama benim bahsettigim tabii ki asagida en buyuk asker bizim asker diye hoplatan abiler degil yani, orada tatil yapmayı afford edebilecekler arasinda orada tatilyapmayı secenlerden bahsediyorum. Onlar iste, o herkesler gibi olayim diyenler iste, daha da fazla bir seyin pesinde kosmayanlar.

Either for work or leisure, these managers travel a lot. Although they had the chance to go to foreign countries prior to join corporate business, the opportunities now are vast through the financial means they have acquired at the moment and through the corporate missions.

Distinctive effects of traveling are obvious in Defne's account. Despite her desire to travel and explaining this desire with her curiosity of other cultures, when asked whether she would move into another country to work, her precondition is not to decrease her life standard. She thinks that there are no additional benefits to move into another country at this moment of her life. :‘Our earnings should not be less than now. If it's less, our standard of life decreases.

We'll leave our home, our order, our comfort, our sea –referring that she lives on the shore of Bosphorus- why? Ok, nothing happens if we don't earn money, but if we decide to move into another country, that must be for a benefit for us or for the happiness. Now, we can go wherever we want, buy whatever we want, live wherever we wish, we want to continue doing all these.’<sup>47</sup>

Similar to Defne, Irem has the same concerns about an expatriate position. Despite her aspiration to travel, she hesitates when it comes to moving into a different country. She is hesitant about the habitus expecting her in a different country:

---

Orada olmak bir konfor ve o konforun sinirlari onlar icin onemli onlar o konforun sinirlari icinde kalmak istiyorlar. Ondan daha fazla bir efor sarf etmek istemiyorlar, onlar icin o yeterli, tatil anlayislari onu karsiliyor...Benimle yani parayi kazanan insanlar silsilesi icersinde insanlar tatile gittikleri zaman ne yapiyorlar %90i oyle bir tatil koyune gidiyor orada tatil yapiyor, hillside'i onun sembolu olarak sectim.hani yapmayip da annesinin yazligina giden ya da neredeki pansiyona giden de var ama cogunluk bunu degil oburunu yapiyor cogunluga dahil olmanin rahatlik ve konfor hissini yasiyor herkes gibi tatil yapiyor bilmem nerede. Cunku o makbul olan sey. Bence cogunluga dahil olmak bir konfor ...Bu gunun sonunda aksam 360a gitmek gibi bir sey bu, hepsi ayni davranis bicimi bu benim soyledigimden farkli bir sey degil aslinda. Belli bir cevreye ait olma hissi...Ben de baska bir cemiyete ait oluyorum ve o cemiyetteki insan sayisi digerlerinden cok daha az ve hani bu tarafta olmak icin bu tarafta olmaktan baska daha zorlu bir seyler yapman lazim. Burasi biraz fazla konforlu oburuyle kiyaslandigi zaman. Yoksa bu taraf da kendini bir sekilde bri formatta tanimliyorsun ve o formatta kendini tanımlayan bir suru insan var dunyada hatta daha ekstremeleri var. Cok daha senin belki yapmaya cesaret edemedigin seyleri yapmaya calisan baska bir takim insanlar var aslinda...Cok daha bagimsiz, oradan oraya, 5 sene orada yasayan 5 sene burada yasayan iste bilmem nerelerden atlayan insnalrvar ona bakarsan. Ben de onlara ait degilim. Ben de hala bir kurumsal hayatın icersindeyim ve onların baktigi taraftan baktiginda tatlisu dalicisiyim yani..

<sup>47</sup> Oyle bir sey olmalı ki fırsat bizim su anki hayat standardimizi dusurmemeli..buradaki evimizi duzenimizi evimizi barkimizi, rahatligimizi denizimizi herseyimizi birakacagiz da oraya gidecegiz niye ? bu kadar para kazanmasan bir sey olmaz, ama ben eger ulke degistirme karari veriyorsam bunun bana getirecegi bir fayda, ya da bundan duyacağım mutluluk duyacağım icin yapacağım bir seydir bu...Su andaki hayat tarzimiz, canimizin istedigı zaman bir yere gidebilmek canimizin istedigı seyı satin alabilmek canimizin istediig evde oturabilmek bunları yapabilmeye devam edebilmek istiyoruz

‘It depends on the place that I’ll go. They want me to send to London[...].I wouldn’t go there because it’s London, what kind of position they’re offering, then, it’s financially very difficult to live in London,.How are they going to promote me, what are they gonna pay me? I would think about these’<sup>48</sup>

These last cases indicate that traveling is an activity that creates instant distinctive effects; thus, these young women are not so willing to live abroad and their condition to move into another country depends on the financial prospects not on the experience or cultural exposure that they long for when expressing their desires to travel. Travel is another way to distinguish oneself through accumulation of cultural capital.

### **3.3.2 Space:**

In addition to traveling, space has a significant part in understanding of the self. Space can include anything from work place to houses. Space is a distinctive tool that these women separate themselves from others not only symbolically but also physically. Being a chemist, Begum’s decision about entering into a different track is related also to spatial terms:

‘I studied chemistry and realized that I’m not that kind of person to solve formulas, do this and that in laboratories, wear an apron all the time, live in bad odor [...].I wanted to have a desk, an office, have connections to the people, not to work at a laboratory all by myself, not to visit libraries for thesis and papers.’<sup>49</sup>

As a chemist, she needed to be either in laboratories or libraries. She expresses her preference for having an office space rather than ‘living in a laboratory with bad odors’ and her desire about being surrounded by people. Even a library was not good enough, which is clearly immune to bad odors of a laboratory. While talking about her

---

<sup>48</sup> Gittigim yere cok bagli. Beni de londraya gondermek istiyorlarSadece londra oldugu icin gitmem, beni ne gorevle gonderiyorlar oraya, ondan sonra londra’da yasamak cok zor, promotion’im nasıl olacak bana ne odayecekler. Mesela bunlari dusunerek giderim

<sup>49</sup> Ben kimya okudum ve fark ettim ki ben soyle bir insan degilim, ben kitaplara gomuleyim, formuller cozeyim, labaratuvarıda bilmem ne yapayim, hep onluk giyeyim, pis kokular icerisinde yasayayim... Hatta boyle bir masam olsun, ofisim olsun, insanlarla iliskim olsun, labaratuvarıda tek basima birseyler calismiyim, tezmis mezmis kutuphanelerde dolasmiyim

wish about having connections with other people, instead of being alone, when asked whether she were an engineer (since this was her first job preference before taking university entrance exam) her reaction would be not different: although she was going to be surrounded by individuals, she sees her office work somewhat higher than factory work in an industrial district. She justified herself by saying that she would ‘dry out’ because those places are not ‘nutritious for the soul’. ‘I could not stand a factory. I can’t imagine myself as being an engineer at factories. I shouldn’t go to a place within the industrial district. I thought that I would dry out in places like that.’<sup>50</sup>

These two types of setting with different densities of people bring to mind that she might have other reasons causing her to ‘dry out’ which are other than being alone. Other than her office, she names the places she goes for her job as hip bars, restaurants, new shopping malls, concert venues, i.e. places about which she hears ‘good things’ and sites about which she is curious: those are the places she makes business connections through arranging meetings . During the course of our conversation, she pointed to the difference in dealing with a club owner and a supermarket chain’s founder. She describes the marketing activities done in places such as a bar as ‘mind opening’, more creative activities and more ‘nutritious for the soul’ compared to the business deals done with supermarket chains.

‘In one of them we designed the parties we will throw etc. Of course, there is bargain in this job, but you talk about another world, your vision expands, you feed each other with your business partner, and that creates something different.’<sup>51</sup>

---

<sup>50</sup> Fabrikalarda falan olamazdim yani. Ben kendimi fabrikalarda muhendislik yaparken dusunemiyorum. Yani oyle bir ortamda, yani organiza sanayi bolgesine ben girmemeliyim. Yani ben oralarda beslenemeyecegimi, kururum falan gibi dusundum yani

<sup>51</sup> Birinde su partiyi nasil yapsak, su organizasyonu nasil parlatsak diye konusuyorsun. Tabii ki orada da bir pazarlik var ama baska bir dunya konusuyorsun, vizyonun genisliyor, hani sen adamdan besleniyorsun adam senden besleniyor vs farkli bir sey doguyor.

Describing places as ‘vision-expanding’ or not, indeed, carries a hierarchy similar to educational apparatus i.e. the examination ranking the students according to their achievement. This hierarchy of spaces brings to mind that her occupational preferences are influenced by the individuals that she is working with: the space works as a filter which does not let everyone penetrate as the disciplinary methods regarding distribution achieve it through enclosure and ranking.

The reflection of this ranking is to be seen in her thoughts regarding Begum’s apartment. She recently bought a house and is busy with its decoration. As she suggests bluntly, she is after the new look of her house which will make her happy. She connects her happiness with the look of her house since she sees her place a reflection of her identity it may be a public place, i.e. her office, or a private space, i.e. her apartment. Her recent hobby -- flipping through interior decorating magazines which are also created by other consumerist elites-- are indicators of differentiating through space and material possession:

‘I’m buying a new house, for the last one and a half years I read home decoration magazines. What kind of a setting would make me happy? Almost every weekend I went to furniture stores, I looked for kitchen utensils etc.’<sup>52</sup>

Instead of working in laboratories, Begum prefers to have an office with tables; rather than wandering around a factory among the workers she desires to go to hip clubs as the ‘natural’ extension of her job; the new apartment and its decoration are correlated with ‘happiness’: Space reflects how distinguished the self is as the disciplinary distribution of space does. She distinguishes her self by using her office, apartment and hobbies. As the consumer buys commodities to distinguish herself, so do the consumerist elites: they distinguish themselves by using the very same tools they constantly create.

---

<sup>52</sup> Ev aliyorum...Son bir birbucuk senedir dekorasyon dergileri karistiriyorum simdi...Nasil bir ev dosersem mutlu olurum? her haftasonu mobilyaci falan dolasiyorum. Mutfak esyasi falan bakiyorum

As Cohen and Taylor suggest, 'home' is a paradoxical space that serves 'as a 'free area' or 'refuge', and its antithetical tendency to generate a sense of emotional claustrophobia' (8). In his 1844 Manuscripts, Marx defines the house as an externality: 'The worker therefore only feels himself outside his work and his work feels outside himself. He is at home when he is not working, and when he is working he is not at home' (74). However, it can be argued that although 'home' is described as a space in which one can construct as her 'private' or 'free' area, it is still an extension of the outside world, the distinction between home and outside world is vague. Defne talks about the reasons that she works, she has an apartment in a beautiful location looking over the Bosphorus and explains this with her love to the sea. One of Defne's desires for a high income is caused by her wish to live in this apartment as she expresses:

'I pay rent to sit right across from Topkapi Palace. It's worth every penny because I love the sea'.<sup>53</sup>

When asked why she does not live in Pendik where she can see the open sea, she explains this as the 'lack of view' in Pendik, and being far from the city: 'I don't live here because it's on the Bosphorus shore. I love to see open waters. We don't live on the shore of Bosphorus, this is the exit of Bosphorus, this choice is based on our obsession with the sea, not with Bosphorus'.<sup>54</sup>

She talks about her desire to do everything she wants:

'I don't want to spend my life with something that I don't like to do; I told you that I am self-centered. I always did what I want, and never done anything that I don't want. [...] But there's a price you have to pay and I pay this... I wanted to live in an apartment where I could see the sea, I always thought that it will happen when some certain things are reached such as

---

<sup>53</sup> Kira oduyorum, topkapi sarayina karsi oturmak icin. Yani bence bunun valla son kurusuna kadar degeri var..Cunku denizi seviyorum

<sup>54</sup> Ben bogaz oldugu icin burada oturmuyorum.hani acik denize dogru oturmak da gayet olurdu benim icin yani. Aslinda bogazda oturmuyoruz, bogazin cikisinda oturuyoruz oyle bir bogaz da bogaz degil de deniz de deniz diye olmus bir sey

a house we like, a place where we can afford. I say this: I'm not gonna live in an apartment in which I can't see the sea. I don't know how, I think I must work forever (she laughs).'<sup>55</sup>

The habitus she lives in naturalize her desire for seeing the sea from her couch. She tells us that she makes sacrifices for the things she wants to do which indicates that taste is a distinguishing matter where the person makes herself to endure many difficulties.

### **3.3.3 Sports:**

In addition to travel and space, sports is an indicator of taste. Begum's new hobbies reflect her taste that connects her to the dominant class. These newly acquired hobbies are not randomly selected. While focusing mainly on athletic activities, she underlines the fact that she does not go to the gym in sake of doing some cardio exercise but she selects activities such as horseback riding, tennis and Pilates. It is noteworthy that these activities are inherently – especially horseback riding and tennis – have been associated with an affluent background. 'I try to discover different things in sports. I ride horses, I start playing tennis, and I was curious about Pilates and tried that. I don't go to gym for fitness' sake...I look for diverse experiences.'<sup>56</sup>

For example, Zeynep mentions about her desire to be involved with sports. She explains this desire as a precaution against the negative effects of aging. 'I want to start exercising again. I could do it before but because of my daughter, I can't do it now. I think of it as an investment to myself. When I retire, I want be able to do things that I dream of. Every year, you gain

---

<sup>55</sup> Ya ben hayatimin bir dakika bile ismedigim seylerle gecirmek istemiyorum, dedim ya cok ben merkezciyim falan diye. Hayatta hep istedigim seyleri yaptim hep. Istemedigim seyleri yapmadim hic. ama bunun karsiliginda bir bedel var odemen gereken onu da oduyorum. Deniz goren evde oturmak istiyordum bu bir gun olacak hani belli sartlar olussun istedigimiz tarzda ev olsun afford edebildigimiz bir eve olsun vs vs ...Ama mesela su dakikadan sonra bir daha deniz gormeyen bir evde oturmam oyle soyleyeyim yani. Nasil olur o bilmiyorum da mecburen calismam lazim (guluyor)

<sup>56</sup> Sporda da farkli seyler keşfetmeye calisiyorum, bir sure at binmistim, tenis oyanamaya basladim, sonra pilates'i merak ettim onu deniyim dedim. Yani boyle salt spor olsun diye yapmiyorum...Baska bir sey deneyimleyeyim diye bakıyorum spor secerken de.



weight, you become lethargic. I need to be out of this vicious circle but I can't. Exercising makes me feel better.'<sup>57</sup>

Defne states that next to snow board, she likes scuba-diving. It is noteworthy these are sports that one can learn in adult life. 'People go to Saroz you go to South Africa to do tiger shark dive. You do something that many people wouldn't do. To do those divings, first of all one has to be curious, secondly one has to be aware of the existence of such developments, when one comes and tells a story about it one has to be excited. Thirdly one should have the necessary means. This is not only the financial means, but you have to take the burden to do that because you have to spend a lot of energy to do something like that. It's not like taking the plane instead of a very tiresome bus travel. One has to go through a difficult process to dive into those waters. It's not a touristy dive. One has to bear all these difficulties at the age of 35.'<sup>58</sup>

What Bourdieu talks about these new sports he notes that they are 'often imported from America by members of the new bourgeoisie [...].in particular by all the people working in fashion – designers, photographers, models, advertising agents, journalists – who invent and market a new form of poor-man's elitism (219). However, Defne certainly puts her experience apart from the others' experience in terms of the difficulties she has to bear and of the quality of her experience. The profits she gains from this activity seems to compensate the burdens she has to overcome, as Bourdieu states that choice of sports are not

---

<sup>57</sup> Mesela acil olarak spor yapmaya baslamak istiyorum ve yapamiyorum 0 yani. Eskiden yapabiliyordum simdi cocuk yuzunden onu da yapamiyorum.Kendime yatirim olarak dusunuyorum. Ne bileyim yaslandigimda, yaslandigimda demiyim emekli oldugumda hayalini kurdugum emekliligi gecirebilmek icin kendime yatirim yapmak istiyorum. Spor da oyle bir sey. Her gecen sene daha fazla kilo aliyorsun, daha fazla yaslaniyorsun. Himbillasiyorsun falan, bu donguyu bir yerde kirmek lazim ama kiramiyorum.

<sup>58</sup> Millet gider saroz'da dalar sen gidersin guney afrika'da bilmem tiger shark dalisi yaparsin, bir suru insanin hayatta yapmam ayagimi bile sokmam diyecegi bir seyi yaparsin,yaptim ben daha dogrusu oyle soyliyeyim dalislari yapmak icin de belirli bir birincisi bir merak duygusunun olmasi gerekiyor oyle bir seyi merak etmek gerekiyor bir kere. Ikincisi boyle bir seyin varligindan haberdar olmak gerekiyor birisi bunu gelip sana anlattigi zaman bundan heyecanlanmak gerekiyor... ucuncusu oraya gidebilecek kaynaklari ayirmak gerekiyor ki bu sadece para degil kesinlikle o zamani o zahmeti cekmek gerekiyor cunku o yaptigin aktiviteyi yapabilmen icin anormal bir efor sarf etmen gerekiyor, sadece ucaga bindim indim degil, gercekten cok yorucu bir yolculuk yapıyorsun, sonra o dalislari gerçeklestirebilmek icin cok yorucu bir surecten geciyorsun, yani turistik dalis degil kesinlikle yaptigin sey. Bunlari goze almis olmak gerekiyor ve bunlari boyle 35 yasinda goze almis olmak gerekiyor

randomly distributed and besides the cultural and economic capital invested in the sports it also depends ‘on perception and assessment of the intrinsic and extrinsic profits of each sport in terms of the dispositions of the habitus, and more precisely, in terms of the relation to the body, which is one aspect of this’.(212)

According to Yonca, the employees in her company are expected to have other ‘focuses’ in addition to their job. Most get tennis lessons in their spare time. Still here, instead of playing soccer on synthetic pitch, they play tennis in exclusive clubs. However, due to their social origin, it is unlikely for them to grow up playing tennis. With the help of the financial means acquired in their job, they are now able to get private lessons and be members of exclusive clubs. Yonca mentions about her colleagues who start playing tennis to belong to a habitus: ‘He works too hard, focuses only on the job, but takes tennis lessons. He goes to the tennis club not because he likes it, it feels like a burden to him, and he doesn’t go. He goes in order to be referred as “the person X , who is the member of board of directors, plays golf and he is married and a father of one.” This is all about how normal you look. In fact, he does that for the sake of social activity. They force those who are at a high level like that to get involved in sports [...] It’s not the human resources department but the people around him makes him feel like that. One has to prove that he has various hobbies, that his focus is not only the work. He goes to the tennis club not because he likes it, but to demonstrate his wide range of interests... One has to do something fantastic, something that nobody does. Tennis is not a sport that lay people play. They tend to be involved with types of activities that one can buy. They like horseback riding, they like to play golf. Actually golf seems a bit phony, they don’t necessarily play golf but they don’t play soccer either.’<sup>59</sup>

---

<sup>59</sup> ‘Cok calisiyor, hayatim tamamen ise odaklanmis, tenis kursuna gidiyor zorunlu. Tenise gitmesinin sebebi tenis oynamasini sevmesi degil, tenis ona kulfet geliyor, gitmiyor da... ama ne diyecekler x kisisi yonetim kurulu uyesi tenis oynuyor golf oynuyor evli ve bir cocuk babasi. Hep aslinda ne kadar normal gozuktugunun seyi. Sonra esasinda bunun icin sosyal aktivite yapiyor. Hatta sosyal aktiviteyi zorlayan seyler var o seviyede adamlari ‘bir sey yapmalisin’ diye... Insan kaynaklari demiyor ama cevredeki ortam sana onu hissettiriyor...Cok yonlu bir insan oldugunu ispatlamak zorunda cunku. Is odakli olmadigini da ispatlamak zorunda .. Tenisten hoslandigi

### **3.3.4 Body:**

The utmost manifestation of the habitus is the manners and the posture of the person. According to Bourdieu, ‘the body, a social product which is the only tangible manifestation of the person, is commonly perceived as the most natural expression of innermost nature....this whole commitment to stylization tends to shift the emphasis from substance and function to form and manner’ (196).

The class culture shapes the bodies of the members of a certain class which is reflected on Cagla’s encounter with a supermarket employee. She has routine visits to the supermarkets to understand the consumer better. She worked at a supermarket as an ‘undercover at the booths, however the only person who knew that she was a product manager was the security personnel:

‘At the end of the day, I started talking to other employees of the supermarket. One of the supervisors told me that the instant he saw me that he knew that I was a store manager. I have no idea how he thought that way. I think it’s in my body language, like do this do that...I had black pants, white shirt, and black cardigan. I dressed up like a booth girl. But the way I speak was very didactic, ‘this has to be done like that, why isn’t this like that’ etc. I look very demanding and uptight.’<sup>60</sup>

Defne also talks about her appearance as a differentiation element: ‘The reason why they think I am creative is not only the insights that I bring, but also the way that I look. I am someone who doesn’t stick with the corporate rules, and I declared that on my first day at

---

icin tenise gitmiyor, tenis oynayabildigi icin de tenise gitmiyor. Cok yonluyum diyebilmek icin tenise gidiyor. Ama cok az inandirici senaryo var.. Fantastik kimsenin yapmadigi bir sey yapman lazim ... bakiyorm mesela bu kadar yukselmis adamlar tenis oynuyor. Tenis oyle sey bir spor degil...Avam herkesin oynadigi bir spor degil. Oynadiklari, ilgi duyduykarli alanlar da farklilasmaya basliyor. Iste daha boyle paranin satn alabilecegi sporlara daha meyilli oluyorlar. Ata binmeyi seviyorlar, golf oynamayi seviyorlar. Aslinda golf oynamak kod isim ya herseye o yuzden yanasmiyorlar, ozenti olmanin belirtisi aslidan golf oynamak. Oyle uca kacmiyorlar ama futbol da oynamiyorlar

<sup>60</sup> ben aksama dogru herkesle muhabbet etmeye basladim noktada falan. Reyon gorevlisi cocuk ben seni gorur gormez magaza muduru zannettim dedi. Hicbir fikrim yok nereden anlamis. Ben body language’imde var boyle bir sey. Onu yap bunu yap sunu yap. Gibi bir halim olmus yani, kati.. Siyah pantolon beyaz gomlek giydim. Siyah hirka giydim. Kasten de merch. gibi giyindim. Ama hani konusma tarzimdanda seye kadar gayet didaktik hani bu boyle olmalı su boyle olmalı, su niye boyle degil, demanding bir tavrim var. –meli – mali bir tavrim var

work and people witnessed that I stand by my statement. That's why they think that I am different. Under the evaluation that 'Defne is so different' there are no deep analysis, 'Defne is different because she died her hair green' these are very shallow and visual analysis. Because they think you're different, they connect other things to that, they go the other way around.'<sup>61</sup>

As Bourdieu states the self-assurance given by the certain knowledge of one's own value, especially that of one's body or speech, is in fact very closely linked to the position occupied in social space'. Thus, grooming is associated with 'being modern' which supports Defne's argument in line with the consumers accounts gathered in market researches: 'We have those needs, such as being clean, the requirement of being a civilized person. What I mean by being civilized is that if you want to be a part of modern life, you have to take care of the self, it's been taught that your hands have to be clean, you have to smell nice, you have to groom your hair etc. These are the things that increase your self confidence. You feel better when you smell nice, you dress nice, your hair is nice and this increases your self confidence which enables you to be accepted by the society. These are the descriptions of our consumers, I feel clean, I feel more confident when I'm clean, when I'm more confident, my relations with the society improves, I'm attracted to others etc. They say these during our focus group discussions and house calls.'<sup>62</sup>

---

<sup>61</sup> Ya bana boyle soylar soyluyor olmalarinin sebeplerinin en basinda gelen seyler benim dis gorunusum aslinda. Sadece yaptigim seyler degil. Ayni zamanda nasil bir insan olarak karsilarina ciktim. Ve ben mesela sirketin , genel olarak eczacibasi'nin kurumsal kurallarina uymayan bir insanim. Ve bunu sirkete girdigim birinci gunden itibaren ilan ettim. Ben oyle bir insan degilim, oyle bir insan da olmayacagim dedim ve olmadim. Her ne olursa olsun, bunun boyle devam ettigini gordu insanlar. O yuzden zaten hani Defne farkli bir insan diye bir yere koyuyorlar tamam mi? Ama o farkli bir insanin altinda cok derin bir analiz falan yatmiyor, 'Defne farkli bir insan cunku saclarini yesile boyadi' falan gibi son derece sig ve gorsel bir sey var altinda yani hani sebep var. Ama cok sig ve sey yani, hani derin bir analiz gerektirmeyen bir sebep var, ondan dolayi oraya koyuyor seni, sonra oraya koydugu icin diger seyleri de ona bagliyor, seyden gitmiyor yani bu yoldan gitmesi gerekirken bu yoldan gidiyor'

<sup>62</sup> 'Bir temel ihtiyaclarimiz var, temel temizlik ihtiyaclarimiz var, medeni bir insan olmanin gerektirdigi bir ihtiyaclar. Medeni olmaktan kastim iste modern hayatın bir parcasi olarak hissetmek istiyorsan kendini kendine ozen gosterme gerektigine dair bir sey ogretiliyor sana temiz olman lazim guzel kokman lazim kotu kokmaman lazim, sacin basin duzgun olsun ellerin temiz olsun tirnaklarin falan filan kucuklukten beri ogretilen seyler bunlar bunlar aslinda ayni zamanda senin kendine duyugun ozguveni yukselten seyler. Temiz oldugun zaman guzel koktugun zaman, iyi bir kiyafet giydigin zaman sacin basin duzgun oldugu zaman kendini iyi hissedersin,

It is acknowledged by Defne that being clean and wearing nice clothes are taught since the childhood. However, she asserts that the consumers are aware of those needs but they substitute the products cosmetic companies sell with other goods. However, these are presented as basic needs, and what these marketing executives distinguish themselves from other classes is a complicated process ‘as the inventors and professionals of the ‘stylization of life’ are alone able to make their art of living one of the fine arts’ (Bourdieu 57).

### **3.4 Standard of Living**

The ‘standard of living’ that the informants repeatedly refer is a reflection of a lifestyle, which is described as ‘individuality, self-expression, and a stylistic self-consciousness’ (Featherstone 83). Restaurants they go, the houses they live, the destinations they travel etc. are indicators of the style of their performance. All of their acquaintances are doing similar things and not being able to show their taste in the choices they make means not to be able to keep up with friends. Nevertheless, ‘objectively and subjectively aesthetic stances adopted in matters like cosmetics, clothing, or home decoration are opportunities to experience or assert one’s position in social space, as a rank to be upheld or a distance to be kept’ (Bourdieu 57).

Irem talks about her tastes and desires and their connection with her standard of living: ‘I have been raised in high standard of living, I could not do the third of my shopping with the salary in my old company. There’s a standard that I am used to and I didn’t want to decrease it. Now, I can live in the standard of living that I’m used to, I can even save money...Last summer, I went to Cesme every weekend. I go abroad whenever I want to, I spend my holidays wherever I want to [...] We spend a lot of money on food. In terms of investments, I

---

ve de senin ozguvenin yukselir bu da senin toplum icerisinde daha kolay kabul edilmeni saglar vs vs Bu insanların bize tarif ettigi seyler, ben bunu kullanıyorum cunku boyle boyle oluyor. Kendimi temiz hissediyorum, kendimi temiz hissettigim zaman kendime daha cok guveniyorum kendime guvendigim zaman etrafimla iliskilerim daha duzgun oluyor, baskalari tarafından daha cekici bulunuyorum vs vs boyle zincirleme bir sey var Bunu onlarla yaptigimiz gorusmelerde diyorlar, onlarla yaptigimiz focus group’larda diyorlar. Evlerini ziyaret ettigimiz zaman soyluyorlar..

have some in the bank, about 20-30 thousand, but I'll have a wedding, then we will have nothing left...'<sup>63</sup>

The practices with an end in themselves, is achieved through distancing the self from the world which is according to Bourdieu 'the basis of the bourgeois experience of the world' (54). This is related to the fact that 'affirmation of power over a dominated necessity always implies a claim to a legitimate superiority over those who remain dominated by ordinary interests and urgencies' (Bourdieu 57). This 'affirmation of power', I would like to argue, surfaces in the continuous repetition of the informants that they need their jobs in order to keep the same levels of standards of living. Bourdieu states that 'the dialectic of conditions and habitus is the basis of an alchemy which transforms the distribution of capital, the balance-sheet of a power relation, into a system of perceived differences, distinctive properties, that is, a distribution of symbolic capital, legitimate capital, whose objective truth is misrecognized (172).

Yonca gets pleasure from her ability to buy things that she wants. 'I can buy things by myself. I don't need to be dependent on anyone. I can live by myself, if I don't have a boyfriend or a father. I think it's very important that one is self sufficient. I can buy if I really want something, there's no need for months and years to pass. Of course, I mean small things not big items. There is this pecuniary satisfaction, you can go to the holiday you want, you can do things you really like. You don't need to think twice when you sit in a café like this; you can do things you like easily'.<sup>64</sup>

---

<sup>63</sup> ben iyi standartlarda buyumus bir cocuktum ve hani ben (eski sirketimde) aldığım parayla kendi alıstığım alısverisin ucte birini yapamazdim mesela. Alistigim bir standart vardi ve geri gitmek istemiyorsun. Ama burada mesela, kendi alıstigim standartta kendi aldığım parayla yasayabiliyorum. Para da biriktirebiliyorum ....Simdi soyle diyim gecen yaz her haftasonu cesmeye gittim her haftasonu bilmem ne tatili yaptim, istedigim gibi yurtdisina gidiyorum, istedigim yerde tatilimi yapıyorum ... Mesela biz bunlara acaip para yatiriyoruz, gezelim gorem falan. o yuzden... yemege icmeye cok para yatiriyoruz mesela. Ama yatirim olarak dersin su anda bankada duruyor paralar. Zaten 20-30 milyar para var yani. Evlenecegim icin de simdi zaten bir sey kalmiyor.

<sup>64</sup> Kendi kendime bir sey satin alabiliyorum, kimseye bagimli kalmak zorunda degilim. Hayatimda atiyorum (erkek arkadasim) da olmasa babam da olmasa kendi kendime yasayabilecek duzeydeyim en azindan. O bence cok onemli bir sey insanin kendi ayaginin ustunde durmasi.bir sey canin cok istedigi zaman alabiliyorsun, aylar yillar gecmesi bekleme gerekmiyor. Buyuk bir seyse bekleme gerekiyor tabii de ufak tefek seylerde bekleme

Because ‘taste is the basis of all that one has – people and things – and all one is for others, whereby one classifies oneself and is classified by others’, the people and things around them are in danger of being lost whenever they are unable to express their taste due to financial difficulties (Bourdieu 56). The arbitrariness in life is turned into a ‘legitimate’ way of life through tastes. The informants are aware of the connection between the standard of life and their income, however they cannot answer the question ‘why they want to keep that standard’. The answer lies in taste’s nature which passes unnoticed while other’s taste is felt unnatural. The taste is an opportunity to state one’s position in a social space and the demonstrations of taste in areas such as clothing, traveling etc. are the fortresses to establish one’s position within the society. Thus, the income gained is an indispensable element of this equation of social positioning.

### **3.5 Consumption and Production as differentiation:**

While traditional critique of consumer culture points to the fact that consumption is created through the professionals of marketing, it ignores the fact that the consumers use the products to differentiate themselves from each other. The consumption does not fulfill essential needs originated from ‘the alienation of the worker from his/her labor’, but they act as differentiating elements from other individuals. Baudrillard states that ‘if we acknowledge that a need is not a need for a particular object as much as it is a ‘need’ for difference, only then will we understand that satisfaction can never be fulfilled, and consequently that there can never be a definition of needs’ (Baudrillard 45).

Within the contemporary society, the goods and services are used by the agencies to evaluate the status of other parties within the society. Taste becomes an important element of the daily life while giving clues about the knowledge and ‘cultural capital’ of the individuals. The significance of this approach is its ability to show that these women are not merely

---

gerekiyor. Bence sey maddi tatminin o ozelligi var istedigin tatile gidebiliyorsun hani boyle cok sevdigin seyleri yapabiliyorsun. Buraya oturup ya da disari cikarken falan iki kez uc kez dusunmene gerek kalmiyor mesela. Hakikaten sevdigin seyleri daha kolaylikla yapabiliyorsun

disciplined subjects who are docile enough to be lead by different disciplinary mechanisms; on the contrary, they consciously use the opportunities given by consumer culture. While separating themselves from lower classes, they join the dominant class through acquiring necessary financial tools to distinguish themselves from others. According to ‘consumption as a socio-cultural differentiation’ approach, physical consumption is only one façade of the consumption, symbolically each product is loaded with additional meanings and ‘consumption of goods always presupposes a labor of appropriation the consumer helps to produce the product he consumes by the a labor of identification and decoding [...]Objects, even industrial products, are not objective in the ordinary sense of the word, i.e. independent of the interest and tastes of those who perceive them’ (Bourdieu 100). Consumption and lifestyle preferences involve discriminatory judgments which at the same time identify and render classifiable our own particular judgment of taste to others’ (Featherstone 18).

According to Bourdieu ‘consumption is [...] a stage in the process of communication, that is, an act of deciphering, decoding, which presupposes practical or explicit mastery of a cipher or code[...] A work of art has meaning and interest only for someone who possesses the cultural competence, that is, the code, into which is encoded [...] taste classifies the classifier. Social subjects, classified by their classifications, distinguish themselves by the distinction they make, between the beautiful and the ugly, the distinguished and the vulgar, in which their position in the objective classifications is expressed or betrayed’ (2).

Knowledge is an important aspect of the process of distinction, thus, culture, art, style magazines, newspapers, television programs are all aimed at cultivating the ‘self’. One needs these aides to give correct information about him or herself through the consumption. At this point, the main interest group of this thesis is pointed as ‘new cultural intermediaries’ by Bourdieu. According to Bourdieu, these people ‘ransack various traditions and cultures in order to produce new symbolic goods, and in addition provide the necessary interpretation of



their use[...]their habitus[...]are such that they identify with artists and intellectuals, yet under conditions of the de-monopolization of artistic and intellectual commodity enclaves they have the apparent contradictory interests of sustaining the prestige and making them more accessible to wider audiences' (Featherstone 19).

Defne states that the cosmetics product that she is responsible for are produced to meet the same needs of the consumers across the borders. She states that the conscious level of the Turkish consumers is low: 'We hear from the consumers that they don't need a deodorant because I use perfume...I call it consciousness because the consumer does not know the difference between two products. Somebody should tell them. I said that we target same consumers all over the world, but I meant that people all around the world need to use some products. And there are those who are aware of this need. There are people who are aware that they are in need of a deodorant all over the world. Some of them are more conscious, use it everyday, the consumption in those countries is higher, or some of them are on low conscious levels, they use it only during the summer when it's hot out there or but the deodorant because of its scent'.<sup>65</sup>

As Bourdieu states that 'objectively and subjectively aesthetic stances adopted in matters like cosmetics, clothing, or home decoration are opportunities to experience or assert one's position in social space, as a rank to be upheld or a distance to be kept...(However) the social classes are not equally inclined and prepared to enter this game...elective choices are reserved for members of the dominant class, indeed the very top bourgeoisie, and for artists, who as the inventors and professionals of the 'stylization of life' are alone able to make their

---

<sup>65</sup> Turkiye'de kullanma bilinci dusuk diyoruz, Turkiye'de cok yaygin olarak bizim tuketicilerden duyugumuz, deodorant kullanmaya ihtiyacim yok cunku parfum kullaniyorum. Adam onun yerine bir urun koymus.. Bilince diyorum cunku iki urunun arasindaki fonksiyon farkini bilmiyor ve hani o urune neden ihtiyaci oldugunun farkinda degil. Birilerinin cikip ona anlatmasi lazim dunyanin heryerinde ayni tuketicilere ayni insanlara sesleniyoruz dedim ama tabii ki sey demek aslinda dunyanin heryerinde insanların bazi urunleri kullanmaya ihtiyaci var.ve bunun farkinda olan insanların hepsi bizim tuketicilerimiz. Deodorant kullanmaya ihtiyaci oldugunun farkinda olan insanlar her ulkede var. Onlari kimisi biraz daha bilincli, hergun kullaniyor, orada tuketim daha yuksek oluyor, kimi de bizimkisi gibi biraz daha az bilincli hergun degil de sadece yazin hava sical oldugu zaman kullaniyorum ya da kokusu guzel o yuzden begendim satin aldim diyen tuketiciler var'

art of living one of the fine arts (57). Despite aforementioned ‘consciousness’ is an upper class behavior, Defne sees it as the ‘natural’ order of things.

Defne mentions about the focus groups she helps to organize in which the company receives in depth consumer insights. The structure in which these focus groups are organized are the reflections of the dominant classes ‘aesthetic stances’. They are in an effort to set the standards in using a cosmetics product which all classes in their minds are in a position to adopt ‘One of the participants of the focus group told us that she does not need a facial cream ‘ my skin is beautiful, I don’t need it’ At the end, she said that her skin gets tense after the shower, it becomes so dry, and when we asked her why she doesn’t use it, she could not find an answer.’<sup>66</sup>

Defne points to the distinguishing effects of products ‘A cream of a more selective brand sells more than we do. The price difference is almost 20 fold. That’s why I don’t think it’s a problem with the purchasing power. There are tons of reasons, brand’s image, content, commercials etc. but if we think that the high percentage of non-users, the reason for not consuming these self-care products is not being in need of, not being aware of it or the low usage rate’.<sup>67</sup>

Thus, the dominant classes are more inclined towards presentation, accordingly, the money that they are ready to spend increases when one moves upwards hierarchically. As presentation is one of the items that the dominant class distinguishes itself from other classes: food, culture and presentation. When asked who the target consumer of her brand is, Defne

---

<sup>66</sup> O ana kadar ‘kullanmıyorum çünkü ihtiyacım yok’ dedi durmustu basından beri, iki saat boyuca ‘ihtiyacım yok’ dedi kadın ‘benim cildim çok güzel ihtiyacım yok’ dedi kadın. En sonunda ama benim banyodan sonra cildim böyle geriliyor ama böyle pullanıyor dedi e peki niye kullanmıyorsunuz diyince kadın böyle kaldı bir daha ihtiyacım yok diyemedi kadın’

<sup>67</sup> Selektif bir markanın kremi (bizden) fazla satıyor, fiyat farkı 20 kati falan yani o yüzden bunun alım gücüyle ilgili bir problem olduğunu düşünmüyorum kesinlikle. Bir sürü etken var marka imajı, içerik, reklam o su bu...ustaste binen her tüketici tipi sınıfı için bir çok neden olabilir, birkaç nedenin bileşimi olabilir, ama genel olarak hani kullanmayanların bu kadar çoğunlukta olduğunu düşünürsek kullanmama sebeplerinin en başında ihtiyaç duymama ihtiyacının farkında olmama veya kullanim sikliginin çok düşük olması geliyor

points to ‘natural women’: an explanation which is inline with the dominant class notion of beauty in Bourdesian sense: ‘they feel superior both in the intrinsic, natural beauty of their bodies and in the art of self-embellishment and everything that they call *tenue*, a moral and aesthetic virtue which defines ‘nature’ negatively as sloppiness’ (206) :

‘The target consumers are the real people, but with natural beauty. The user of the product can be anyone; those that are a part of this civilized life, those who are involved in social activities, those who go out everyday, go out for a walk or go for shopping, those who go to work or school, or those who are a part of the society, have a family, people around him or her, those who take care of their look, those who become self confident through this, in short those who are a part of the society. These people don’t want to look like movie stars, or those who don’t care about themselves. It’s in the middle, like you and me.’<sup>68</sup>

Sebnem points out that the brands of her company have distinguishing characteristics in terms of their ‘worlds’. According to her, an established brand has its identity set and continues its marketing activities parallel to that identity: ‘For example product XXX targets the young consumers, it mainly sponsors concerts. It supports rock music’. Thus, brands convey an identity to the consumer, and the consumer distinguishes herself from others through the symbolic meaning assigned to the product. However, this symbolic meaning is not something made up only by the cultural intermediaries, but is created through an interaction with the consumer.

### 3.6 **Conclusion:**

---

<sup>68</sup> Gercek hayattan gercek insanlar diye ozetleyebilirim. Ama dogal bir guzelligi olan dogal bakimli... Kullanicisi da ... herkes diyebilirim. Bu seyde en basta soyledigimiz biraz bu medeni hayatın bir parcasi olan belirli bir sosyal aktivitesi olan, sosyal hayati olan diyim...Disari cikan, hergun yuruyuse giden alisverise giden, hergun ise giden veya hergun okula giden, ya da ne bileyim baska insanlarla birlikte bir cemiyetin icerisinde bir hayat suren iste belki bir ailesi olan, etrafında insanlar olan, dis gorunusune ozen gosteren kendine guvenini bu yolla saglayan ve hani toplumsal hayatın bir parcasi olan insanlar bunlar. Bu insanlar ne boyle cok satafatli cok parlak sinema yildizi olmanın pesindeler, ne de boyle evimde otururum baklami yerim sacim basim da nasilsa oyle diyen insanlar. Ikisinin ortasinda senin benim... gibi kendime ozen gosteriyorum, duzgumum, dogal bir guzelligim var diyen insanlar

In this chapter, I wanted to demonstrate the effect of allocation from the choice of profession to the college choice. In addition to this, I also wanted to point out to the developing tastes of these managers to distinguish themselves from others. I have tried to draw parallels with the distinctive practices of these managers in their subjectivity construction and their job in marketing. Consumer is not merely manipulated by the army of marketers, but there is a meaning attached to each good and service by the consumer. This approach also explains why consumers resist some advertisement and marketing efforts. Nevertheless, needs are not created as easily as Galbraith suggested in detail in the previous chapter. Baudrillard states that ‘needs, taken one by one, are nothing [...] there is only a system of needs, or rather [...] needs are only most advanced form of the rational systematization of the productive forces at the individual level’ (75). While the individual attaches meaning to her productive activities and consumption, this relationship is a flawless one. In the next chapter, I will elaborate on the tensions these efforts at making and creating distinctions generate and the ways in which they are attempted to be reconciled.

# Chapter 4: Consumption and Discourse

## 4.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I will examine the personal crisis caused by the failure of disciplinary and distinctive practices, and the following subjectivity construction through discourse by middle marketing managers. Specifically, I will focus on the ways in which managerial discourses of excellence lead to a personal crisis. The chapter will discuss how these managers deal with the gaps, and what kind of similarities are there between their subjection building process and their work as cultural intermediaries of consumption.

The failure of the total subjection of the enterprising self both at school and at work will be considered from a ‘personal crisis’ point of view which Bourdieu claims to be the result of postponing decision making within neo-liberal discourse. I will examine how these individuals go through crisis in order to understand another aspect of subjectivity construction since uneasiness with the job is a widespread issue in contemporary employee discourse.

After discussing the search for a ‘true self’ following a personal crisis, I will direct my interest into the discourse developed by these subjected individuals again and point to the fact that the cultural intermediaries are not fully in control to ‘manipulate’ the consumer. Theoretically, I will combine Beck’s ‘autarkic human self’ with Foucault’s confessional self. Finally, I will show the parallels between the discursive self and the product manager at work who needs discursive practices to manage her work. This fact was also emphasized by poststructuralist thought: the importance of discourse in terms of creating subjectivities and employing of power.

## 4.2 Personal Crisis

Zeynep complains about her former class mates who always talk about their corporate positions during the homecomings of her college: ‘For example you go the homecoming at Bosphorus... Your old classmate starts the conversation with ‘Hi, I work at . . . ’ Or you

haven't seen that person for years and they don't ask you how you are but they say 'I work at . . . company, how about you?' I hate those conversations.'<sup>69</sup>

Although successfully assumed by some, as Zeynep's example suggests, the corporate self is not an identity without problems. I would like to argue that while enterprising self is 'a calculating self ... [a self] that works upon itself in order to better itself' (Rose quoted in du Gay 60), this self-improvement project leads to the questioning of the corporate position itself whether or not it is the right place to be. Nevertheless, it is not the sole reason for this type of questioning, but it is the discourse of excellence which at least prevents this crisis for a while and ironically opens the door for a personal crisis.

Beck points to the fact that neo-liberal economics 'designates the individual as an 'autarkic human self' and 'to seek biographical solutions to systemic contradictions' is parallel to the enterprising subject as the only one who is in charge of her own life (Beck xxii). While it works well with some individuals, Beck argues that 'the 'do-it-yourself biography' ... can easily turn into a 'breakdown biography' (7).

Although the excellence discourse allows these women to experience fulfillment and 'add value in every sphere of existence', it is a task with conflicts and the constuctions of their selves are prone to face dilemmas. For example, Irem feels that she is not a good fit for her company: 'I am not a politically correct person, thus I don't think that I can climb up the career steps within this company. I'm sure that I will gain experience, but I won't be someone like my boss. I can't organize the meetings so that a 'certain someone' can't attend and have a

---

<sup>69</sup> Mesela mezunlar gunune gidiyorsun Bogazici'nde , nefret ediyorum artik, gitmiyorum sirf o yuzden 'merhaba bilmem nerede calisiyorum' diye giriyor. Veya yillardir gormemissin 'napiyorsun, iyi misin' gibi degil yani 'merhaba bilmemnerede calisiyorum, sen nerdesin' falan Yani hic hoslanmiyorum bu seyden, ve bu hakikaten okulun tarzi

meeting with another specific person. That's why I won't be too successful at this company, with success I mean climbing up the hierarchical steps.'<sup>70</sup>

Although her company conveys a corporate culture providing its employees a solid ground, she complains about this culture: 'There is an insecure environment, I don't like that. People gossip behind your back, and I am not a politically correct person, I say whatever comes to my mind, and yet you need to be politically correct, you have to be able to manage people. These are the things that disturb me.'<sup>71</sup>

Even though the new technologies claim to accelerate the velocity of the business while improving the communication within the company and to reduce hierarchies, she is disturbed by the huge email traffic within the company : 'I think it's overwhelming, I receive 300 emails everyday... For example, tonight I'll go home, I'll connect to the internet. While watching the television, I'll check my emails and answer those who wrote to me. I think it's horrible. As I said, the turnover is really high. The people are very unhappy, because there is no time left for your self. And it's very stressful. You miss doing things which are less stressful. When my boss calls me, I say 'damn! What's gonna happen next?' ... It's a very pushy environment and if things turn out to be bad all of a sudden, they can make you suffer. They forget all your good deeds, you become the scapegoat. It's a merciless atmosphere'.<sup>72</sup>

---

<sup>70</sup> Cok az politically correct olan bir insanim yani o yuzden de hani ben burada cok ilerleyebilecegimi dusunmuyorum. Cok iyi tecrube edirim falan ama bir Seren olamam yani. Cok oyle alttan girip ustten cikip da boyle o toplantiya onun gelmemesini saglayip bu toplantiya bununla kendi kendime yapmayi beceremeyen bir insanim. O yuzden de burada cok basarili olamam yani. Basarili olamam derken stepleri tirmanaman yani

<sup>71</sup> Boyle cok biraz hiyerarsi var. Ben bunlardan hoslanmiyorum mesela hic bana gore degil mesela. Cok guvenli bir ortam yok ondan hoslanmiyorum. Dedikodular donuyor, cok sey degil boyle ben cok politik bir insan degilimdir, cat diye dusundugunu soyleyen bir insanimdir, ama politik olman gerekiyor bir cok seyde, insanlari idare edebilmen gerekiyor falan. Bundan cok hoslanmiyorum mesela. Beni rahatsiz eden seyler....

<sup>72</sup> 300 tane email geliyor mesela... Mesela benim su anda, eve gidicem, bilgisayarimi bagliyacagim direkt online olacagim ...televizyon seyretsek bile, masaya gidip bakicam birisi bir sey yazmissa ona cevap aticam falan... Acaip kotu bir sey bence. Turnover cok yuksek diyorum ya... Yani insanlar mutsuzlar yani, cunku yani özel yapabildigin hicbir sey yok yani . Ve de cok stresli.. Stressiz bir seyler yapmayi ozluyorsun. Ne bileyim benim patronum aradiginda telefonumda gordugumda 'aa simdi bu kahretsin ariyor' falan diyorum yani, 'bakalim ne olacak' falan yani..her sey kotu gittigi zaman yerlerde falan surunduruyorlar seni oyle soyliyim. Yaptigin butun iyi seyleri unutup, hersey kotu gidiyorsa bir anda kotu oluroysun yani. Biraz acimasiz bir ortam var

The work and non-work is blurred when she checks her emails at home. She states that she has to do this because one time when she was on a business trip her boss conveyed her discontent for not checking her emails by the hour, since Irem failed to respond her email in a short time.

Discipline, another aspect of subjection, does not work all the time: disciplined self is not always docile outside of the corporate life. The agency can react differently in the private sphere. While complaining the demanding personality of her boss, she (Irem) states that she is not as patient at home as at work: ‘My boss is a very difficult person. I mean, you have to be really patient to her which pushes your limits, you learn to say ‘yes’ all the time. In contrast, at home, you become more aggressive because you consume your patience at work sometimes.’<sup>73</sup>

Cagla complains about the discrepancy between the school and the corporation. Some of the attitudes proven successful before do not work at the corporate environment. According to Cagla, the ones who apprehend it earlier are men. Due to lack of communication between the general manager and her female employees, her male colleague can establish closer contact with the manager. While Cagla and her colleague are ‘the girls who sit in the front row’ that should stick to the rules of the company, their male colleague is appreciated more when he works outside the set boundaries. According to Cagla, some inherent characteristics brought by men to the work place such as not taking the responsibility when making a mistake, is not true for women and Cagla takes all the responsibility when she makes the same mistake. She also talks about her characteristics as a woman such as being meticulous and perfectionist. ‘He thinks that he does not have to stick with the procedures. And the strangest thing is that nothing happens to him. Because as the girls in the front row we’re told that we have to stick

---

<sup>73</sup> Benim patronum zor bir insan yani ona o kadar sabir gosteriyorsun ki her dedigine evet demeyi ogreniyorsun ki evde daha hircin bir insan olabiliyorsun, cunku sabrinin son damlasina kadar gelmis olabiliyorsun yani oyle seyler var negatif olarak.



with the rules. However, this is a mistake in corporate business... 'I take the responsibility' attitude works to our disadvantage, and yet the society inscribes this to us'.<sup>74</sup>

Cagla can not question this structure. On the contrary, she questions her own attitudes. The general manager discriminates his employees on the basis of gender not through conscious acts but through informal connections that he builds with his male inferiors, and forces female employees to strictly apply to the rules. Cagla's experience is in line with Kanter's findings about behavioral responses to powerlessness. According to Kanter, 'the powerless inside an authority structure often becomes rules-minded in response to the limited options for power in their situation' (192). In this case, her gender makes her powerless by blocking the communication with her boss, and the more it is blocked, the more she and her female colleague become rule-minded. This rule-mindedness limits their power even more since they are curbed by their regular business outcomes.

One of the reasons of this disappointment is the vagueness of the new professions. Bourdieu argues that 'the reason for attractiveness of the new or renewable positions lies in the fact that, being vague and ill-defined, uncertainly located in social space often offering none of the material and symbolic criteria whereby social time, and also social hierarchies are experienced and measured they leave aspirations considerable room for maneuver' (155).

Cagla complains about the non-specific characteristics of her job stating that everybody is an expert on marketing:

'There is this thing about marketing: it's not a scientific discipline and everyone can be a sales person. Everybody has an idea even about the design of a label. You have to get approval from everyone. On the one hand, you're the boss, and there are many departments who serve under you: logistics, quality department, sales department... and on the other hand, you're

---

<sup>74</sup> Ben prosedurlere uymak zorunda degilim diye dusunuyor. Ve garip olan uymadiginda da hicbirsey olmuyor. Biz uymaliyiz dendigini icin bize, biz siranin en onunde oturan caliskan kiz ogrenciler misali uyuyoruz. Fakat hata yani is dunyasinda. 'bu benim sucum bunun sorumlulugunu aliyorum' demeleri aslinda hep bizim aleyhimize attitude'lar. Ama bu toplumdaki bize geliyor.

very vulnerable, because you're open to every impact. If anything goes wrong with the product, you're responsible for it, and they put the blame on you. You have to take your guard all the time, a brand manager friend of mine resembled being a brand manager to solving a puzzle, you should not leave a piece out. When the puzzle is solved, all the pieces must be in place and the picture must be complete. Every project is like this. As a brand manager, you're responsible for those pieces missing. This is a huge responsibility and it's very stressful.'<sup>75</sup>

As mentioned by many of the informants, studying business entailed flexibility that enables them to choose from among a variety of jobs. However Cagla's point is that since the expectations from her are vague; she has a hard time to meet these expectations: 'I am a responsible person. If I'm given a task, and the limits of the task are drawn, I'm brilliant. But they give me a task and they don't draw the limits. There are thousands of dynamics and everything is subjective.'<sup>76</sup>

Cagla also talks about her disappointments about her job and connects this with her relationship to men: 'I'm working for this company for the last 5 years. When I first started I was happy, and for the last 3.5 years I'm miserable. Actually I used to be unhappy also at my old company, and I thought that I was unhappy because the company was bad, because I could not get along with my boss, or because my boss was a psycho... I always thought that it was not me. I had a tough divorce, and then I started working here... Back then, it was such a relief for me to work really hard, and I remember saying that everything is going to be different this time. By the help of therapy, I decided that I was not going to discourage myself

---

<sup>75</sup> Pazarlamada bir de soyle bir sey var: pazarlama bir bilim dali degil ve herkes pazarlamaci. Herkes o etiketin rengi oyle olmasin boyle olsuna kadra herseye karisiyor. Herkesin onayini almak zorundasın. Hem çok patronsun, birçok departman sana hizmet veriyor, lojistiği olsun, kalite departmanı olsun, satis olsun. Aslında onlara guidance veriyorsun, hem patronsun hem de çok vulnerable'sin, çünkü herseye acıksın. Urunle ilgili yanlış giden herseyin sorumlusu sensin. Onun için çok suçlanabilirsin. Onun için çok boyle sey olman tetikte olman lazim gecen gün ürün muduru bir arkadaşım yorum yaptı, çok hoş bir yorumdu 'ürün muduru olmak puzzle yapmak gibidir, ne bir eksik parça çıkacak ne bir fazla. Puzzle bittiginde tüm parçalar yerine oturmus olacak ve resim bütün olacak. Her proje boyle. O yüzden her türlü eksikten ve fazladan sen sorumlusun. Bu büyük bir sorumluluk, bir yandan da bu is stresli.

<sup>76</sup> Sorumluluk sahibiyim. Yani bana bir task verilsin, task'ın sınırları çizilsin ben brilliant'im. Tabii bunda da bir task veriliyor ama sınırları çizilmiyor ve her yerden her an binlerce dinamik var, hersey subjektif hersey'

like I did at my other company... and everything was going to be fine. I would do great, they would love me, this job would turn out to be great. I would work hard, and they would promote me soon. I came to this company with these resolutions, but it didn't work out. As a result, I work as a product manager for ten years. I am not satisfied with my job anymore.... Even the type of men that I'm attracted to has changed.'<sup>77</sup>

Her feelings towards the job was first externalized, and she considered herself as not being responsible of anything going wrong at her workplace. Nevertheless, after her divorce, she literally merged the work and non-work self into each other as a remedy to forget her troubles with her ex-husband. Then, she realized that 'work' is not the 'essential element in the path of self-realization' (Miller and Rose, quoted in du Gay). Since the work and non-work are indispensable from each other, the corporate 'men' stopped being attractive for her.

Nevertheless, the autonomous self is at work which pushes her to take the whole responsibility of her being 'unfit' for her job. Parallel to neo-liberal discourse, instead of questioning corporate business as a space to regulate human relations, she puts the blame on herself and assumes she is the one 'politically incorrect' and she considers herself not being adequate for the job, not the opposite that the set-up is wrong.

Zeynep has a similar approach towards her control over her career: she blames herself for not taking any alternative routes other than business. She blames herself for not regarding any entrepreneurial job or an artistic occupation as an option, and not being shrewd enough.

---

<sup>77</sup> Yaklasik 5 senedir, degil, (sirkete) ilk girdigimde mutluydum, 3.5 senedir mutsuzum. Yani soyle mutluydum: yani aslinda (eski firmamda) da mutsuzdum ve bunu dissal seylere yoruyordum. Diyordum ki 'aa iste (firma) kotu , cunku patronumla anlasamiyorum, cunku partorumum psikopat' falan. Tamam mi? (orada) boyle. Gerçekten psikopat olmasi bir seyi degistirmez ben oyle mutsuzlugumu disa yansitiyordum. Bu benden kaynakli degil diyordum, sonra iste bosandim. O bosanma donemim cok kritik gecti ve tam o arada burasi oldu. Ben buraya ekimde bosandim kasim basi buraya basladim. Ve hani cok yogun calismak bana cok iyi geldi o donemde ve hani buraya baslarken seyi hatirliyorum, psikologa gidiyordum o sirada, sey diye dusunuyordum, 'bu sefer hersey cok farkli olacak, oburunde yaptigim gibi kendimi asla demotive etmeyecegim, hep motive olacagim yani hersey cok guzel olacak, cok guzel yapacagim, beni cok begenecekler, mukemmel olacak bu is. Cok siki sarilacagim bu ise, yukselecegim ben bu iste gibi kararlarla girdim. Ama oyle olmadi. Sonucta 10 senedir ayni pozisyonda calisiyorum, urun muduruyum yani. Yani kisisel tatmin olayi su an icin hic kalmadi. O mitler bilmem neler.. artik su an benim icin sey bile degisti cekici buldugum erkek tiplmesi bile ozellikle ozel sektörde calisan ve basarili olan...

Parallel to excellence discourse, she considers herself as an autonomous subject who is capable of making all sorts of choices. Despite her middle class background and being the daughter of two retired civil servants, she considers herself as a free subject despite the lack of economic capital to take alternative routes such as being an entrepreneur.

Bourdieu states that ‘everything takes place as if the new logic of the educational system and economic system encouraged people to defer for as long as possible the moment of ultimate crystallization toward which all the infinitesimal changes point...the final balance-sheet which sometimes takes the form of a ‘personal crisis’ (Bourdieu 155). As Bourdieu points out that this delay in decision turns out to be a ‘personal crisis’ as in Cagla’s case: ‘I don’t know how but I educated myself in not thinking about myself. What do I want from life, what suits to my character? I can talk for hours about what I hate but when one asks me what I want I can’t find a word. It’s because I’m in a comfort zone, no matter what I say I’m in my own territory.’<sup>78</sup>

Until recently, Cagla did not feel any urgency to question herself and successfully deferred her decision about what she wants to do. According to her, she has confined herself in a comfort zone where the work and non-work selves were overlapping. Nevertheless, due to the very nature of the excellence discourse her problems at work point to the ‘final balance sheet’ which this time turned out to be a ‘personal crisis’ of questioning her position within the organization:

‘Being a ‘career clown’ is widespread in marketing. The important thing is how you sell your ideas, not what you do. It works this way because if you sell your ideas in the right way, you finish your chore faster. You overcome the business procedures more easily, and your projects bloom. But if you can’t market yourself, and if your counterpart questions everything, you

---

<sup>78</sup> Nedense ben kendimi dusunmeme konusunde kendimi, ne yaptiyam yapmisim, egitmisim dusunme kismini aldirmisim. Tamam mi? Hayatta ne istedigimi benim kisiligime ne uygunu...Ben neden nefret ediyorumu saatlerce anlatabilirim ama ben ne istiyoruma gelince ‘hink’ diye kaliyorum. Cunku cok comfort zone’umdayim su an. Soylesem de benim coplugum.

spend enormous amount of time and you become obliged to do things you don't approve and it upsets you. Just because you can't express yourself right, you become the slave of your projects. I am not good at marketing myself, I can get anxious. I am not an ambitious person. I know that I don't want to be a marketing manager as my next career step. I have to be more politically correct to be one and this is against my nature. I am in a profession which does not suit my character. Because of the projects that seem very interesting from the outside I continued in this job for ten years. Since I have not been fired from any position, in a way I managed to stay. However, this job requires someone politically correct because it's a department that deals with all the communication: You have to be in good terms with sales, you have to be nice to your superiors, you have to be good at coordinating people around you, you are not supposed to offend anyone when you delegate something. You have to be a team worker, I don't have any problems with that, but you have to look congenial to your superiors, and I am rather direct when I talk about my requests. And the marketing manager position is a political one. I suffer from being at a department that requires being politically correct. If I were a physician, I would not need to be politically correct, the knowledge is out there. You have to do this, period! If I were a dentist or an architect, I would be evaluated by the quality of my work. Although I am very talkative, I can't lead my manager by using phrases like 'why don't we look at this from another point of view'. I am not capable of those maneuvers. That's why I'm stuck at this position and I can not be a marketing manager, that's why I am a brand manager for ten years. And I don't want to be a marketing manager, because I realized that I do not want to be one.'<sup>79</sup>

---

<sup>79</sup> Kariyer maymunlugu ozellikle pazarlamada var, ne yaptigin degil kendini nasil sattigin cok onemli, cunku o fikri dogru satiyorsan islerin cok hizli yuruyor, cok rahat yuruyor. Is prosedurleri cok kolay asiyorsun, veya onaylari cok kolay aliyorsun, projelerin cicek aciyor falan. Ama eger sen kendini satamiyorsan, karsindaki insan da hersyei sorguluyorsa durmadan asiri bir enerji harciyorsun, inanmadigin seyleri yapmak zorunda kaliyorsun ve bunaliyorsun. Yani kedini kendin olarak express edemedigin, yapamadigin projelerin kolesi olarak gormeye basliyorsun. Ben de hani kendimi satma konusunda cok basarili degilim. Ofkelenebiliyorum. Ofkem simdi disardan bakiorum ama yani, bu firmalarda mi boyle. O kadar hirsli da degilim ayrica, pazarlama muduru olmak istemiyorum. Next level'im o ama ben pazarlama muduru olmak istemiyorum, onu anladim. Cok daha politik olmam lazim, ama benim dogam politik degil. Dogama aykiri bir ise girmisim. Yani distan bana

While accepting the goals of the company as her own goals, her job practice is not consistent with the promise of the discourse of excellence. Although she works hard, she realizes that her success is not only based on her hard work, but also on the maneuvers in practicing her job. This discrepancy causes her a personal crisis.

Zeynep's moment of questioning of her job came after she gave birth to her daughter: 'One can make up anything: If I get bored with this company, I can start working for another company. I don't know, if I get bored with marketing, I start doing sales. However, I won't have the opportunity to spend time with her at this age again. Most probably I'll look back and regret it. On the other hand, I feel restrained now, I don't know what to do. It's not about giving birth, being away from corporate business for six months changed me.'<sup>80</sup>

---

pazarlama cok renkli gozukmus, proje bazli olmalari, projelerinin renkli olmasi da hosuma gitmis ki 10 senedir bunu yapmisim. Hicbir yerden atilmadim ki idare de etmisim, ama benim dogamda politiklik yok. Ve bu is politiklik istiyor. Cunku cok ortada bir departman. Satisla iyi gecineceksin, ustlerine iyi davranacaksin, koordinasyonunu iyi yapacaksin, kimseyi delege ederken irite etmeyeceksin, teamworker olacaksin. Teamworker'da hicbir sikintim yok da, ustlerime sirin gozukme, istediklerini oyle deigl de boyle dogru soyleme falan konularinda falan ben direkt soyluyorum. Cok politik bir insan degillim. Ve pazarlama muduru cok politik olmasi gereken bir pozisyon. Ama is hayatimda bu kadar politik olmasi gereken bir bolum ve bu kadar subjektiv oldugu iicn bu kadar politik olmasi gereken bir dalda olmanin acisini cekiyorum. Eger bir doktor olsaydim bunda politiklige gerek yok, bu bilgi bu bilgidir. Bunu yapacaksin budur. Disci olsaydin ya da mimar yapardin isini 'ainesi istir kisinin lafina bakilmaz' olurdu. Ben de 'ainesi istir kisinin lafina bakilmaz' degil 'ainesi laftir kisinin isine bakilmaz' gibi bir is yapiyorum ben. Ki benim agzim laf yapmak konusunda, yani konuskan olmama ragmen o kadar her birseyi cevirmek, onun dedigini 'o iyi ama bir de su acindan bakarsak' diyerek kendini satmak gibi manevralar istiyor, bu manevralar bende yok. Onun icin tikaniyorum ben onun icin pazarlama muduru olamiyorum, onun icin 10 senedir urun muduruyum, olmak da istremiyorum. Cunku anladim kendimi bu bana uygun degil.

<sup>80</sup> Kariyer maymunlugu ozellikle pazarlamada var, ne yaptigin degil kendini nasil sattigin cok onemli, cunku o fikri dogru satiyorsan islerin cok hizli yuruyor, cok rahat yuruyor. Is prosedurleri cok kolay asiyorsun, veya onaylari cok kolay aliyorsun, projelerin cicek aciyor falan. Ama eger sen kendini satamiyorsan, karsindaki insan da hersyei sorguluyorsa durmadan asiri bir enerji harciyorsun, inanmadigin seyleri yapmak zorunda kaliyorsun ve bunaliyorsun. Yani kedini kendin olarak express edemedigin, yapamadigin projelerin kolesi olarak gormeye basliyorsun. Ben de hani kendimi satma konusunda cok basarili degilim. Ofkelenebiliyorum. Ofkem simdi disardan bakiyorum ama yani, bu firmalarda mi boyle. O kadar hirsli da degilim ayrica, pazarlama muduru olmak istemiyorum. Next level'im o ama ben pazarlama muduru olmak istemiyorum, onu anladim. Cok daha politik olmam lazim, ama benim dogam politik degil. Dogama aykiri bir ise girmisim. Yani distan bana pazarlama cok renkli gozukmus, proje bazli olmalari, projelerinin renkli olmasi da hosuma gitmis ki 10 senedir bunu yapmisim. Hicbir yerden atilmadim ki idare de etmisim, ama benim dogamda politiklik yok. Ve bu is politiklik istiyor. Cunku cok ortada bir departman. Satisla iyi gecineceksin, ustlerine iyi davranacaksin, koordinasyonunu iyi yapacaksin, kimseyi delege ederken irite etmeyeceksin, teamworker olacaksin. Teamworker'da hicbir sikintim yok da, ustlerime sirin gozukme, istediklerini oyle deigl de boyle dogru soyleme falan konularinda falan ben direkt soyluyorum. Cok politik bir insan degillim. Ve pazarlama muduru cok politik olmasi gereken bir pozisyon. Ama is hayatimda bu kadar politik olmasi gereken bir bolum ve bu kadar subjektiv oldugu iicn bu kadar politik olmasi gereken bir dalda olmanin acisini cekiyorum. Eger bir doktor olsaydim bunda politiklige gerek yok, bu bilgi bu bilgidir. Bunu yapacaksin budur. Disci olsaydin ya da mimar yapardin isini 'ainesi istir kisinin lafina bakilmaz' olurdu. Ben de 'ainesi istir kisinin lafina bakilmaz' degil 'ainesi laftir kisinin isine bakilmaz' gibi bir is yapiyorum ben. Ki benim agzim laf yapmak konusunda, yani konuskan olmama

When asked, Zeynep, the mother of a one-year-old, said that she would quit if she had the means. Zeynep explains this with giving birth to her child: '[Before the birth] there were times that I questioned myself from time to time. It's not like that I was like the Duracell bear, and I became like this after the birth. I don't want to connect this to birth. Being away from everything for six months was very secure; you know that you'll be back in six months. That was a time when I realized the world with an open mind. Of course, having a child changes your character. It's impossible to be the same person. However, I think that it's important to be away from your professional responsibilities, because you practically have no time to stop and question yourself due to the intensity of work load.'<sup>81</sup>

Zeynep's maternity leave lead her question herself within the corporate business. The routine of the business did not lead her to think about the enterprise culture but now the very culture forces her to question herself as an autonomous person to evaluate her likes and dislikes about her job as an area of self-actualization.

Sometimes, a personal crisis comes during important breakthroughs such as a woman being a mother, while at other times it emerges when one feels that a constant genesis comes to an end like in Begum's case. During her troubled times, Begum's visit to a life coach is noteworthy to show how the individual feels a discrepancy between what is expected and

---

ragmen o kadar her birseyi cevirmek, onun dedigini 'o iyi ama bir de su acidan bakarsak' diyerek kendini satmak gibi manevralar istiyor, bu manevralar bende yok. Onun icin tikaniyorum ben onun icin pazarlama muduru olamiyorum, onun icin 10 senedir urun muduruyum, olmak da istremiyorum. Cunku anladim kendimi bu bana uygun degil

<sup>81</sup> Dogumdan) once de arasira kopup 'ya ne oluyor' dedigim donemler olmustu yani hani. Doguma kadar da Duracell ayisi gibiydim, dogumdan sonra boyle oldum gibi de degil yani... Doguma da baglamak istemiyorum o acidan ama aslinda dogum degil orada aslinda, cocuk dogurmus olmak degil. Aslinda 6 ay is hayatindan uzak kalmak, yoksa artik cocugum oldu daha baska seyler dusunuyoru degil yani... bir guvence var cunku... Altı ay sonra donup gideceksin, o donemde bir arayis icersinde degildim. Sadece bos bos oturup cevreme bakabildigim bir donem. O yuzden insanlar cocuk dogurduktan sonra falan ayrilirlar ya bence tabii ki cocuk sahibi olmak karakterini sekillendiriyor, degistiriyor, ayni insan olman mumkun degil. Ama bence bunun da cok etkisi var, boyle bir islerden uzaklasmanin, ya ne oluyor diye bakmanin. Yoksa obur turlu o kadar yogun bir kosusuturmaca ki zaten oturup durup 'ya ne oluyor' demiyorsun bile yani.

what is felt in work life: 'There were times that I felt miserable, and I questioned myself. Once upon a time I was feeling that I could accomplish everything.'<sup>82</sup>

After experiencing constant success, Begum's career has come to a stagnant point. Excellence discourse includes a general feeling of genesis which motivates these managers to search for a better self. By the time that they come to an end, it is a common solution to embark on a 'soul search' journey as in Begum's case.

Cagla also refers to a inner core, a 'real' self: 'Was I born as a brand manager? Is this what defines me? It's not. I am here as a human being, I'll respect myself if I can communicate with everyone. I don't want to be a person who defines herself by a title, or someone whose behavior is imbued in her character. I want to be myself, however who am I? That's the question to be answered.'<sup>83</sup>

In the next section, we will be looking at the search for an 'inner core' by these young managers.

#### 4.3 **Soul Search**

As seen in Begum's case, during the times of personal crisis, individuals start to 'explore' their 'real' personality, a parallel move to imagined autarkic human self. Nevertheless, instead of being 'there' to be explored, Foucault alleges that the concepts such as personality, subjectivity and consciousness are 'carved out' of soul (1995: 29). One should also bear in mind that the 'non-corporeal' characteristic of soul does not mean that it is an imagination, on the contrary, it 'it has a reality, it is produced permanently around, on, within the body by the functioning of a power that is exercised on those punished...on those one

---

<sup>82</sup> Ben mesela kendimi cuvallamis hissettigim donemler oldugu zaman mesela buna isle ilgili sorguladigim donem de dahildir, mesela soyle bir sey de hissettim kendimde, eskiden herseyi yapabilecek gucu kendimde hissediyordum

<sup>83</sup> Sonucta ne ki hayatta urun mudurluguyle mi dogdum, urun mudurlugu beni tanımlayan bir sey mi. Degil . ben insan olarak varım, ve insan olarak her türlü insanla sohbet edebilen bir insan olsam kendime daha fazla saygi duyacağım. Oyle bir urun mudurlugu veya bir title ile kendini tanımlayan bir insan olmak veya bunun bana sinmesini hareketlerime kisiligime sinmesini istemiyorum cunku bu hayattan cikmak istiyorum zaten. Ben ben olarak olayım. Tabi ben kimim sorusu tabi burada...



supervises, trains and corrects' (29). To do this, body is subjugated through being turned into an 'object of knowledge'. This knowledge is not the science of its functioning but a 'political technology of the body' which aims at turning the body something both productive and subjected entity. According to Foucault, confession becomes one of the prime ways for finding the 'inner truth'.

'The truthful confession was inscribed at the heart of the procedures of individualization by power. Next to testing rituals, testimony of witness, and the learned methods of observation and demonstration, the confession became one of the west's most highly valued techniques for producing truth.' (1990, 59)

While disciplinary instruments train the person 'may do what one wishes, but also operate as one wishes' and accomplishes this through education and surveillance, confession makes the person watch over him or herself and encourages her to dig the inner truth. As a result, discipline and confession are two mechanisms where the person builds her subjectivity.

Following the discontent at her job, Begum started seeing a life coach. The notion of genesis is achieved through the school is reflected on the career expectations of these managers. Although nothing seems to be wrong in her life apparently, Begum felt desperate in the way of dealing with her failures. These failures seem to stem from the loss of the feeling of being capable of achieving everything desired. Starting in a sales position with an irrelevant major, transferring to a marketing position from it are regarded as the natural development of things: she obviously expected the continuation of this process. By the time that this genesis came to an end, it made her feel to loose control over her life:

'While feeling strong, by the time passes maybe because I put so much energy into work, or get hurt in a taught world, I felt that I lost my control'<sup>84</sup>

---

<sup>84</sup> Kendimi guclu hissederken zaman icerisinde belki enerjimi cok fazla ise aktardigim icin bilemiyorum tam nedenini, niyesini bilemiyorum.. kontrolumu kaybettigimi hissettim

With the intention of finding the ‘real self’, she employed different methods:

‘I have a life coach... Think that like this: you go to a doctor, it’s beyond a therapist. My life coach is an expert in astrology. I thought going to a therapist but I couldn’t tell what I would say to her when I visit her. I couldn’t name those thoughts and experience which impaired me, what am I gonna tell? Am I gonna tell her I did this I said that today? That’s what I could not set up in my mind. I wanted somebody to tell me ‘Begum, this is what’s wrong with you, this is the reason, and you have to do this and that, and I listen’.<sup>85</sup>

Instead of trying to confess, she let her life coach to tell what was wrong with her.

‘He united NLP and astrology, and he does that according to your birth date: he has your astrological map, and tells you your strengths and weaknesses. He predicts which cases will bother you. And tells you the story of your life. He says ‘If you’re here today and feel that you’ve failed it’s because you must have felt like that, because you acted like this’.<sup>86</sup>

It is noteworthy that both this technique in which the life coach is the authority to reach the inner ‘truth’ or confession method are based on the same premise: there is a ‘real’ personality that one can get in touch with in times of trouble.

---

<sup>85</sup> Benim bir life coach’um var... Sey gibi dusun, doktora gittin, psikologdan daha ote bir sey. Benim gittigim life coach astroloji de biliyor...Ben psikologa psikiyatriste de gitmeyi dusundum ama gitsem ne anlatacagimi bilmiyorum. Gitsem bana zarar veren duygu ya da dusunce ya da deneyimin ne oldugunu bilmiyorum, gitsem ne anlatacagim? Ben buna bugun sunu soyledim, su bana bunu soyledi bunu mu anlatacagim, onu tam olarak oturtamamistim kafamda. Istiyordum ki biri ciksin karsima desin ki Begum senin sorunun su, nedeni de bu, soyle yapman lazim. Ben dinleyim sadece

<sup>86</sup> NLP ile astrolojiyi birlestirmis birisi, bu da senin dogum tarihine gore senin yildiz haritani cikartiyor, senin guclu ve zayif yonlerini belirliyor. Ondan sonra hangi durumlarin seni zorlayacagini cikartiyor, senin hayatini ona gore anlatiyor. Diyor ki sen bugun buradaysan kendini cuvallamis hissediyorsan, herhalde soyle hissetmissindir, su durumda boyle davrandigin icindir. Seni soyle bir anlatiyor su anki durumunu ...

‘We no longer perceive it as the effect of a power that constraints us; on the contrary, it seems to us that truth, logged in our most secret nature, ‘demands’ only to surface(Foucault 1990, 60).

Restoring oneself is dependent on finding the ‘real self’ and the inner ‘truth’ in Begum’s analogy:

‘Think it this way: you’re exposed to some viruses and like a computer your programming gets damaged. You become unable to do things you ought to do. Then the viruses are disinfected and you continue as if nothing happened. He finds those viruses, and disinfects and you remember how the computer ought to work and you learn how to affect your life’.<sup>87</sup>

This process is explained with an analogy to software viruses harming computers and these viruses are detected by the life coach to bring the client back to where she started and who she really is. The difference between a pure confession led by a therapist and this life coach’s approach is although the aim is the same – to find the ‘real’ self – one is achieved by the discourse created by the patient, while the other starts from the point indicated and named by the authority i.e. the life coach. The ‘soul search’ task is transferred to another person who is entitled to do that. In this case, a personal core is found without seeking.

As Zizek points that ‘ideological is a social reality whose very existence implies the non-knowledge of its participants as to its essence’ (21). Ideology functions ‘not to offer us the social reality itself as an escape from some traumatic real kernel (45). This ‘traumatic real kernel’ is the gap between the ‘Real’ and its symbolization and it is a misrecognition. Since ‘Real’ is impossible to grasp, the enterprise culture can never

---

<sup>87</sup> Hani sey gibi dusun ...bilgisayar gibi uzun zaman icerisinde bir takim viruslere maruz kaliyrosun, ve programin bozuluyor . yapman gerekeni dogru yapamiyorsun, sonra virusler temizleniyor sonra da sen ayni sekilde isleme devam ediyorsun. Iste o virusler bulunuyor, o virusler temizleniyor, sen de sonra bilgisayar nasil calismaliydiyi hatirliyorsun, sonra hayatina nasil etki ettigini ogreniyorsun...

achieve its goal to capture individuals as a whole. Similarly, the goal to reach to a ‘real self’ is a goal never to be achieved. As du Gay points that ‘the most that government can hope for is to manage this ‘lack of fit’ without ever resolving it, this personal crisis cannot be achieved through finding the ‘soul’ which is discursively constructed (du Gay 73). Rather, these managers develop tactics to ‘manage the lack of fit’ as best as they can.

#### **4.4 Discursive subjection**

If we go back to Begum’s sessions with her life coach, what she learned from the life coach was not being judgmental in her relationships with the colleagues. Although she did not like to work with her colleagues, she eventually accepted their existence within the company. ‘I used to judge people by saying ‘I deal with stupid people’. Then I realized I make my life miserable by thinking this way. Stupid or not, maybe you’re a fool for him. Maybe they say the same ‘I have to deal with morons’ This was a stage that I had a hard time to overcome, I was judging people and thinking that they make my life harder. However, I erased those thoughts, ‘I’m not gonna think that way and approach them without judging them’, because I can’t escape them, I have to work with people and I have to motivate them to reach some goals. I thought that this kind of thought does not serve any purpose other than making my life miserable, and makes me anxious, and don’t I deal with the same work, yes in an increased amount...So, I learned to work with people while liking them. I learned to love people under every circumstance.’<sup>88</sup>

---

<sup>88</sup> Eskiden sey yapardim acik soylemek gerekirse insanlari yargilardim ‘aptallarla ugrasiyoruz’ diye. Sonrasinda baktim ki ben boyle dusunerek kendi hayatimi zorlastirmaktan oteye gidemiyorum. Aptal maptal, belki sen de ona gore aptalsin. Belki o da diyor ‘aptallarla calismak zorundayim’. Dolayisiyla bu benim zor astigim bir surecti, insanlari sey yapiyordum, yargiliyordum ve isimi zorlastirdiklarini dusunuyordum. Kafamda sildim yani. ‘Ben bunu artik boyle dusunmeyecegim ve yargilamadan olaylara yaklasacagim’ cunku bundan kacisim yok yani, ben insanlarla calismak durumundayim ve insanlarin belli hedeflere kosmasini saglamak durumundayim. Dolayisiyla boyle dusunmek hayati zehir etmekten baska bir ise yaramiyor, sinirlerimi yipratiyor vs o isle ugrasmiyor muyum ugrasiyorum, daha beter ugrasiyorum. Dolayisiyla insanlari severek calismayi ogrendim. Insanlari her sartta ve kosulda sevmeyi ogrendim.

The consumerist elites resort to the same methods to cope with the problems of the daily business. Whatever this new ‘direction’ of Begum is unclear and it is not found through profound existential search: it is rather found in daily hierarchies such as being more successful in life. The problem is solved through finding tactics applicable to everyday life.

This discursive subjection is not always done through soul search, but also through practical observations. Cagla tells what she likes about her job such as coaching people and developing projects. She is aware that she cannot change the corporate culture, thus she thinks working as a freelance developing independent projects enabling her to stay within the corporate business and at the same time to avoid the undesired aspects:

‘I am strong in developing projects because I know the logic of the companies. Maybe I should work on that, because this is not something what I hate. If you work on project basis, you don’t have to be a ‘teacher’s pet’ to the manager. When the project is done, your work is done.’<sup>89</sup>

In addition to this, she also talks about her dreams of quitting her job:

‘This apartment belongs to my father and I have some savings. My goal is to invest my savings into a real estate, to secure the monthly rent of it, and then quit and do whatever I want. Maybe I travel around the world, or go to India for six months and spend 2 dollars a day’.<sup>90</sup>

During the assessment activity of her company, Defne is asked how a creative person like Defne’s manages to be content in a company as corporate as hers. She summarizes her reactions in three steps. She said that she laughed at it first, in the second step she asked

---

<sup>89</sup> Firmaların mantığını bildiğim için proje geliştirme konusunda aslında gucluyum. Belki de buna gitmem lazım. Cunku bunda benim nefret ettiğim şey yok. Proje bazlı çalıştığında mudurlere kendini hoş göstermek yok. Proje bittiginde bitiyor is

<sup>90</sup> Ev babamın, bir birikimim var. Ha su anki hedefim su: bu birikimle bir yatırım yapmak, ev ya da dukkan gibi bir şey almak. Onun aylık getirisini garanti altına almak, ondan sonra da buradan istifa edip, hayatta ne istiyorsam, ya da hiçbir şey istemiyorsam, ya da dünyayı mi gezicem, gunlugu iki dolara hindistanda 6 ay boyle mi gecircem

whether they have a serious offer, and in the third step she decided that's what she is doing, i.e. working at a corporate company is something distinguishing:

'This is where I am right now: I told you that I would like to do my own job at some point, and I have some plans regarding to that. And we actually realized some of those things. At some point, I would like to work freelance...That's what I said. On the other hand, I work at a company and at a position like this because it's a challenge for me, to work at a place like this. This is a challenge for someone like me; even I can be in an organization like this. It is really hard to find or keep people like me at organizations like this. Within these companies, you find average people who don't take many risks. I take too many risks in my work, I am cautious in making decisions but I am very courageous to take risks that most people are unwilling to take.'<sup>91</sup>

While having certain attempts to escape from the corporate world, Defne recently start creating a discourse which is based on the notion that this kind of a job is a 'challenge' for herself. Defne also mentions about the escape discourse among the professionals:

'Two years ago, I felt like that it was unbearable to work eight to five, to wear those high heels...I wanna do my own thing, I have this idea, I want to do that , and this life is something that I have to get rid of, it's like working as a civil servant. This was the mood of the people around me, they all say 'let's leave this' Those who get the support from their husband do it more easily. Etc. You motivate each other within corporate life with this kind of conversations....It is probably very difficult to do this every morning, you have to wake up

---

<sup>91</sup> Simdi geldigim yer su, sen daha onceki konusmamizda da demistim ya, ben bir yerden sonra kendi isimi yapmak istiyorum ve onunla ilgili kafamda zaten bazi seyler var. Ve hatta kafamdaki bazi seyleri hayata gecirmeye basladik zaten aslinda. Bir yerden sonra ben de freelance bir is yapicam, freelance demiyim de kendi isim olacak, ona gore hayatimi duzenleyecegim falan diyordum. Ama ote yandan simdi bakiyroum ya ben boyle bir sirkette boyle bir iste calisiyorum aslinda cunku bu benim icin bir challenge, boyle bir yerde calismak aslinda. Benim gibi bir insan icin challenge, ben boyle bir sistemin icerisinde bile olabirilimin yansimasi. Ben boyle bir seyde calisiyorum cunku aslinda bizimkisi gibi sirketlerde benim gibi insanlari bulmak ya da tutmak cok zor yani,yok oyle insanlar. Daha boyle...daha ortalama, daha saglamci insanlar calisiyor. Ben mesela cok daha fazla risk aliyroum is hayatinda da oyle. Hem temkinliyimdir bazi seylerde, mesela karar almakta temkinliyimdir ama baska insanlarn almakta tereddut ettigi riskli kararlari da alirim yani yani hani riski tartar alirim

same time everyday. It's like Chaplin's *Modern Times*. You are a cog in the wheel... This is not a nice feeling. But on the other hand, I realized something: everybody talks about the same, it's like opium, and however, 90% of those are happy with the situation. They don't have any desire to change anything, those who really long for a change is a very small minority.'<sup>92</sup>

She is aware from the pleasure taken from the discourse, however points that nobody takes action towards leaving the job:

'Corporate life is very comfortable for many. They have order; they have a job which they learned to manage. She does this and that, and in the evening she goes home. It's a beautiful life. It's not that stressful for many.'<sup>93</sup>

After being in the same mood for a long time she developed her discourse to manage this unhappiness with her job:

'My third step is that I don't tell the truth. At least not for me, because I realized that not everyone can do what I do. I am quite sure of that, this is a profession requiring certain abilities. Second, I really like what I do, because I add some value to the work. This feeling of producing something satisfies me a lot. I don't have to do what others tell me to do. I think a lot about how I can do it. No one else but me...If you think this way you create something.

---

<sup>92</sup> Ben bundan 2 sene once bu kurumsal hayat sabah git aksam gel iste giy topuklulari, ben giyemem de klasik olarak bu hayat bu cekilir sey degil, sonucta zaten ben gunun birinde kendi isimi yapmak istiyorum, yapmayi istedigim bir is de var. Onu hayata gecirmek de istiyorum bu da zaten kurtulunmasi gereken bir pranga, sabah git aksam gel memuriyet hayati ve zaten aslinda bizim icinde bulundugumuz insan toplulugu icersinde herkes bu modda 'abi bir biraksak gitsek de' falan filan. İste kocasından guc alanlar bunu daha kolay yapabiliyo vs. Vs. Ama bu hani zaten yapilmasi gereken bir sey falan diyordum hani, ben de yapicam bunu bir gun..cok sikildik cok sikildik falan..birazcik da is hayatinda birbirini gaza getiriyorsun bu konusmalarla. Ulan cekilir sey degil. Genellikle benim arkadas cevremde herkes 'ya abi bu is cekilir sey degil boyle hayat mi gecir sabah git aksam gel' falan bir yerden sonra bunu kirmek lazim. Muhtemelen bu hergun ise gitme zorunlulugu cok yildirici bir sey cogu insan icin, ben de dahil olmak uzere, sabah ayni saatte kalkmak zorundasın, bir nevi sey gibi, Charlie Chaplin Modern Zamanlar diyim yani. Bir carkin parcasisisin, arada karisiyorsun dislilerin arasına donup duruyorsun (guluyor). O duygu hos bir duygu degil. Ama ote taraftan ben soyle bir sey fark ettim. Birikti birikti bu konusmalar, herkes ayni seyi soyluyor herkes ayni seyi soyluyor falan, bir yerdensonra seyi fark ediyorsun: hani bu boyle cok guzel bir afyon tamam mi boyle... afyonlu bir sakiz, dillere pelesenk olmus, herkes ayni seyi konusuyor ama konusanların %90 i da durumdan gayet memnun yani. Hicbir sey degistirmeye niyetleri yok yani, cok kucuk bir azinlik aslinda gercekten farkli bir hayat surmek isteyen

<sup>93</sup> Yani yoksa ekmek elden su golden bir cok insan icin calisma hayati. Duzeni var yani, ogrenmis oldugu bir is var, onu yapiyor para kazaniyor aksam saati geldiginde kalkip evine gidiyor. Aslinda gayet guzel bir duzen aslinda. Boyle super yorucu super stresli bir durum da yok

And third, I earn money in return and I can't make this amount whatever I do by myself. It is the truth, this money enables me to do what I really want in life. In return of my labor, I conduct a good life. On the one hand, I do what I want to do, and on the other I don't sacrifice anything. Many people may work to do what they want after work hours, I don't work like that, I work with pleasure. I think I was unfair to this aspect of my life. I admit that it's not easy to leave home early in the morning and come home at night, I worked under serious pressure, and I agree one can't stand this until the age of eighty...However, nobody forces me to do this, we earn something in return, and it gives me pleasure, I make money, thus I have decided it's so unfair to undermine it. It's unfair because I don't have a regular job. If I worked at another company at a different post, I wouldn't be at this position. I feel that I personally create something here... It is not fair to me too, to pretend as if I do a repetitive job is unfair.<sup>94</sup>

---

<sup>94</sup> 3. asama .bu vardigim yargi ve bu soylediklerim aslinda dogru degil. Benim acimdan da dogru degil, cunku aslinda ben sunu fark ettim birincisi benim yaptigim isi herkes yapamaz. Ondan kesinlikle emnim, bu hakikaten belirli bir beceri duzeyi gerektiren bir is. İkincisi ben yaptigim isi gayet severek yapiyorum. Cunku ben yaptigim isi katarak yaptigima inaniyorm hakikaten bir sey katarak yapiyorum, o da bana bir sye urettigime dair bir tatmin duygusu veriyor bana bunu soylediler, ben de bana soylenei yapiyorum allah kahretsin diye yapmiyorum. Hakikaten bunu ben nasil yapabilirim, ben ne yapayim bunla ilgili diyerek yapiyorum. Baskasi degil de ben ne yapiyorum bununla ilgili,Defne ne kattin yani buna diye yapiyorum. Boyle dusunerek yaptigin zaman ama kucuk ama hevesle ama zorla bir sey yapiyorsun yani...ve bir ucuncusu de bununu karsiliginda da bir para kazaniyorum ki bu kazandigim parayi kendi kendime yaptigim hicbir isle kazanamam. İsin dogrusu bu bu para bana hayatta diger istedigim seyleri yapma luksunu veriyor, o bir hak zaten de , imkanini veriyor. emegimin karsiliginda aldigim parayla da iyi bir hayat surebiliyorum. Hayatta yapmak istedigim diger seyleri yapabiliyorum. Hayattta yapmak istedigim diger seyleri yapmak icin bu tarafta bir sye feda etmiyorum. Bir cok insan buna katlanayim da bunun karsiliginda isten ciktikten sonra istedigim seyleri yapayim diye calisiyor olabilir, ben oyle calismiyorum ben gayet guzel calisiyorum. O acidan bu tarafa haksizlik ettigime karar verdim su ana kadar. Evet sabah gidip akşam gelmek cok zor bir sey, cok stres altinda calistigim donemler oluyor. Bu sekilde hayat gecmez, buna katiliyorum ben seksen yasina kadar bu sekilde calismiycam yani, benim amacim belli bir sure sonra gercekten kendi isimi yapmak, daha farkli dha yavas tempolu bir hayata gecmek. Simdi cok hizli calistigima ve bunun beni cok yorduguna kesin karar vermis durumdayim. Bu tarafı da kimse zorlamiyor ki, kimse kafamiza zorla silah dayamiyor yani burada bu sekilde calisalim diye bunun karsiliginda bir sye aliyoruz, bir zevk de aliyorum, parasini da aliyorum e o zaman niye bundan, yani bunu yerden yere vurmanin kendime haksizlik olduguna karar verdim. Cunku ben siradan bir is yapmiyorum hakikaten , baska bir sirkette baska bir pozisyonda calisiyor olsaydim bu noktaya gelmeyebilirdim...Yani ben sunu dusunuyorum, ben burada kisisel olarak da bir sey urettigimi dusunuyorum. Ya bir sey uretiyorum, urettigim seyden cikan sonuctan da bir memnuniyet duyuyorum. Ve bunu da seyden ya da bunu tamamen yok saymak ya da hicbirsey yapmiyormusum da dolap beygiri gibi oraya gidiyormusum geliyormusum gibi sey yapmak kendime haksizlik cunku. Evet, sabah 8de kalkmak istemiyorum hayatim boyunca hergun hergun bazen 10da kalkmak istiyorum, bazen 12de kalkmak istiyorum mumkunse. Bazen hic calismak istemiyorum. Evet keske oyle bir sey mumkun olsa da oyle calissam bir gun insallah olur da ama simdi de haksizlik etmeye gerek yok, oyle dusunuyorum



However, she still distinguishes her self from others by stating that she is one of those who will be missed in the case of her absence. Thus, this is one of the discursive tactics she develops within the field. Defne is well aware of the distinctions that she makes through her choices, however, she distinguishes herself within distinction:

‘I don’t believe that a ‘domestic’ looking person can be very creative. All these visual and structural things are related to how a person packages herself. Yes, I dyed my hair green, because I wanted to be seen like that, I wanted to express that I’m different from the rest. I ride a Vespa motorbike, but don’t drive because there are no other girls that I know who drives her Vespa on TEM. I do these very things because I know that I’ve been categorized as different. That’s what I show to people around me. All these are different parts of it, my house is a part of it. My hobbies are part of it. But this is true for everyone, however most of the people want to be a part of a group. They like to feel safe, they enjoy living in a comfort zone, they really want not to be different, because this is a responsibility, this is an outcast case. Everybody appreciates you but no one looks up to you...She appreciates you but says ‘I’d never be like her’ and bleaches her hair, walks with her high heels. Her role model is someone like her, she wants to be like that. If my looks are important to me, it is also important to my domestic opposite. She lives in a traditional house, in domestic clothes, that’s a part of her. And from that look you reach a verdict ‘this is a person like that’ and other say ‘Defne is someone like this’...I say that what you create is connects to how you look. Where do you put your self, how do you describe yourself. You don’t give a list, with what you do, create, think you are a whole and the people reach their verdict about you. Looks and physical features are aspects that they can see and how they get their first impressions and they stick with those impressions. There’s no relationship network where everyone can see each others creations, thoughts, even if you work at the same company, let alone those who are distant than your coworkers. Like my reaching a verdict a person who wears suits, they reach a

verdict when they see me. I have a different profile not only from those people that I work with, but also from everyone around me'.<sup>95</sup>

Defne claims that she does not define her self in terms of her job:

'The traditional approach is that those people who work for corporate business is to describe oneself with her job. What they accomplished, which position they came, how many years has is been. When they first meet, they ask each other 'what are you doing' I don't describe myself through my job.'<sup>96</sup>

Her disinterestedness in her profession is a distinguishing characteristic, she underlines this distinction with her interests and escape attempts which do not produce any income and done for their own sake while serving no interest but the individual's own:

---

95 'Bunların hepsi birbirini bütünleyen şeyler. Bunlardan biri olmadan oburunun olabileceğini düşünmüyorum ben. Çok domestik bir durumu olup da çok yaratıcı olan bir insan da pek yok yani etrafta. Ama sadece o değil, bütün bu görsel ve işte sekülsel bir takım şeyler de aslında insanın kendisini nasıl tanımladığı ve paketlediğiyle ilgili şeyler yani evet benim sacımı ben yeşile boyadım çünkü oyle görülmek istiyordum, farklı olduğumu oyle ifade etmek istiyordum ben vespaya binip geziyorum ama araba kullanmayı bilmiyorum mesela, çünkü vespaya binip de işte ne bileyim TEM'den giden kız yok mesela benim bildiğim, o mesela farklı bir şey onu yaptığım zaman onun oyle algılandığını bildiğim için de yapıyorum aslında. Çünkü onu gösteriyorum etrafımdakilere... O hepsi bunun parçası olduğum ev de bunun bir parçası. Sahip olduğum hobiler de bunun bir parçası, ama bu herkes için böyle bu sadece benim için benim için böyle değil, bunu herkes kullanıyor ama bazı insanlar ya da insanları bir çözüme, belirli bir cemeiyetin bir parçası olmak isterler. Kendilerini safe hissetmek isterler, belli bir güvenlik çemberinin içinde yaşayıp gitmek isterler ve mesela hakikaten farklı olmamak isterler, çünkü o bir sorumluluktur ve aynı zamanda bir tecrit durumudur. Çünkü şöyle bir şey vardır yani, çok takdir edirlirsin ama imrenilmezsin. Çok takdir edirlirsin, ama 'ben asla oyle olmam' der mesela ben gene de saçlarımı sarıya boyatır saçlarımın mecaz yaptırır topuklu ayakkabılarımın gezerim der kadın. Onun rol modeli oyle birisidir, oyle olmak ister. Ama seni çok takdir eder. Bunun gibi şeyler işte. Dis durumu benim için nasıl benim nasıl bir insan olduğumun bir parçasıysa aynı zamanda son derece domestik benim tam zıddım olan bir kişi için de bir parçası. O da mesela kendisini son derece geleneksel bir evde, son derece domestik kıyafetler içerisinde, dopiyes giyerek ifade ediyor, onun kişiliğinin bir parçası da o..ve sen o dis duruma bakarak onunla ilgili bir yargıya varıyorsun 'bu insan böyle bir insan' diyorsun, benim için de aynı şekilde bana bakıp 'Defne böyle bir insan' diyorlar...ben diyorum ki insanın ürettikleriyle dis durumu birbirine bağlı diyorum. Birbirine bağlı derken insanın kendisini nereye koyduğunun parçaları bunlar. Sen kendini hayatta nereye koyuyorsun, sen nasıl bir insan olarak kendini tarif ediyorsun baskalarına...yazılı liste vermiyorsun, sen yaptıklarınla, ürettiklerinle, dis durumunla, fikirlerinle vs bir butunsun ve insanlar bunları görerek senle ilgili yargılarını oluşturuyorlar. Ve dis durumu ve fiziksel olarak onların görebildiği dokunabildiği hissedebildiği şeyler ilk izlenimlerini edindikleri ve ilk yargılarını verdikleri ve genellikle de o yargıya bağlı kaldıkları şeyler. Çünkü herkes hakkında bütün ürettiklerini, bütün fikirlerini algılayıp, özümseyip yorumlayacak ve o detaya girecek bir ilişki ağı yok yani. İşte aynı şirketin içerisinde çalışırken yok, daha uzaktayken hele hiç yok. Ben nasıl ki dopiyes giyen bir kadın olduğumda onunla ilgili bir takım yargılara varıyorum, onlar da beni gördükleri zaman bir takım yargılara varıyorlar... beraber çalıştığım insanlardan değil bence benim etrafımdaki herkesten daha farklı bir profilim var kesin yani.

<sup>96</sup> İnsanların geleneksel yaklaşımı bizim gibi kurumsal şirketlerde çalışan insanların yaptığı kendini işle tanımlamak, işte basardıkların, işte hangi pozisyona geldiğin, kaç senedir çalıştığın, kaç sene ne işler yaptığın falan filan. İlk insanlar birbirleriyle tanıştıkları zaman 'ne iş yapıyorsun' diye soruyorlar bu kadar basit. Ben o anlamda kendimi isimle tanımlamıyorum.

‘If you ask me what the meaning of life is I don’t have an answer for that. There are things that I enjoy doing, for example for the last two years, the moments that I felt best were when I was writing. When I write something and publish it I feel great about it because it’s something related only to me, something that I do all by myself, something I created, it’s not like corporate world. I don’t produce something with my labor at work, I produce some other stuff outside of the work place. I write, I take photographs. I feel great when I write, when I take couple photographs that I like, I feel that I accomplish something. That’s why I don’t describe my self only through paid work’.<sup>97</sup>

Being a mother changed Ozge’s life in terms of her passions about job:

‘After Ela was born, I put less value on things such as those marketing games, tactics, trying to be liked by the general manager etc. I say ‘don’t worry’ to myself. Before, I was thinking about career more, why they made me Aysegul’s subordinate, why do I promote later than other people, why does someone before me. After Ela’s birth, I discovered another dimension of life. You don’t envy other’s careers, you say ‘ok, he or she holds a position like that but doesn’t have a daughter like Ela. Being a mother becomes a dominant feeling and this softens me. I have Ela, if I promote to this position I have to work late, but I have to look after Ela. I say they can go to this place for the holidays, however I want to be with my daughter, and I elude all my ambitions. Before the kid was born I was looking for a new job, however after giving birth and after paying the installations for the apartment... you think twice before you do anything’.<sup>98</sup>

---

<sup>97</sup> Ama hayatın anlamı nedir dersin sudur diye bir cevabım da yok, evet yapmaktan zevk aldığım şeyler var ama mesela su son bir iki senedir kendimi en iyi hissettiğim zamanlar yazdığım zamanlar. Yazıp da bir şey yayınladığımda kendimi acaip iyi hissediyorum çünkü hakikaten sadece benimle ilgili sadece benim yaptığım bir şey o, ben olmasam o yazı olmayacak yani anladın mı tamamen benim ürettiğim bir şey, tamamen benim ürettiğim hickimseye bağlı olmaksızın ortaya koyduğum bir şey, iş hayati falan filan gibi değil yani. Sadece yaptığım işle yani sadece isimde üretmiyorum. İsimin dışında da üretim yapıyorum yazı yazıyorum fotoğraf çekiyorum. Bunlar da benim için bir şey üretmek ama demin söylemek istediğim şey oydu, yazı yazarken ya da kendi hoşuma giden bir kaç fotoğraf çektiğim zaman kendimi iyi hissediyorum, bir şey basarmış hissediyorum, oyuzden zaten işle tanımlamıyorum kendimi

<sup>98</sup> Ben Ela olduktan sonra, eskisi kadar pazarlama oyunlarına, taktiklere, genel mudure oynama bir pozisyonu kapmak gibi şeylere daha az önem veriyorum. Daha fazla bosver diyebiliyorum, mesela oyle bir ayırım bende

In addition to substituting her unfulfilled expectations with being a ‘happy mother’ at the private realm, Ozge distinguishes herself from other marketing managers by choosing the product she markets and she works for the products that she likes:

‘Some people in brand management are willing to market anything. It’s not true for me, I really chose one industry or product over another. Five months ago, a headhunter invited me to an interview for a marketing manager position at a liqueur company. It’s impossible for me...I don’t drink much – it’s not about my religious beliefs – and yet I wouldn’t satisfy me to think about marketing a liqueur, even though they would have come with a great offer. I refused to meet the company, same is true for automotive industry, it’s distant to me. I like cosmetics, food industries. It’s related to the fact whether I like the product...I like the concreteness of the product which is advertised and put on the market shelf. It needs to be something that I personally like, something like chocolate, because I like chocolate, I like to think about it. I have never been a person who doesn’t care about the product as long as she makes money.’<sup>99</sup>

---

oldu. Eskiden cok daha fazla kafayi takardim, niye Aysegul’un altina bagladilar beni, neden ben daha gec uzman urun yoneticisi oluyorum da bilmem kim daha erken oluyor falna. Ama Ela olduktan sonra hakikaten hayatın baska bir boyutunu kesfediyorsun. İnsanların is ve kariyer anlamındaki kiskançlıkların olmuyor da diyorsun ki tamam o pozisyona gelmiş ama Ela gibi kızı yok. O o kadar baskın bir his olmaya baslıyor ki, beni hakikaten asagiya dogru cekiyor. O hırslarımı seylerimi bir anda yumusatıyor. Ya Ela var ya, ben şimdi bu pozisyona gecsem daha gec cikmak zorunda kalıcam iste ama benim Ela’la ilgilenmem lazim. Ama bana sey insanlarla ama tabii onun kızı yok ya tabii oralara gider, o buraya gider, o istedigini tatili yapar, ama ben kizimla olmak istiyorum diyerek seylerimden siyiriliyorum. Hani biraz sey vardır ya settle olma dedigimiz, olgunluk, oturaklı anne bazılarında o kadar olmadı, ama bende biraz daha fazla oldu. Butun hırslarımdan arındigimi hissediyorum. Hem birazcik naisl oluyor biliyor musun, çocuk dogmadan önce ben daha bir is degistirebilirim seyne girmistim. Baska yerler de var, aynı şirkette cok kalmamak lazim. Depresmistiyim yani, calismak istemiyordum ne bu boyle diye... ama hani (cogugum) olduktan sonra ve de bu ev taksidi falan olunca, yani hayatın gercek kismina baktigin zaman, hani ev taksidi var onu odemen lazim, çocuk var cocugun okulunu dusunmen lazim... Hani boyle seylerle cok dikkat etmek zorunda kalıyorsun, cok saglam yere basman lazim adimlerini. (Dogumdan) sonra daha bir saglamci oldum. Once daha bir aman canım nasilsa birimiz calisiyoruz diye sey yaptigim seyleri şimdi o kadar rahat hareket edemiyordum sonra bir de sosyal cevresi de insanın cok degisiyor. Daha saglamci oluyorsun.

<sup>99</sup> Bazi pazarlamacılar ben ne urun olsa olsun satarım abicim diye düşünür. Benim için o cok geceri degildir ben hakikaten sektor ve urun secerim. En basitinden bundan 5-6 ay önce, headhunterlerden birisi aramisti beni, gittim nedir ne degildir diye. (Bir alkollu icecek şirketine) pazarlama muduru ariyorlarmış. Benim imkansız bir sey icki...Ben cok icki icmem, dincilikle alakası yok, ama ickinin pazarlamasiyla ilgili kafa yormak beni hic tatmin etmez, kesinlikle manevi bir sey onlar bana cok iyi de teklif edebilirlerdi. Ben dedim yok musteriyle de gorusmek istemem, bu sektor bana acaip uzak bir sektor dedim. Aynı sekilde otomatik, o da bana soguk geliyor, bana boyle daha kozmetik, gıda onlar bana birazcik daha yakin gelebilecek seyler. Biraz o urunu sevmem o urune yakin olmamla ilgili. Herseyi pazarliyorum diyemem ben, her firmada olur finans boyle bankalardaki pazarlamacılar hic bana gore degil mesela. Oradaki elle tutulur, reklami yapılabilir rafta duracak birebir

Ozge's other solution is her ability to change the agency she works with:

'I like to work people, and I also admit it's sometimes hard to work people, however not everyone is hard to work with... Although some are tough, I would never transfer to a position where I don't have any connection with others. You always meet nice people, if you don't like an agency, you simply change it. Change as much as you can, it would be a good strategy to be happy'.<sup>100</sup>

Zeynep's discourse is to think that her dissatisfaction is related to her company which is not 'aggressive enough':

'My company does not aggressively compete 'of course the competitor will take some share, we're the leader of the market' attitude of the company is so not me. I could be happier at a more aggressive company. Here I'm rasped when somebody tells me 'take it easy' ... While we need help to be more successful, there are some in the company. I would work longer in an aggressive company, but things would go faster and I could have done more work.'<sup>101</sup>

Yonca's tactic to stay happy is avoiding grumpy people:

'The beauty of human being is its adaptation skills. There is no 100% fit, if I quit today and start another job, I'd adapt to it too. It's very important a person to be happy; I'm prone to be happy without complaining much... I think if someone else were in my position she would say different things...It's sort of a defense mechanism: for example, I don't allow

---

tuketiciyle daha bir sye olacak ki benim de kisisel olarak sevdiğim bir dal olması lazım atıyorum bilmemne çikolata, o olur çünkü çikolatayı severim. O konuda düşünmeyi severim. Hiç böyle şey olmadım ben, ben para kazanayım de ne urune baktığımın onemi yok.

<sup>100</sup> İnsanlarla çalışmayı seviyorum ama insanlarla çalışmanın zor olduğunu da kabul ediyorum. O da başka bir boyut, insanlarla çalışmayı seviyorum ama bütün insanlar da zor değil. Zor olanları çıktığı zaman sen diyorsun bu işin de maalesef negatif kısmı bu. Ama insanlarla hiç ilişkisi olmayan bir işe geçiyim, onu demem. Mutlaka, acaip yepyeni düzgün insanlarla da tanışabiliyorsun, ya da bir ajans varsa zaten beğenmezsen bir daha ona gitmiyorsun, değiştiremiyorsun onu. Değiştirebileceğin kadarını değiştirip iyilerle devam etmek gibi bir strateji olabilir yani. Mutlu olabilmek için...

<sup>101</sup> Bizim şirket öyledir, tamam ya lideriz bizden pay alacak tabii ya' biz de şey olmaz yani . bu benim tarzıma çok uygun bir tarz değil. Belki de ben çok daha agresif bir şirkette daha mutlu olabilirdim. Benim bu şeyimi daha gazlayacak bir şirkette. Çünkü burada tam tersine daha fazla torpüleniyorum. 'ya tamam ya sakın ol' dendiği. Ama orada sorun su, ben zaten oyle çalışmaya çalışmaya çalışıyorum. Şey değilim yani , şirket bana böyle yaklaşıyor diye ben de ,tamam ya doğru diyorlar' yapamıyorum tam tersine daha da zorlanıyorum. Böyle yardım alıp ucmamız gerekirken böyle seyyapan tipler var ya, durduran tipler. Belki o yüzden hani daha agresif bir şirkette belki saat olarak daha fazla çalışırım ama işim daha kolay görülür, bne daha kolay iş çıkarırım daha mutlu olurum yani.

people around me to talk negatively. One is influenced by the people around...If the person I'm talking is 90% negative, work or non-work, next time I see that person I think twice. I eliminate those who suck my energy... I don't see that person, or he or she understands that I got bored at some point... That's why I don't have so many people around me.. I don't like those who complain and cry all the time/ I like to look from the positive side of everything. Let's say something bad happened, I say 'it's Friday, I've tried but it's Friday' I try to find something positive, there are times that I can't find anything but if I'm really desperate I don't simply just go home, or go and cry, I arrange something that evening something to make myself happy'.<sup>102</sup>

Cagla talks about her lack of interest in being a marketing manager within the company. Her reason is that she wants to have a work- personal life balance.

'(Successful women) are masculine. Successful women can't spend much time for their family. Like a man, their focus is work. I could be masculine too if I spend less time at home.

---

<sup>102</sup> Bence benim farklılığımdan kaynaklanmıyor... Onu düşünüyorum şimdi, farklı bir hayat yaşayıp farklı bir şekilde çalışıyor olsaydım eminim o moda adapte olurum. Eminim onu da çok severdim!!!! İnsanın güzelliği orada zaten, nereye gidersen oraya adapte oluyorsun. Oyle bir şey yok aslında. %100 doğrusu yok aslında. Bugün bu işi bırakıp başka bir iş yapmam oraya adapte olacağım. Çünkü önemli olan insanın kendini mutlu etmesi sonuçta. Çok şikayet etmeden olduğum yerde çok mutlu olmayı bilen bir yapım var. Yani düşünüyorum yaptığım işler çok farklıydı şimdiye kadar, tamam şirketler benzerdi ama hani okuldaki çevrem bir süre çevrem falan çok şikayet etmeyi seven değil de daha çok yaptığım, elimdekiyle mutlu olmasını bilen bir karakterim var aslında. Ondan dolayı benim pozisyonuma başka birisini koysan muhtemelen çok farklı şeyler soyluyor olabilir. Çok yoruluyorum işte olduk bittik, ya da atıyorum çalışılır mı böyle ya da başka bir şey ama şey yani bence insanın elindekiyle mutlu olmasını bilmesi biraz da şey koymak, yani savunma mekanizması koyuyorsun... Mesela şey, işle ilgili birinin yanında negatif konuşmasına izin vermiyorum çünkü bir süre sonra... çok etkileniyorsun yanındaki insandan, çok negatif şey dinlemeyi sevmiyorum gerçekten. Hakikaten bir insanla konuşuyorsam %90i negatifse mesela iş ya da başka bir şey olsun o insanı ikinci kez gördüğümde bir daha düşünüyorum. Enerjimi çektiğini hissettiğim insanları kenara itiyorum. Şeyi yok birazcık da fifty fifty. Çok yakın bir arkadaşım olur, bir problemi olur bir şeyi vardır, ama çok negatif şeyleri kendimden uzak tutmaya çalışıyorum. Gorusmuyorum ya da oyalıyorum muhabbetin bir yerinde sıkıldığımı anlıyor bir şekilde, sonraki sefer o gorusmek istemiyor. Allahaan çevremde çok oyle insan yok. Ama çevremde bu kadar insan olmamasının sebebi zamanında elemiş olmamdır herhalde. Çok şikayet eden çok ağlayan insanları da sevmiyorum. Boyle karakterler de vardır uzaklaştırıyorum bir şekilde. Daha böyle pozitif tarafından bakmayı seviyorum herseye.. (Diyelim ki kötü bir şey oldu) şey diyorum, yavaşın Cuma aksami, yoruldu ama Cuma aksami diyorum. Bir şeyini bulmaya çalışıyorum, bulamadığım zamanlar da oluyor tabii ama çok desperate olduğum çok canımı sıkıttığım zamanlar da oluyor ama canım sıkıldıysa mesela o gece gidip eve kapanmıyorum. Ya da oturup ağlamıyorum, o gecenin aksamina mutlaka beni mutlu edecek bir program koyuyorum ki dengelesin beni

But I have work- life balance...I'm not ambitious, otherwise I'd like to be a marketing manager...'<sup>103</sup>

Yonca's pleasure from her job is a mixture of the opportunities given to her by her job. The rise in Yonca's cultural and economic capital is reflected in her group of friends, and she sees herself different from people working for example for a state enterprise:

'One of the reasons that attach me to the job is the people around me. Those are the people who went to the same schools with you, your mind works the same with them. If I worked at a state's enterprise, there would not be an attachment since the mentality is so different. The people around you are so similar, and your job enables you social opportunities. I work for the weekends...Five days of the week enables me with the tools relieving me over the weekend. Your financial belongings, your standard of life increases. I think they are important. There are three kinds of satisfactions here: job, financial and social.'<sup>104</sup>

Despite the fact that Yonca is a career person and deploys financial and cultural means she received from her job in her life, she discursively separates herself from her profession and explains her choice of friends and her 'mentality' as a personal choice as if it could be possible to be the same 'agency' in a place other than her company.

However, this commitment to the job does not come without a price. Yonca has been in corporate life since the age of eighteen and for the last three years she does not have enough time to pursue her interests- note that she previously said that she works for the weekends::

'To sleep over on Saturday mornings feels like a social activity. I'm not gonna explain this with time constraints, but work sucks your energy during the week and I really want to sit in a

---

103 '(Basarili olan kadinlar) erkeksiler dikkat edersen. Basarili olan kadinlar her zaman icin daha mesela cok basarili olan kadinlar ailesine cok fazla vakit ayiramiyor. Bir erkek gibi, is odakli oluyor cok fazla...Ben de erkeksi olabilirim ben de sey olabilirim, eve daha az vakit ayirsam. Ama benim de ozel hayat dengem var. Zaten bastan sunu soyliyim ben hirsli degilim. Pazarlama muduru olmak isterdim yoksa.

104 Baglayan cevremdeki insanlar yani senle ayni seyde, ayni okullardan mezun kafaca ayni, oyle bir cevrede yasiyorsun mesela dusunuyorum bir devlet burosunda calissam, mentalite o kadar farkli ki hani o seni tutmayacak bir sey olabilir. Hani cevrendeki insanlar falan cok benzer arti sosyal olanaklar sagliyor,ben Cumartesi Pazar icin calisiyorum haftanin 5 gunu. Tabi Cumartesi Pazar'I rahat gecirmen icin gerekli olanaklari sagliyor. Maddi olanaklarin, hayatın, yasam standardin yasam standardimi yukseltiyor bir yerde. Onlar onemli bence. Is tatmini arti maddi tatmin arti cevre tatmini uc tane tatmin var burada

couch doing nothing over the weekend. I am living on a stand-by. Except for going out with friends or going to a theatre play or a movie, I don't have anything that I do with passion. I don't dance anymore. I feel bad about it. I think it's important for you to have something you hang on passionately other than your job and your boyfriend and friends. Maybe, you don't wanna split yourself into variety of things...If you complain and don't do anything about it, it means it's not that bad. And I love my job, and the company attaches me to itself, the brands attach me, I feel I do something really important.'<sup>105</sup>

Nevertheless unnoticed taste is one of the reasons for these discourses. For the rest of this section, I would like to explore the unnoticed character of taste and its diffusion even into supposedly most immune area of escape attempts. Thus, subjection has to be discursively reproduced over and over.

#### **4.4.1 Taste Unnoticed:**

Although the informants learn how to like or learn to make the preferences they make, the 'ideology of natural taste' makes it feel as natural and not learned: 'it naturalized real differences, converting differences in the mode of acquisitions of culture into differences of nature (Bourdieu 68).

---

105 Cumartesi sabah uyumak mesela sosyal aktivite gibi oldu mesela. Ama sey yok, aslında vakitsizlik demiyecem ona yalan olur ama bir enerjini çok gomodugun için haftaarası bes gün boyunca haftasonu hakikaten bacaklarımı uzatıp falan yatmak istiyorum başka bir şey yapmak istemiyorum. Birazcık şey çok artık sifirlandım diyebilirim. Arkadaşlarımla dışarı çıkmak tiyatroya gitmek konsere gitmek haricinde tutkuyla yaptığım başka bir şey yok yani. Dans falan da bitti. Herkesin bir dönemi var ama onu hissediyorsun; bak bunu hissediyorum 3 sene daha bu tempoda yasayamam. Bir yerde başka priority'nin değişiyor olması lazım. Böyle sürekli aynı şeyi devam ettiremezsin bu dönem böyle geliyor. Ama bundan 3 sene önce böyle degildi hayatım. Biraz şey kotu hissediyorum kendimi. 3-4 sene evvel daha aktif daha sosyal, hala dansa devam ediyordum. Bir şeyler yapıyordum en azından, sadece iş degildi tutundugum. En azından hayatımda (erkek arkadaşımı) bir kenara koyuyorum özel hayatımı arkadaşlarımı da bir kenara koyuyorum ama başka bir şey iş kadar tutkuyla bağlandığım bir şey olması çok önemli bence. Biraz da şey kendin de istemiyorsun belki, çok bolunmek de istemiyorsun belki. Tercih etmiyorum gibi geliyor su anda ama ilerde bu beni mutlu eden hayattır, sürekli devam edicem diyemiyorum. Ha bir yerden başka bir şeye başlamak lazım, ama başlamak için zaman bulamıyorsun. Muhtemelen bir şey noktası gelecek, gına gelecek bir şeylerden. Bıcak gibi kesip başka bir şeye başlayacaksın muhtemelen. Keskin bir şey olması lazım. Çünkü şey yapıyor bir şekilde çok mutlu gidiyorsun aslında hayatında, çok şey degilsen, negatif bir şey hissetmiyorsan evet şikayet ediyorsun – gerci ben çok şikayet eden bir insan degilim mesela – çok oldum bittim diye degil de ama hani şikayet ediyorsun ama aksiyon almıyorsan hala seysin dayanmamıs. Dayandığı noktada da aksiyon alıyorsun zaten. Bir, çok sevdiğim bir iş yapıyorum çok seviyorum yani, yaptığım işi çok seviyorum. Artı şirket çok bağlıyor kendine, markalar çok bağlıyor, önemli bir şey yaptığını hissediyorsun yani...



As Irem puts it, her job is indispensable for her because it is the way for her to conduct the life she had been since her childhood:

‘I’ve always got what I wanted since my childhood. If I wanted to eat at this restaurant I never felt that I have no money to do so. If I feel the same, that I can do whatever I desire then I would do other things to satisfy me such as helping people.’<sup>106</sup>

Her desire to help people is conditional in terms of her standard of living. She has been grown up being in a well-off family and according to her she never felt a restriction to eat for example at a restaurant. She never gave a second thought about the money, even though she has her desires to work for charities which she sees as ‘adding’ something into one’s life and she is well aware that she works for business which is in the pursuit of financial gain, and she has a critical stance towards them, her condition is to work for charities is being able to work without any compromises.

When talking about her plans for quitting her job and staying at home, Zeynep has the financial concerns in mind:

‘Money...If I quit today, I have to decrease my standard of living. I’m not ready for that, I have no courage to do so. I have a young daughter, I hear about the fees of kindergartens. I have even a greater pressure on me to earn more’.<sup>107</sup>

She is aware of the distinctions that her job gives her.

‘I know myself, especially when it comes to my daughter. I want to send her to a good school, I want to give the same opportunities that other kids have and all these are very expensive things. The extra curricular activities such as sports, music...If I can’t let my child participate

---

106 ‘Ben cocuklugumdan beri cok imkani olan ama ayni zamanda da cok mutevazi olan bir ailede buyudum...ama istedigim herseyi elde ettim yani, ondan sonra orada da ben burada bu aksam burada yemek yemek istiyorsam hicbir zaman hayatimda paramin olmadini hissetmedim burada yemek yemek icin. Gene ayni seyi hissedersen, ben hayatimda herseyi yapabilecek durumdayim bu parayla ve bu maddi gucle o zaman hani ok bu bir yana ama busefer kendi istedigim ve kendimi tatmin edecek farkli seyler yapayim insanlara yardim edeyim...’

107 Para. Su anda calismayi biraksam hayat standardimi dusurmeme gerekir. Ve ona hazir degilim, oyle bir cesaretim yok. Iste kucuk bir cocugum var, anaokulu fiyatlarini falan duyuyorum. Hatta daha da cok para kazanmalıyım diye de üzerimde anormal de bir baskı var

in those activities, it would really make me sad. I can't take the risk. It's unfair for the kid, because I want to be more contented how can I set limits to what she can have. To stay home for example: what I mean is not staying home, but go out, have fun. You need money for all these. If we suddenly become a family with a single bread winner, the person staying home can't do these.'<sup>108</sup>

Zeynep is concerned with her child's future: she wants to give adequate cultural capital to enable her daughter to turn this cultural capital into economic capital in the future. Although it seems that her decision depends on her, who considers herself as a free subject, her concerns are bound to the institutions such as welfare state that facilitates.

Irem shares the same concerns as Zeynep about her future child:

'The amount I make is certain, if I want to send my child to the neighborhood kindergarten I can't. It's so bad; it feels like you restrain your child from something. Within the next five years, the child will find itself coping with the real world. How can one afford 30 thousand a year as the fee for the school? I worry about my wants and desires if I pay so much for the kid's education. What about my desires, what about the standard of life that I want to keep up' .<sup>109</sup>

#### **4.4.2 Escape Attempts:**

---

108 Kendimi tanıyorum özellikle çocuk konusunda, iyi bir okula göndermek isteyeceğim diğer çocuklara sunulan fırsatları sunmak isteyeceğim ve bunların hepsi gayet pahalı şeyler. Ne bileyim sporu olsun muzigi olsun bilmem nesi olsun, neyi olursa olsun. Bunu yapamamak beni çok üzer. Ve onu hiç goze alamıyorum. Çocuk için de haksızlık, ben oturup rahat rahat oturucam diye neden onun sahip olabileceği şeyleri, ne hakla kısıtlayabilirim diye düşünüyorum o yüzden de cesaret edemiyorum., evde oturmak ne demek mesela: bence evde oturmaktan kastettiğim evde oturmak değil yani gezmek tozmak takılmak eğlenmek yani. Bunların hepsi için de paraya ihtiyacın var yani. Ve su anda biz tek maaşlı bir aile haline gelirse evde oturan kişi bunları yapamaz. Yani o kadar rahat yapamaz

109 Ben mesela onu düşünüyorum, benim yilda kazandığım miktar belli,cocugumu anaokuluna göndermek istersem kosedeki anaokuluna kosedeki ilkokula da gonderemiyorsun artık. Bence o da çok kotu bir şey,cocugu bir şeylerden eksik bırakıyormuş gibi hissediyorsun. Bundan 5 yıl sonra ister istemez çocuk kendini bir şeylerle mücadele eder bulacak kendini. Sen de o mücadeleyi yapması için bütün tool'ları en iyi şekilde veriyor olman gibi bir düşünce oluyor. Yilda 30 milyar cocugun okulu baska masrafları, nasıl karşılayabilirsin yani. Hani çok şey mesela beni şeyler korkutuyor, cocuga bu kadar para vericem peki benim yapmak istediklerim ne olacak. Benim yapmak istediklerim ve hep sürdürmek istediğim bir yaşam standardı var o zaman ne olacak gerçekten onları falan düşünüyorum.

Escape attempts which are thought as the enclaves of one's secret desires are affected by the classifying nature of taste. Defne dream of escape of corporate life is having a little shop where she can sell books in a way she likes. However, she and her partners, after preparing a deliberate business plan, foresee they have to do the very same things that they criticize in other bookshops:

'If we are gonna do the same as those we criticize, there is no point for us to do that, it's not something that can satisfy us. We realized that those things that we improve are not profitable businesswise.'<sup>110</sup>

Irem has the same concern when she talks about her desire for voluntary work at NGOs and her escape attempt is based on the status of the thing that she will do and the standard of living:

'I would like to work for the UN or something in Istanbul. I would like to work on projects, but at a multinational like UN or something like Turk Egitim Gonulluleri. Because the image of them is better, if I work for an NGO I would not work for a stupid one but for one that I can really accomplish something.'<sup>111</sup>

When reminded that her income will be relatively low in case of doing voluntary work, she puts 'keeping her standard of living' as her prerequisite:

'I have my order, without decreasing my standard of living. If I can do everything I want. If I feel that I am in a position to do anything I want, I would do something I really want, something that will satisfy me such as helping people. What I do right now is business, this is a capitalist world, you earn money but the corporate business gets the bigger share. On the

---

<sup>110</sup> Eger bizim sikayetci oldugumuz begenmedigimiz tarzda is yapacak olsak o zaman yapmanin anlami yok, bu bizi memnun edebilecek bir sey degil... O bizim soyle de olsa dedigimiz seylerin sey acisindan business acisindan cok da karli olmadigini gorduk maalesef

<sup>111</sup> O zamanki kendi maddi ihtiyaclarimi dusunerek bir sonraki stepim sey olur, ne olur biliyor musun UN de calismak falan olur yani mesela atiyorum Istanbul'da bilmem nede calisirim. Yeni proje yapayim ama kuvvetli daha multinational gibi UN diyorum mesela bak seydemiyorum...ya da iste aslinda atiyorum Turk egitim gonulluleri vakfında da calisabilirim. Cunku benim kafamda da onun imaji iyi iyi kotu bilemiyorum su anda ama hani siivl toplum orgutunde de calisacaksam kiytirik bilmemne de calismiyim de gercekten bir seyler yapabilecegim bir yerde calisayim imaji var. Mesela isterim oyle bir seyde calisayim.

other side, there is a humanitarian aspect of it, you can add something to another persons's life. I would like to do something like that, from that instant on that I feel I can sustain my life as it is. I am really happy, it satisfies me a lot, now I for example I eat out five days a week, then it would be two days a week, ok three days, but I enjoy eating home spending time with my husband, and spend less...I need to think about those.'<sup>112</sup>

#### **4.5 Consumption and Discourse:**

Product management is not based on the arbitrary decisions: newly launched products are the end products of long market research, starting from the regular marketing reports to specific ones. Begum states that:

'We have a research department; we question the consumer all the time. There are continuous researches that the company regularly does. From those researches, we make certain deductions and we say to ourselves; 'beer consumption among the youngsters decreases... Wait a minute, we have to research this on a deeper level.' Then you find out that young people's beer consumption is shifted towards another alcoholic beverage. 'Ok, let's produce something alternative to that'. You receive feedback from the consumer, and you develop it further. Then you decide on the name, the packaging, to the world of the product. You do these by resorting to those who are your target consumer'<sup>113</sup>

---

<sup>112</sup> O zamana kadar duzenimi kurduysam eger...Su andaki standardimi dusurmeden yasayabiliyorsam. Istediklerimin hepsini yapabiliyorsam... Seyi hissersem, ben hayatimda herseyi yapabilecek durumdayim bu parayla ve bu maddi gucle o zaman hani ok bu bir yana ama bus efer kendi istedigim ve kendimi tatmin edecek farkli seyler yapayim insanlara yardim edeyim falan filan sonucta her ne kada r ne olursa olsun yaptigim isi sey olarak goruyorum. Hakikaten kapitalist dunyada goruyorum sen para kazaniyorsun ama kurumlar para kazaniyor falan. Ama oteki tarafta insani bir boyutu var yani hani bir insanin hayatina bir sey katabiliyorsun falan. Oyle bir sey yapmak isterim. Ama butun hayatimi istedigim gibi devam ettirebilecegimi anladigim andan itibaren.... Cok da mutlu oluyorum cok da haz aliyorum ama atiyorum her 5 gun yani disarda yiyorum ama bu isi yaparsan diyelim ki iki gun disarda yiycem ya da uc gun disarda yiycem yani nelerden vaz gececegimi bilmem lazim ki,tamam ya 3 gun ne olacak ki ben zaten artik evde yemekten daha cok hoslaniorum,kocamla evde olmaktan daha cok hoslaniorum zaten o yuzden de daha az para harciorum diyip benim onlari bi tartmam lazim mesela.

<sup>113</sup> Bizim arastirma departmanimiz var, onlarla birlikte o sekilde... surekli tuketiciyi sorguluyoruz. Yani zincirleme devam eden arastirmalar var zaten, sirketin rutinde goturdugu. Onlardan bir takim tespitler yapiyoruz. Mesela diyoruz ki: 'genclerde bira tuketimi dusuyor.Aa, bir dakika..Bunu daha derin arastilalim' ... orada bu sefer bir sey tespit ediyorsun: genclerde bira tuketimi seye kaymis, alkollu bilmem ne icecegine kaymis, baska bir icecege kaymis. 'Ha, tamam o zaman ona alternatif bir sey yapalim'...(tuketiciden) feedback aliyorsun, ona

She asserts that her job is assigning ‘identities’ to the new beverages: in her words ‘brands are created from ground zero’. She is in charge of creating an identity about the new brand and being in a position to tell the consumers what drink they want to drink. ‘Foreign brands and the main local brand of the company have settled images in the minds of the consumer. The managers of those brands are responsible for the adaptation of images sent from abroad. As a result, the world of the brand never changes. The brand manager thinks about how she can market a product that has a certain image, taste etc. They work on developing the brand further. But my brands, those are brand new, those are drinks developed in Turkey, from the taste to the packaging and the concept and the communication strategy they have been worked at from ground zero. So I experience the step of giving birth to them, it’s not like baby given to me, I am involved in every step of its birth. I need to be more creative, and be more attentive’.<sup>114</sup>

However, not all the brand managers are as lucky as Begum in terms of creating new products from ‘ground zero’. Most of the time, they have to launch products which already exist. Cagla, for example, tells us that her daily business consists of administrative jobs such as finding a new production site or changing the packaging which are consistent with the general strategy:

‘I don’t make much contribution to strategy; you make a difference during the administration’.

---

gore belki bir alan daha fazla focuslanıyorsun, onu daha fazla geliştiriyorsun. Ondan sonra ismine karar veriyorsun, ambalajına karar veriyorsun, dünyasına karar veriyorsun. Bunların hepsini kime ulaştırmak istiyorsan ona sorarak yapıyorsun

<sup>114</sup> Yabancı markalar zaten yutdisindabelli bir konumlandirmayla hayatini surduren bir takim markalar. Onların tamamen tum konseptiyle Turkiye’ye tasınması, Turkiye’de lanse edilmesi gibi bir sorumlulugu var lisansli markalardan sorumlu olanların... Yani sonucta, markanın dünyasi degismiyor hicbir zaman. ... Ama bir nevi markanın tadi belli, ambalaji belli, dünyasi belli: onu turkiye’de nasıl pazarlarım ve daha iyi yaparım diye bir yol bulmaya çalışılıyor Onların geliştirilmesi çalışması var. Ama benim markalarım mesela... çok yeni markalar, tamamen Turkiye’de geliştirilmiş, tadından ambalajından seye kadar konseptine kadar, iletişim stratejisine kadar herseyi sıfırdan düşünülmuş markalar dolayısıyla onları ben bir de doğurma aşamasına yasiyorum, hani benim kucagıma gelmiyor bebek, ben onu doğurma aşamasına geliyorum... Daha kreatif olmam gerekiyor, ondan sonra ve daha iyi gözlemlemem gerekiyor.

Thus, it is clear that these marketing executives apply the daily business to their personal lives such as being aware that they are not capable of changing the general strategies however, they move within the limits to reach the best outcome as in Cagla's case who does not change whether or not to sell a brand within a country but she changes the form or the weight of the product to compete with the competitor.

Yonca talks about the global campaigns of her brand; she is not the one who decides on the global strategy and she sees her job as the adaptation of the global strategies into the local market:

'Brand's strategy is global, it's not specific to Turkey. But you have to adapt it to Turkey, and your job is to execute it as good as possible, to bring it to Turkey and make it known through several campaigns. What will the TV be, how are we execute outdoor activities, what are the promotions gonna be, what kind of promotional activities are we gonna organize? We do not invent campaigns here, to be more specific, we don't assign local identities to the products. The identity of a brand comes as a ready made, the product comes, your responsibility is to make the consumer understand the product'.<sup>115</sup>

Her job is parallel to what she does in life. Her job requires her full control over the process of marketing; however, due to her position as a product manager at a multinational company, by definition her abilities to initiate a product from scratch are limited and most of the time she is given the campaigns by the global marketing teams. In this case, best she can do is creating an alternative discourse to adapt the product to the local market as she calls herself to subjection even though the disciplinary and distinctive practices trying to subject her do not work perfectly.

---

115 Markanın Türkiye'de uygulayacağı strateji, aslında strateji global geliyor, Türkiye'ye özel bir şey değil, ama gelen stratejiyi Türkiye'ye adapte edip, Türkiye'de en iyi şekilde execute etmek aslında... Ama Türkiye'ye getirip onu çeşitli kampanyalarla tanıtmak. Televizyon ne olacak, outdoorlarından tut, promosyonları ne olacak, aktiviteleri ne yapacağız... Burada kendimiz bir kampanya çıkartmıyoruz. Kampanya çıkartmıyoruz derken yanlış anlaşılmasın kimlik yaratmıyoruz. Zaten markanın bir kimliği hazır, ürün senin eline geliyor, senin ürünü doğru bir şekilde tüketicinin anlayacağı şekilde anlamasını sağlamaya çalışıyoruz.'

#### **4.6 Conclusion:**

In the previous chapters, the subjection process of managers were flawless: the disciplinary mechanisms such as hierarchical observation and examination lead the individuals towards making certain choices of profession and institutions without questioning and the enterprise culture suggested work as a space of 'self-actualization'. The personal and business goals merge each other. Also effects of allocation are at work during job selection through social image of the position and the prospects inscribed in it. These managers acquire tastes that are suitable to their new position as members of transnational professional class. From their leisure travel destinations to the sports they are interested in, they reflect their distinction from other groups and the similarities of these choices brings to mind that these preferences are far from being arbitrary. From this point of view, it seems that the work and non-work of these managers merged and the 'self as a project' is prevalent in production and consumption aspects of life.

The merging of work and non-work, however, is hardly a smooth process. As Beck states that 'the do-it-yourself biography is always a 'risk biography' and prone to lead towards a personal crisis. This personal crisis comes at points such as failure at job. A soul search is usually a method practiced to find the 'true' self following a personal crisis. Despite the efforts of a 'true' self, these managers usually reconcile with their current situation discursively and through the unnoticed taste and even their escape attempts are imbued in these tastes.

Their professional positions are in line with these discursive practices. Despite their control over their jobs, those who work for the multinationals originating in other countries than Turkey admit that their discretionary power is limited to tactics rather than strategies such as changing packaging or adapting a global campaign to the market in Turkey.

## Conclusion

In this research, I have tried to understand the subjection process of young female Turkish brand managers. In the course of their life, they go through different institutions such as school, family and corporation and they are shaped by disciplinary mechanisms and enterprise culture. They are allocated to higher educational institutions and professions through social images, prospects and image of cultural accomplishment. Nevertheless, my informants who were at one point in the position of docile pupils are now teachers within their organizations: they are the mentors or sponsors of their juniors. Accordingly, they also acquire distinctive life-styles to distinguish themselves from other groups. Theorists like Giddens argues that creating the self becomes more and more about 'life-styles' with the erosion of a stable ground to anchor in such as traditions (Modernity and Self-identity 5).

The importance of young managers working in marketing is related to their job's position between the production and consumption. They are the arbitrators between these two areas. Their job enables consumers to structure (them)selves by providing them with a variety of tools to identify themselves with.

However, this subjection process is not a faultless one. As the enterprise culture tries to penetrate into every aspect of the life of the contemporary person by indicating the qualities belonging to an enterprise such as self-reliance, boldness and willingness to take responsibilities have been regarded as human virtues. Although these can be human virtues, to embark the whole responsibility of being oneself independent of the social origin or the failure of prevalent excellence discourse pointing the company as a site of self-actualization, the individuals sometimes experience a personal crisis which is in turn a result of the postponing of decision making.



Personal crises are followed by a search for the 'true' self. However, this 'true' self appears as a reconciliation with the current self, since 'truth is not by nature free but that its production is thoroughly imbued with relations of power' (History of Sexuality 60).

Accordingly, the power relations that brought these individuals to the positions they occupy at the moment are also constitutive of this 'true' self. Through the unnoticed nature of taste even their escape attempts are 'imbued with power'. Thus, although the individual is not merely a victim of the structural forces, she is not as independent as some post-modernist literature suggests. Rather, the agents can make their own decisions in terms of choosing a school, major, profession, and company; however, the similarities of their selection points to the fact that these choices depend on both the agency and structure. Nevertheless, as Giddens states 'the human history is created by intentional activities but is not an intended project' (The Constitution of Society 27).

One of the decisions made prior to the research was the gender of the informants. I was curious whether gender was a factor (for what) for these women who work in marketing. During the course of my research, gender surfaced in a few interviews. Only one informant mentioned about a possible difference between her career and her male colleague's career. Other than that, all the informants considered themselves having equal opportunities for promotion and declared that their gender does not hinder their career. Despite the fact that this research is not a comparative study of the subjectivity construction of male and female brand managers, the women do not feel constrained in their career due to their gender. However, the points that is made by Wajcman are parallel to the findings of my research 'that men and women managers use similar narratives to describe their prospective careers, gender remains a significant factor in how public career identities are articulated with private ones' (998). Wajcman argues that 'between men and women in career routes are less and less dictated by gendered differences in their self-images in work and the labour market. But, because private

identities remain so integrally and fundamentally gendered, they are the increasingly dominant source of the quite different ‘family–work’ choices and dilemmas men and women face’ (1000). Among my informants, only two of them were mothers and in both interviews the dilemma of staying in a career and raising a child surfaced on several occasions. Since I did not have any men among the informants, I did not have a chance to study the meaning of the private realm for men. However, according to one of my informants who stated her choice for not becoming a mother in the future, her former superiors quit their jobs to raise their children although they were quite ‘ambitious types’. This point is supported by the two mothers who declared their preference of leaving their professional careers if they had the necessary financial means.

Nevertheless, it seems that the careers of woman managers have a quite similar route to man’s career path, and they reject the idea of being discriminated on gender difference. According to my initial observations, the crucial point in female career is the motherhood. Marriage does not appear to be a factor affecting careers of these brand managers. Half of my informants were married, and childless managers did not mention a ‘tough’ choice between the family and career. A further research could be in the direction of studying the effects of motherhood among the woman managers, and including men would offer complete the picture of the private realm, since the private realm is the sphere where the gender difference is underlined more.

Another way to explore the gendered identities could be a comparative study of marketing with other professionals where the gender balance is leaned towards male side such as finance. While both being members of the transnational capitalist class, their subjections can be compared and contrasted in terms of working at multinationals and the gendered aspect of the jobs could be explored more deeply in a comparative study.

Another way to go is exploring marketing within the developing countries. The development of consumer culture within these countries and its construction of subjectivities and the connection between the brand managers and the consumer can be explored. The relationship between the foreign brands and local people can be researched further to search for similarities and differences between the producers of consumption and the consumers.

Since this study is based on the narrations of these managers, only the discursive side of subjection has been partly discovered. As demonstrated by Foucault, knowing subject is a creation of discourse and the individuals are part of this creation. So the escape can be regarded as some hapless endeavor: if the language creates the dichotomies such as inside and outside, one cannot talk about the 'escape'. However, a participant observation study could reveal the tactics developed by these managers with daily challenges of their work. In addition to discourse, as de Certeau argues 'meaning is also produced by consumers through the use to which they put those objects in the practice of their everyday lives' (du Gay 103). According to de Certeau, what is important is what the consumer makes out of something. Drawing parallels between consumers and Indians under the rule of Spanish colonizers, he tells that 'they escaped it without leaving it' (de Certeau, xiii). Thus, in a further research, one can follow a more non-narrative path to study daily practices of these managers while simultaneously examining the daily lives of consumer who produce meanings of the products which may or may not be those intended by these brand managers.

As a conclusion, despite the disciplinary and distinctive mechanisms, it is an impossible task for the structures govern the agencies completely. However, the subjects need a Subject to be interpellated to construct their subjectivity. Thus, even in the areas of failure of discursive and disciplinary mechanisms, subjects, brand managers in this research, need to subject themselves discursively to be interpellated by the Subject.

## Works Cited

- Ahiska, Meltem and Zafer Yenal Aradiginiz Kisiye Su An Ulasilamiyor. Istanbul: Garanti Arsiv ve Arastirma Merkezi, 2006.
- Althusser, Louis. 'Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses'. 'Lenin and Philosophy' and Other Essays. Monthly Review Press: 1971.
- Aycan, Zeynep. 'Key Success Factors for Women in Management in Turkey'. Applied Psychology (2004) 53:3, 453 –477.
- Bali, Rifat. Tarz-ı Hayattan Lifestyle'a: Yeni Seçkinler, Yeni Mekanlar, Yeni Yaşamlar. Istanbul: İletisim, 2002.
- Baudrillard, Jean. The Consumer Society. London: Sage, 1998.
- Beck, Ulrich and Elisabeth Beck-Gernsheim. Individualization. London: Sage, 2002.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. Distinction : a social critique of the judgment of taste. Cambridge, Mass.: Routledge, 1984.
- Castells, M. The Rise of the Network Society. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996.
- Cohen, Stanley and Laurie Taylor. Escape Attempts. London: Routledge, 1992.
- De Certeau, Michel. The Practice of Everyday Life. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1984.
- Du Gay, Paul. Consumption and Identity at Work. London: Sage, 1996.
- Du Gay, Paul, Stuart Hall, Linda Janes, Hugh Mackay, Keith Negus. Doing Cultural Studies: The Story of the Sony Walkman. London: Sage, 1997.
- Dumenil, Gerard and Dominique Levy. 'The neoliberal (counter)revolution' in Alfredo Saad
- Featherstone, Mike. Consumer Culture and Postmodernism. London: Sage, 1991.
- Filho and Deborah Johnston (eds), Neoliberalism, A Critical Reader. London: Pluto, 2005.
- Galbraith, John Kenneth. The New Industrial State. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1969.

Giddens, Anthony. Modernity and Self-identity. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1997.

The Constitution of Society. Cambridge: Polity, 1986.

Foucault, Michel. Discipline and Punish. New York, NY: Vintage, 1995.

History of Sexuality. New York, NY: Vintage, 1990.

Haveman, Heather and Mukti Khaire. 'Organizational Sociology and the Analysis of Work' in Korczynski.

Kanter, Rosabeth Moss. Men and Women of the Corporation. New York, NY: BasicBooks, 1993.

Klein, Naomi. No Logo. London: Flamingo, 2000.

Korczynski, Marek, Randy Hodson, and Paul Edwards (eds). Social Theory at Work. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006.

Kotler, Philip and Gary Armstrong. Principles of Marketing. Delhi: Pearson Education, 2001.

Kunda, Gideon. Engineering Culture. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1992.

Layder, D. Understanding Social Theory. London: Sage, 1994.

Leidner, Robin. 'Identity and Work' in Korczynski et. al.

Marx, Karl and Friedrich Engels. The Communist Manifesto. London: Penguin, 2002.

Marx, Karl Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844. Prometheus Books, 1988.

Ritzer, The McDonaldization of Society. London: Sage, 2000.

Sklair, Leslie. 'Social movements for global capitalism: the transnational capitalist class in action', Review of International Political Economy, (1997) 4:3, 514 – 538

The Transnational Capitalist Class. Oxford: Blackwell, 2001.

Smart, Barry. Economy, Culture and Society: A social critique of neo-liberalism.

Buckingham: Open University Press, 2003.

Wallerstein, Immanuel. The Modern World-System: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins

of the European World-Economy in the Sixteenth Century. New York, NY: Academic Press, 1976.

Wajcman, Judy. 'Narratives of Identity in Modern Management: The Corrosion of Gender Difference?' Sociology, (2002) 36: 4; 985–1002.

Yilmaz Sener, Meltem. 'Turkish Managers as a part of the transnational capitalist class', Journal of World-Systems Research, (2008) 13:2, 119-141.

Zeytinoglu, Isik Urla. 'Factors affecting females managers' careers in Turkey' . The Economics of Women and Work in the Middle East and North Africa (2001) 4, 225-245.

Zizek, Slavodan. The Sublime Object of Ideology. London: Verso, 1989.